

69

	Rs.	Rs.
(5) <i>Vice-Chancellor</i> . (for 3 years) at Rs. 1,500 per mensem.		18,000
(6) <i>Registrar</i> at Rs. 500 per mensem		6,000

(7) *Registrar's Office*—(a) *General Department*.

1 Superintendent at Rs. 200 per mensem	2,400
1 Stenographer at Rs. 100 per mensem	1,200
1 Typist at Rs. 50 per mensem	600
2 Clerks each at Rs. 50 per mensem	1,200

(b) *Accounts Department*.—

1 Accountant at Rs. 200 per mensem	2,400
1 Cashier at Rs. 150 per mensem	1,800
1 Bill Clerk at Rs. 75 per mensem	900

(c) *Examinations Department*.—

1 Superintendent at Rs. 200 per mensem	2,400
1 Typist at Rs. 50 per mensem	600
2 Clerks each at Rs. 50 per mensem	1,200

(d) *Peons*.—

6 each at Rs. 20 per mensem	1,440	16,140
--------------------------------------	-------	--------

(8) *Physical Education*.

5,000

(9) *University Employment and
Information Bureau*.—

Secretary at Rs. 150 per men- sem	1,800
--	-------

70

	Rs.	Rs.
Establishment	1,000	
Contingencies	200	
(10) <i>University Publications and grants</i>		3,000
(11) <i>Travelling Allowances for members of Senate Syndicate External Examiners, etc.</i>		5,000
(12) <i>Examination Charges</i>		10,000
(13) <i>Contingencies</i>		50,000
(14) <i>Repairs to buildings, insurance, Municipal Charges, etc.</i>		3,000
(15) <i>Provident Fund</i>		6,000
(16) <i>Printing and Stationery</i>		3,500
(17) <i>Miscellaneous—</i> (Printing of Diploma, postage and telegrams, furniture, advertisements, telephone, etc)		5,000
Total ..		2,26,840

III.—Recurring Income.

- I. Tuition fees from University Departments of Sindology (10 students) and Applied Sciences (20 students) at Rs. 150 and Rs. 200 per year respectively .. 5,500

2. Examination Fees, as under :—

	Candidates.		Rs.	Rs.	
(1) Matriculation	2,875	at	15	43,125	
(2) F. Y.	661	at	20	13,220	
(3) Intermediate	824	at	25	20,600	IV
(4) B. A. Jr.	126	at	25	3,150	
(5) B. A. Sr.	126	at	25	3,150	
(6) B. Sc. Jr.	70	at	30	2,100	
(7) B. Sc. Sr.,	70	at	30	2,100	C
(8) B. A. Supplemen- tary	30	at	40	1,200	C
(9) B. Sc. Supplemen- tary	30	at	40	1,200	-

71

		Candidates.		Rs.	Rs.
(10)	M. A. ..	30	at	75	2,250
(11)	M. Sc. ..	5	at	100	500
(12)	1st LL. B. ..	101	at	30	3,030
(13)	2nd LL. B. ..	30	at	50	1,500
(14)	1st LL. B. Supple- mentary ..	50	at	30	1,500
(15)	2nd LL. B. Supple- mentary ..	20	at	50	1,000
(16)	F. E. ..	111	at	30	3,330
(17)	S. E. (Civil) ..	43	at	30	1,290
(18)	S. E. (M. E.) ..	30	at	30	900
(19)	B. E. (Civil) ..	50	at	50	2,500
(20)	B. E. (Mech.) ..	15	at	50	750
(21)	B. E. (Elec.) ..	13	at	50	650
(22)	B. E. Supplemen- tary (C) ..	33	at	50	1,650
(23)	B. E. Supplemen- tary (M) ..	5	at	50	250
(24)	B. E. Supplemen- tary (E) ..	10	at	50	500
(25)	Engineering Diplo- mas.				
(26)	F. Sc. (Agri.) ..	24	at	30	720
(27)	S. Sc. (Agri.) ..	13	at	30	390
(28)	B. Sc. (Agri.) ..	10	at	50	500
					<hr/> 1,13,055
3.	Fees for supplying marks, retotalling etc.				2,000
4.	Fees from recognised High schools ..				700
5.	Fees for conferring of degrees ..				3,500
6.	Fees for registration of graduates ..				1,750
7.	Sale-proceeds, University papers, publi- cations etc. ..				500
8.	Miscellaneous ..				1,000
					<hr/>
Total ..					1,28,005
IV.—Annual Deficit*				Rs.	99,000

ESTIMATES UNDER SCHEME II.

(i.e. if the University starts its own Arts and Science College in addition to the University Office, Library, Convocation Hall, etc.,

* The deficit shown is in addition to the grants already being made by the Government to the Sind Collegiate institutions.

I.—Non-Recurring Expenditure.

(1) University Offices	..	Rs.
(2) Convocation Hall	..	75,000
(3) Research Departments with equipment	..	1,00,000
(4) Arts College including Hostel	..	2,00,000
(5) Science College	..	2,50,000
(6) Library	..	4,00,000
(7) Gymkhana	..	2,00,000
(8) Development Charges	..	20,000
	..	30,000
Total	..	12,75,000

II.—Recurring Expenditure.

(1) Grant to the Arts and Science Colleges to enable them to balance the budgets	..	Rs.
	..	30,000
(2) The remaining expenses the same as shown under Scheme I	..	1,76,840
Total	..	2,06,840

III.—Recurring Income.

The same as under Scheme I	..	Rs.
	..	1,28,005

IV.—Annual Deficit	..	79,000
---------------------------	----	--------

The deficit, in either case, is below one lakh of rupees annually, and we came to the conclusion that the Government should meet this deficit in the interest of higher education in the province.

We may place it on record that there was no unanimity about the above estimates. One member was in favour of adding to several items of recurring and non-recurring expenditure *e.g.* the salaries of Professors, the Library grants to Colleges and soon. There was another section of members who thought that there was a very wide scope for reduction of expenses, especially under Scheme I, *e.g.* in hostel accommodation and quarters for the staff.

CHAPTER XIII.

MISCELLANEOUS TOPICS.

In the organisation of a huge educational structure, such as a university for a province is likely to be, a number of problems come up for consideration which cannot be conveniently classified or put under categories specified by the terms of reference. All such problems, or as many as were considered important enough and were germane to the subject matter of our inquiry, have been dealt with in this chapter. We cannot anticipate here all the other problems of a minor or major importance which may arise in the actual working of the University, and will require close study by the Senate, the Syndicate and other constituent bodies. So we have confined our attention to only a few.

I. *Adult Education and Extension Courses.*—Nearly 75 years ago, the Universities of Great Britain and America awoke to the grave problem of semi-educated adults who, owing to the need of early entry into professional careers or otherwise had not been brought into contact with what is best in art, thought and life. In an age of extending democracy, it was thought undesirable that large masses of adults, who are the real sovereigns of the state, should be relegated to mere primary or secondary education. It is true, university education, in its fullest sense, is ordinarily confined only to a few, but that is no reason why the ordinary tax-payer who maintains this education should not get some benefit out of it. As it has been very aptly said, "if people are not able to go to the University, the University should go to the people." In India, with the introduction and extension of democratic forms of Government, the masses of adult population are beginning to acquire unprecedented importance in national life, and the education of these masses has become a problem of extreme importance to the sound functioning of democracy. While a part of this work of mass education would naturally be attempted by special agencies and the Education Department, "the provision of a liberal education for adults should be regarded by universities as a normal and necessary part of their functions." Such work may not be considered essential to a university in the narrower sense, but it is essential in the broader view that it is the duty of a great seat of learning to offer its talents and its treasures of the mind to all who desire to benefit by them. By undertaking adult education, the universities of India would become, as they ought to be, great centres and springs of education throughout the country and command the sympathy and affection of the nation at large.

What organisation the University of Sind should set up for efficiently discharging this function, and what courses of instruction it would offer to the adult population are matters of detail which we feel cannot be correctly indicated at this stage of the Sind University, idea, but we are all agreed that the new university, when it comes into existence, should undertake this pioneering work for the province.

2. *Physical Education.*—In our recommendations on the curricula for the Intermediate Examination, we have already laid great stress on Military Training as a compulsory subject for all students. But we feel that the whole subject of general physical fitness of the future generations needs close attention on the part of the University. It is, we believe, not enough that the students of the First and Second year classes in Colleges should be required to attend drill of an uninteresting nature twice or thrice a week. What is needed is regular daily training by body building exercises and games, as well as by a sound knowledge of the laws of physical efficiency, so that the youth of the province would grow up hardy and strong in the colleges, and continue their zest for physical well-being even after they have left their colleges. We are very emphatic that the University of Sind should initiate a carefully conceived programme of physical regeneration for the youth of the province.

3. *Social Life in the Colleges.*—As the result, partly of lack of adequate accommodation, and partly lack of vision, we have hardly any social life in the colleges of Sind. Hostels, where this could be developed easily and effectively, have encouraged or allowed all these years a system of numerous communal or territorial messes where inter-communal contacts become difficult, and each little group lives an exclusive life of its own. This is the very negation of "liberal education" which is deemed to be one of the functions of universities to impart. The colleges, apart from their hostels, have very rarely any systematic or regular plans for the establishment of healthy and stimulating contacts between student and student, and between teacher and student outside the class rooms. The spirit of camaraderie, which is generated by common platforms of thought and activity is singularly lacking in the colleges of Sind, and we feel that the new University should not allow this state of affairs to be perpetuated. It must encourage the organisation of such activities and such life in the colleges singly or jointly as will bring different minds into lively exchange with each other more frequently, bring the

teachers and students together outside the class room in a bond of fellow-feeling, and thus create an atmosphere of stimulating fellowship and a sense of corporate existence among them.

4. *Territorial limits of the Sind University.*—The province of Sind and the State of Khairpur would, in our opinion, be the territorial limits of the University unless any bordering State or province like Las Bela, Kalat or Baluchistan expressly desires to prepare its students for the Sind University courses of studies and examinations.

5. *Residence of Students.*—The Committee agreed that the present regulations of the Bombay University governing this aspect of student life should be followed by the University of Sind.

6. *Separate Colleges for Women.*—Education of girls in Sind is still negligible as far as the Muslim population is concerned, and since *purdah* still prevails among them, the present co-educational institutions would more or less be a closed door to Muslim ladies seeking higher education. On other grounds too, the idea of co-education has many opponents in Sind, and we decided to recommend that separate colleges for women are desirable in Sind, and the University of Sind should afford facilities for the starting of such Colleges.

7. *Honorary Degrees and Fellowships.*—The system of Honorary Degrees and Fellowships has been a feature of universities all the world over, and we decided that the University of Sind, should, in this matter, follow the practice of conferring such marks of honour on men of merit and distinction, as obtains now in the Bombay University.

8. *Publication Bureau.*—We have laid a good deal of emphasis on research as an important feature of the University of Sind. The existence of a University Publication Bureau will offer some incentive to research. If the research workers in the University preparing theses are given facilities for publication, many young men of talent would feel stimulated to undertake original research, and Sind will have an opportunity of contributing its quota of new knowledge to the country. A publication bureau conducted on right lines would give to the new University that prestige which it will sorely need in the early stages of its career. It could also be a source of some welcome addition to its slender finances if it published its own text-books for the various courses of instruction prescribed by it for the various examinations. We are, therefore, of the opinion that the University of Sind should have a publication bureau

as early as possible after its inauguration. Among its regular publications may well be a monthly bulletin, which should popularize the ideals and activities of the University as well as the affiliated colleges.

9. *Correspondence Courses*.—The Committee agreed that, for diffusion of education and training young men for careers, such courses may be found desirable, though no actual scheme was considered necessary to formulate at this stage.

10. *Inter-University Exchange of Professors*.—In some universities of the West, the practice of exchanging Professors is widely prevalent, and it was not unknown to the ancient universities in India. We feel that the Sind University would do well to profit by the learning of eminent scholars from other universities by inviting them to deliver courses of lectures.

