

CHAPTER XVIII.

EDUCATION DEPARTMENT.

338. The Department of Education is one which needs continuous expansion and extension. This necessarily means more expenditure year by year and the Committee naturally cannot suggest retrenchment or economy in this Department. But with the march of time and changing methods of education, reforms both in the method of education and administration would be necessary. The Committee can lay no claim to give guidance in matters pertaining to form of education, for it would be a subject more for educationist experts than for a Committee set up for Reorganization. In view, however, of the present circumstances of Sind, the Committee have tried to study and hereby submit various facts and figures chiefly with a view to present a true picture of the Province's backwardness in education, which is decidedly more marked in comparison to the other Provinces. With that sole object, the Committee have described in some detail the present aspects of educational movement in Sind and ventured certain suggestions largely concerning administrative reforms.

339. The Committee propose to give several statistical details in this Chapter to enable the Government and Honourable Members of the Assembly to visualise their responsibility towards education which is the basis of all social service and progress of the individual community and country.

340. The Miles-Irving Committee had taken the basic revenue figure for education at Rs. 1·18 lakhs. We are nearly reaching this figure as the amount provided under 'XXVI—Education' for the year 1938-39, is Rs. 1·12 lakhs. It is mainly derived from fees, Rs. 95,000 representing fee receipts of the Government Secondary Schools. On the expenditure side, the Miles-Irving Committee placed the basic figure at Rs. 27·8 lakhs. They reckoned the cost of separation as under :—

(a) An allowance of Rs. 200 to the Senior Educational Officer in Sind to work as Director.

(b) A separate Educational Inspector at Rs. 1,200 per mensem.

(c) Contributions to several Educational Institutions of the Government of Bombay in the Presidency for taking up Sindhi students Rs. 40,000.

341. Apart from considerations of expansion due to Lloyd Barrage, the expenditure under Education has already advanced in the separated Sind as under:—

1935-36	Rs.	27,04,097
1936-37	"	27,46,554
1937-38 Revised	"	30,05,000
1938-39 Estimate	"	30,64,000

It would be interesting to note under what heads these increases had been registered in the 4 years.

	Estimate for 1938-39.	Increase over 1935-36. (round figures.)
	Rs.	Rs.
(a) Grant to Colleges (University Education)	84,200	21,000
b) Grant to Secondary Schools of—		
(i) Non-Government ...	2,73,300	32,000
(ii) Local Bodies ...	48,500	4,000
c) Grant to Primary Schools of—		
(i) Non-Government ...	2,17,600	53,000
(ii) Local Bodies ...	18,69,400	2,35,000
Direction and Inspection ...	1,65,000	7,000
Scholarships ...	1,13,400	3,000
Government Secondary Schools	1,96,400	1,000
Miscellaneous ...	13,900	5,000
	29,81,700	3,61,000
Additional expenditure on Special Schools	82,300	1,000
Total ..	30,64,000	3,60,000

342. We propose next to indicate by figures how education has advanced in the matter of instruction and pupils in the quinquennial period 1932-1936 —

INSTITUTIONS.

Institutions.				1931-32.	1936-37.
Secondary	{	Arts Colleges	2	3
		Professional Colleges	2	2
	{	High Schools	39	52
		Middle Schools	103	125
	Primary Schools		2,329	2,383
	Special Schools		48	47
	Total recognised Institutions		2,523	2,612
Unrecognised Institutions		774	526	

PUPILS.

				1931-32.	1936-37.	Increase.
				Pupils.	Pupils.	
Arts Colleges	1,092	1,262	170
Professional Colleges	199	301	102
Secondary Schools...	19,226	24,691	5,465
Primary Schools	1,45,483	1,55,488	9,985
Special Schools	2,161	2,253	92
Total ...				1,68,161	1,83,975	15,814

Communal distribution of pupils for 1936-37 is as under:—

		Population.	No. of pupils.	Percentage of pupils to population of the community.
1	Europeans and Anglo-Indians...	8,506	654	7.7
2	Indian Christians...	6,627	1,606	24.2
3	Hindus { Advanced	5,01,723	86,177	17.2
	Intermediate	2,79,415	5,833	2.1
	Backward	2,34,087	4,114	1.8
	Total—Hindus	10,15,225	96,124	9.5
4	Mohammedans	28,30,800	82,086	2.9
5	Farsis	3,537	998	28.2
6	Sikhs	18,505	1,367	7.4
7	Others	3,870	1,140	29.5
	Grand Total	38,87,070	1,83,975	4.7

It will be seen from the above figures that there is a marked increase in the Secondary Schools, due specially to private enterprise for which Sind is indebted to several keen educationists.

343. The increase in the number of Primary Schools is very slight, this is due to paucity of funds on the part of Local Boards and lack of financial help on the part of Government. The numbers of pupils show an increase all round. But the most marked feature of the above statistics is that the percentage of school-going population of the Muslim community, which forms the bulk of the population is very small. This shows how regretfully backward education is in this community. Similarly the Intermediate and Backward Hindu Classes which constitute one half of the total Hindu population of Sind, show equally poor percentage and they also are as backward as the Muslim community.

344. The total expenditure incurred on education can be seen from the following :—

	1931-32.		1936-37.	
	Amount.	Percentage.	Amount.	Percentage
	Rs.		Rs.	
Government Funds ...	28,17,030	49.1	27,02,668	43.8
Board Funds ...	11,04,250	19.3	12,63,369	20.5
Fees ...	10,36,584	18.1	13,21,882	21.4
Other sources ...	7,75,435	13.5	8,79,346	14.3
Total ...	57,33,299	100	61,67,065	100

The following table will show that the expenditure from the Provincial Funds decreased in the 5 years from Rs. 28 lakhs to 27 lakhs, namely, by 4.1 per cent. The decrease is mostly in expenditure on grants to Local Authorities on account of Primary Education. The cut in the above said grant was at the rate of 5 per cent. in the year 1931-32, and at the rate of 8 per cent. in the year 1936-37.

PROVINCIAL EXPENDITURE.

	1931-32.		1936-37.	
	Amount.	Percentage.	Amount.	Percentage.
	Rs.		Rs.	
University and Higher Education	67,054	2.4	60,700	2.2
Secondary Education ...	3,84,615	13.7	3,81,224	14.1
Primary Education ...	17,83,416	63.3	17,12,872	63.4
Special Education...	1,01,681	3.6	1,05,460	3.9
Total (Direct) ...	23,36,766	83.0	22,60,255	83.6

	1931-32.		1936-37.	
	Amount.	Percentage	Amount.	Percentage
	Rs.		Rs.	
Direction and Inspection ...	3,07,000	10.9	2,84,033	10.5
Buildings ...	6,714	.2	5,254	.2
Miscellaneous ...	1,66,550	5.9	1,53,125	5.7
Total (Indirect) ...	4,80,264	17.0	4,42,412	16.4
Grand Total ...	28,17,030	100	27,02,668	100

From the year 1937-38, however, it is note-worthy that the allotment for grants to Arts Colleges has been raised from Rs. 29,000 to Rs. 43,000. Similarly the allotment for grants to Secondary Schools has been raised from Rs. 2,45,600 to Rs. 2,66,200. It is also pleasing to note that the cut in the grants to Local Authorities for Primary Education has been wiped out and an additional provision of Rs. 2,52,000 has been made in the budget for the purpose. Thus the new quinquennium bids fair to be one of progress all round.

345. We now propose to give a resume of condition and progress of Education in Sind under main divisions of Institutions.

346. *University Education.*—The five Colleges of Sind are affiliated to the Bombay University. Its Senate consists of 144 Fellows. Sind is represented by only seven. Our Province has no seat on the Academic Council nor on the Syndicate which is the Executive Body of the University. In the whole life of the University, once only one Sindhi was on the Syndicate for two years, for it is very difficult for a Sindhi to snatch a seat by election.

347. The question of a separate University for Sind had been considered very carefully by the Dow Committee. Several reasons were then adduced to show that it was impossible for Sind to have a separate University, for lack of resources whether in brains or money. The Committee, however, were not dejected for they did not regard that the paucity of individuals of culture or high educational attainments, or the dark background of the social life of the Province were good arguments against the constitution of the Sind University. They were definitely of the opinion that a separate Sind University will be able to remove the intellectual and other deficiencies through

education on the best, broadest and most penetrative lines. They made it clear that the Examining University of Bombay in which Sind has no voice, cannot transform nor produce any effect on Sind life. The University syllabuses have, naturally, repercussions on the school curriculum and therefore the scope of tackling the peculiar Sind problems in the matter of education is necessarily restricted. The Dow Committee, therefore, emphatically suggested that the Government ought not to accept a defeatist position in respect of the problem of a separate Sind University, and that Sind ought to be able to shape the education of her own children. This Committee felt very strongly that the University is a part of the life of a nation, that it is intimately related to the moral and intellectual well-being of the people, and Government ought to shoulder the responsibility and ought not to allow its educational policy to be controlled by a body outside the Province. The Dow Committee, therefore, suggested immediate appointment of two scholars possessing high academic distinction and educational experience as Educational Advisors who should institute a searching survey for ways and means to establish a Sind University. We fully endorse these views and hope that Government will take suitable steps.

348. Sind pays already over Rs. 74,000 per annum as fees for examinations of the Bombay University and this should be an important element in the finances of the Sind University. The scheme for separate Sind University must take long time; in the meanwhile the Government of Sind ought to press for adequate voice on the Bombay University Bodies.

349. The Director has suggested that —

(a) there should be a certain number of nominated Fellows for Sind;

(b) the number of representatives of (1) the Professors and Principals together, and of (2) the Registered Graduates should be also distributed among regional groups so that Sind may get a definite number of these;

(c) the Director of Public Instruction, Sind, should be an *ex-officio* member of the Senate and the Syndicate.

These suggestions may, after necessary examination, be pursued energetically. We would like to add that the Sind Legislative Assembly should be accorded the right to elect two representatives on the Bombay University Senate.

350. *Arts Colleges.*—The three Arts Colleges in Sind receive Government grant amounting to Rs. 43,000 of which Rs. 29,000 are paid to the D. J. Sind College which has 894 students on its rolls. The other two Colleges at Hyderabad and Shikarpur imparting instruction, respectively to 288 and 70 students have been registered for grants-in-aid since 1937-38 only. Out of the total of 1,262 students 205 are ladies.

The communal statistics of attendance in the Colleges are as under:—

Community.				No. of students during	
				1931-32.	1936-37
1				2	3
Europeans and Anglo-Indians	5	3
Indian Christians	32	30
Hindus	{	Advanced	...	829	954
		Intermediate	...	14	11
		Backward	...	1	13
Mohammedans	128	168
Parsis	54	48
Sikhs	9	8
Others	20	27
Total				1,092	1,262

The total recurring expenditure of the three Colleges was Rs. 3,07,409 in 1936-37, as compared with Rs. 2,51,337 in 1931-32, an increase of 22·3 per cent. The expenditure during 1936-37 was met from the following sources:—

Provincial Revenue ... Rs. 29,000 Since raised to Rs. 43,000.

District Local Board and Municipal Funds. „ 3,250

Fees ... „ 1,91,909

Other sources ... „ 83,250

Total ... Rs. 3,07,409

It will be seen that two-thirds of the expenditure is met from College fees.

351. *Professional Colleges.*—There are two Professional Colleges in our Province—Engineering College and Law College. The N. E. D. Engineering College, has 218 students of which 155 are Hindus, 16 Mohammedans and 47 others. This College receives a grant of Rs. 24,000. The total expenditure of the College was Rs. 94,641 in 1931-32 and Rs. 96,191 in 1936-37. The average cost per student is Rs. 152 against Rs. 246 five years ago. The total expenditure of the College was met from the following sources:—

	Amount.	Percentage.
Provincial Revenues ... Rs.	31,700	33·0
District Local Board and „	5,750	6·0
Municipal Funds.		
Fees ... „	41,011	42·6
Other sources ... „	17,730	18·4
Total ...	96,191	100

The Law College had 83 students on its rolls in 1936-37 of which 61 were Hindus, 15 Mohammedans and 7 others. The total expenditure amounted to Rs. 22,712 which was met entirely from fees and other resources.

