



T1900189938

**COMMUNAL POLITICS, SINDHI SEPARATISM,  
AND THE CREATION OF PAKISTAN  
1920-1951**

**NOEL BOREHAM**

*B.A. (Hons.)  
University of New England*

*A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy  
of the University of New England*

February 1998

Gul Hayat Institute

***I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not currently being submitted for any other degree or qualification.***

***I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.***



.....  
Signature

---

Gul Hayat Institute

## ABSTRACT

This thesis explores and explains the roles that communalism, Muslim nationalism and Sindhi ethnic identity performed in the Sind during the period 1920-1951. In particular, the argument is presented that in the case of Sind, a regional, ethnic identity was as significant a factor as the 'Islamic response' in mobilising the support of the Muslim provincial elites for the Pakistan demand. It will be explained how the changes which colonial rule brought to Sind's economic and political infrastructure prompted the response from the Muslim elites of demanding the separation of the province from the Bombay Presidency in the first decades of the twentieth-century. The granting of the Sindhi Muslims' separatist demands by the British in 1932 represented the legitimisation of their entwining communal and ethnocentric issues, and resulted in furthering the development of a distinctive Sindhi Muslim political identity. The subsequent structuring of state institutions under the provisions of provincial autonomy served to politicise religious identity. Combined with the legacy of the Sind Separation movement, state structures encouraged the communalisation of provincial politics. Although the establishment of the provincial government in 1937 offered Sindhi Muslims the opportunity to govern the province, they were consistently outmanoeuvred by Hindu members in the Assembly. Failed attempts by the land-owning Muslim leaders to use an Islamic discourse to control political action in the public arena, and the strengthening of Hindu political power, demonstrated the need for assistance from the All-India Muslim League. By 1943, the establishment of a strong Muslim League provincial government formed a watershed in Sindhi politics. The catalyst for the popularity of the Pakistan movement came with the definition that it was to mean the creation of the sovereign state of Sind. Ethnicity as well as religious identity shaped the Pakistan movement in Sind as it became the vehicle for the Sindhi Muslims to achieve their goals which the Sind Separation movement and provincial autonomy had failed to deliver. The centralising of Muslim politics into Jinnah's hands produced the culmination of communalism in the creation of an highly centralised Pakistan Government. The seizure of Karachi by the Pakistan Government, the resettlement of Muslim migrants in Sind's cities (thus replacing Sind's Hindus with non-Sindhi Muslims), the dismissal of the Sindhi Government and the replacement with central rule (1951), produced a legacy which Pakistan increasingly bears today.

## CONTENTS

<i>List of charts, figures, maps and tables</i>	<i>page</i>	v
<i>Lists of Chief Ministers and Governors in Sind, 1937-1951</i>		vi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>		ix

<b>Introduction</b>		1
---------------------	--	---

<b>Part One</b>	<b>The Impact of British Colonialism</b>	
Chapter 1	The Impact of British Colonial Administration	47
Chapter 2	The Responses of the Muslim Leaders	79
Chapter 3	Provincial Autonomy and the Politicisation of Religious Identity	109

<b>Part Two</b>	<b>Majority Government and Minority Rule</b>	
Chapter 4	The Communalisation of Provincial Politics	140
Chapter 5	Mandli, Mosque, and Riots	171
Chapter 6	The Reshaping of Muslim Political Power	199

<b>Part Three</b>	<b>Majority Rule and the Redefining of Provincial Politics</b>	
Chapter 7	The Sindhi Definition of Pakistan	230
Chapter 8	The Centralisation of Muslim Politics	264
Chapter 9	The Culmination of Communalism	295

<b>Conclusion</b>		330
-------------------	--	-----

<i>Glossary</i>		344
<i>Assessment of Sources</i>		346
<i>Bibliography</i>		352

## **List of Charts, Graphs, Maps and Tables**

### **Charts**

1	VOTES POLLED IN THE MUSLIM CONSTITUENCIES: 1946 GENERAL ELECTION	42
---	--	----

### **Graphs**

1	CORRELATION OF PERCENTAGES OF NON-MUSLIMS, NON-SINDHIS, AND MEMBERSHIP OF THE MUSLIM LEAGUE, 1944	249
---	---	-----

### **Maps**

1	MUSLIMS AS A PERCENTAGE OF PROVINCIAL POPULATIONS, 1941; AND 1946 GENERAL ELECTION: VOTES POLLED BY THE MUSLIM LEAGUE	5
2	GENERAL MAP OF SIND	49
3	SIND 1937: ADMINISTRATIVE DISTRICTS	50
4	SIND 1931: MUSLIM POPULATION BY TALUKA	57
5	SIND 1931: HINDU POPULATION BY TALUKA	58
6	MUSLIM LEAGUE MEMBERSHIP: ADULT MUSLIM MALES, 1944	243
7	AREA IRRIGATED BY THE SUKKUR BARRAGE	244
8	SIND: VARIATION IN POPULATION OF NON-MUSLIMS, 1931-1941, BY TALUKAS	247