11. *Discipline in Colleges*.—Indiscipline has, for a generation or so, been a serious problem in the University education in India. Apart from the general spirit of defiance inculcated among the young by the politics of the country and the world movements, the lack of better organised life in the Colleges has something to do with subversive tendencies among the young. Want of contact between the teaching staff and the students, overcrowded class rooms, uninspiring curricula, faulty time tables, and many other short-comings of college organisation have tended to loosen the old bonds between the teacher and the taught, and we felt it our duty to mention this problem as one to which the new University must address itself with all the care that it deserves. We thought, however, that the problem of indiscipline would be solved to some extent if congestion in colleges is removed.

12. *Employment Bureau*.—There was a time when every graduate of the Indian Universities was able to get good employment. This state of affairs was bound to change in course of time, and the whole country is now faced with the problem of having on its hands more graduates than it can find occupation for. It is true, it is not the function of a University to provide jobs for its pupils, but it has been felt for some time that universities should try to see if they can help their graduates to find jobs. Sometimes, young men are willing to work and are fit for jobs, but they have no accurate knowledge about the many fields of employment open to them, and the machinery by which they can secure it. It is here that the universities can ease the situation, created by widespread un-employment among their graduates. We have, therefore, decided that the University of Sind should have an Employment Bureau as soon as it begins to send out its own graduates to face the hard realities of life.

CHAPTER XIV.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS.

I. Aim and Purpose of University Education in Sind.

(Term of Reference No. I.)

(1) A modern university being the highest organised effort of the State for the education of its youth, the fundamental aim of the University of Sind, in our opinion, ought to be to train select youth for leadership in all aspects of life so as to make them efficient individuals as well as useful citizens.

(2) The second aim of the University of Sind should be, to impart available knowledge to its alumni and to diffuse it among the masses of Sind.

(3) The third aim should be the encouragement and organisation of research in arts and science for the creation of a new body of knowledge, with particular reference to the needs and opportunities of our province (e. g., in aeronautics, marine biology, marine engineering, irrigation, agriculture, and rural economics).

(4) The fourth aim should be the conservation and promotion of the culture of Sind, its language, literature, history, philosophy.

(5) While in all universities the imparting of culture is the main objective, the aim of the Sind University should also be to provide facilities to its alumni for training in useful professions so as to make them economically independent (*vide* page 15 of Report).

II. Type of University desirable for Sind.

(Term of Reference No. IV.)

(1) The type of University deemed desirable for Sind is a combination of the Teaching and Affiliating types, the University undertaking direct teaching in some subjects including postgraduate courses, while for the rest it will be an affiliating type.

(2) While we do not think it practicable to establish a University with Agriculture as its basic bias, we think it desirable that the University of Sind should emphasize the essential agricultural character of the province

and its peoples. This it could do by making provision in the several courses of instruction as also by instituting research in problems of agriculture (*vide* page 21).

III. Constitution of the University.

(Term of Reference No. V.)

(1) The authorities recommended are (*vide* page 24): —

- (a) The Chancellor.
- (b) The Vice-Chancellor.
- (c) The Registrar.
- (d) The Senate.
- (e) The Syndicate.
- (f) The Faculties.
- (g) The Boards of Studies.
- (h) The Academic Council.
- (i) The Council of Research.
- (j) The Library Board.

(2) Appointment, composition, functions and powers of the authorities are recommended to be as under :—

(a) *Chancellor* to be Governor of the Province with the same powers and functions as are prescribed in the Bombay University Act, with the exception of the power to nominate the Vice-Chancellor and sanction other appointments (pages 25—27).

(b) *Vice-Chancellor*, for the first three years, is to be appointed by the Chancellor from a panel of 3 names of eminent educationists of all-India reputation to be recommended by the Syndicate. He is to be a whole-time paid Official drawing a salary of Rs. 1,500 per mensem. The term of his office is to be three years to synchronise with the life of the Senate and Syndicate. His functions and powers are to be similar to those provided in the Bombay University Act, Statutes, Ordinances and Regulations (*vide* page 28).

(c) *The Registrar* is to be a competent person appointed by the Syndicate for a period of 5 years in the first instance, on an average salary of Rs. 500 per mensem with a probationary period of one year.

He would be a Fellow of the University without the right of vote, and would be removable by the Syndicate after due notice. His powers and functions would be similar to those contained in the Bombay University Act, Statutes, Ordinances and Regulations (page 28).

(d) *The Senate* of the Sind University is to consist of 20 Ex-officio members comprising the Chancellor, the Vice-Chancellor, the Minister of Education, the Chief Judge, the Director of Public Instruction, the Director of Agriculture, the Director of Industries, the Director of Public Health and Medicine, the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, the Principals of the existing seven Colleges, 3 Heads of University Departments; 10 nominated members, 5 Heads of registered High Schools of whom one would be the head of a Girls' High School; 10 College Teachers; 6 Registered Graduates; 4 representatives of District Local Boards; 4 representatives of Borough Municipalities out of which one will be reserved for the Karachi Municipal Corporation; 3 representatives of the Sind Legislative Assembly; 1 representative of Commercial bodies; 1 representative of Zamindars' Association; 1 representative of Haris' Association; each individual donating not less than Rs. 30,000 in money or property to the University; One out of every 10 donors each donating a sum of not less than Rs. 3,000, to be elected by the electoral college of these donors; and the Registrar.

In case the Sind Collegiate institutions are taken over by the Sind University, some representatives of the Sind Collegiate Board would be given representation on the Senate.

The term of office of the Senate would be three years, at the end of which there would be simultaneous general elections for this body.

The powers and functions of the Senate were fixed on lines similar to those provided in the Bombay University Act with the addition of power to make, amend or repeal statutes, and to consider, modify and cancel ordinances and regulations (pages 30—31).

(e) *The Syndicate* of the Sind University will consist of the Vice-Chancellor, the Director of Public Instruction, 4 members elected from the Council, 4 Teachers elected from the Academic Senate, 7 non-academic members elected from the Senate, in all making 15.

The term of Office of the Syndicate will be three years, after which there would be general election for its fresh composition.

The powers and functions of the Syndicate would be similar to those defined by the Bombay University with the addition, "to define the duties and functions of the Research Council by ordinances" (pages 33--35).

(f) *The Academic Council* would be composed of the Vice-Chancellor, 2 Deans of Faculties, 3 Heads of University Departments, 1 Head Master of a Registered High School, 5 members elected by the Senate, 14 members elected by the Board of Studies, making a total of 25.

The powers and functions of the Academic Council would be similar to those in the Bombay University (pages 36--37).

(g) *The Faculties* would, at the start, be only two, Arts and Science. The Senate will have the power of assigning Fellows to one or more Faculties. The functions and powers of the Faculties would be similar to those in the Bombay University (page 37).

(h) *Boards of Studies* would be 17 in all, at the start, as under :—

(a) Sindhi Language, Literature and Culture.

(b) English.

(c) Sanskrit, Hindi, Gujarati, Marathi and other allied modern languages.

(d) Arabic, Persian, Urdu and Avesta Pahlavi.

(e) Latin, Greek, French, German and other European Languages.

(f) History, Economics, Sociology, Politics, Archeology and Geography.

- (g) Philosophy.
- (h) Mathematics.
- (i) Education.
- (j) Fine Arts. (Drawing, Music, Painting).
- (k) Physics and Chemistry.
- (l) Biology, Physiology and Hygiene.
- (m) Agriculture and Forestry.
- (n) Engineering.
- (o) Law.
- (p) Medicine.
- (q) Military and Physical Education.

Their formation, powers and functions would be as in the Bombay University (page 38).

(i) *The Research Council* would consist of the Vice-Chancellor, 2 Deans of Faculties, Head of the University Department of Sindology, 2 Heads of other University Departments, and 2 outside experts recommended by the Academic Council. The powers and functions of the Council would be as in Rule 4, page 243 of the Travancore University Calendar, 1940-41 (page 39).

(j) *The Library Board* would be composed of the Vice-Chancellor, 2 Deans of Faculties, 1 Librarian (as Member and Secretary without vote), 2 member elected by the Senate, 5 members elected from the Academic Council. The functions and powers of the Board will be as shown in the Bombay University Calendar (page 40)

IV. The University Office.

(Term of Reference No. VI.)

The University Office would have five establishments with the staff for each as shown below :—

(1) General Office, with one Superintendent, one Stenographer, one Typist, and two Clerks.

(2) Accounts Branch with one Accountant, one Cashier and one Bill Clerk.

(3) Examination Branch with one Superintendent, one Typist, and two Clerks.

(4) Library Board, with one qualified Librarian and two assistants.

(5) Research Council with one Typist Clerk (page 41).

V. Curricula and Examinations.

(Term of Reference No. VII.)

The University of Sind should conduct its own Matriculation Examination with its own courses of studies which, with a variety of options proposed, would serve as a suitable admission test for the University as well as the requirements of a school-leaving test (page 42).

The subjects suggested for the Examination, for being taken in compulsory and optional groups would be the following (page 45):—

- (1) English.
- (2) "Mother-Tongue" or "Additional English".
- (3) Mathematics.
- (4) History and Geography.
- (5) Classical Language.
- (6) General Science.
- (7) Fine Arts.
- (8) Home Economics (Domestic Economics) Cookery, Laundry and Account-keeping.
- (9) Manual Training.
- (10) Commercial Training.
- (11) Physical Training.
- (12) Military Training.
- (13) Civics and Hygiene.

The B. A. and B. Sc. Courses would be of four years' duration each, after the Matriculation. Each would be divided into two periods of two years each, the Intermediate and the B. A. or B. Sc. To both these, the principle of compartmental examinations would apply, i. e., the Intermediate would be a two years' course, but students would be allowed to appear in some subjects at the end of the first year and in the rest at the end of the second.

Similarly, students would have to sit for some subjects of the B. A. or B. Sc. course at the end of the 3rd year and for the rest at the end of the 4th year.

There would be no bifurcation into Arts and Science Courses immediately after the Matriculation. The Intermediate would be a combined Arts and Science Course with a variety of options to suit various aptitudes. It would also provide groups for eventual diversion to specialized courses, *e. g.*, Engineering, Medicine, Commerce, etc., (pages 46—47).

The subjects suggested for the Intermediate Examination, for purposes of grouping into compulsory and optional, are (pages 48) :—

- (1) English.
- (2) Modern Languages with emphasis on Literary history.
- (3) Classical Language.
- (4) World History, as the evolution of man and his civilisation.
- (5) Logic and Scientific Method.
- (6) Civics and Administration (with special reference to Sind).
- (7) Mathematics.
- (8) Economics with special reference to rural conditions in Sind and field work.
- (9) Geography of India, and Physical Geography with exploration and other field work in connection with Sind.
- (10) Fine Arts.
- (11) Commercial training.
- (12) Military Training—Compulsory for all.
- (13) Social Service.
- (14) Education.
- (15) Physics.
- (16) Chemistry, with emphasis on application to industry.
- (17) Biology, with emphasis on plant and animal life of Sind.

- (18) Science and Statistics.
- (19) Home Economics.
- (20) Mechanics.
- (21) Geology.

The B. A. Course would consist of English as a Compulsory subject, and any two out of the following list of subjects as optionals, one of which must be taken for Honours (pages 50) :—

- (1) English.
- (2) Modern Languages.
- (3) History of Democracies.
- (4) History of Empires.
- (5) History of India.
- (6) Politics.
- (7) Economics.
- (8) Philosophy.
- (9) Education.
- (10) Mathematics.
- (11) Classical Languages.
- (12) Music and Painting.
- (13) Home Economics.