352. The Government of Sind, in order to make admission available for Sindhi students in certain Colleges in the Bombay Presidency, contribute a sum of Rs. 7,200 as under. The Miles-Irving Committee had forecasted an expenditure of Rs. 40,000 for this purpose:—

	No. of seats reserved.	Yearly contributions per student.	Total
		Rs.	Rs.
1 Royal Institute of Science ...	8	100	800
2 Grant Medical College ...	7	120	840
3 College of Commerce and Economics	21	5	105
4 Secondary Training College ...	9	600	5,400
Total ...			7,145

353. *More Colleges.*—The establishment of an Agricultural College in Sind is already settled and we hope to see it started by the beginning of the next financial year.

354. A Secondary Training Institute is a crying need of the Province. The scheme of running a Secondary Training College for B. T. Degree in conjunction with the D. J. Sind College has, we are informed, not found favour with the University of Bombay. An altogether separate Training College may possibly be beyond the financial resources of the Province at present. A more modest and practicable scheme but nonetheless effective for our requirements, would be an Institute for Secondary Training Diploma Course. It could be run at moderate cost along with the N. J. High School, Karachi. We would emphasise that Government should take early steps to start a suitable Secondary Training Institute.

355. The Medical College for Sind is another great necessity. As many as 24 students applied this year for admission to the Government Medical College, Bombay, but only 7 were admitted. Several lady students were ready to join the Lady Reading Women's College at Delhi, but only two could get admission. These allotments are very meagre and must have caused great disappointment to prospective students and their parents. The number of well qualified doctors in Sind is not large. Notwithstanding efforts of Government, qualified doctors are not available for practice in the rural areas of Sind. This difficulty would disappear if Sind had its own Medical College. This necessity should be supplied as early as possible.

356. *Other Centres of Education.*—Sind can no longer remain without Technical and Technological Education. Such Institutions will pave the way for solving the unemployment problem. Time should not be lost in getting necessary schemes, modest at the start, prepared by experts.

357. *Secondary Education.*—We have already stated that the number of Secondary Schools in the Province, both for the boys and girls, has increased. There were 142 five years ago, and today there are 177 showing an increase of 23. The increase in the number of pupils was 28.4 per-cent. from 19,226 to 24,691. Out of 177 schools, 157 are Boys' Schools, 40 being High Schools and 117 are Middle Schools teaching upto 5th standard. The total number of boys under education in 1936-37 was 19,646. The following table gives comparative statistics.

217

	Schools.				Pupils.			
	1931-32.		1936-37.		1931-32.		1936-37.	
	High Schools.	Middle Schools.	High Schools.	Middle Schools.	High Schools.	Middle Schools.	High Schools.	Middle Schools.
Government ...	6	...	5	...	2,166	...	1,680	...
District Local Board.	2	54	2	63	415	1,496	409	1,795
Municipal ...	3	18	4	18	920	1,840	1,110	1,892
Aided ...	16	22	25	25	6,458	1,929	8,521	2,346
Unaided ...	2	4	4	11	357	302	1,229	664
Total ...	29	98	40	117	10,316	5,567	12,949	6,697
	127		157		15,883		19,646	

358. Hyderabad High School was transferred to the Muslim Education Society, while the districts of Dadu and Upper Sind Frontier have no Government High School. The District Local Boards are adopting a policy of attaching English classes to Primary Schools. That accounts for the increase in Local Board institutions and their attendance.

359. The following are the figures of Communal distribution of boys educated in Anglo-Vernacular Schools :—

				Number of boys in Anglo-Vernacular Schools.	
				1931-32.	1936-37.
Indian Christians	40	35
Hindus	{	Advanced	...	10,625	13,244
		Intermediate and Backward	...	675	760
Mohammedans	3,777	4,473
Parsis	225	275
Others	281	386
Total	...			15,650	19,173

218.

				Male population.	Percentage of boys to male population.
Indian Christians	3,822	0.9
Hindus	Advanced	2,70,558	4.9
	Intermediate	1,62,747	0.3
	Backward	1,33,212	0.2
Mohammedans	15,89,735	0.3
Parsis	1,868	14.7
Others	13,311	2.9
Total				21,75,253	0.9

The percentage of pupils to population shows interesting and marked differences for various communities. It will again be noticed how backward the Muslim Community and Intermediate and Backward Hindus are. This should require very careful consideration of the Government and all concerned.

360. The total expenditure on the Secondary Schools excluding Anglo-Indian and Europeans Schools was Rs. 14,72,491 in 1936-37. The subjoined tables show the school managements and the sources from which the expenditure was met:—

Authorities of Schools.				Expenditure.	
				Total.	Percentage from Provincial funds.
GOVERNMENT—				Rs.	
High Schools	1,94,119	55.3
Middle Schools
Total				1,94,119	55.3

Authorities of Schools.	Expenditure.	
	Total.	Percentage from Provincial funds.
DISTRICT LOCAL BOARD AND MUNICIPAL —	Rs.	Rs.
High Schools	1,25,435	18·9
Middle Schools	1,80,709	10·0
Total ...	3,06,144	13·7
AIDED —		
High Schools	7,35,149	22·9
Middle Schools	1,41,931	12·6
Total ...	8,77,080	21·2
UNAIDED —		
High Schools	64,480	...
Middle Schools	30,668	...
Total ...	95,148	...
GRAND TOTAL ...	14,72,491	...

SOURCES OF EXPENDITURE.

Provincial Funds	Rs. 3,35,441
Fees	„ 8,13,188
Local Bodies	„ 1,39,871
Other sources	„ 1,83,991
Total ...	Rs. 14,72,491

361. *Wastage.*—Wastage in Secondary Schools is inordinately large as seen from the subjoined statistics. It is a great pity that a large number of boys fall off year after year:—

Number of pupils on rolls in Standard I on 31st March 1931 ... 3,721				
Do.	do.	do.	II	do. 1932 ... 3,315
Do.	do.	do.	III	do. 1933 ... 2,938

Municipality of Jacobabad have established a High School, while an Education Society has started it at Mehar and another such Society at Dadu is endeavouring to establish a High School there. We propose that Government should make more substantial grants for the High Schools at Jacobabad, Mehar and Dadu and ensure that the additional grants are utilised for making those Institutions serve as models in the absence of Government Institutions.

365. The Government make the following grants to local bodies and other Institutions to subsidise Secondary Education:—

Grant to Local Bodies	...	Rs.	48,500
„ Private Registered management	„	2,33,900	
„ Private Registered managements for education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in 3 Schools at Karachi.	„	39,400	
Total		Rs.	3,21,800

366. In order to give greater encouragement for expansion of Secondary Education among Muslims, Government give special grants to Sind Madressah at Karachi and the Madressah at Tando Bago. The Sind Madressah gets a grants of Rs. 46,000, while the Tando Bago Madressah gets a grant to the extent of half the admissible expenditure—the ordinary practice being $\frac{1}{3}$ rd in other cases.

367. The total Government expenditure on Secondary Education, namely, Rs. 4,78,800 works out to annas two per head of Indian population which must be admitted as very low. The grant of Rs. 26,800 made for the education of the Anglo-Indian and Europeans population works out at Rs. 3-2-0 per head of their population. The Government cost per annum per pupil of Indian communities works out to Rs. 21, whereas that for Anglo-Indian community at Rs. 79 per pupil. The total cost of European and Anglo-Indian education is Rs. 1,01,041 of which over $\frac{2}{3}$ rd is met by fees and community subscriptions. It may also be brought to notice that a sum of Rs. 12,600 is paid by Government by way of orphans' and destitute grant for the upkeep of such Anglo-Indians and European boarders and day pupils. Their number in 1936-37 was 146.

368. *Girls' Education* — The Chapter of Girls' Education may be said to be practically blank in the Province of Sind. There is not a single Government Institution devoted exclusively to education of girls, except a Vernacular Training College for Women

Teachers. The girls are allowed to join the Government High Schools where co-education prevails. Necessarily the percentage of admission is limited. All Institutions exclusively imparting education to girls are private enterprises. In the last 5 years such Institutions have increased from 326 to 386, or by 18.4 per cent. The number of girls in schools 5 years ago were 38,989; they number now 46,454—an increase of 19.1 per cent. Of these 31,332 are receiving education in the Girls' School and 13,005 in the recognised Boys' Schools and the rest 2,117 in the unrecognised Boys' and Girls' Schools together. The increase in the number of girls was 19.1 per cent. in comparison to 4 per cent. in the case of boys during the last 5 years. The percentage, however, of the increase in comparison to population has risen from 2.3 to 2.7 in the last five years.

369. The following statements of girls' institutions and pupils, percentage of literacy and expenditure, would be interesting:—

INSTITUTIONS AND PUPILS.

—	Number of institutions for girls.	Number of girls in Institutions for girls.	Number of girls in Institutions for boys.	Total number of girls under instruction.
1936-37.				
All Institutions excluding European and English Teaching School.	414	31,506	14,171	45,677
European Schools	2	279	117	396
English Teaching Schools ...	1	381	...	381
Total ...	417	32,166	14,288	46,454

DISTRIBUTIONS AMONG INSTITUTIONS.

—			No. of girls under instruction.	Percentage of increase in 5 years.
			1936-37.	
Art Colleges	205	61.4
Professional Colleges...
High Schools	3,596	55.1

223

				No. of girls under instruction.	Percentage of increase in 5 years.
				1936-37.	
Middle Schools	632	184.7
Primary Schools	39,625	15.3
Medical Schools	15	1.4
Normal and Training Schools	91	184.4
Commercial Schools	38	375.0
Technical and Industrial Schools	67	10.7
Schools for adults	6	200.0
Other Schools	35	52.2
Total, recognised				44,337	20.1
Total, un-recognised				2,117	1.8
GRAND TOTAL				46,454	19.1

DISTRIBUTIONS BY COMMUNITIES.

Community.				Number of girls under instruction.	Percentage increase during the quinquennium on total.	Percentage on total of female population of the community.
Europeans and Anglo-Indians	351	35.0	12.5
Indian Christians	568	10.7	20.2
Hindus	Advanced	25,404	30.6	11.0
	Intermediate	1,397	36.6	1.2
	Backward	619	34.0	0.6
Mohammedans	16,953	3.9	1.4
Parsis	407	11.5	24.4
Others	755	26.0	8.3
				45,454	19.1	2.7

The literacy percentages of Mohammedan community and of the Intermediate and Backward classes of Hindus are most disheartening.

EXPENDITURE AND ITS SOURCES.

	Secondary Schools.	Primary Schools.	Total.	Percentage to the total expendi- ture.
	1936-37	1936-37	1936-37	
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Provincial Funds ...	63,916	2,69,898	3,33,814	35.9
District Local Board Funds	25,609	25,609	2.7
Municipal Funds ...	9,261	1,96,943	2,06,204	22.2
Fees ...	1,46,456	29,276	1,75,732	19.0
Other sources ...	74,360	1,13,340	1,87,700	20.2
Total ...	2,93,993	5,35,066	9,29,056	100.0

370. *Expenditure*—The Government spent on girls' Education Rs. 3,33,814 by way of grants to Local Bodies and private managements for their Primary and Secondary Girls' Schools. The Training College for Women costs Rs. 26,177 and certain Special Schools for Girls Rs. 9,634 in 1936-37. The total expenditure on Institutions specially maintained for girls in that year was Rs. 9,64,860, which is about 17.9 per cent. of the total expenditure on education. The allotment provided in the budget estimates of 1938-39 for the Training College for Women is Rs. 28,300 inclusive of Rs. 3,500 given as stipends to girl-pupils. The Girls' Schools are due grants upto half the expenditure, but owing to financial stringency this has been reduced since 1933-34 to 1/3rd of the expenditure. Some schools do not receive even the reduced share on the score of want of funds.