### **Tables**

1	AGRICULTURAL CLASSES 1931-1932: COMPARISON OF SIND WITH NWFP	53
2	HINDU PERCENTAGES OF CITIES (>10,000), 1931-1941	60
3	WHEAT EXPORTS, KARACHI, 1880-1904	73
4	COMPOSITION OF MUNICIPAL BOARDS BY RELIGION, 1927	76
5	1937 ELECTION: RESULTS FOR MUSLIM SEATS (ALL PROVINCES)	115
6	1937 ELECTION: VOTES POLLED IN MUSLIM SEATS	120
7	1937 ELECTION: DIFFERENCE IN PERCENTAGE OF VOTES POLLED BETWEEN FIRST AND SECOND CANDIDATES	129
8	1937 ELECTION: DIFFERENCE IN PERCENTAGE OF VOTES POLLED BETWEEN FIRST AND SECOND CANDIDATES IN SIND	131
9	1937 ELECTION: INDICATORS OF COMPETITIVENESS IN SIND: GENERAL RURAL CONSTITUENCIES	131
10	1937 ELECTION RESULTS FOR SIND	134
11	SUKKUR BARRAGE TALUKAS WITH A POPULATION INCREASE GREATER THAN 33%, 1931-1941	245
12	JANUARY 1946 ELECTION RESULTS FOR SIND	281
13	COMPARISON OF VOTES POLLED BY THOSE CANDIDATES WHO CONTESTED IN BOTH 1937 AND 1946	283
14	SETTLEMENT OF MUHAJIRS IN ALL PROVINCES, 1951	313
15	SINDHI MUSLIMS PERCENTAGE OF CITIES (>10,000), 1941-1951	314

### List of Chief Ministers in Sind, 1937-1951

March 1937 - February 1938	Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah
February 1938 - March 1940	Allah Bakhsh Soomro
March 1940 - March 1941	Bande Ali Talpur
March 1941 - October 1942	Allah Bakhsh Soomro
November 1942 - August 1947	Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah
August 1947 - April 1948	Mohammed Ayub Khuhro
May 1948 - February 1949	Pir Illahi Bakhsh
February 1949 - May 1950	Yusuf Haroon
May 1950 - March 1951	Kazi Fazlullah
March 1951 - December 1951	Mohammed Ayub Khuhro
<i>(December 1951 - imposition of Governor's Rule)</i>	

### List of Governors in Sind, 1937-1951

April 1936 - March 1941	Sir Lancelot Graham
April 1941 - February 1946	Sir Hugh Dow
February 1946 - August 1947	Sir Francis Mudie
August 1947 - October 1948	Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah
October 1948 - 1952	Justice Din Mohammed

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The origin of this thesis lies in a brief journey I made to the Indian sub-continent, including the province of Sind, in 1982. The journey stimulated a great interest in the histories of India and Pakistan, and I undertook university studies in order to answer the numerous questions which the sub-continent had provoked. Of course, more questions than answers were revealed, and some of the more provoking questions concerned the modern political history of Sind. In the course of an honours programme which focused on the roles of the Muslim-majority provinces' in the Pakistan movement, the surprising absence of material dealing with the province produced a considerable void in the literature. That sense of surprise turned to concern, because it became obvious that without an adequate explanation of Sindhi politics for the first half of the twentieth-century, the existing interpretations of the Pakistan movement had been made without all of the pieces of the puzzle being revealed.

The research into Sind's history during this course of study has been thoroughly rewarding. I acknowledge the privileges of embarking on an area which does not carry the footfalls of the more familiar areas of colonial India's history. However, seven years' exploration of uncharted territories has not been without its trials, and I owe an immense debt to the patience and generosity of my supervisors: Associate Professor Howard Brasted of the University of New England, and Dr. Jim Masselos of Sydney University. To Associate Professor Brasted, I express my gratitude for so unhesitatingly sharing his considerable wisdom of Jinnah and Muslim politics, and for setting such a high standard of scholarship. Most of all, I thank him for his friendship. To Jim, I sincerely thank for consistently making his time available, his feedback and for his probing questions

which led to new and fruitful perspectives. Without their encouragement and commitment to the value of the project this thesis could not have been written.

I would also like to acknowledge the assistance by words of personal advice so kindly given in all too brief moments with Ian Copland, Robin Jeffrey, Peter Reeves, John Maguire, David Gilmartin, Mushirul Hasan, Sandria Freitag, Sarah Ansari, D.A Low, Romila Thapar, and particularly Sinnappah Arasaratnam. As a student undertaking the doctorate programme externally, and part-time, their comments have been of immense personal importance. The activities of the National Centre for South Asian Studies have been especially useful in bringing students and distinguished scholars together.

There are several other people to whom I acknowledge my gratitude. The warmth of the Brasted family, the encouragement of Noel Keleher, and the enthusiasm of John Bloomfield have helped make my period of research and writing a personally rewarding one. I wish to thank the generosity of my employer, the Australian Taxation Office, with especial thanks Terry de Ste.Croix for his support. I would also like to thank the staff at the Dixon Library and the Oriental and India Office Library in London, whose cooperation and endeavours contributed in no small way to my being able to complete the doctorate.

Gul Hayat Institute

Most of all, I must thank Julie. Her patience and faith will never be forgotten.



## ABBREVIATIONS



AIML	All-India Muslim League
anon.	anonymous
BC	Bombay Chronicle
Cmd.	Command Papers
Comm.	Commerce constituency
CP	Central Provinces
CRO	Commonwealth Relations Office, London
Europn.	European constituency
FO	Foreign Office
HC	UK High Commissioner, Karachi
INC	Indian National Congress
Land.	Land-holders constituency
MLA	Member of the Legislative Assembly
n.d	not dated
NWFP	North-West Frontier Province
OIOC	Oriental and India Office Collection, London (formerly India Office Library and Records)
PRO	Public Records Office, Kew
SAC	Sind Azad Conference
SAP	Sind Azad Party
SFR	Sind Fortnightly Reports
SMPP	Sind Provincial Muslim League
<i>TOPI</i>	<i>Transfer of Power Volumes</i>
UP	United Provinces

Gul Hayat Institute