The B. Sc. Course would consist of any two of the following subjects one of which must be taken for Honours (page 50) :—

- (1) Physics.
- (2) Industrial Chemistry.
- (3) Mathematics.
- (4) Geology.
- (5) Botony.
- (6) Zoology.
- (7) Microbiology.
- (8) Marine Biology.
- (9) Genetics.
- (10) Climatology.
- (11) Pharmaceutical Chemistry.

Gul Hayat Institute

The B. E. would be three years' course after the Intermediate and would comprise Civil, Mechanical Electrical, Marine and Aeronautical Engineering. There would be also Diploma Courses of a duration of two to three years after the Matriculation, in Navigation, Radio Engineering, Marine Engineering, Architecture, Automobile Engineering and Aeronautics in addition to those in Civil, Mechanical and Electrical Engineering (pages 51).

The LL. B. would be two years' course after the B. A. or B. Sc.; and the B. Sc. (Agriculture) will remain as it is now in the Bombay University. The subjects for the former are to be the same as now prescribed by the Bombay University. The subjects for the latter also would be the same with the addition of Dairying, Poultry, Agricultural Parasitology, Law of rural holdings, etc., (pages 52).

The B. T. would be one year course to be taken two years after the first degree examination (B. A. or B. Sc.) in subjects similar to those prescribed by the Bombay University (page 52).

There would be no M. A. Degree obtained by submitting an approved thesis. It would be awarded on the merit of work in a written examination in a number of papers in one subject. It would be open to candidates two years after graduation. The M. Sc. Degree would be obtainable either on the strength of an approved thesis or work shown in the written examination in any one of the subjects now prescribed by the Bombay University (pages 52).

The Regulations and Courses for the Ph. D. would be similar to those now in vogue in the Bombay University (page 52).

There would be in addition to the Degree Courses, a fairly extensive system of Diploma Courses open for those who do not wish or cannot afford to take the Degree Courses. Among the subjects for Diplomas would be :—

Zamindari, Veterinary, Science, Forestry, Diarying, Pharmacy, Public Health and Sanitation, Dentistry Archeology, Law for the Layman, Poultry, Horticulture, Surveying, Indian Medicine, Teaching, Nursing, Drawing, Music, Radio Engineering, etc., etc., (page 53).

The Sind University would permit affiliated Colleges to undertake training of candidates for the various competition examination (page 53).

Social Service would be made an integral part of the College Courses in the University (pages 54).

VI.—Examination and Teaching Standards.

(Term of Reference No. VIII.)

1. The Sind University will have a system of external examiners and the ratio of such examiners, *i. e.*, examiners drawn from other universities, would be 50 per cent. of the entire number (page 56).

2. It was also thought desirable to introduce such devices as the change of seat numbers of candidates on the answer books before they were despatched to examiners, and the periodic change of examiners (page 56—57).

3. The University would encourage tutorial work in its own and affiliated institutions.

4. It would encourage research work being done by the teachers.

5. It would institute frequent and close inspection of schools and colleges.

6. It would organize a carefully planned system of inter-collegiate lectures.

7. It would occasionally invite distinguished Professors and Experts to deliver courses of lectures in the different Colleges (page 57).

VII.—External Relations of the University.

(Term of Reference No. IX.)

1. It is essential that a large measure of autonomy should be secured to the new University. With the exception of the powers of the Chancellor already settled, and that the Director of Public Instruction and the Minister of Education and some other Government Officials would be ex-officio members of the University Senate and Syndicate, the Government should have little other control over the University. The Government may, however, have the power to conduct inquiry into University affairs under certain specified circumstances (pages 58—59).

2. While the Sind University will conduct its own Matriculation examination, it is desirable that a system of collaboration with the Education Department should be evolved by mutual good will to avoid possible divergencies of dual control in Secondary Education. Beyond this, no other control should be exercised by the Education Department in the councils and managements of the University (page 60).

3. The Sind University should try to strengthen its influence and control over Secondary Education by independent annual inspection of its own, conducted by its own officials (page 61).

VIII.—Site for the University.

(Term of Reference No. X.)

Among the sites considered *e., g.*, Burns Garden with Polo Grounds, Reclaimed Land opposite the Thole Produce Yard, Gizri Hill, Clifton, Land between Gizri and Clifton Roads, the Willingdon Farm, Land between Drigh Road and Malir (south of Railway Line) and Land near the Country Club on the northern side of the road leading from the Central Jail, the last was regarded as the best suited for a teaching-affiliating University as recommended for Sind.

An area of about 1,000 acres would be necessary for the purpose (page 63).

IX.—Inauguration and Development of the University.

(Term of Reference No. XI.)

1. The University would start functioning with the completion of the University buildings, namely, the Offices, Convocation Hall and Library, and at least one of the Sind Collegiate institutions with necessary residential arrangements (pages 63—64).

2. In case negotiations with the Sind Collegiate Board do not fructify, then, in addition to the completion of the University buildings referred to above, the building of one College having the Faculties of Arts and Science with the necessary hostel accommodation would have to be completed before the University starts functioning. In the meantime preliminaries would be undertaken in order to enable the University to function at the proper time (page 64—65).

3. In addition to the existing Faculties, the University should establish within a reasonable time all the remaining Faculties, each of the Faculties being established at an interval of not less than two years (page 65).

X.—Finance.

(Term of Reference No. XII.)

1. In case the Sind Collegiate institutions are taken over by the University and shifted to the Country Club Site, the financial estimates would be as under :—

(a) The cost of building and equipping the four Colleges, the Hostel, the University Offices, the Convocation Hall, the Library, the Research Department, the Gymkhana, Residential accommodation for the staff, the Vice-Chancellor and the Registrar, etc., on the selected site would be a little over Rs. 42,00,000 spread over about 6 years, less value of the properties of the Sind Collegiate Board (pages 65—68).

(b) The recurring expenditure would be annually about Rs. 2,27,000, and recurring income about Rs. 1,28,000 involving an annual deficit of Rs. 99,000 (pages 70—71).

(c) The above deficit would have to be made good by the Government of Sind (page 71). This would be in addition to the grants now being given by the Government to the Sind Collegiate Board.

2. In case the University starts its own College of Arts and Science instead of taking over the Sind Collegiate institutions, the financial estimates would be as under :—

(a) The cost of building and equipping the Arts and Science College with Hostels, the Convocation Hall, the Library, the Research Departments, etc., would be a little less than Rs. 13,00,000 (page 70).

(b) The recurring expenditure would be annually about Rs. 2,07,000, and the annual income of Rs. 1,28,000, leaving a deficit of Rs. 79,000 (page 71).

(c) The deficit would have to be made good by the Government of Sind (page 72).

XI.—Miscellaneous.

(Term of Reference No. XIII.)

Recommendations have also been made on the following miscellaneous subjects.—

- (i) Adult Education and Extension Courses (page 73).
- (ii) Physical Education (page 74).
- (iii) Social Life in Colleges (pages 74—75).
- (iv) Territorial limits of the University (page 75).
- (v) Residence of Students (page 75).
- (vi) Separate Colleges for Women (page 75).
- (vii) Conferring of Honorary Degrees and Fellowships (page 75).
- (viii) University Publication Bureau (page 76).
- (ix) Correspondence Courses (page 76).
- (x) Inter-University exchange of Professors (page 76).
- (xi) Indiscipline in Colleges (page 76).
- (xii) University Employment Bureau (page 76).

22nd December 1941.

*(Sd.) MIRAN MAHOMED SHAH,
Chairman.

*(Sd.) RUPCHAND BILARAM,

*(Sd.) U. M. DAUDPOTA,

*(Sd.) S. B. JUNNARKER,

*(Sd.) T. J. MIRCHANDANI,

*(Sd.) JETHMAL PARSRAM GUL-
RAJANI,

*(Sd.) I. I. KAZI,

*(Sd.) B. J. VASWANI.

All the remaining members, who were absent at the last meeting, authorized the Honourable Chairman to take their signatures to the Report for granted.

*Subject to a minute of dissent.

(i) Joint Minute of Dissent (with addenda).

We regret we are in complete disagreement with some of the majority recommendations of the Committee; and this disagreement is on issues of such fundamental character that we are compelled to append a minute of dissent to the Report.

We feel that, on the whole, the scheme offered by the majority decisions in the Committee needs to be altered considerably before it will truly serve the needs of the province in university education. In our detailed dissent given below, we have confined ourselves only to the more important terms of reference.

1. *Term of Reference No. IV. (Type of University).*
We are convinced that the examining-affiliating type of university such as Bombay, Calcutta, Madras and the Punjab were in their entirety for over half a century, and such as they still predominantly are, is the only type of University suited to the requirements of India, and therefore in a greater measure to those of Sind. The cry of "teaching university" that has been raised all over India after the publication of the Calcutta Commission Report reveals existence of bankruptcy of educational thought which needs to be exposed in all its nakedness before the country will settle down to the standards of sober simplicity which have characterized the genius of Indian civilisation throughout the ages. In the diffusion of higher education, India has still a great leeway to make as the figures given below will make clear beyond a shadow of doubt:—

The proportion of students in the universities to the entire population in Germany is 1 to 690, in Great Britain 1 to 455, in the United States 1 to 125, while in India it is still not more than 1 to 3,000.

This being the state of higher education in the country, it is simply suicidal to talk of "teaching universities" as the last word in educational reform in the country. A teaching university in the sense in which it is understood by its advocates, is by its very nature a local university, and can serve only

a small area even in a small province. If we insist upon teaching universities as the ideal for India, every province will either have to be contented with one or two such universities, and thus make it impossible for large numbers of its young men and women to receive higher education, or turn every college into a university. How staggering, and out of all proportion to the resources of the country, will be the finance of university education in India in the latter case may be judged from the following figures :—

The number of universities in Canada is 13 for a population of $8\frac{1}{2}$ millions.

The number of universities in Australia is 6 for a population of $5\frac{1}{2}$ millions.

The number of universities in South Africa is 4 for a population of $1\frac{1}{2}$ millions.

If we take South Africa as the ultimate consummation of expansionist schemes, India will need 1,500 universities in course of time, and even Sind will need 10 universities. And if a teaching university is to have direct teaching arrangements for all the faculties, each university will cost nearly one crore of rupees. India will then need 1,500 crores of rupees as non-recurring investment, and nearly 15 crores as annual recurring expenditure on university education alone. Sind, on this basis, will need 10 crores intitially and 10 lakhs annually. This is extravagance run amok, and our educationists continue to repeat the faddist slogans of Sadler as articles of faith long after the ideal has been discredited even in the West. Lord Haldane who was the most powerful advocate of a teaching, unitary and residential type of university, is himself a standing example of disillusionment. In the Royal Commission on University Education, of which he was the distinguished Chairman, he came to the conclusion that examining affiliating universities are still indispensable even in the comparatively rich countries of the West. How infinitely greater is their desirability in a poor country like India where millions of boys and girls still go without even a semblance of university education can be judged. The teaching university is the veritable "pot-bellied Falstaff" of educational finance in India, and this demon

(3) All the examining-affiliating universities of India are mainly teaching universities already. They do their teaching function through the agency of the affiliated institutions, and if the regulations regarding the affiliation are so designed as to cover such matters as the appointment of adequate and adequately qualified teaching staff, and insistence on tutorial system and organisation of social life in the colleges, almost all the advantages of a teaching university can be secured to the examining universities, and they would be able to educate ten times the number that the teaching universities will be ever able to do.

(2) The examining-affiliating universities of India are still doing much better work than some of the so-called teaching universities of India. Calcutta has outstripped them all in research work, and Punjab is certainly superior to Delhi. In fact, it is a fantastic idea that the teaching university necessarily does better work than some of the colleges affiliated to the examining universities. Madras Christian College, Bombay St. Xavier's College, and many more are doing in fact better work than the teaching universities of Lucknow, Annamalai, and Delhi. Higher education in Ceylon is guided by the far away British Universities which are nothing better than examining universities with reference to Ceylon, and still successful higher education is being imparted to thousands of young men in that island.