371. *Wastage*.—There is considerable wastage in the girls' education too. The number of girls who entered infant class during 1931-32 was 14,258, but only 944 passed Vernacular Standard III and joined A.V. Schools and only 1,500 passed Vernacular Standard IV during 1936-37. This shows that only 17.1 per cent. attained literacy. The wastage in Primary Education of girls is, among other reasons, due to purdah system and inefficiency of Girls' Schools in general.

372. *Scholarship*.—There are 115 scholarships endowed by Government for girls:—

	No.	Value of each.
For prospective School Mistresses in Primary Schools.	{ 15 35	... 12 ... 7
For other pupils in Primary Schools.	30	... 3
For pupils in Secondary Schools.	{ 15 20	... 4 ... 5

Encouragement of this nature ought to be on a far more liberal scale.

373. *Primary Education*.—The recognised Vernaculars of the Province are Sindhi, Gujarati, Marathi and Urdu. The agencies for imparting this education are:—

(1) School Boards under Municipalities (Local Authorities).

(2) School Boards under District Local Boards (Local Authorities).

(3) Private managements controlling aided schools, *e.g.*,—

(i) Mulla Schools aided directly by Government

(ii) Schools aided by Local Authorities.

All these agencies receive grants-in-aid from Government on the following basis:—

(1) Municipalities receive half of the admissible expenditure.

(2) Local Boards receive 2/3rds of the admissible expenditure.

(3) Mulla Schools receive grants under several heads, *e.g.*,—

(a) Capitation grant.

(b) Assistants' pay and allowance.

(c) Accommodation grant, Rs. 150 every ten years.

- (d) Equipment grant.
- (e) *Lungis* and other rewards.
- (f) Prizes for good attendance.
- (g) Books and writing materials.
- (h) Prize books and slates.

374. *Expenditure.*—The expenditure under grants for primary education has ranged in the last 3 years and has been estimated for 1938-39 as under:—

	1935-36.	1936-37.	1937-38. Revised.	1938-39. Estimates.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Grant to Mulla Schools ...	1,64,140	1,64,346	1,87,600	2,17,600
Grant to Local Bodies Schools	16,33,954	16,86,685	18,54,400	18,69,400

375. *Training College.*—In order to help advancement of Primary Education, Government maintain Training College for Men and Women separately at Hyderabad and there are two practising schools attached to them which serve as model primary schools.

Besides these two Training Institutions, there are 3 other privately managed and located at Karachi, Sukkur and Shikarpur.

Before the 1923 Act, Primary education in districts (except Municipal areas) was controlled by Government through the Deputy Educational Inspectors and their Assistants.

In Municipal areas the Municipality exercised administrative control while inspection was done by the Government Inspectors. After the 1923 Act, 8 District Local Boards, 13 Municipalities and 4 Cantonments have been constituted Local Authorities and each Local Authority has a statutory School Board which carries on the work of Primary education administrative and inspectional. Each School Board has an Administrative Officer as its Chief Executive Officer and one or more Supervisors for inspection.

376. The subjoined statement shows the Administrative and Inspecting staff of the Local Authorities together with the number of schools and pupils.

Name of Local Authority.	No. of Administrative Officers.	No of Super-visors.	Number of schools.		Total.	Number of pupils.
			Maintained by Local Authority.	Approved, and aided by Local Authority.		
District Local Board, Karachi.	1	2	85	4	89	5,369
District Local Board, Hyderabad.	1	2	180	12	192	9,860
District Local Board, Thar Parkar.	1	2	139	7	146	6,640
District Local Board, Nawabshah.	1	2	169	8	177	10,686
District Local Board, Sukkur.	1	3	192	1	193	12,216
District Local Board, Upper Sind Frontier.	1	1	78	...	78	3,851
District Local Board, Larkana	1	2	182	1	183	12,447
District Local Board, Dadu ...	1	2	132	3	135	9,378
Municipality, Karachi ...	1	5*	131	58	189	28,735
Municipality, Hyderabad	1	2†	23	36	59	8,778
Municipality, Tando Muhammad Khan.	1	...	1	...	1	291
Municipality, Tando Adam ...	1	{ ...	2	3	5	940
Municipality, Shahdadpur ..		{ ...	2	1	3	649
Municipality, Mirpurkhas ...	1	...	2	1	3	618
Municipality, Rohri ...	1	...	4	...	4	954
Municipality, Sukkur ...	1	...	11	14	25	4,925
Municipality, Shikarpur ...	1	{ ...	13	19	32	5,196
Municipality, Garhi Yasin ...		{ ...	1	3	4	531
Municipality, Jacobabad joint with District Local Board, Upper Sind Frontier.	1	...	4	3	7	1,144
Municipality, Larkana ...	1	...	5	6	11	1,676
Municipality, Ratodero ...	1	...	3	...	3	639
Total ...	19	23	1,359	180	1,539	1,25,550

* Includes two Supervisors for Girls' Schools.

† Includes one Supervisor for Girls' Schools.

377. *Mulla Schools.*—The Mulla Schools in the Province number 840 with pupil population of 28,863. These are directly aided by Government and supervised and controlled by 3 Special Mulla Schools' Deputy Educational Inspectors and their 9 Assistants all borne on Government cadre.

378. *Progress.*—The 1932-37 quinquennium had not proved a progressive period for Primary Education. The number of Primary Schools stood at the end at 2,383 registering an increase of 2.3 while the number of pupils was 1,55,468 an increase of 6.9 per cent.

379. The subjoined table shows distribution of pupils in Primary Schools by communities in 1936-37.

Community.	No. of boys in Primary Schools.	Percentage to male population of the community.	No. of girls in Primary Schools.	Percentage to female population of the community.	Total No of pupils in the Primary Schools.	Percentage to total population of the community.
Europeans ...	26	0.4	20	0.7	46	0.5
Indian Christians.	246	6.4	265	9.5	514	7.7
Hindus--						
Advanced ...	45,739	16.9	21,619	9.3	67,358	13.4
Intermediate ...	3,800	2.3	1,348	1.1	5,148	1.8
Backward ...	3,151	2.3	598	0.6	3,749	1.6
Muhammadans ...	61,477	3.9	14,972	1.2	76,449	2.7
Parsis ...	170	9.1	149	8.9	319	9.0
Others ...	1,207	9.0	678	7.5	1,885	8.4

380. *Total Expenditure.*—The total expenditure on Primary Schools rose in the quinquennium from Rs. 30,67,603 to Rs. 31,23,896 and it was met from the following sources:—

				1931-32.	1936-37.
				Rs.	Rs.
Government Funds	17,83,416	17,12,872
Board Funds	7,53,032	9,13,801
Fees	61,449	83,502
Other sources	4,69,706	4,13,721
Total, Expenditure ...				30,67,603	31,23,896

381. The Director of Public Instruction estimates that 50 per cent. of boys and 20 per cent. of girls of school-going age are receiving primary education in the various public and private schools and $3\frac{1}{4}$ lakhs are being spent on primary education in the Province. If the remaining 50 per cent. boys and 80 per cent. girls were educated at Primary Schools the additional cost will be in the neighbourhood of Rs. 70 lakhs, besides enormous non-recurring expenditure. Primary education alone will thus absorb more than a crore—an ideal impossible of achievement during any conceivable period. The Government of India had therefore drawn attention to the fact that much of the money now spent on primary education was wasted and careful scrutiny of the ways of expenditure was essential. They have advised Local Government to revise their policy about Primary Schools and take such action as will ensure more profitable use of funds now spent.

382. *Wastage.*—The sub-joined table shows the wastage in primary education :—

Year.	Pupils in infant class.	Pupils in Standard IV, five years later.	Pupils passing Standard IV five years later.	Percentage of pupils Standard IV to pupils in infant class.	Percentage of pupils passing Standard IV to pupils in infant class.
1927-28	49,108
1931-32	...	13,391	9,444	27.3	19.2
1928-29	52,279
1932-33	...	13,983	9,522	26.7	18.2
1929-30	51,291
1933-34	...	14,686	10,527	28.6	20.5
1930-31	51,291
1934-35	...	14,87	11,141	29.0	21.7
1931-32	56,383
1935-36	...	14,795	11,660	26.2	20.7
1932-33	53,427
1936-37	...	14,913	11,100	27.9	20.8

383. The Director of Public Instruction of Sind (K. B. Ghulam Nabi Kazi) has made some very frank observations in this connection. A few extracts from his remarks in official communications may, therefore, be quoted. These should open eyes of those interested in Sind and its education and deserve to be pondered over by all.

"This table discloses an enormous wastage—a disheartening feature of the Primary education. Out of every 100 pupils receiving admission into a Primary school, hardly 20 per. cent. pass the fourth standard. This figure includes the figures of urban areas where population is far advanced. The number of pupils reaching this stage in rural areas must necessarily be much smaller. There is no doubt about tremendous wastage observable in Primary Schools. Out of 56,383 children who joined the infant class in the year 1931-32, only 20,614 or 36·6 per cent. passed standard I in the year 1932-33, while only 11,660 passed standard IV in the year 1935-36. Thus except for a small percentage of about 21, all others either stagnated or dropped out during the course of 5 years.

The financial implications of this waste may be gauged from the subjoined table of average cost of educating a pupil in a Primary School:—

Government	...	Rs. 22·1	per pupil per annum.
District Local Board	...	" 16·2	" "
Municipal	...	" 10·9	" "
Aided	...	" 5·4	" "
Average for all schools		Rs. 11·8	per pupil per annum.

The foregoing appalling picture of wastage has remained a standing problem for the Department to tackle. It is therefore worthwhile to survey and re-survey the whole situation and to consider in great detail, the various causes contributing to this state of things and to find out ways and means which might be helpful towards minimising the evil.

The question is whether the value obtained for the large amount of money spent on primary education is adequate. I am afraid the answer will be in the negative. Since the transfer of control, the transfers amongst the teaching staff have been indiscriminate and based upon considerations other

than those of improvement and efficiency. Favouritism is rampant and there is no appreciation of good and conscientious work. To have asked the Local Authorities to administer schools in these areas, would not have been so bad if the work of inspection had been carried out by the Government Inspecting Agency. There should have been independent staff of Inspectors who should have given a correct picture of the state of things existing in schools. But that is not the case now. The work of inspection is mainly done by the employees of the School Boards, who under the peculiar circumstances of their service, may give altogether unreliable account of schools. A bad teacher may easily become a very good one and a very good teacher may be condemned as a very bad teacher. The teaching staff have lost all zest for honest work. They do not feel secure and do not find it necessary to turn out good work. The Government Inspecting staff which is expected to do the super-check work, has suffered in numbers and also in status. It is necessary that this duty be done by an officer, not lower in status than the Administrative Officer of the School Board. But, the Deputy Educational Inspector with his Assistants has been replaced by one Assistant Deputy who may be in the grade of Rs. 45—170. He is the sole representative of Government in the district. The Local Authorities attach no importance to his suggestions and oftentimes resent them."

384. The new Government responsible to the elected legislature will be striving hard to develop and expand Primary Education. They will have to contribute 2/3rds of the expenditure in case of the District Local Boards, and one half on account of the Municipalities on all new schemes. It were proper, Government satisfied themselves that their present moneys are well spent and education is in efficient condition. It is felt that it is high time that the Primary Education Act be drastically revised, and Government Inspectorate thoroughly over-hauled before efficiency of work in Primary Schools can be expected. Unfortunately it is only in the Presidency of Bombay and this Province governed by the Bombay Primary Education Act, 1923, that things on account of grave flaws in the Act have, we were told, gone so hopelessly bad. In all other Provinces atleast the duty of inspection devolves on the Government Inspectorate.

385. *Reasons for wastage* —The Director of Public Instruction ascribes the wastage and leakage to:—

- (i) Inefficient teacher.
- (ii) Unsuitable houses.

- (iii) Unsuitable text books.
- (iv) Unsuitable courses.
- (v) Inefficient and unnecessary schools.
- (vi) Parental antipathy partly induced by the necessity to employ children for assistance in field labour.
- (vii) Ineffective supervision.
- (viii) Lax Administration.

386. *Importance of teacher.*—The most important factor in the life of school is the teacher himself. It has been observed that a teacher with good initiation into the technique of his work and with tact, initiative and attractive manner galvanizes even a drooping school and wins the affection and regard of not only the children but also of the apathetic parents, while a bad teacher brings ruination in a short time even of a good and flourishing school. A few teaches are born as such, but the bulk of them have to receive training to be good teachers. If the trained hand is given a living wage he will work contentedly and effectively, provided his work is correctly as-essed and properly appreciated. The ordinary Vernacular Final passed person who is considered qualified to work as a teacher is really not upto much. Therefore if we succeed in training every teacher without incurring much additional cost we should have achieved something. The work in school will be more effective, than before and the wastage and the stagnation appreciably reduced. With the object of increasing the percentage of trained men serving under the Local Authorities, the Director of Public Insruction, Poona, had submitted a scheme so to fix the pay of the new entrants serving on the teaching staff under the Local Authorities that the increase in the percentage of trained teachers should not result in corresponding increase in the cost to the Local Authorities, that scheme may be examined by Government.

387. Government should also consider the proposal of the Director of Public Instruction to restore the Matriculate teacher to his old rights and recognise him as 1st year trained teacher. A Matriculate is far superior to a mere Vernacular Final passed hand. He has better education, and will surely prove a more efficient teacher. In these days of unemployment it will be easy to have scores of them to serve as primary teachers specially in urban areas

388. *One-Teacher Schools.*—It will come as a surprise to many to know that a very large number of schools in each district are one

teacher-schools the percentage of one-teacher schools in each district being as under :—

56 per cent. in Karachi.

50 per cent in Hyderabad and Thar Parkar.

47 per cent. in Nawabshah.

23 per cent. in Dadu.

30 per cent in Sukkur.

26 per cent. in Larkana and Upper Sind Frontier.

Classified by managements, the one teacher-schools in the Province also cover a large percentage as will be evident from the subjoined table :—

Institutions.	Year.	No. of schools	No of one teacher schools.	Percentage to the total number of schools.
Government ...	1936-37	3	1	33.3
District Local Board ...	"	1,131	435	38.2
Municipal ...	"	231	5	2.2
Aided — (Mulla schools) ...	"	840	644	76.7
(Other Schools) ...	"	168	17	10.1
Unaided... ..	"	10	2	20.0
Total ...	1936-37	2,383	1,104	46.3

389. *Compulsory Primary Education.*—The Compulsory Primary Education has been carried out merely in name in the Province. So far in one ward in Karachi Municipality area had the compulsory scheme for boys been introduced in 1930. In the districts, Larkana taluka was made a compulsory area in 1929, similarly for boys, the number of villages under compulsion in the taluka being 613.

The following table will give some idea of the results of these two solitary compulsory schemes working in the Province :—

Area of compulsion.	Number of pupils in all primary schools in the area of compulsion.					
	No. of pupils previous to the introduction of compulsion.			On 31st March 1937.		
	Boys.	Girls.	Total.	Boys.	Girls.	Total.
Lyari and Trans-Lyari Quarters of Karachi City ...	2,529	...	2,529	4,697	120	4,817
Larkana taluka ...	1,633	109	1,742	3,850	405	4,255

In Karachi the actual enrolment rose from 45 per cent. to 86 per cent. of the boys of school-going age; 25 new schools were opened and 91 additional assistants were appointed. In Larkana taluka the actual enrolment rose from 30 per cent. to 75.5 per cent. of the boys of school-going age and 29 new schools and 62 additional teachers were appointed.

EDUCATION OF BACKWARD COMMUNITIES.

390. *Muslim Community.*—We have made some observations supported by figures indicative of meagre progress of higher education among backward communities. We now desire to give some more figures and facts which may draw the attention of all interested in the Province.

391. The Muslim community, which constitutes nearly $\frac{3}{4}$ ths of the Provincial population is educationally a most backward community. A very large section of it inhabits rural areas and is devoted to agricultural pursuits. Their economic condition is anything but satisfactory. The question of Mohammedan education is, therefore, properly regarded as not only a question of educationally backward community but that of a very poorly placed community. The Mohammedan population by the census of 1931 was 28,30,800 while there were only 82,086 pupils under instruction in all recognised schools in 1936-37, thus only 2.9 per cent. of the Muslim population were under instruction. The subjoined tables show the distribution of Muslim pupils in the several kinds of educational Institutions and the comparative percentage of pupils to population of different communities.

235

Distribution.

Instructions.	1936-37.	
	Boys.	Girls.
Art Colleges ...	167	1
Professional Colleges ...	31	...
Secondary Schools ...	4,567	184
Primary Schools ...	61,477	14,972
Special Schools... ..	672	15
Total, recognised ...	66,914	15,172
Total, unrecognised ...	5,945	1,781
GRAND TOTAL ...	72,859	16,953

Percentages.

				Percentage in	
				1931-32.	1936-37.
Hindus ...	Advanced	14.4	17.2
	Intermediate	2.1	2.1
	Backward	1.4	1.8
Average for Hindus				8.0	9.5
Mohammedans				2.9	2.9
Others				11.7	14.0
Average for the whole Province				4.3	4.7

	Hindus.			Moham- medans.	Others.
	Advanced.	Intermediate.	Backward.		
Higher Education ...	0.2	0.01	0.006	0.007	0.4
Secondary Education .	3.3	0.2	0.1	0.2	6.3
Primary Education ...	13.4	1.8	1.6	2.7	8.4

392. Government are said to be bestowing special attention to promote education among Muslim community. But much ground still requires to be covered. The Government have provided scholarships tenable in Arts College and Professional Colleges and have encouraged District Local Boards and other bodies to allot scholarships.

393. In the case of Secondary Education liberal grants are only given to two Muslim High Schools. Each Government High School is required to admit a certain percentage of Muslim students. Every second Muslim receiving collegiate education and every 7th student studying in a Secondary School is on an average a scholarship holder as there are in all 99 scholarships tenable at College and 700 scholarships tenable at Schools. Free studentships are allotted to Muslims to the extent of 30 per cent. of the total limited to 15 per cent. of attendance.

394. Primary Education is specially encouraged and advanced among Muslims by Mulla Schools.

The total number of Mulla Schools in the Province was 840 in 1936-37, imparting instruction to 28,803 pupils, i.e., roughly 40 per cent. of the total Muslim pupils receiving Primary Education. Mulla Schools have been particularly helpful in spreading education among girls. Out of 14,972 girls receiving Primary Education in 1936-37, 4,290 girls belonged to Mulla Girls' Schools. It is the earnest desire of the Department to introduce Primary course in Mulla Schools. But so far much success has not attended their efforts. At present only 335 out of 840 schools are teaching the Primary course. The progress may not, however, be regarded as very disappointing as there were only 165 such schools in 1931-32 and 268 in 1935-36.

In the year 1936-37, the Mulla Schools received grants as under :—

Capitation grant	...	Rs. 1,12,099
Assistants	...	„ 28,887
Accommodation grant	...	„ 6,000
Equipment grant	...	„ 3,967
Lungis and other rewards	...	„ 1,000
Prizes for good attendance...	...	„ 2,099
Books and writing materials	...	„ 4,996
Prize books and slates	...	„ 1,001
Total	...	<u>Rs. 1,60,049</u>

Government have decided to supplement the grants by an additional amount of Rs. 25,905 and 100 Assistant Teachers in the year 1938-39.

In addition to this expenditure, Government support the Special Inspection Agency for Mulla Schools. There are three Moham-medan Deputy Educational Inspectors and 9 Assistants engaged specially for Mulla Schools. Their annual cost is Rs 47,000.

INTERMEDIATE AND BACKWARD.

395. *Hindu Community*.—We have made some remarks about the poor progress of education among these classes.

The subjoined table gives distribution of pupils of these two classes attending the various Institutions in 1936-37 :—

Colleges	41
Secondary Schools	810
Primary Schools	8,897
Training Schools	1
Special Schools	198
Total				9,947

396. Special facilities provided by Government for these classes are the following :—

Scholarships.

College.	No.	Value.
Intermediate Hindus	4	Rs. 20
Backward Hindus	4	„ 20
Total	8	

Secondary Schools.

Intermediate Hindus	7	Rs. 4, 5, 6 & 8
Backward Hindus	35	„ 4, 5, 6 & 8
Total	42	

Free Studentships.

Intermediate Hindus	22½ per cent. of the total number of pupils.
Backward Hindus	All free.

Advanced Hindus' allotted number of $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. freeships is foregone in favour of the above two classes.

397. It will be noticed that the encouragement offered to these Backward Hindu classes is comparatively very meagre. These classes have suffered by reason of being least vocal and having least political backing. Further, being grouped under the head Hindus, their condition has not attracted requisite attention.

398. The Director of Public Instruction recently investigated into the educational condition of classes specially known as 'depressed' in Sind at the request of the Harijan Sewak Sang. He reported to Government that the 'depressed' classes number 99,551 and the number of pupils are only 3,800, i.e., 3.1 per cent. Regarding them as educationally backward he had suggested an allotment of Rs. 2,500 for scholarships and a grant for the Hostel at Nagar Parkar. The Committee cannot help observing that Government are spending Rs. 29,000 for reforming only a few habitual criminals calling it Criminal Tribes' reform. It ought to be their special duty to raise this backward community by bringing education nearer their door.

ADULT EDUCATION.

399. This is a problem and a large one too for the whole country and specially for a Province like Sind which is very backward in education. The adult illiterate population in the Province consists of 87 per cent. males and 98 per cent. females. So far there are only 24 schools for adults in our Province and 721 learners. 5 are managed by District Local Boards, 3 by Municipalities and 14 by private bodies. Of these, only 2 are Secondary Schools in Karachi for labouring classes and peons who may be anxious to obtain some knowledge of English; both are privately managed.

22 Primary Schools cost	Rs. 5,234
-------------------------	-----	-----	-----------

2 Secondary Schools cost	„ 2,020
--------------------------	------	-----	---------

Total	...	Rs. 7,254
-------	-----	-----------

Government grant amounts to Rs. 2,069 for this purpose.

400. There are various methods being tried in this country for adult education. Some zealous expert reformers have on hand schemes for educating adults rapidly within a period of 3 to 6 months. These are being experimented by other Provincial Governments. We suggest that the Sind Government must immediately get into touch with other Provinces where these experiments are being conducted and take a leaf out of their experience.

401. We would further advise that Government should make a beginning for promotion of adult education by taking steps to impart primary education to the Jail population and the illiterate Police force in Government employ. They should make it obligatory for factory owners to provide facilities for imparting primary education to the adult labour employed in factories.

402. *Education for juvenile offenders.* A Remand Home for juvenile boy and girl offenders has been started at Karachi. There are 7 boys in it. A demand for education in some technical line is bound to arise sooner or later for juvenile offenders. Government will have to consider this problem at an early date.

403. *Education of defectives.*—There is one School for the Blind in the City of Karachi. There are 600 blind children in the Province of whom only 40 are being trained. There is no provision for girls. The difficulty is the residential accommodation. The Ida Rieu Poor Welfare Association runs the School at a cost of Rs. 13,473 of which Rs. 2,500 are provided by the Government. There is no school for the deaf and the mute in the Province. No one will deny the necessity of such Institutions in our Province, and Government should bestow attention as soon as funds become available.

404. *Teaching of Handicraft and Agriculture.*—Handicraft and Agriculture bias curriculum has been adopted in a few schools, but the results have been very disappointing. The Hyderabad Municipality have introduced spinning and weaving in some schools. Weaving classes are run under private management in vernacular school at Ghotki in Sukkur district. There are 7 Agricultural bias classes. The subjects are taught in V, VI, VII Vernacular Standards. The total number of pupils attending these classes is 131, of whom 94 are agriculturists and 37 non-agriculturists. It is said that this experiment has failed owing to deficiency of water supply and the attraction of Government service for the ordinary Schools passed hands. But the real cause, in our opinion, is that the experiment has not been pursued with necessary zeal and drive.