(1) Throughout the world, not excluding the British Isles, there still exist examining universities which are doing excellent work. The London University is the most outstanding example of this type in Ireland, South Africa, Australia, New Zealand and America.

which has possessed the mind of Indian University men needs to be exorcised ruthlessly and immediately to restore the soul of India to its characteristic equilibrium. If there were any further justification needed for continued existence and popularisation of examining-affiliating universities in India, it is afforded by the following facts and considerations:—

2. *Term of Reference No. V. (Constitution).*—We feel there is not much justification for an Academic Council for a small university like that of Sind. The Bombay University did very well without it for nearly seventy years, so did Madras and Calcutta. And after its introduction as an additional authority in the Indian universities, things have not improved in any way. Numerous bodies with overlapping and inadequately demarcated functions have acted as clogs in the wheels of educational machinery and made several universities hot-beds of party intrigue and power politics, apart from the dilatory procedures that they have introduced in the disposal of business. Sind will do well to adopt a simple constitution, and not go in for the glitter of grand names. We would urge the abolition of this body altogether, and the apportionment of its functions among the Senate, the Faculties and the Boards of Studies as has been successfully done in the

The only serious defect of the examining-affiliating universities in India has been their neglect of research, and this is being attended to it with brilliant results in Bombay, Calcutta and the Punjab. There is no reason why Sind, a deficit province needing a larger number of highly educated men, should follow the will-o-the-wisp of teaching universities and land herself into the quick-sands of educational necromancy. We are convinced that the financial condition of the province, the general poverty of the people, and the demands of democracy cannot permit the creation of such costly and aristocratic institutions, and the only connotation of our recommendations on the subject of the type of the universities is that it should be mainly affiliating, and for the rest should introduce small teaching departments for research. Even as an examining university in the main, our own university will be a powerful Centre for new enthusiasms for all the colleges, and could improve education substantially over the province by better curricula, by inter-collegiate lectures and numerous other programmes which are denied to Sind at present owing to our great distance from Bombay. Moreover, research conducted by the Sind University will aid materially in the revival of Sind culture which has been neglected so long, as well as the industrial advancement of the province.

Travancore and Osmania Universities, and as has been recommended for the new universities of Assam and Orissa.

3. *Term of Reference No. XI (Inauguration and development).*—We are afraid the whole series of recommendations of the Committee on this subject seem to be in the nature of a well-designed system of checks and impediments against an early inauguration of a separate university for the province. While the essential need of the province is an immediate separation from the University of Bombay, the recommendations of the Committee make the inauguration of the Sind University dependent on the fulfilment of such conditions as will put it off to the Greek Kalends. The recommendations attempt to bring in by the back door, a predominantly teaching university, which, by one step more, would be turned into a unitary and residential one, which the Committee definitely rejected. Our recommendations on the type of University, while they do not debar the Sind University from starting its own colleges in any faculty, do not make it obligatory on it to do so as a condition precedent to its functioning, as the recommendations of the majority on this term of reference attempt to do. The history of every university in India has been the history of gradual growth from modest beginnings, and why the inauguration of the University of Sind should be hedged round with unwarranted conditions is hard to understand. We need a separate university immediately if we must have cultural autonomy, and not continue to allow a far away province which is no longer interested in the problems of our province to guide our destiny in such a vital subject as education. We have hardly any voice in the councils of the Bombay University, and the Bombay University cannot do anything to serve the special interests of Sind. Our secondary education needs reorganisation, but without a university of our own to recognise the new courses and practices, it is impossible for us to make any move in this direction. Research departments started by the University of Bombay are either inaccessible to the Sindhi student or are in subjects which have very little bearing on the needs of Sind. Our province has a wide and virgin field of research which has not been undertaken and will never be undertaken by the Bombay University, and the province needs for its economic as well

as intellectual and spiritual regeneration an immediate investigation of these problems. It is only our own university which can do it, and the earlier it begins to function the better. Sind, moreover, owing to its continued subordination to Bombay, has no place or status in all-India organisations for university education. It is merely a dependency or a department of the University of Bombay, which is hardly an enviable position for an autonomous province. These, and a score of other considerations make it imperative that Sind should have a university of its own immediately ; and yet the majority recommendations of the Committee under this term of reference will have no other effect but that of indefinitely delaying the inauguration of the university. We would suggest the following scheme of inauguration and development for the University of Sind :—

(a) The Government should consider the Report along with minutes of dissent immediately, and arrive at a decision of its own by end of March 1942.

(b) A University Bill should be introduced by the end of June 1942, and be passed into an Act by end of September.

(c) A Provisional Committee appointed under the Act should, thereafter, attend to all the spade work for the inauguration of the university by February 1943 when the Provisional Committee would dissolve itself and the Senate, Syndicate and other bodies would begin to function.

(d) By April 1943, the university should draw up in detail all the curricula for the various examinations along with necessary regulations for circulation among high schools and colleges, so that from 1944 new courses and regulations would come into operation all over Sind, and the first examinations would be held by the Sind University, some in 1945 and the rest in 1946.

(e) In the meanwhile *i. e.* between 1943 and 1946, the University Library and Research Departments would be built up, as also independent University Offices.

4. *Term of Reference No. X (Site).*—In view of the plan of inauguration and development suggested in the

previous paragraph, we would prefer the Burns garden and Polo grounds as a suitable site for the University, if they could be obtained. In case a donor is found for University Arts and Science College, the better place would be the vast spaces between the Gizree and Clifton roads on the east of the Clifton Road or near the Clifton Jail. If Drigh Road continues to be developed as a central headquarter for the military, large spaces and buildings occupied by the Baluchi Regiment near Parsi Colony, may become available, and any one of these sites would be very advantageous.

5. *Term of Reference No. XII (Finance).*—The financial estimates, under two alternative schemes, as framed by the Committee follow as a corollary from the recommendations on the term of Reference No. XI. We have already in section 4 of our note of dissent, disputed the soundness or desirability of these recommendations, and are, therefore, bound to reject both the financial estimates. The first scheme is definitely designed to turn the Sind University into a teaching, unitary and residential university which the Committee has definitely rejected. Provision of buildings on the basis of 1,000 students each for the Arts and Science Colleges *i. e.* a number even greater than it is at present, provision of residence for one thousand students and fifty teachers, a Convocation Hall to accommodate two thousands—all are definite justification of our contention that the Committee has tried to stage a recantation of its recommendations on Term of reference No. IV and its true connotation. Since, according to us, both the financial estimates are *ultra vires*, we need not go into a detailed criticism of each item in them. We will only say that the finance in both schemes is so inflated that it will be like putting a mill-stone round the neck of the infant university even before it has begun to toddle on the highroad of new education. We are giving below a financial estimate based on the Committee's recommendation on the Term of Reference No. IV in the only interpretation which it originally bore *i. e.* the Sind University will be an affiliating university in the main and a teaching university only in some research departments:—

I.—Capital Expenditure.

(1) University Offices

Rs.

50,000

	Rs.
(2) Library	1,00,000
(3) Research Departments	1,50,000
(4) Convocation Hall	1,00,000
(5) Unremunerative expense for the first three years when there will be no income	1,50,000
Total ..	5,50,000

i. e. a total of less than Rs. 6 lakhs spread over a period of 3 years.

II.—Annual Expenditure (from the fourth year).

	Rs.
(1) Vice-Chancellor (for 3 years only)	18,000
(2) Registrar	6,000
(3) Registrar's Office	16,000
(4) Sindology	7,500
(5) Applied Sciences	16,000
(6) Library	5,000
(7) Physical Education	5,000
(8) University Publications and Grants	5,000
(9) Travelling Allowances	10,000
(10) Examination Charges	40,000
(11) Contingencies	3,000
(12) Repairs, etc.	5,000
(13) Provident Fund	3,000
(14) Miscellaneous	5,000
Total ..	1,44,500

Gul Hayat Institute

III.—Recurring Income.

(1) Tuition Fees from Postgraduate students in Sindology and Applied Sciences	5,500
(2) Examination Fees	1,13,000
(3) Fees for supplying marks, etc. ..	2,000

(4) Fees from recognised High Schools	..	7%
(5) Fees for conferring degrees	..	3.7%
(6) Fees for registration of graduates	..	1.7%
(7) Sale-proceeds of University Papers and etc.	..	1.0%
(8) Miscellaneous	..	1.0%
Total	..	1,28,450

Deficit would be about Rs. 16,000 per year.

N. B.—We would suggest addition to the income of the University by the organisation of a publishing department and the opening of a University College of Commerce. This College would be able to combine with itself also the Employment Bureau and along with the publishing department is likely to bring at least Rs. 5,000 annually to the coffers of the University. This will reduce the deficit to Rs. 11,000, and if after the first period of three years, the University is able to do without a high salaried Vice-Chancellor, it would save another Rs. 18,000 annually, thus making the University self-supporting. We may point out that the Orissa University Committee has recommended a scheme which would involve the Government in an additional expense of only Rs. 17,000 per year.

MIRAN MOHAMMED SHAH,
I. I. KAZI,
U. M. DAUDPOTA,
B. J. VASWANI,
JETHMAL PARSRAM,
HATIM A. ALAVI.

Addendum I by Shams-ul-ulema Dr. U. M. Daupota.

The following points require very serious consideration :—

1. *Appointment of the Vice-Chancellor.*—I am strongly of opinion that the Vice-Chancellor should be nominated by the Chancellor and that he should be honorary.

2. *Composition of the Senate.*—The educationally backward minority community of Sind has not been given adequate representation. While not disagreeing to the assignment of *four* seats to the Borough Municipalities in spite of their restricted jurisdictions, I strongly feel that the District Local Boards, on account of the vastness of their jurisdictions and their importance, ought to have at least 8 members on the Senate. Besides, the Senate is overweighted with Principals and Professors of Colleges. The Principals of the Arts Colleges, therefore, should not be ex-officio members, but should form a separate constituency of their own just to elect one representative from amongst themselves. The number of seats assigned to 'University Teachers' seems to be too large and should be reduced to *five* only. I do not consider it necessary to give any representation to the Zamin-dar and Hari Associations, as such associations are not represented in any University in India.

3. *Control of the Matriculation.*—While the Matriculation Examination should be conducted under the auspices of the University by a Board consisting of members of the University and the Education Department, the University should have no control over the High Schools, except in so far as the enforcement of the Matriculation Syllabus is concerned. The high schools should be recognised by the Department alone and not by the University.

4. *Position of the Local Colleges.*—The local colleges should not be the constituent colleges of the University, but should simply be affiliated to it,

as the other Sind Colleges will be. Beyond that they should not have any dominating voice in the governance of the University. It is not essentially for the University to have an Arts College of its own at the very outset as insisted on by the Majority Report.

21st December 1941.

U. M. DAUDPOTA,

Addendum II by Mr. I. I. Kazi.

The principle that every University must to a great extent cater for its 'local needs' as well, has been accepted by the majority throughout the report. But as the Committee, by its very constitution, represented one school of thought, one interest and one institution, no other interest, however legitimate or however large and no other thought however sound, had the slightest chance of either presentation or prevalence.

So much so, that there was no occasion even to discuss the theoretical side of the question such as history and aims of education, with any kind of freedom or purpose. As is usual in these times, even History and Philosophy make way before the parochial conceits. It is therefore that I dissociate myself with the conclusions arrived at in Chapter III of the report.

Nor was there any orientation possible in the circumstances as no new view-point detrimental to this interest, had even a possibility of a fair hearing. That accounts for my absence at most of the meetings.

There was so much tantalization over the issues, that I kept on hanging, only in the hope, that better councils might prevail. But the door was closed on the affair with a thud.

No one realizes more than I do, that I should have resigned long long before the Committee brought its task to this conclusion.

Far be it from me, however, to find fault with the majority. The majority is blameless. It has been con-

sistent throughout. The fault *ab initio* lay with the nomination of the Committee. It was anything but representative of provincial educational interests.