405. *Special Schools*.—We have already referred to the Medical School at Hyderabad in the Chapter on Hospitals. There are 6 Technical Schools of which one is maintained by Jacobabad Municipality and 5 by private bodies, of these three are for women. The crafts' schools for boys teach Carpentry, Smithy, Drawing, Sign Board Painting, Lacquer work, Wood turning and Carving, Wiring, Cane work and Oil painting. Women are taught Embroidery, Needle-work and Tailoring. Technical education both for youths and adults is a great help in these days and a vital necessity. Government ought to encourage Municipalities and Local Boards and private bodies in every district to establish such schools either separately or along with the High Schools. A very modest beginning is made in Virbaiji Parsi Boys High School in Karachi. This School has made technical work compulsory for IV, V and VI Standards. We would draw the attention of Government to this experiment. It will at least make boys hard-working and mechanically minded. Besides improving their physique, it will remove apathy for mechanical work and labour, thus rendering life more contented.

There are 8 Schools for commercial education, 6 being situated in Karachi. 606 students are being trained at these Institutions. Their total cost was Rs. 15,305 in 1936-37.

For all these Special Schools, Government had provided an allotment of Rs. 6,100 besides a sum of Rs. 300 incurred for training 6 Sindhi students in the Sir J. J. School of Art at Bombay.

SCHOLARSHIPS, ETC.

406. It is interesting to take notes of Government expenditure on Scholarships tenable at several Educational Institutions:—

Colleges—

Arts	Rs. 14,360
Professional	„ 1,700
Military	„ 1,000

Schools—

Secondary	„ 76,340
Primary	„ 19,000
Military	„ 1,000

Total	...	Rs. 1,13,400.
-------	-----	---------------

The allotment for Primary education scholarships is obviously very inadequate and requires to be substantially increased. In this connection we would like to emphasise that selection for the grant of scholarships should be very carefully made being principally based on pecuniary needs of applicants coupled with brilliant scholastic and collegiate career. Special inducement should be offered for taking up a Professional course. Other miscellaneous educational matters supported by Government are the following:—

Literary Productions	Rs. 600
Boy Scouts Associations	„ 3,500
Girls Guides	„ 1,000
Dakshna Fellowship	„ 720
Interprovincial Board for European Education	„ 300
Total	Rs. 6,120

SUPERVISION AND ADMINISTRATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOLS.

407. We cannot do better than quote some remarks of the Director of Public Instruction on the present defective system of Supervision and Administration of Schools in order to lend support to the recommendations formulated by the Committee:—

“The Administrative Officer is entirely at the mercy of the Chairman and the members. In most cases, he is a miserable creature because he is seldom allowed to exercise his discretion. Not only he, per force, has to connive at the irregularities on the part of the Board but sometime by sheer force of circumstances he becomes a party to some serious irregularities himself. He cannot reward merit and punish vice when he so wishes.

The supervisors have in many cases grown irresponsible and indifferent to their work. They are influenced by the School Board members and not unoften their remarks about teachers are vitiated by this influence so that good and capable teachers get bad remarks and bad teachers get schools carrying allowances and situated at places of advantage.

The teachers are exploited by some influential members for their personal aggrandisement in the matter of elections, etc. Those that render help in these matters, are the favourites and receive all kinds of rewards. Those who cannot or do not, are marked out for all kind of punishments. The transfers of teachers are, therefore, often times made not on public grounds and in the interests of schools, but to satisfy personal considerations.

Efficiency all round has degenerated and we are not having the value of the huge amount of money that is being spent every year. Thus in spite of apparent increase of schools and pupils which can only be ascribed to normal awakening in the masses for education, it is an open secret that there is degeneration and deterioration all round. I think that there are serious flaws in the Primary Education Act and the rules thereunder, for in their enthusiasm to make a living reality of Local Self Government, the authors of the Act did not properly calculate the effects of the unrestricted transfer of control of Supervisory staff to local bodies. Government did not only give away all the control to local bodies but they completely weakened their own Inspection staff "

408. We have also before us a copy of the report of the Vernacular Education Committee of the Central Advisory Board of Education presided over by the Honourable Mr. Kher, Premier of Bombay. This Committee met at Simla in September last to consider certain questions connected with the administration and control of Primary Education. This Committee's report lends full support to the proposals contained in the memorandum submitted by the Director of Public Instruction in Sind, to our Committee. This Committee had made many valuable suggestions with regard to the improvement of the tone of administration and prevention of wastage in Primary Education. It transpired that after taking part in the deliberations of this Committee, Honourable Mr. Kher, Premier of Bombay, pressed the matter energetically and has had the Bombay Primary Education Act of 1923 amended by his Legislative Assembly. The reforms introduced by the Amending Act may be summarised as under :—

- (1) The Administrative Officer should be appointed and shall be the servant of the Provincial Government ; his pay, powers and duties shall be as prescribed by Government.
- (2) The Provincial Government may appoint such officers as may be necessary to inspect approved schools. The Officers so appointed shall be servants of the Provincial Government. Their pay, powers and duties shall be prescribed by Government.
- (3) A Provincial Board of Education shall be constituted to advise Government on educational matters.
- (4) Educational qualifications of members of School Boards have been prescribed.

- (5) Nominations have been abolished.
- (6) Provisions about disqualification of membership have been inserted.
- (7) Appeal has been provided against validity of elections of School Boards.
- (8) Powers of supervision and supersession have been vested in the Director and Government respectively.
- (9) Provision for removal of Chairman and Vice-Chairman has been inserted.

409. The Director of Public Instruction in Sind has made the following suggestions for the promotion of primary education along sound lines:—

- (1) Number of trained teachers should be increased.
- (2) There should be well ventilated and well lighted school buildings and at the same time simple and cheap.
- (3) Text books require to be brought in line with the times.
- (4) Changes in curriculum should be effected.
- (5) Inefficient schools in the Province should be weeded out. Though one Teacher Schools under local circumstances are an unavoidable evil, resort may be had to the appointment of pupil-teachers in such schools.
- (6) Inspectorate should be independent, so that their inspection reports may be worthy of reliance. The Inspection of Schools be done by Government Agency. This will require re-adjustment of relations between Government and Local Authorities necessitating amendment of the Act and Rules.
- (7) Position of the Government Inspecting Officer should be improved. He should at least have equal status and pay with the Administrative Officer and be a Gazetted Officer in the scale of Rs. 170—500.
- (8) The minimum qualifications of Chairman should be defined. He should be an English knowing man with sufficient knowledge, to be able to read and understand Government orders so as not to have the excuse of being ignorant of rules.

DIRECTION AND INSPECTION.

410. The Head of the Department is the Director of Public Instruction. Before separation, Sind was administered for educational purposes from Bombay. On separation, the most Senior Officer in the Educational Department of Sind was made Director with a special grade pay of Rs. 1,200—50—1,500 outside the time-scale of Provincial Service, Class I.

411. The total directional cost to Government is estimated for the year 1938-39 at Rs. 54,800. The staff consists of—

1 Director of Public Instruction	...	Rs. 13,410
1 Personal Assistant (170—500)	...	„ 8,400
17 Office staff (30—300)	„ 20,255
8 Peons (10—18)	...	„ 1,544
Allowances	...	„ 6,000
Contingencies	...	„ 4,500
Total	...	<u>Rs. 54,800</u>

412. The Director of Public Instruction has represented necessity for additional staff indicated in the subjoined table showing the present and the proposed strength:—

		Present. Rs.	Proposed. Rs.
1 Superintendent...		180—10—260	200—10—300
1 Accountant ...		150—5—200	200—10—300
			with Superintendent's designation.
5 Senior Clerks ...	1	105—5—140	1 105—5—140
	4	95—5—125	5 95—5—125
	<u>5</u>		<u>6</u>
9 Junior Clerks ...	4	85—5/2—100	4 85—5/2—100
	2	30—5/2—80	2 30—5/2—80
	1	25—5/2—55	2 25—5/2—55
		60—5/2—75	60—5/2—75
	2	25—5/2—55	4 25—5/2—55
	<u>9</u>		<u>12</u>
1 Stenographer ...		80—5—140	80—5—140
1 Daftari	1 24—1—29

The average additional cost has been worked out at Rs. 2,665 per annum. Various reasons have been adduced for strengthening the staff and improving the pay scales of the Superintendent and Accountant. He has drawn upon his experience of two years and has referred to the considerable increase in the correspondence and account work as is but natural in a head office. It is to be borne in mind that the Sind Director's office is both a Director's and Inspector's office. The office staff of the Educational Inspector for Sind numbered 13 before separation. The addition of 4 clerks merely was obviously very meagre when the Bombay Director had 3 Superintendents and 45 clerks in his office alone.

413. *Inspection.*—The Inspection cost is estimated at Rs. 1,13,200. The staff consists of:—

- 1 Educational Inspector for Sind. (This appointment has been held in abeyance).
- 1 Inspectress in Sind.
- 3 Deputy Inspectors.
- 18 Assistant Deputy Inspectors.
- 16 Clerks.
- 41 Peons.

The Director of Public Instruction reported that there is no room for any retrenchment. In his opinion the inspection is meagre and insufficient and he gives this as a reason for enormous wastage in education—Primary and Secondary. We have referred to the wastage in education in previous chapters.

414. *Educational Inspector for Sind.*—He has made an earnest appeal for the revival of Educational Inspector's post, and he requests that as the budget provision exists, the post should be filled up at an early date. In support of this request he has emphasised the following factors:—

(i) The Sind Director of Public Instruction's Office has not been adequately manned compared to that of the Director of Public Instruction for Bombay.

The latter has Gazetted staff of:—

- 1 Deputy Director of Public Instruction, I.E.S.
- 1 Assistant Director of Public Instruction, B.E.S., Class I.
- 3 Superintendents, B.E.S., Class II, in his office. For inspection and administration work in the districts; there are 4 Educational Inspectors, one each for three Divisions and one for Bombay.

(ii) The Sind Separation Officer, who had investigated into the requirements of separated Sind administration, had included the appointment of an Educational Inspector in the Educational Departmental organization of the Province in addition to the Personal Assistant already working with the Educational Inspector in the pre-separation days. The Miles-Irving Committee had also included this appointment.

(iii) The Director of Public Instruction without the Educational Inspector is more an Inspecting than a Directing Officer. He has to function both as Educational Inspector and Director of Public Instruction, never done anywhere.

(iv) High School Inspection work is on the increase every year, there are 17 High Schools in Karachi and 29 outside.

(v) Much of his time is taken up in attending to the public in the present days of democracy and reformed Councils.

(vi) He is left with very little time for thinking out and maturing schemes for improvement and advancement of Education in the Province.

415. We are told that the Educational Institutions have multiplied very much since the Primary Education Act was passed as will be evident from the subjoined comparative table:—

		Colleges.		Schools.				Total.
		Arts.	Profes- sional.	High.	Middle.	Primary.	Special.	
For Boys—								
No. of Institu- tions.	{ 1923-24 ...	2	1	14	43	1,581	28	1,669
	{ 1936-37 ...	3	2	42	117	2,022	40	2,226
No. of Pupils.	{ 1923-24 ...	677	100	4,925	2,744	80,665	1,076	90,187
	{ 1936-37 ...	1,262	301	14,291	6,697	126,627	2,095	1,51,273
For Girls—								
No. of Institu- tions.	{ 1923-24	5	1	218	9	233
	{ 1936-37	10	8	361	7	386
of Pupils.	{ 1923-24	697	45	14,701	173	15,616
	{ 1936-37	3,204	499	28,841	158	32,702

416. The Director of Public Instruction is expected to visit Colleges, hold detailed inspection of all High Schools, cursory inspection of most Middle Schools and casual inspection of some Primary and Special Schools. A large sum of Rs. 2,82,400 is paid as grant-in-aid to Secondary Schools, and Rs. 84,200 to Colleges in Sind. Assessment of grant-in-aid, involving financial implications should be made by a high responsible Officer.