I. I. KAZI.

Addendum No. III (Mr. Jethmal Parsram.)

While I endorse that Sind requires, a separate University and am also glad that some forward and necessary ideas have been accepted, I differ fundamentally in certain marked aspects as follows :—

(1) *Aim of the University.*—In the words of the report I advocated the aim of the University to serve the entire population of the Sind region by a mass diffusion of knowledge. This has not been accepted. The mentality behind the report is that of catering for the select youths of select classes.

I advocate the starting of a Peoples' University not one that provides for only select classes, my main basis being that the inauguration of provincial autonomy in India has the fundamental principle of serving the entire population, and not a particular class. Sind having been separated from Bombay, it follows truly that it must have, a separate University of its own but the same will fail in its purpose if it does not take up the charge of educating the entire population of Sind. For such a purpose it is essential to give the first place to the Sindhi Language through the medium of which education should generally be imparted. Without this the University cannot claim or hope to be Peoples' University. Very valuable evidence was given in support of this view of mine, but the report has completely ignored this altogether.

It is a matter known to every teacher that students in the Colleges do not follow the lectures on subjects as history, administration, economics, philosophy and science in English.

Therefore it is that even in Calcutta and Benares Universities, the vernacular is being used in college classes upto Intermediate and in the Usmania University in all

classes and all subjects. Experiment or experience have proved the value of this procedure.

(2) *Constitution*.—I differ from the report, fundamentally with regard to the very basis of their constitution. I take my stand here too on the fact of Provincial Autonomy conferred on the people of the province by the Act of 1935, the main characteristic of which was the utter elimination of the official and nominated block from the Legislatures in the Provinces. This principle also has been applied to the Local Bodies. I hold the same must be worked out in the University which is being started. Without accepting the principle of autonomy in the University, the whole of its working is bound to be vitiated, and all the blindness of the past will be repeated, with all the complications involved. I, therefore, dissent from the following conclusions arrived at by the experts in this direction :—

(a) *Governor as Chancellor*.—To accept the Governor of the Province as Chancellor, the University now is to deny the right of democracy and get back into the noose of imperialism. The Head of the Sind Government is not the Governor, but the Premier; it would be something to confer the job of the Chancellor on the Premier but I prefer that the Chancellor should be the one elected by the Senate. It should be noted that even in the West on which is based our slavish model, the Chancellors of the British Universities are not Government Officials, but men of the people.

(b) *Power of Nomination*.—The report recommends :—

“The Chancellor shall have the power of nominating a fixed number of Fellows to the Senate”.

This number is fixed at 10. I thoroughly dissent from this. Add to this the fact that there will also be an equal number in the official block of Directors of various Government Departments, last but not the least, add again to this the power given to the Governor to appoint a Vice-Chancellor from a panel of 3 names submitted to him, all this means that the Governor

will be the virtual ruler of the University, for naturally the paid Vice-Chancellor who again is the Chief Administrator and guide of the University, being his appointee, cannot at the same moment bind himself to the lead of the Senate.

The report all through in this direction suffers from the complex of inferiority, lack of clear thinking, and bold assertion of rights. Strange enough it shelters itself under the same argument, hitherto given by the British beaurocracy, as for instance the report has it,

"We hope the power of nomination still allowed would be used for adjusting any inequalities of representation which the election might reveal from time to time."

The weakness of this argument again is that the power given to an autonomous legislature to frame the constitution of the University is virtually taken away from it and also the Senate in a direct and contradicting form.

I am of opinion that this power of the Governor instead of adjusting inequalities will create them.

To my mind the majority group among the members of the Committee were looking at this matter from a sectional if not an altogether communal point of views, and both of its wings were each contemplating a favourable prospect of support from the Governor as Chancellor for its section. Manifestly the harmonious and progressive prospects of the University are according to me more than compromised. Instead of settling up our difference now or leaving them for settlement after experiment and experience, we have left our fate to be determined by the third party. My mind is not all free from trouble and doubt owing to my bitter experience of late in certain directions, but I believe in facing and settling situations, not evading them in dubious and incorrect ways.

(c) *Type of the University*.—I have agreed to the unanimously arrived at conclusion that the type of the University be "Teaching and Affiliating" but I demur to many suggestions and steps advocated in the report.

I do not agree that the starting of the University must be delayed till the University has either taken over the present 4 Colleges in Karachi or the University Graduate Board or has started Arts and Science Colleges of its own.

I am not against the University having Colleges of its own, but at the present moment, they are not a necessity, as already there are 7 well established colleges in Sind. If the University takes over the four Colleges at Karachi, the teachers will be the very same, and some of them are highly salaried ones with experience of many years, Doctors and others of repute and merit, well-known in the Presidency. No new addition to their staff will be essentially required. In any case the standard of teaching will not be different from what it is today. If in the alternative the University started new Colleges, it would engage new teachers not excluding those who would try to leave the existing Colleges and seek appointment in the new Colleges. In either way, it is beyond me to understand how the standard of teaching will be higher than the existing one in the present Colleges in Sind.

This whole thing appears to me to be whimsical. I cannot help saying here that the majority which came to these decisions consisted mainly of the staff of the Karachi Colleges who couldn't help themselves to be guided by the President of their Board who too was a member of the University Committee. The attendance at the University Committee meetings was generally 50 per cent. of the total number and the majority in these consisted of Karachi College Professors, where dominant concern seemed to be the expansion of the Karachi citadel or nest as humorously put in by Dr. Wrench. Their attitude I think was natural but it also served as a deterrent to an impartial decision. This is proved by their very absurd

proposal of Government contribution of 42 lakhs of rupees for starting the University. Diwan Rupchand Bilaram who is mainly responsible for this scheme, did say that about 30 lakhs would be realisable from the sales of the present buildings, etc. of the Colleges, but he was also of opinion that Government must not sell these, but maintain them for further development of the University.

How on earth is Sind Government going to find out over 42 lakhs net, I am not able to see. I am not against the University taking over the present Colleges, but according to me the College Group have spoiled their own case by such exorbitant demands.

As regards the alternative scheme of over 12 lacs, the primary condition of Government starting their own Colleges is its deterrent weakness. I have argued this point beforehand; it only requires to add, that starting of new colleges at Karachi, will positively be considered as obstacle to the progress of the existing Colleges. It is not improbable that any of the Colleges outside Karachi, will be available to satisfy this condition if insisted on. My view is that the proposals of the Sind College group cut both ways and against each other, and thus make the starting of a University very difficult. I, therefore, suggest that the University should not for the time being start any Arts and Science Colleges, but have post-graduate teaching departments in Agriculture, Sindology, Marine Biology, Aeronautics, Genetics (as suggested by Sir C. V. Raman), Industries, Health, etc. These will serve as a solid basis for a right teaching University. For bettering the standard of teaching in the present Colleges I suggest that a Joint Association of all the Professors in all the Colleges in Sind be formed, that courses of study first of the science and art be framed for the Professors.

For teaching in school every teacher is required to get through a course of teaching, even then more than 50 per cent. are not a success, but strange enough in the colleges a fresh graduate is appointed straight away to take charge of teaching a college class. I have experience both of schools and colleges, and

I therefore do not hesitate to state that 75 per cent of the teachers in the colleges are a little responsible for the growing line among the College youths.

Along with these courses in teaching, highly advanced courses in the subject in which teachers have taken their degrees be framed for their private study and a regular plan for teachers to take to research and writing the short their association may be turned into a Provincial Training College. Even if the University is not an examining one, it always has the framing of syllabuses in its own hand; this means what to teach is already there; by my suggestion the teaching will be a better one. If the University is free from the above mentioned complications, it will be an assured income of over a lac and four rupees accruing from examinations; the financial foundation being laid, a solid structure will be gradually and steadily erected.

3. *Site.*—I don't approve of the Country Club. I advocate the Clifton and Bath Islands site. I approve the above suggestion which I gave to the Committee in its very first meeting.

(ii) **Minute of dissent by Mr. Rupchand Bilaram.**

The Honourable Chairman and the Secretary of the Committee deserve our congratulations on this excellent and lucid report.

2. I agree with the view taken in the report that the proposed University of Sind should be both a teaching and affiliating University and that as a teaching University should be established near Karachi.

3. In the report two suggestions have been made with regard to the teaching part of the University. The first suggestion is, that the existing colleges which are under the control of the Sind Collegiate Board should be taken over by the University and removed to a place near the Country Club and expanded by providing, *inter alia*, post-graduate

studies in Sindology and Applied Sciences. It is said in the report that this suggestion would involve the University in a non-recurring expenditure of Rs. 42,59,000 and an annual recurring expenditure of Rs. 2,26,840 less Rs. 1,28,000 estimated income, or in other words a net deficit of Rs. 99,000. This sum will be required in addition to the existing grants which are given annually to the Sind Collegiate Board.

The alternative suggestion is that if the first suggestion does not materialize then the University of Sind should establish its own colleges for teaching Arts and Science and provide for post-graduate studies in Sindology and Applied Sciences. These colleges, it is suggested, should be situated in the same locality and their establishment should be made a condition precedent to the coming into existence of the University of Sind. This alternative scheme, it is said, would entail a non-recurring expenditure of Rs. 12,75,000 and an annual recurring expenditure of Rs. 2,06,840 less Rs. 1,28,000 estimated income, or Rs. 79,000 as deficit.

4. If the first suggestion materializes and the Sind Government is prepared to foot the bill, I am in favour of the University of Sind coming into existence. The only exception I have to this scheme is with regard to the selection of the site. I would wish the selected site to be as far from the city as possible. I have suggested Malir but I would even prefer Landhi where land would perhaps be available free of any cost to Government.

5. It is rather unfortunate that no serious attempt has so far been made to find out from the Sind Collegiate Board the terms on which the Board would be prepared to transfer the control of the existing colleges. The letter from the Honourable Chairman inquiring about the terms, addressed to me in my capacity as the President of the Sind Collegiate Board is dated the 17th instant, and it is not possible for me to consult the Board or the different parties interested in this subject during the course of four days.

6. The proposed constitution of the University of Sind, should, in my opinion, be fixed only after the terms on which the Sind Collegiate Board is prepared to transfer the colleges are known. The pioneers and their representatives who have brought the colleges into existence and have

developed them during the last 60 years, the philanthropists who have contributed to the funds of the colleges and have vested rights in the management of the colleges would not have representation on the Senate and also to a certain extent on the Syndicate. To frame a constitution before the terms for the transfer of the colleges are settled is, in my humble opinion, putting the cart before the horse.

7. If the first suggestion does not materialize, I am afraid I cannot agree to the second suggestion being given effect to. It will be a sad mistake to duplicate colleges of Science and Arts in the same locality. If this is done it will considerably affect the revenues not only of the existing institutions but also of the new colleges. This means, that on the one hand, much larger grants will be required by the existing colleges to enable them to function properly, and on the other, the net extra expenditure required by the new colleges would be far in excess of that shown in the estimate. Not only that, but the continuance of the existing colleges in the present locality will affect seriously the education and discipline of students. In this connection I beg to invite attention to the answers given by me to the questionnaire issued by the University Committee.

If provision is to be made for post graduate studies in Sindology and Applied Sciences and if that is the main reason for having a separate University there should be no serious obstacle to such studies being entrusted to the Sind Collegiate Board on payment to the Board of adequate grants both non-recurring and recurring.

8. As stated by me in my answers to the questionnaire, there can be no dispute that Sind should have its own teaching University provided finances are available.

Money is required not only for the proposed University of Sind but for other equally if not more important objects.

Two suggestions are now pending before the Government of Sind ; (i) the establishment of a Technical Institute, and (ii) the establishment of a Women's College. The establishment of both these institutions would mean money. There can be no doubt that in a province where female education amongst the majority community is in the back-

ground due to the pardah system, and where practically no industries exist, the establishment of a women's college and a technical institute are wants which must be attended to before the establishment of a University.

The establishment of a Medical College in Sind has also been agitating the minds of the public. It is for the Government of Sind to decide if money should not be spent on all these objects before it is sunk in University buildings.

If the Government of Sind cannot spare all the money which may be required for all these objects, the proper thing to do is, in my humble opinion, to proceed slowly on the lines indicated by me in my answers.

For easy reference a copy of my answers to this Questionnaire is being attached.

9. One more point which I wish to mention is that the figures of both non-recurring and recurring expenditure required whether the first or the second suggestion made in the report is given effect to, do not, I am afraid, give a proper idea of the approximate amounts so required. I have no doubt that before any of the two suggestions are given effect to, the Finance Department of Government will go into the figures and in doing so will take into consideration, *inter alia*, the following points :—

(a) If the existing colleges are removed to the proposed site, what hostel accommodation should be provided for students. The number of students at present receiving education in all the colleges of Karachi is over 2,000. This number is likely to increase in the near future. As the colleges are located at a distance of seven or eight miles or even more from the town proper, should not accommodation be provided for all students coming from outside Karachi and if so, what should be the approximate cost of such accommodation?

(b) The cost of material and labour is going up and it is not likely that this cost will go down for several years after the war comes to an end. What provision, should therefore, be made for the cost of the proposed buildings, furniture, fittings, etc.

(c) Whether the estimated expenditure and income have been properly calculated. Under both the schemes the estimated income is shown as Rs. 1,28,000. It is hardly likely that the estimated income of the rival colleges would be the same as that which has been estimated as extra income of the transferred colleges.

RUPCHAND BILLARAM.

(iii) Minute of dissent by Principal S. B. Junnarker.

I accept the report with its recommendations on each term of reference. I have, however, only one suggestion to offer. Should the transfer of the Karachi Colleges under the management of the Sind Collegiate Board to the proposed Teaching-Affiliating University of Sind, not materialise for any reasons, the Committee recommends that the University should start its own Arts and Science Colleges. In the financial statement for this alternative scheme, Rs. 650,000 have been provided against this item. Instead of spending this sum on the duplication of Arts & Science Colleges, I suggest that it be utilised for establishing a Technical Institute. The main object of the Committee that the University should provide under graduate teaching besides the proposed post-graduate departments, will, in my opinion be more effectively served, if my suggestion is accepted.

S. B. JUNNARKER.

(iv) Minute of dissent by Dr. T. J. Mirchandani.

I agree with the recommendations of the Committee except as modified by the following note.

Reference Numbers 4, 11 and 12.—For the purpose of the this note, I have grouped these terms of reference together.

The type of University for Sind must necessarily be a Teaching University, located at one centre *i. e.*, Karachi, with the provision to establish or recognise other teaching centres at places away from Karachi and where special facilities for that type of work exist *e.g.*, Sakrand for Irrigational Agriculture and rural economics, or Manora for

naval Engineering etc. The University will also have the power to affiliate other colleges but I consider it desirable that certain powers of management of these colleges be vested with the University. The very object, for which the University is being established in Sind viz., the proper growth of higher education in the province, will be defeated if any compromise is made on this vital issue of the University being essentially a teaching one. This recommendation presupposes that University should have its own colleges for teaching under-graduate and post-graduate courses. Though the Committee have submitted alternative proposals, namely, the taking over of Sind Collegiate Board colleges or the establishment of new colleges by the University, I attach greater importance to the utilization of existing colleges at Karachi to form the nucleus of a teaching University. I personally see no difficulty in achieving this, if the following conditions are conceded to :—

- (1) That the names of colleges and other buildings shall be retained.
- (2) That suitable representation be given to the vested interests on the University Bodies.

I do not consider essential that the Collegiate Board should insist upon any financial adjustment regarding the buildings of existing colleges. It is inherent in our recommendations that these colleges must necessarily be shifted to the new site selected for the University i.e., area near Country Club. On this site, suitable buildings, with sufficient space for other activities and expansion, will be provided according to the University requirements. It has been recognized that the present site of colleges is too congested and that full college life cannot be developed under the existing conditions. I therefore propose the following time table consequent upon the acceptance of principle of existing colleges being taken over by the University.

1st & 2nd year.	.. Shifting of the Arts College and the construction of necessary buildings for the University on the new site at the cost of Rs. 9,50,000. (Appendix A.)
-----------------	---

3rd & 4th year

Shifting of Engineering College on the new site and establishment of three new Faculties at the cost of Rs. 9,00,000. (Appendix B.)

5th & 6th year

... Shifting of Science College on the new site and establishment of one new Faculty at the cost of Rs. 9,00,000. (Appendix C.)

7th & 8th year.

... Establishment of two new Faculties and completion of equipment of existing Faculties at the cost of Rs. 8,50,000. (Appendix D.)

Total for 8 years ... Rs. 36,00,000.

Average for each year ... Rs. 4,50,000.

Regarding the recurring expenditure, my proposals are as under

That the University offices be established in the second year with the appointment of the Registrar for full year and the Vice-Chancellor may also be appointed towards the latter part of the year. For this, provision of Rupees 50,000 in the second year will be required. It may be pointed out that the University at this stage, will have no income of its own.

The University shall start to function fully from the beginning of the third year of the above Time Table. From this time onward, the Government should give recurring grant of one lakh of rupees to the University in addition to the grants now made by them to the existing colleges. This sum along with the income will be required to run the University and feed the new Faculties.

The time table given herein shows that at the end of eight years, Sind will have a full fledged University, with Faculties of Arts, pure and applied Sciences, Engineering (several branches), Aeronautics, Marine Biology, and

Culture or Sindology, Teachers Training and Commercial colleges. There will also be a provision for residence of about 500 students and some members of the teaching staff. The total non-recurring expenditure involved is about Rs. 36,00,000 extended over eight years *i. e.*, Rs. 4,50,000 per year. The Government will get the property of the Sind Collegiate Board, *i. e.*, buildings, grounds etc., worth only a little less than this amount.

I have made no mention regarding Faculty of Medicine as this matter is already pending with the Government and as soon as this college is established, its management may be handed over to the University. The Agricultural College, Sakrand, should be the University teaching centre for Irrigational Agriculture and Rural Economics, undergraduate and post-graduate. I do not propose that the Law college should be shifted to the new site yet.

Term of Reference No. 5.—I am not in favour of having so many University Bodies as proposed by the Committee. In addition to the Research Council and Library Board, the University Bodies should be to start with :—

- (a) Court or Senate.
- (b) Governing Body or Syndicate.
- (c) Boards of Studies.

and I propose that the representation in the Court and Governing Body should be as follows.—

Court :—The total number of members should be 60 and be divided as follows :—

- | | | |
|---|----|---|
| (1) The Chancellor; The Vice-Chancellor ; The Minister of Education ; The Chief Judge ; The Chief Engineer, Public Works Department ; The Director of Public Health and Medicine ; The Director of Public Instructions ; The Director of Agriculture; The Director of Industries. | .. | 9 |
| (2) Nominated by Chancellor | .. | 5 |

(3) Heads of University Departments	
(4) All the heads of existing colleges in Sind	4
(5) From College Teachers.	7
(6) From head-masters of schools (one of whom shall be the head of a Girls' High School).	10
(7) From Registered Graduates	16
(8) From the Legislative Assembly	3
(9) Commercial Bodies	2
(10) Donors, etc.	5
	<hr/> 60 <hr/>

The Sind Collegiate Board representation will be included under 4 and 10.

Note.—A donor is already defined in the body of the report of the Committee.

I am not in favour of representation being given to Municipalities or Local Boards unless they become donors.

Governing Body.—The Governing Body or Syndicate should consist of 15 members only as follows:—

Vice-Chancellor ; The Director of Public Instruction; eight members elected by the Court from groups 3, 4, 5 and five members from the rest.

T. J. MIRCHANDANI.

22nd December 1941.

Note :—The cost of buildings is calculated at Rs. 12 to Rs. 4 per square foot, depending upon the type of building. The figures may be modified when detailed plans and estimates are prepared by Public Works Department.

713

APPENDIX A. 1st and 2nd year.

	Rs.
(1) Convocation Hall and equipment	1,75,000
(2) Arts College	1,75,000
(3) Library	1,00,000
(4) Bungalows of Vice-Chancellor, Registrar and Principal, Arts College ..	60,000
(5) Hostel to accommodate 200 students and Hostel Superintendent, with necessary out houses	2,00,000
(6) Sports pavilion and courts	25,000
(7) Houses for clerical staff	40,000
(8) Houses for servant staff	25,000
(9) Development	50,000
(10) Furniture of University offices and Library	25,000
(11) Books	50,000
(12) Shifting and refitting and miscellaneous expenditure	25,000
	<hr/>
	9,50,000

APPENDIX B. 3rd and 4th year.

	Rs.
(1) Construction of Engineering College and workshop, including expansions with new courses to be established by the University ..	4,00,000
(2) Buildings for New Faculty of Sind Culture or Sindology and School of Aeronautics	1,00,000
(3) Equipment for new Courses as under 1 and 2	1,00,000
(4) Hostel to accommodate 100 students	1,00,000
(5) Sports	10,000
(6) Houses for clerical staff	25,000
(7) Houses for servant staff	25,000
(8) Development	20,000
(9) Books and furniture for Library	20,000
(10) Shifting and refitting of Engineering College	50,000
(11) Establishment of Rural Economics Centre at Sakrand	50,000
	<hr/>
	9,00,000

Appendix C. 5th and 6th year.

(1) Building for Science College with necessary provision for Applied Science to be started ..	1,00,000
(2) School of Marine Biology to be established ..	1,00,000
(3) Shifting and refitting of Science College ..	20,000
(4) Hostel to accommodate 100 students ..	20,000
(5) Houses for teaching staff ..	1,00,000
(6) Sports ..	1,00,000
(7) Development ..	1,00,000
(8) Books for Library ..	20,000
	20,000
	9,00,000

Appendix D. 7th and 8th year.

(1) Completion of equipment of new Courses, shown in Appendix B and C ..	3,00,000
(2) Teachers Training College and Commercial College buildings and equipment ..	2,50,000
(3) Houses for teaching staff ..	1,00,000
(4) Houses for clerical staff ..	50,000
(5) Houses for servant staff ..	20,000
(6) Hostel for 100 students ..	1,00,000
(7) Books for Library ..	20,000
(8) Development ..	10,000
	8,50,000

(v) Note of Dissent by Prof. L. H. Ajwani.

1. The Sind University Committee having been explicitly instructed by the Government not to discuss the question whether it was *desirable* to have a separate University for Sind, the sole task of the Committee was to formulate a scheme for the establishment of such a University.

2. In performing this task the Committee has, in my opinion, been unduly swayed by one paramount consideration, namely that, as Sind's newly found dignity must have a University as an appanage, and as funds do not permit an outlay on a really splendid appanage, any embellishment that could be called a "University" will do. "Cut your coat according to your cloth" has been the watchword of the Sind University Committee.

3. The result is that after laying down rather grandiose aims of University Education, and affirming such pious resolutions as that "Social Service would be made an integral part of the college courses in the University", the Committee has contented itself with a University which would either be a glorified—just a little glorified—edition of the Sind Collegiate Board, Karachi, and its institutions, or which would be little better than what has been proposed by someone—a University housed in a hired building and functioning at the nominal cost of just under a thousand rupees per month.

4. A careful reader of the Report of the Sind University Committee will note among other things that—

(1) The Report takes no notice of the widespread demand in Sind for the immediate establishment of a Medical College.

(2) The Report does not envisage any radical departure or improvement in the present machinery for imparting Agricultural education in the Province of Sind.

(3) The Report makes no recommendation about the foundation of Schools of Aeronautics and Archeology, the two subjects in which Sind could give a lead to the other provinces in India.