417. The Director of Public Instruction has requested the Committee to consider all these factors and support his proposal for the revival of the post of Educational Inspector for Sind. He does not ask for additional staff for the Educational Inspector, as he will work with Director of Public Instruction's Office Staff.

418. *Assistant Inspectress.*—The next pressing necessity urged by the Director is the creation of the appointment of Assistant Inspectress, Girls' Schools. It has been ascertained from the Director's Office that the Inspectress of Girls' Schools is concerned with the following Primary and other Schools for Girls:—

		Institutions.	Pupils.
Primary Local Board	...	73	28,841
„ Municipal	...	76	
„ Approved	...	68	
„ Mulla	...	144	
Secondary A. V. Schools	...	8	499
High Schools	...	10	3,204
Special Schools	...	7	158
Total		386	32,702

The difficulty of carrying out inspection of so many Institutions spread far and wide with any measure of efficiency is self-evident. The Director of Public Instruction says that some of the Schools receive their turn of the Inspectress' visit in three or four years. She is unable to devote any time to Mulla Girls' Schools—the town schools taking most of her time and attention. The Director's proposal is to create an appointment of Assistant Inspectress in the grade of 170—10—250—15—325 B. E. S., Class II. The average annual cost on account of pay would be Rs. 3,115. We endorse that it is impossible for one lady to carry out the work and we feel that one Assistant Inspectress is an immediate necessity.

419. Two other matters stressed by the Director of Public Instruction are :—

- (1) Taking over of the Administrative Officers and Supervisors of the School Boards by Government.
- (2) Expansion of the Government inspection staff and improvement of their status.

420. *Administrative Officers and Supervisors.*—In our remarks on Primary Education, we have emphasised (receiving support from the conclusions of the Vernacular Sub-Committee presided over by Honourable Mr. Kher, Premier of Bombay, and the opinion of the Director of Public Instruction that the inspection of educational institutions was very inadequate and Primary Education had in consequence deteriorated. The two remedies suggested were improvement of the Government Educational staff and transfer of inspection agency of School Boards to Government. The Bombay Government have already passed the Primary Education Amendment Act designed to effect the second reform.

421. Before the transfer of control of Primary Education to Local Bodies under the Act of 1923, the Sind Inspectorate consisted of :—

				Rs.
7 Deputy Educational Inspectors	...	Old scale	...	250—800
		New „	...	170—500
16 Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors	...	Old scale	...	80—250
		New „	...	45—170
3 Mulla Deputy Educational Inspectors	...	Same as Deputy Educational Inspector.		
9 Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors	...	Same as Assistant Deputy Educational Inspector.		

After the passing of the Primary Education Act, 1923, the administrative and inspectional control over Primary Schools other than Mulla Schools was transferred to Local Bodies, who employed Administrative Officers and Supervisors. Towards the pay of these officers Government contribute the full amount of their pay in cases where Government lent hands are working, while in other cases, Government give as grant the minimum pay plus $\frac{1}{3}$ rd of the difference between maximum and minimum of the pay so far as District School Boards are concerned and half of pay in the case of the Municipal School Boards.

422. The Director of Public Instruction has reiterated that administration of these Schools leaves much to be desired and on account of unwarranted and frequent transfers of teachers, efficiency and work of Schools have suffered to a great extent. Even otherwise he deems it highly desirable that there should be an independent Inspecting staff to report on the Primary Schools over which Government spend huge amounts every year. We have referred at length to this aspect of the question and buttressed our argument with the weight of the opinion of the Vernacular Committee of the Central Advisory Board presided over by Honourable Mr. Kher. The Bombay Government had already taken requisite steps in this direction. It may therefore be reasonably argued that as Sind sailed in the same boat with Bombay and the defects of the Primary Education Act had similarly affected adversely the course of Primary Education in Sind, the Sind Government would be well advised to follow the lead given by Bombay.

423. The Director of Public Instruction has accordingly proposed to bring all Administrative Officers and Supervisors of the District and Municipal School Boards under Government Service. The number of Administrative Officers and Supervisors at present employed under all School Boards and their present average cost to Government is as under :—

8 Administrative Officers of District School Boards ...	Rs. 26,893
17 Supervisors of District School Boards. „	28,018
11 Administrative Officers of Municipal School Boards ...	8,474
7 Supervisors of Municipal School Boards... „	9,158
Total ...	<u>Rs. 72,543</u>

The Director of Public Instruction estimates that the average additional cost of taking over this staff on Government estimates entirely will be as under after retrenching some superfluous staff in the Municipal sections :—

For Administrative Officers of District School Board ...	Rs. 3,532
For Supervisors of District School Boards. „	9,262
For Administrative officers of Municipal School Boards... „	4,205
For Supervisors of Municipal School Boards. „	8,020
Total ...	<u>Rs. 25,019</u>

It would be worthwhile incurring this comparatively slight additional expenditure in order to give proper tone to the educational movement and save it from certain deterioration on account of unwholesome influence of the Boards' members.

424. *Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors.*—The Director of Public Instruction has pressed strongly for expansion of the Government Inspection Agency and improvement of their status and pay. We have dealt at length with this matter in our observations about the state of Primary Education. In this matter too the Honourable Mr. Kher's Committee had stressed the present defective arrangement. The present Government Inspection agency comprises 8 Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors in the grade of 45—170—one for each district. It is not unreasonably urged by the Director that these Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors carry little weight with Local Bodies and private managing bodies of Schools both Primary and Secondary. Their official status is below that of the Administrative Officers of Local Bodies. Naturally their opinion is under-rated and their criticism resented. The Director has urged that the present Government Inspecting Agency be raised to the rank and status of Deputy Educational Inspectors in the scale of Rs. 170—500 prescribed for Class II, Provincial Educational Service. The Director of Public Instruction has worked the additional cost of this urgent reform at Rs. 12,522. He has also proposed an additional Clerk on Rs. 85—5/2—100 and two peons for each Deputy Educational Inspector. The extra average cost of this additional staff has been calculated as under:—

8 Clerks	Rs. 9,366
16 Peons	„ 3,684
Total			Rs. 13,050

Travelling allowances, contingencies, service stamps and rent will involve an additional expenditure of Rs. 7,698. The aggregate expenditure on the proposed improvement of Government Inspection Agency has been worked out to Rs. 33,270 per annum.

425. On second consideration of the question the Director has modified his proposal and asked for 5 officers of the Deputy Educational Inspectors' rank in a scale of Rs. 170—10—250—15—400 in place of the existing 8 Assistant Deputy Educational Inspectors, thereby retrenching three latter appointments. Further, in view of salary standards of the present incumbents of the 8 Assistant Deputies posts and their gradual retirement, he has worked out that even if the present 8 posts of Assistant Deputies were converted to an equal number of Deputies the additional annual cost in the next 10 years will be as under :—

First year	Rs. 1,200
2nd	„	...	„ 2,400
3rd	„	...	„ 3,700
4th	„	...	„ 4,000
5th	„	...	„ 2,900
6th	„	...	„ 3,500
7th	„	...	„ 3,600
8th	„	...	„ 1,400
9th	„	...	„ 2,000
10th	„	...	„ 1,900

As, however, he has on further consideration proposed the raising of only 5 posts to Deputy Educational Inspectors' rank in a scale of Rs. 170—400 and retrenchment of 3 posts of Assistant Deputies, he observes that the additional cost of the conversion of 5 posts will be more than covered by the savings of the retrenched 3 posts. We have accepted the modified proposals of the Director of Public Instruction.

426. *Committee's recommendations.*—The Committee have dealt with all the activities of the Department of Education at great length as their importance could not be sufficiently emphasised otherwise. We have not only traced some recent history and progress of the movement but have drawn attention to several draw-backs and very valuable suggestions received for its general and special improvement. After very careful consideration of the several aspects of this nation-building department, we have come to certain conclusions, which we record below together with our recommendations for very earnest consideration and early adoption by Government.

427. The Committee are not satisfied with the functioning of the Primary Education Act, 1923. There are many flaws in its working which must be remedied so that the deterioration that has set in may be checked, and progress on sound lines be advanced. To achieve this object—

(a) the Bombay Primary Education Act, 1923, should be suitably amended. The Committee generally approve the outlines of the Bombay Primary Education Amending Act, 1938, recently passed by the Bombay Legislative Assembly and they strongly advise the Sind Government to introduce a similar legislative measure in the Sind Legislative Assembly. Minimum educational qualification for membership and chairmanship of the School Boards should be prescribed and the Committee consider the under-mentioned qualifications as essential:—

6th Standard English passed	...	} For member-
or		
Vernacular Final	...	} ship.
Matriculation Examination	...	
or		} For Chairman-
School Leaving Certificate	...	
		ship ;

(b) the Administrative Officers and Supervisors of School Boards whether of the District Local Boards or Municipal Local Authorities including those of the Karachi and Hyderabad Municipalities should be converted into fully paid Government servants subordinate to the Director of Public Instruction. Their powers and duties *vis-a-vis* their School Boards and Local Authorities and their pay-scales should be prescribed by Government. Such present officers whose appointments have been approved by Government should be taken over by Government as their employees. They will, however, continue to work under the authority of the School Boards and Local Authorities. Since they will also be responsible to the Head of the Educational Department, they should be required to refer important matters of difference of opinion to the Director of Public Instruction. Further as they will be fully paid Government servants, they shall be liable to be transferred by the Director of Public Instruction subject to general authority of Government from one local area to another. The scale of the Administrative Officer should be Rs. 170—10—350, while the scales of the Supervisors should remain as they are.

428. Following steps should be taken for the advancement of Education in the Province :—

A.—Primary..

- (1) Number of Schools must be increased.
- (2) Special facilities should be provided for raising proportion of literacy among 28 lakhs of Mohammedans, and 5 lakhs of Intermediate and Backward Hindu classes, who all sail in the same boat and among whom roughly 98 per cent. are illiterate.
- (3) Wastage which is enormous should be stopped.
- (4) The number of trained teachers should be increased.
- (5) Employment of matriculates as teachers in Primary Schools should be encouraged being preferred to Vernacular Final passed untrained hands. The great advantage would be that one year's training course for a matriculate will equip him for his work as much as three years' course for a Vernacular Final passed man. Great saving combined with considerable efficiency will be thereby achieved.
- (6) Training classes should be established by Government at all district headquarter towns for giving training to local and district teachers.
- (7) Evening classes should be conducted by the Local Administrative Officers and Supervisors for the local teachers in Municipal areas, so that in a year all the untrained teachers will have received sufficient grounding in the art of teaching, and completed the first year's training course. Special efforts should be made in Karachi for training of Urdu, Gujrati and Marathi teachers of Girls' Schools. A missionary zeal should be introduced into these local training centres.
- (8) Kindergarten teaching should be introduced in the Training Institutions so that passed teachers may carry the methods to their schools.
- (9) Free and compulsory education schemes should be advanced vigorously so that within the course of ten years the whole Province may bristle with educational activities. One Taluka in each district should be taken each year so as to complete the expansion in a course of 7 to 10 years.

(10) All schemes for voluntary expansion of Primary Education prepared by the Local Authorities should in the meanwhile be encouraged and decision be reached by Government within three months of their submission. Papers relating to schemes for voluntary expansion whether agreed to by Government or not, should be placed on the Council Table as they arise during the interval between two Sessions.

(11) One teacher-schools should be reduced as far as possible. Wherever there are more than 30 regularly attending pupils spread in more than two standards in a school, an Assistant Teacher should be posted to such a school. Same rule should also apply to Mulla Schools.

(12) Every Mulla should be required to make his school fit for curriculum of 3 Primary Standards and show such results within 3 years of its first registration and of 4 Primary standard in the next two years. Else the registration should be cancelled and grant confiscated.