(4) The Report makes no provision either for Scholarships in the new University or for setting up a machinery to bring scholars and experts of repute to Karachi to carry on studies and researches. By fixing the maximum salary of a University Professor at Rs. 500 per mensem, (the salary of a subaltern in the great State Departments), the Report

definitely cuts out the possibility of first class men choosing to take employment under the Sind University. By limiting the annual equipment of the new Science Departments to Rs. 5,000 the Report practically precludes any progress in Science subjects beyond the elementary stage.

(5) The Report frankly prescribes that the new University will not be a first class or a self-sufficient University by limiting its direct teaching to some (not all) subjects.

(6) The Report recommends the institution of Diploma courses but makes no provision for teaching these courses.

(7) The Report does not lay stress on the fact that a modern University catering for the needs of a Province with a great sea and airport should have a first class College of Commerce as one of its constituent Colleges.

5. In my opinion, narrow considerations of provincial patriotism or finance should not hold exclusive sway in the all important field of University education—the agency to which is relegated the responsibility of training leaders of the race. The Prophet of Islam was in favour of men going to China, *i. e.*, to distant places, in pursuit of knowledge, and it is certainly not correct for us to put the clock backward in Sind education just to have the pleasure and pride of having our own University. While I fully recognise the fact that Sind has special needs of its own which a University in Sind alone can satisfy, I do not like the scheme of an ill-staffed, ill-equipped and circumscribed University which my colleagues have adumbrated. I am reminded of the celebrated speech in which Touchstone defends his choice of Aubrey,

“A poor virgin, Sir, an ill-favoured thing, Sir, but mine own; a poor humour of mine, Sir, to take that no man else will”.

6. Even as modern warfare needs *men, money, and munitions* on a large scale besides postulating a sound *morale* in the nation fighting in a war, so a modern University

needs men (first class brains), money and equipment, even if it takes no account of that imponderable factor—the intellectual background of the society or community in which the University has its habitation. It has been made impossible under the scheme formulated in the Report of the Sind University Committee to invite and keep first class men in Sind. Nor will there be enough men. For instance, in the new University, one Professor will continue to teach three subjects—Botany, Zoology, and Microbiology—as it happens now in the D. J. Sind College, and four or five men will constitute the English Department (as against over a dozen for the Degree classes alone in the University of Lucknow).

7. The bugbear of finance has scared away my colleagues so much that they have been content to let things remain pretty much as they are now, with one difference, namely that, the present congestion in the Colleges of the Sind Collegiate Board must be removed by the shifting of these Colleges outside Karachi, or by the establishment of an Arts—Science College under the wing of the University. In other places the builders of Universities have not allowed themselves to be circumscribed in their plans by considerations of narrow finance. The Hindu University at Benares, or the Muslim University at Aligarh, has cost crores of rupees, and requires annual grants of several lakhs of rupees from the Central Government. One College alone cost over twenty lakhs in the dominions of His Exalted Highness the Nizam of Hyderabad. The Ismail College at Jogeshwari, started to give a fillip to the education of Muslims, cost 8 lakhs at the very start. The Universities of Dacca, Allahabad and Lucknow, receive annual grants varying from six to twelve lakhs of rupees from the Government to carry on their work. The tiny University of Delhi confined to one city only, receives a grant of one lakh every year, besides bumper grants amounting to several lakhs whenever it finds itself in difficulty—and this difficulty recurs quite frequently. Why should we alone, in Sind, desire a University which is to be supported by an annual grant ranging from rupees ten thousand to a maximum of a lakh of rupees, and whose initial cost is to be just that required for the erection of a College building, and for putting up a few accessories, say, a Hall and Library premises? The problem of water

for the city of Karachi is no doubt an important problem, but the problem of University education for the province is in no way less important, and if for the solution of one run into anything between half a crore of rupees and two crores of rupees, there is no reason why that much amount of money could not be found. It is a just and happy solution of the other problem.

8. I think it necessary to call attention to the important evidence of Principal N. V. Thadani, Rector of the Delhi University.

"It is possible to start a University for Sind without excessive cost, if the main objective of the institution is, is it worth while? During the last eight years, Delhi has gained little and suffered more by its dissociation from the Punjab; but its special connection with the Government of India and the Vice-Chancellor inspires the hope that the deficit will be made good before long. Agra too has shared the same fate, and its degrees have not the same value as those of the older University of Allahabad. If Sind has no scholars of its own, at present, can it not import them from the outside? While the number of competent scholars in the country is limited, it may be possible to get them from outside if necessary funds can be provided. The whole question then, may be resolved into terms of money. How much will the Government of Sind be prepared to find? The cost of the original scheme of the University of Delhi was estimated at the modest figure of Rs. thirty-four lacs, Capital, and four lacs recurring. The Government of India have made a recurring grant of Rs. one lac a year but nothing has been done about it. They propose to raise it to Rs. two lacs in the next three or four years, but that too is believed to be inadequate. How much can Sind provide? The Universities of Benares and Aligarh get a grant of Rs. three lacs each from the Central Government, and have large endowments of their own; while the Universities of Dacca and Lucknow get a grant of about Rs. seven lacs a year—each from their respective Governments

If the Government of Sind have unlimited funds to finance other urgent and beneficent needs and also to support a proper University, every body should accept it with gratitude. On the other hand, if funds are limited, it is a matter for consideration as to which demand should have priority. I believe the most urgent requirement of Sind at present, so far as higher education is concerned, is a full-grade Medical College."

9. My sincere fear is that if the scheme set forth in the Report of the Sind University Committee is put into operation, the well-to-do Hindus and Muslims in this Province will send their sons to Bombay, Benares, Aligarh, Ahmedabad, Lahore and Allahabad for university studies, particularly if they want their sons to grow up to be doctors and technicians, bankers and commercial men.

10. As for the constitution of the proposed University of Sind, I generally concur with the recommendations of my colleagues, specially with the recommendation that in the beginning the Vice-Chancellor should be a paid man of All-India reputation in the field of education. To this safeguard I should like to add another, namely that, for some years, the examinations held by the Sind University should be under the Control of an officer of the status of a Judge. In a province like Sind we cannot be too careful to eliminate all chances of party patronage, official influence and individual corruption. In the constitution of the Senate I should like to propose two changes, (i) that the Principals of the seven existing Colleges in Sind should be grouped together with the Professors or the University Teachers, provision to be made that at least one Principal each of the Arts, Engineering, Law and Agricultural Colleges, respectively, should find a place in this group of Fellows, (ii) that the four seats allotted to the municipalities and Local Boards each should be reduced by half, the four seats thus released to be added to the six seats provided for the Registered Graduates.

11. To specify, under the various terms of reference, my recommendations, as distinguished from the recommendations of the Sind University Committee are ;—

Type of the University desirable for Sind.

(Reference IV.)

The type of University desirable for Sind is a combination of the Unitary and Affiliating types, the University undertaking direct teaching in all subjects including post-graduate courses. This (Unitary type of) University will be self-sufficient, having Colleges of Arts and Science, Engineering, Law, Medicine, Commerce and Teaching besides schools of Archeology and Aeronautics. It will form a township of its own.

Constitution of the University.

(Term of Reference V.)

The Senate.—The Senate of the Sind University is to consist of 13 Ex-officio members, 10 nominated members, 5 Heads of Registered High Schools, 17 College Teachers of whom there will be one Principal at least of an Arts College, Engineering College, Law College and Agricultural College respectively, 10 Registered graduates, 2 Representatives of District Local Boards, 2 Representatives of Borough Municipalities, 3 Representatives of the Sind Legislative Assembly; 1 Representative of Commercial Bodies; 1 Representative of Zamindars' Association; 1 Representative of Haris' Association

Boards of studies.—Add (r) Commerce and (s) Aeronautic to the 17 Boards of Studies mentioned.

Examination and Teaching Standards.

(Term of Reference No. VIII.)

An officer of the status of a Judge should be appointed as Controller of Examinations who will be independent of the Registrar of the University.

Inauguration and Development of the University.

(Term of Reference No. XI.)

The University would start functioning as soon as the University township is complete with all the needed apparatus and equipment for the Arts and Science, Engineering, Law, Medicine, Commerce and Teaching Colleges.

(Term of Reference No. XII.)

Finances.—The Government of Sind will provide half a crore of rupees, for capital outlay on the Sind University, and will make provision for an annual grant of rupees six lacs.

The salary of a University Professor will be fixed at an average of rupees one thousand per mensem and that of a Reader as rupees seven hundred per mensem.

17th December 1941.

L. H. AJWANI.

(vi) Minute of Dissent by Prof. T. M. Advani.

I sign the report subject to the appended note of dissent on two points of reference.

Re: the proposed Constitution of the Senate (Term of Reference No. V), I am strongly of the view that the Registered Graduates, who form the most independent electorate, have not been given adequate representation. I would give them at least *ten* seats on the Senate (as against *six* suggested for them in the Report). It may be mentioned here that the Bombay University Act gives to the Registered Graduates 25 seats in a Senate of about 140 Fellows while our report recommends only 6 seats in a Senate of 70 member. To the Local Boards I would give no more than *two*. Here also it may be pointed out that in the Bombay University the Local Boards have five seats (one for each Province) in a Senate of 140 members. I am not in favour of the Haris being represented at all on the Senate, as *in effect* the Haris' seat will be an additional seat for the Zamindars, and I think we shall be well advised to drop this element of "democratic radicalism" in our constitution.

Under the term of reference No. X, *viz*, "the Inauguration and Development of the University", *two* alternate proposals have been made. The first is that Government should take over the existing four colleges of the Sind Collegiate Board, effect necessary improvements therein, and make them the *nucleus* for the proposed University. The other proposal is for the establishment of an Art

Science College as a University College, and make that as the starting point of a Teaching University. I am against the second alternative, as I believe it will mean unnecessary duplication of educational effort. The comparative cheapness of this scheme will be found on examination to be illusory. The first scheme (*vide* Financial Statement under Term of Reference No. XII) is to cost Rs. 42 lacs, and the second Rs. 12 lacs. But it has to be remembered that under the first scheme the Government will realize about Rs. 30 lacs the approximate value of the properties of the Sind Collegiate Board, and if this amount is deducted from Rs. 42 lacs, the net burden on the Government would be only Rs. 12 lacs; and for this the University will have not one but four teaching institutions—Arts, Science, Engineering and Law—under its direct control and management. The first scheme should therefore commend itself to Government in that—

- (1) it is a comprehensive scheme ;
- (2) it is not in effect more expensive ; and
- (3) it avoids unnecessary duplication of education.

T. M. ADVANI.

Gul Hayat Institute

APPENDIX I.

Names of Persons and Institutions that sent written replies to the Questionnaire.

1. Mr. Abro Alikhan Umarchan, M.A., S.T.C.D., Head Master, Government High School, Mirpurkhas.
2. Mr. Advani Dharamdas Tekchand, B.A., S.T.C.D., Head Master, N. J. V. High School, Karachi.
3. Mr. Advani P. B., M.A., LL.B., Principal, S.C. Shahani Law College, Karachi.
4. Mr. Advani Ramsingh, D., B.A., S.T.C., Principal, N. H. Academy, Hyderabad, (Sind).
5. Association of Heads of Recognized High Schools, Karachi.
6. Mr. Brow D. B., Member, Sind Collegiate Board, Karachi.
7. Mr. Chandni A.D., B.A., B.T., Principal, Shikarpur Academy, Shikarpur.
8. Lt.-Colonel Eminson, B., I. M. S., Civil Surgeon, Karachi.
9. Mr. Halford, D. R. C., I. C. S., Revenue Officer, Lloyd Barrage and Canals Scheme, Sind.
10. Mr. Holt, E. H., I. C. S., Collector of Dadu.
11. Mr. Jog. G. W., B.A., B. T., Assistant Master, N. J. V. High School, Karachi.
12. Karachi Medical Association.
13. Mr. Kazi Jan Muhammed A., Administrative Officer, District School Board, Sukkur.
14. Mr. Kedar T. J., B.A., LL.B., M.L.A., Vice-Chancellor, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
15. Mr. Kothavala, T.T., M.A., B.Sc., Collector of Sukkur, Sukkur.
16. Dr. Lakhani, J.V., M. Sc., Ph. D., Professor, D. J. Sind College, Karachi.
17. Mr. Malkani, H.C., M.A., Principal, C. and S. College, Shikarpur.

19. Mr. Narwani C.S., M.Sc., Assistant Professor,
Sind College, Karachi.
20. Mr. Notani K. H., M. A., Professor, D. G. College,
Hyderabad (Sind).
21. Mr. Paranjpe, M.R., M.A., B.Sc., Professor,
College, Poona.
22. Mr. Pherwani S.N., M.A., Shikarpur.
23. Mr. Ramchandani N.H., B.A., S.T.C.D., Head,
Government High School, Shikarpur.
24. Mr. Rupchand Bilaram, B.A., LL. B., Chairman,
Collegiate Board, Karachi.
25. Mr. Thadhani, N.V., M.A., Principal, Hindu College,
Delhi.

APPENDIX II.

*Names of persons who tendered Oral Evidence before
the Committee.*

1. Mr. Advani P.B., M.A., LL. B., Principal, S. C. State
Law College, Karachi.
2. Lt.-Colonel Eminson B., I. M. S., Civil Surgeon,
Karachi.
3. Mr. Jog, G. W. B. A., B. T., Assistant Master, N. J.
High School, Karachi.
4. Dr. Lakhani J.V., M.Sc., Ph. D., Professor, D. J. College,
Karachi.
5. Mr. Malkani H.C., M.A., Principal, C. & S. College,
Shikarpur.
6. Mr. Narwani C.S., M. Sc., Assistant Professor, D. J.
Sind College, Karachi.
7. Mr. Pherwani S. N., M. A., Shikarpur.

127

APPENDIX III.

OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY,
SIND UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE,
Karachi, 21st August 1942.

From

PROFESSOR B. J. VASWANI, M. A.,
Secretary, Sind University Committee, Karachi.

To

Sir,

I have the honour to forward, herewith, a copy of the Questionnaire prepared by the Sind University Committee, and to request that you will be good enough to help the Committee with your replies before the 15th October next.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Yours most obedient servant,

B. J. VASWANI,

Secretary.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS.

1. It is not necessary to answer every question. The Committee will particularly welcome replies based on personal experience. Suggestions of a concrete rather than an abstract nature will be specially valuable.

2. It is requested that the answer to each question be begun on a separate page.

The contributors are requested to state the following on the first page of their volume of replies.—

- (a) Name, with University Degrees or other distinctions and titles.
- (b) Present official or other position.
- (c) Experience of University problems.
- (d) Address in full.

QUESTIONNAIRE.

TERM OF REFERENCE No. I.

To formulate clearly the aim and purpose of University Education, with special reference to the Province of Sind.

QUESTIONS.

1. (a) What, according to you, should be the aims and functions of University education in modern times?
- (b) How far have these aims been realized in Sind, during its connection with the Bombay University?
2. (a) Are there any special needs of Sind in regard to University education which a separate University can best serve?
- (b) If yes, please state in what manner these special needs will be best served?

TERM OF REFERENCE No. IV.

To consider the different types of Universities including a new type with agriculture as its basic bias, and suggest one which would suit the conditions of Sind best.

QUESTIONS.

3. What are the different types of Universities, now functioning in India, and what do you think are the distinctive features of each?
4. What type, or combination of types, will, in your opinion be best suited to Sind?
5. (a) Don't you think it is essential to establish a University with agriculture as its basic bias? If yes, indicate fully the nature and working of such a University.
- (b) Can you suggest the extent and the manner in which such a University will best serve the uplift of the peasantry of the Province?

TERM OF REFERENCE No. V.

To draw up a constitution for the proposed University including its various constituent bodies.

QUESTIONS.

6. Do you think the constitution of the Bombay University would suit the proposed Sind University? If not, what alterations would you suggest, and why?
7. What, according to you, should be the composition of the Senate, its electoral constituencies, the proportion of elected, nominated and co-opted members, its functions, powers, etc.?
8. Is it necessary, according to you, that local, commercial, professional and agricultural bodies in the Province should be represented on the Senate by the process of election? Could not this representation be achieved, when necessary, by nomination and co-optation?
9. What other University authorities would you suggest, *e.g.*, the Syndicate, the Academic Council, the Faculties, etc., and what should be the composition, functions and powers of these bodies?
10. Do you agree that the Governor of the Province should be the Chancellor of the Sind University? If yes, what should be his powers and functions as Chancellor?
11. What should be the qualifications, functions and powers of the Vice-Chancellor of the Sind University?
12. Should the Vice-Chancellor be an honorary or a salaried official? Should he be elected by the Senate or nominated by the Chancellor?
13. Do you think it is desirable to have any other high officials like the Pro Vice-Chancellor, Rector, etc.,? If yes, what should be their functions and powers?

14. Do you think that a Board of Examinations, a College Inspection Board, a Board of Academic Studies, and a Council of Post-Graduate Studies, and a University Library Board should be statutory bodies in the University constitution, or should have the status of departmental committees to be created and controlled by the Senate and the Syndicate within the scope of the functions and powers laid down for these bodies?

TERM OF REFERENCE No. VII.

To suggest tentative curricula for the various examinations recommended.

QUESTIONS.

15. Have you any criticism or suggestion to offer with regard to the present Matriculation Examination in general, and with reference to the following in particular :—
- (i) The curriculum prescribed for it ;
 - (ii) Its suitability as a test for entrance to the University ;
 - (iii) Whether its control should be vested entirely in the University or the Education Department or an Independent Board ;
 - (iv) Whether it is advisable to permit the Colleges, to introduce their own examination for admission ?
16. If you prefer the University to undertake the Matriculation Examination at the end of the high school stage, what would be your suggestions for the courses of studies for this examination, and how would you spread them among the three or four years preceding the examination, bearing in mind the fact that the secondary school course is proposed to be reduced from seven years to six ?
17. Do you agree to the principle that a wide variety of options in individual subjects or groups of subjects should be offered at the Matriculation Examination ? If yes, how would you arrange these options ?

18. (a) What should be the medium of instruction in the secondary school stage and the University stage ?
- (b) What place should be assigned to English, the Classical Languages and the Modern Indian Languages during these stages ?
19. Would you prescribe a different course of studies and work for girls at the Matriculation and University stages ?
20. What place would you assign, in the Matriculation syllabus, to such subjects as Fine Arts, Military Training, Agriculture, Typewriting, Correspondence, Accounting, Social Service, etc. ?
21. (a) Have you any suggestions to make with regard to the courses leading to the first degree examinations in Arts and Science in general, and with reference to the following in particular :—
 - (i) The duration of the courses and the subjects proposed for study ;
 - (ii) The stages at which University examinations should be held ;
 - (iii) Whether there should be separate courses for Pass and Honours Degree Examinations, and the manner in which you would differentiate between the two ?
- (b) Are you in favour of bifurcation between the Arts and Science courses ? If yes, at what stage would you introduce it ?
22. Have you any new subjects such as Military Training, Home Economics, Teaching, Music, Sind Culture, Sociology, Aeronautics, and Archeology to suggest for the new curriculum for Colleges ?
23. What alterations would you suggest in the present courses of study and regulations with regard to the First Degree examinations other than B.A. and B.Sc. ? Give a detailed scheme.

24. Which post-graduate degrees would you award by thesis alone, or partly by thesis and partly by examinations by papers?
25. Are you in favour of short Diploma Courses in various subjects being instituted in the various Colleges and approved by the University? Give a detailed scheme of such courses, their utility and practicability.

TERM OF REFERENCE No. VIII.

To consider the question of maintenance of proper examination and teaching standards in the proposed University.

QUESTIONS.

26. What steps would you take to ensure efficient setting of papers for the various examinations, maintenance of proper secrecy, careful conduct of examinations and impartial uninfluenced assessment of answers, and expeditious declaration of results?
27. Would you prefer a Board of Control to look after the conduct of all the Examinations? If yes, what should be, in your view, its proper constitution, functions and powers?
28. Do you think that the conditions in Sind will require the importation of outsiders as Paper-setters, Moderators and Examiners? If so, what percentage of such examiners would you suggest?
29. What should be the extent and the manner of control exercised by the University over its constituent colleges to ensure the maintenance of proper standards of efficiency?
30. Are you in favour of Tutorial Systems being compulsorily introduced in the Colleges, or have you any scheme which would remedy the drawbacks of the present practice of huge classes and mass lecturing?

31. Have you any suggestions to make for co-ordination of work and prevention of wasteful duplication in the constituent colleges ?
32. (a) Should the University undertake teaching in (i) Undergraduate Classes, (ii) Post-graduate Classes ?
(b) Do you favour the view that all post-graduate teaching should be controlled directly by the University ?

TERM OF REFERENCE No. IX.

To consider the relations that should subsist between the University and the Government, the Education Department, and the Secondary Schools.

QUESTIONS.

33. What, according to you, should be the nature of minimum control which the Government of Sind (through the Governor as Chancellor and the Minister of Education) may legitimately exercise over the University of Sind ? Specify the spheres and limits of this control.
34. Do you think that the Education Department should exercise a certain amount of control over the activities of the University ? If so, to what extent and in what manner ?
35. If you, think however, that the University should be free from the control of the Education Department, how would you make it independent ?
36. What should be the extent and the nature of the control which the Sind University should exercise over the secondary schools of the Province ?

134

TERM OF REFERENCE No. X.

To suggest a suitable site for the proposed University.

QUESTION.

37. Considering the aims of University education and the type of University which would suit the Sind conditions best, what, according to you, would be the best place for locating the proposed University? Please specify the site in that place, and give your reasons for the selection.

TERM OF REFERENCE No. XII.

To go into the entire question of finance involved in the starting of a separate University for Sind, and suggest ways and means for the purpose.

QUESTIONS.

38. What is your estimate of the finance involved in making the first beginnings in the creation of the University you recommend, and what would be the involvements of the Government over the entire period of its future developments?
39. (a) How much, do you think, should the University buildings including the Library building and their equipments cost at the start?
- (b) What would be the cost of likely extensions and maintenance charges each year?
40. What would be your estimate of initial and further yearly outlay on books, etc., for the University Library?
41. What, according to you, would be the likely excess of expenditure over income every year? Give full details.
42. Can you suggest ways and means of meeting the initial outlay and the annual deficits which you think likely?

43. Do you think that the Government of Sind should undertake the responsibility of finding the money for the University entirely? If not, would you suggest a scheme of private endowments, donations, etc., which would help the early inauguration of the University?

44. What, in your opinion, should be the minimum recurring grant from the Government of Sind, every year, to the Sind University?

TERM OF REFERENCE No. XIII.

To report on such other matters germane to the above questions as may be considered necessary.

QUESTIONS.

45. Have you anything to say on any or all of the following problems?

- (a) Adult Education or Extension Courses in Colleges;
- (b) Physical Education and other extra-mural activities;
- (c) Social Life in the Colleges;
- (d) Territorial limits of the Sind University;
- (e) Non-collegiate or Private Students;
- (f) Admission of students from outside the territorial limits of the University for the various examinations;
- (g) Conditions of life of students, e.g., hostels, private residences, etc.
- (h) Desirability of having separate Colleges for women;
- (i) Conversion of the D.J. Sind Collegiate Board and its institutions into a nucleus for a Sind University;
- (j) Conferment of Honorary Degrees and Fellowships;
- (k) Publication Bureau for the University;
- (l) Correspondence Courses;
- (m) Inter-University exchange of Professors;
- (n) Discipline in Colleges;
- (o) Tuition Courses for All-India Competitive Examinations.

46. Are there any problems which have not been covered by this Questionnaire? If so, please state them.