(13) Vocational bias pertaining to Agriculture or other small industry should be provided in all Taluka headquarter schools and others having student population of not less than 50 in V, VI and VII Vernacular standards collectively and all Middle and High Schools.

(14) It is necessary to attract children of Haris and Harijans to take to primary education. These classes being very poor employ their children for grazing cattle. Some inducement is, therefore, required to be offered. It would be very helpful if Government created 200 scholarships in each district—total 1,600 scholarships of rupee one each for such children. An additional expenditure of Rs. 19,200 per annum is well worth incurring for such object.

(15) The present number of scholarships for Girls attending in Primary Schools is most inadequate. The existing 50 scholarships of varying values for Girls studying in Primary Schools while they are under agreement to be prospective School Mistresses should be increased to 100 of uniform value of Rs. 5. These girls will, while taking training at the Female Training College, Hyderabad, be paid the usual stipend fixed for that Institute.

(16) Similarly the existing number of 30 scholarships for Girls attending Primary school is obviously insufficient. These should be substantially increased. There should be at least 50 scholarships for Girls in each district—total 400 for the Province. The value of these 400 scholarships should be fixed at Rs. 3 per month each.

B.—Secondary.

(1) Steps should be taken to prevent existing wastage.

(2) Wherever outside the district headquarter towns there is a pressing demand for a Middle or High School and sufficient number of pupils are forthcoming, private enterprise should be encouraged by payment of 50 per cent. of the recurring expenditure by the State. This should be rigidly adhered to. A request for grant-in-aid in suitable case should not be ignored for any reason.

(3) The N. J. High School at Karachi should be abolished. Its premises should be disposed of. The Bunder Road frontage part should be sold for business and residential purposes and the remaining portion should be added to Civil Hospital for its expansion. Value realised from the sale of road frontage part will possibly suffice for the cost of the Hospital expansion. While on this question the Committee will as well suggest disposal of sites of—

- (1) Educational Offices on Bunder Road.
- (2) Old Judicial Commissioner's Court and Offices on McLeod Road.
- (3) Executive Engineer, Karachi Buildings Division Offices on Victoria Road.
- (4) Mukhtiarkar's Kutchery on Bunder Road.

These sale proceeds should be utilised for opening suggested Technical Schools, Professional Colleges and general educational purposes.

C.—Technical.

Technical Schools for training in mechanical and other arts and crafts should be opened at two centres, one in North Sind and other in South Sind for 100 students each. The Committee would in this connection suggest to Government to take over and develop the Victoria Jubilee Technical Institute, Sukkur, as Government Technical Institute.

D.—Physical Culture.

Physical culture training should be given to Teachers at each of the proposed district headquarters Training Institutions, on the lines lately adopted by the Government of Bombay.

E.—Collegiate.

Secondary Training, Medical and Agricultural Colleges should be established in the Province. If the establishment of a College for degree of Bachelor of Training in conjunction with the D. J. Sind College, is not a feasible proposition acceptable to the University of Bombay, Government should take steps to establish a course of Secondary Training Diploma in conjunction with the Government High School at Karachi. This even will effectively serve the purpose in view. The Committee are of the opinion that no more Arts Colleges should be assisted in Sind, and the existing grants of the Arts Colleges should not be increased.

Military training should be made compulsory in all collegiate institutions.

F.—University.

The Committee agree with the Dow Committee in their remarks about a University for Sind. Government should start with the preliminary work as suggested by the Dow Committee. In the meanwhile the Sind Government should represent to the Bombay Government for increasing the representation of the Province of Sind on the Senate, Syndicate and Academic Council of the Bombay University. Sind should have 1/5th representation electoral and nominational. The Director of Public Instruction's suggestions for more effective representation are supported. Strong representation should in addition be made, for according to the Sind Legislative Assembly, the right of electing two representatives from among its members on the Senate of the Bombay University.

G.—Education of Defectives.

One Central Institution for imparting education to the Blind, Deaf and Dumb should be opened in the Province.

H—Literary Production.

The present allotment of Rs 600 for prizes to authors of literary works is very meagre. Sindhi literature can only be enriched if the authors are reasonably encouraged. The Committee recommend that this allotment should be very substantially raised. A sum of Rs. 2,000 per annum will not be excessive.

429. *Departmental Staff.*—(a) The Director of Public Instruction's pay should be fixed at Rs. 1,000—50—1,250 corresponding to that proposed by the Committee for Provincial Service Collector and District Judge.

(b) One Assistant Inspectress be appointed as the Inspectress cannot cope with the inspection work of the female educational institutions of the Province. The Committee suggest the scale of Rs. 170—10—350 for the Assistant Inspectress, who should be a B.A., B.T., or a B.A. with ten years experience of teaching.

CHAPTER XIX.

CO-OPERATIVE DEPARTMENT.

430. The Co-operative Department in Sind which came into being nearly 20 years ago and was started with a staff of one Assistant Registrar, one Auditor and two clerks, has now grown to large proportions. It ostensibly marched with a steady foot. Agricultural Credit Societies multiplied; Banks, Zamindari and Urban sprang up under the auspices of an Apex Bank at Karachi; Housing Societies made a bold bid in Karachi and Non-Credit Societies were started here and there. All looked smooth until a few years ago when the District Banks showed symptoms of weakness because the Agricultural Credit Societies failed to repay loans. The Apex Bank, *viz.*, the Sind Provincial Co-operative Bank Karachi, was, however, strong and it stood out to take the District Banks under its wing making them its branches. The storm was thus blown over, but it was evidently a temporary lull. The pace of recovery of loans advanced to Agricultural Credit Societies and even of the interest grew slower and slower. A regular crisis occurred a few months ago when Government came to the aid of the Apex Bank and it has just regained its foot-hold and its activities are being revived. The shareholders agreed to the substitution of the old elected-cum-nominated Directorate by a new one wholly Government-nominated Directorate.

431. The Registrar has at our request supplied the following statistical information about present number and liabilities, etc., of the Societies.

I.—Strength.—

Provincial Co-operative Bank	1
Agricultural Credit Societies	995
Agricultural Non-Credit Societies...	...	29
Non-Agricultural Credit Societies...	...	119
Non-Agricultural Non-Credit Societies	...	114
Total ...		1,258

II.—Aggregate liability and indebtedness of Agricultural and Non-Agricultural Credit and Non-Credit Societies:—

Type of Society.	Aggregate liability.	Amount due for recovery including previous arrears on 30th June 1937.	Amount actually recovered during the year.	Arrears at the end of the year.	
				Authorised.	Unauthorised.
(a) Credit Societies ...	Rs. in lakhs. 214.83	Rs. in lakhs. 154.41	Rs. in lakhs. 63.06 41 per cent.	Rs. in lakhs. 63.49 42 per cent.	Rs. in lakhs. 27.86 17 per cent.
(b) Non-Credit Societies .	33.14	36.98	9.95 27 per cent.	23.60 65 per cent.	3.43 8 per cent.
Total ...	247.97	191.39	73.01 38 per cent.	87.09 46 per cent.	31.29 16 per cent.

III.—Aggregate liability and indebtedness of Agricultural Credit and Non-Credit Societies—

Type of Society.	Liability shown by Society Principal Co-operative Bank upto 30th June 1937.	Amount due to recovery shown by Society Principal Co-operative Bank upto 30th June 1937.	Amount actually recovered during the year.	Amount recovered this year.	
				Authorized	Unauthor- ized
	Rs. in lakhs.	Rs. in lakhs.	Rs. in lakhs.	Rs. in lakhs.	Rs. in lakhs.
(a) 931 Agricultural Credit Societies.	38.64	53.40	5.03 9 per cent.	32.16 60 per cent.	15.21 30 per cent.
(b) 4 Zamindari Banks.	2.91	13.97	3.36 24 per cent.	7.09 57 per cent.	2.62 19 per cent.
(c) 29 Agricultural Non-Credit Societies.	1.57	12.77	6.26 42 per cent.	5.51 42 per cent.	1.18 9 per cent.
Total	43.15	79.14	14.65 19 per cent.	44.76 15 per cent.	20.01 23 per cent.

432. The above figures relate to principal only. It is understood that about Rs. 6 lakhs are due on account of interest from the Societies. There are besides several Societies, which have been taken into liquidation. The amount due from them is computed at Rs. 4,96,000 and a recovery of Rs. 14,000 only has so far been recovered. Thus the situation is critical and must cause all concerned anxiety about its discharge.

433. The Committee cannot but view with great concern the present financial position of the Co-operative Institutions in the Province. The aggregate liabilities of the Co-operative Societies on the 30th June 1937 on account of principal alone stood at Rs. 248 lakhs of which Rs. 191 lakhs were due for recovery on that date. The actual recoveries were however only Rs. 73 lakhs (38 per cent.) while Rs. 87 lakhs (46 per cent.) were authorized arrears and 71 lakhs (36 per cent.) unauthorized arrears—total of Rs. 158 lakhs. The Agricultural Credit Societies are the greatest defaulters. A sum of Rs. 33.4 lakhs were due on 30th June 1937. They had repaid only 9 per cent. while 91 per cent. remained unpaid. Next came the Zamindari Banks which were due to repay Rs. 13.97 lakhs, but had paid only 3.36 or 24 per cent. This cannot be regarded as a healthy prospect. In order to restore confidence and avoid a set back of the movement, it is absolutely essential that ways and means for reducing liabilities and outstandings must be explored with the utmost dispatch.

434. Side by side Government should stop all the propaganda in favour of the opening of new Agricultural Credit Societies and save in exceptional cases and for most weighty reasons refuse registration to new Societies especially of the type of Agricultural Credit Societies until such time as the position of the existing ones has been consolidated. New registration should be done with the greatest care. The work of consolidation should include the weeding out and winding up of the weakest Societies. Only such should be permitted to continue as are likely to regain financial stability within a reasonable limit.

435. The Committee regret to notice, that inspite of the embargo on the registration of Societies imposed by Government in September 1933 on the recommendation of the Thomas Committee which too had pointed out the unhealthy condition of indebtedness of Societies in 1933, the Sind Co-operative Authorities for the time being had however granted registration to 350 Societies of the following types:—

Agricultural Credit Societies	...	130
Agricultural Non-Credit Societies	...	9
Non-Agricultural Credit Societies.	...	74
Non-Agricultural Non-Credit Societies	...	137
Total	...	350

436. The Committee will now proceed to deal with the present organisation of the Co-operative Department. It consists of—

GAZETTED STAFF.

Registrar, Co-operative Societies in Sind, I.C.S.

Assistant Registrar, Co-operative Societies in Sind, B.A., LL.B. Rs. 300—15—400.

Special Auditor ... Rs. 300—50/2—500—50—750.

NON-GAZETTED STAFF.

Auditors.—

		Strength.
1st Grade Auditor	... Rs. 200—10—300	1
2nd Grade Auditor, new grade.	„ 130—5—200 135—5—180	4
1st Grade Agricultural Organizer.	„ 180—10—300	1

2nd Grade Agricultural Organizer.	Rs. 120—5—175	Strength. 1
Sub-Auditors including Head Clerks to the Registrar.	„ 105—5—140	5
Sub-Auditors	„ 85—5/2—100	2
Clerks	„ 30—5/2—50	13
Co-operative Training Scheme Staff Inspectors.	„ 125—200	3
Clerk, Co-operative Training Scheme Staff Inspector.	„ 30	1

One post of Sub-Auditor in the grade of Rs. 75—5/2—90, one post of Senior Clerk in the grade of Rs. 80—5/2—95 and two posts of Clerks in the grades of Rs. 25—5/2—55—E. B.—5/2—75 and 25—5/2—55 have been created since December 1936.

437. The total cost of the Department has varied as under in the recent few years :—

1935-36	...	Rs. 94,881
1936-37	...	„ 1,12,904
1937-38 revised	...	„ 1,24,000
1938-39	...	„ 1,14,000

The current year's allotment consists of the following items :—

Pay of Gazetted staff	...	Rs. 25,000
Pay of Subordinate staff	...	„ 40,300
Allowances	...	„ 24,900
Contingencies	...	„ 6,300
Co-operative Training	...	„ 6,300
Subsidy to Co-operative Institute	„	6,300
Grant to Supervising Unions	„	5,300

1,14,000

438. The audit cost included in the above figures is Rs. 58,000. The Registrar has reported that in the year 1936-37, the total cost of the audit was Rs. 49,200, whereas the audit fees recovered were only Rs. 23,675. Government bore the deficit of Rs. 25,525. The Thomas Committee had much deprecated the

non-recovery of full audit charges from the Societies observing that a Society which was unable to pay the minimum audit fee was fundamentally weak and not fit to exist. The Committee had also recommended that the Societies should bear all charges, which a commercial undertaking doing similar business would have to incur including registration, stamp-fee and cost of audit. The former Registrar had pleaded that some of the Agricultural Credit Societies find it too hard to pay the entire cost of audit as they find it difficult to meet with their working expenses. He has suggested that the Societies in charge of the Special Auditor, *viz.*, Urban Banks, Zamindari Banks and Housing Societies which are functioning very well could bear an extra burden and that the audit fees recoverable from such institutions could be so arranged as to cover the entire cost of the Special Auditor and his staff. This should be considered by Government. The rules about exemption of certain types of Societies from levy of audit fees for certain terms may also be reviewed so as to avoid deficit in the audit cost recovery.

439. Training in Co-operation and Co-operative laws is given by a Sub-Department, which is specially financed by the Government of India. This section costs Rs. 6,300 per annum. An Inspector and Assistant Inspector received their training in 1936 at Poona for 6 months and on their return classes were conducted at Hyderabad for a four months' course and four batches of 52 persons were instructed. The following took advantage of the training:—

Departmental staff	28
Sind Provincial Bank staff	20
Sind Provincial Institute staff	2
Urban Banks staff	2

Total ... 52

This year training has been extended to the staff of Supervising Unions, Secretaries and members of rural Societies by means of peripatetic Training Classes. We are not sure of the real usefulness of these Co-operative training classes and hope that the Government of India subsidy of Rs. 6,300 is not frittered away. We suggest that this matter may be examined by Government, enquiries made from other Provincial Governments, who have progressed on sounder lines and suitable steps to alter the system if required, may be taken by authorities.

440. The two Agricultural Organizers carry on Co-operative propaganda in rural and urban areas for formation of new Societies wherever necessary and their proper development, and advise Honorary Organizers. They have also been allotted some audit work of Primary Societies and in fact are engaged half for audit and half for propaganda and departmental organization.

441. Co-operative work of whatever nature be it, credit, sale, purchase or manufacture, housing or farming is conducted through the agency of Primary Societies, while the financing is done by a chain of the Sind Provincial Banks in the districts with the Apex Bank at Karachi, the Zamindari Banks and the Urban Banks spread over Sind. The latter have sprung up largely at Karachi and Hyderabad.

442. Then there are—

- (a) Group Secretaries;
- (b) Supervising Unions; and
- (c) Honorary Organizers;

all being non-official links between the Official Agency and the Societies.

(a) Group Secretaries numbering 150 in the Province are maintained at an annual cost of Rs. 36,000 wholly contributed by the Societies. Each Group Secretary looks after 4 or 5 Societies. It is his duty to call meetings of the Managing Committee and General Body of the Societies in his charge, to keep minutes, maintain account books, to make recovery of dues and prepare lists of arrears. Every Society roughly pays Rs. 4 per month towards the pay of its Group Secretary, who receives in the aggregate Rs. 20 to 25 per month.

(b) A Supervising Union is itself a registered Co-operative Society created for providing machinery to train and enable Societies to carry on internal supervision by themselves. These Unions receive annual subscription from affiliated Societies at a flat rate of 8 annas per cent. of the working capital of each Society and also get Government subsidy. Each Union maintains one or more Supervisors who are required—

- (i) to supervise and inspect the affiliated Societies;
- (ii) to train the Secretaries in account keeping, recording of minutes and general principles of Co-operation;
- (iii) to execute arbitration decrees against defaulters; and
- (iv) to effect recoveries of ordinary loans when they fall due.

During the last Co-operative year the Unions received Rs. 30,115 as annual subscription from the affiliated Societies and Rs. 5,250 as Government subsidy.

(c) Honorary Organizers constitute a higher group of Honorary workers, who carry on propaganda work among rural masses for forming new Societies and train Secretaries, Managing Committee and other members generally in fundamental principles of Co-operation and to apprise them of their duties and responsibilities. They also render assistance in recovery work, conferences, etc. Some experienced organizers are entrusted with arbitration work under the Act. For this purpose these Honorary gentlemen tour about in their respective areas and draw merely travelling allowance from Government. The Societies do not bear any share of their cost. During the last year the aggregate cost of their travelling borne by the State was Rs. 3,800. Their number for the year 1937-38 was 14 of whom 4 were ladies. It is understood that the four ladies have since ceased to work in this capacity.

443. We have referred above to the financial vicissitudes of the Co-operative movement in Sind brought about by the failure of the Societies to repay the loans advanced by the Sind Provincial Co-operative Bank and its Branches. The Management of the Bank came in lately for a good deal of controversy and criticism. An entirely Government appointed Board of Directors now control the finances of the Bank.

444. Government had lately invited Mr. V. L. Mehta, Managing Director of the Provincial Co-operative Bank of Bombay to give suggestions for the reform of the Bank's working. This report is now under the consideration of Government. Other Provincial Governments are paying considerable attention to this most important movement and we would very much wish that the Government of Sind would follow suit and bring about healthy and progressive reforms. The work as done at present so far as we can see, does not possess much practical value. Largely it consists of loaning out the Bank funds fed by public deposits to the Primary Societies. No attention has practically been given to the more important and vital side of the Co-operative movement, *viz.*, buying and selling of Agricultural produce of the Societies, Marketing, Co-operative Farming, Co-operative Stores and many other activities which can be run on Co-operative lines for the benefit of the Agriculturists, Small Industries and Consumers. The main problem to-day before the Sind Co-operative Department is the large amount of over 2 crores locked up in the Primary Societies, which show little inclination of voluntary repayment. The figures of colossal indebtedness supplied to us by the Registrar should draw the

earnest attention of the Government and those interested in the movement.

445. Several factors seem to have brought about the collapse. Firstly, the slump in prices has reduced the margin of Agriculturist's profit and affected his ability to repay his loans. Next the authorities immediately concerned have failed to give requisite attention to the growing indebtedness and to impress thrift. There is no trace of Co-operative spirit or sense left, in that the members of the Primary Agricultural Societies which form the great majority of defaulting bodies, definitely feel and take it for granted that the failure of any of them to pay their dues will not recoil on the heads of the other members, but will be made good by the summary powers of collection vested in the Collector. This impression has led to the exercise of least care in granting loans, which has been the bane of the movement. The moment, the security for the loan ceases to be the collective honesty, thrift and personal credit of the borrower and his sureties as known to the neighbours, and is transferred to the tangible assets of the borrower merely, the whole movement degenerates into a system of financing the production of crops on a commercial or at least on non-Co-operative basis thus striking at the very root of the movement. This is what has happened in the Province.

446. On the top of these weakening factors there is the heavy burden of the cost of running the Societies. Each is called upon to defray fixed salary of the Group Secretary and contribution to the Supervising Union, occasional subscription to the other institutions in addition to the obligatory items of interest on loans taken and audit fee. Honest and honorary service for the sake of the movement is rare or has not been properly invoked. We are informed that a Society with a working capital of Rs. 5,000 and earning 3 per cent. profit between the borrowing and the lending rate *i.e.*, Rs. 150 provided full repayment along with all interest due is made, which is a rare occurrence, has to spend as much as Rs. 148 per year over Supervisory charges. How far can a Society with a gross profit of Rs. 2 do any useful Co-operative work or be a regular pay master? All these drawbacks should necessarily make the Societies non-paying if not a losing concern.

447. Careful reformation in the entire structure is necessary. As we do not want to and should not enter into technical details, we emphasise that an expert enquiry Committee be appointed to go through the working of the Department at an early date. Mr. V. L. Mehta, was in Karachi for a few days only and was entrusted with the work of the immediate repair of Provincial Co-operative Bank only. This is not sufficient. Much more requires to be done. The suggested expert Committee will investigate and give the lead.

448. We have referred above to the audit staff and recovery of audit fees. We cannot sufficiently emphasise the necessity of strict and impartial audit. The question is whether this is possible if the entire audit staff is subordinate to the Executive head of the Department. The main function of the Department has, it is clear, been regarded in the past to do propaganda in favour of the Co-operative movement. That seems to have clouded the other and no less important aspect of proper utilisation and repayment of loan funds provided for furthering the objects of the movement. The Committee have no doubt that if the audit staff had been sufficiently alert about the use of funds and their due return, the pace of growing indebtedness would have been checked in time and the present critical position would not have arisen or at least the position would not have been so acute, for the Auditors would have raised an alarm and Government would have been warned long before to order a halt on the process of increasing indebtedness of Societies and to take suitable measures for recovery of loans. We are strongly of opinion that a certain portion of the Audit Section should work independently of the Registrar's Department on the correct principles of auditing. These Auditors should either be placed under the Revenue Secretary or the Comptroller. The late Registrar was of the opinion that the audit of the Co-operative Society requires some extra qualification and knowledge of auditing and that the system of Co-operative auditing is somewhat different and Auditors should be under the Registrar. We cannot agree with this opinion. The Auditors are trained for all purposes and they can well adapt themselves to Co-operative laws or routine methods and systems as required by the Act.

449. After very careful consideration of the organization of the Department and the statistical information collected, the Committee make the following supplementary recommendations for the well-being of the movement :—

(1) Honorary Organizers and Group Secretaries should be disbanded resulting in a saving of Rs. 3,500 to Government and Rs. 36,000 to the Societies. The grant made at present towards the travelling allowance of Honorary Organizers should be withdrawn. They did valuable work in the initial stages of the movement, but the scope for further work of the same nature will for some time to come, be so limited that no provision on this account seems necessary. The Group Secretaries, who are of the nature of parasites, cost a substantial amount to Societies and should go. There is considerable over-lapping in the functions of the non-Official Agency of Secretaries, Organizers and Union Supervisors and it requires to be put a stop to.

(2) Union Supervisors may be retained to assist the Bank Inspectors in making recoveries. They cost the Societies Rs. 30,115 and Government Rs. 5,250 per annum. If the Registrar could manage their number may be substantially reduced.

(3) Agricultural Organizers costing Government Rs. 5,000 per annum should be disbanded. These Officers do propaganda and audit work. The former is no longer necessary in any intensive form and it is doubtful if their audit work is of much value.

(4) A small Audit Section should be separately constituted being made independent of the Executive of the Co-operative Department for supervisory audit check. Out of 11 members of the existing audit staff the Special Auditor and 2 Subordinate Auditors should constitute the Supervisory Audit Section answerable directly to the Secretary, Revenue Department through the Comptroller for Sind. If the Registrar's audit considered essential by him for his satisfaction, cannot be effected by the remaining 9 members of the existing audit staff, one or even both of the existing Agricultural Organizers may be retained for purely audit work, provided the present incumbents are expected to give promise of good turn-over in that respect.

(5) Audit cost of the Registrar's staff as distinguished from that proposed by us for supervisory audit check should be wholly recovered from Societies brought under audit. A part of the saving of Rs. 36,000 effected by abolishing Group Secretaries may be utilised for recovering the deficit in the Registrar's cost to Government. The charge of 8 annas per cent. of the working capital levied on the Societies for payment of the Group Secretaries and Union Supervisors may in view of possible savings, be proportionately reduced.

(6) The staff under the Co-operative Training Scheme should be utilised for propagation of Co-operative spirit.

450. We would re-iterate in the end that the recovery of the amounts lent to the Societies should be the foremost subject for consideration, for, without recoveries coming in a normal stream, the credit of the Department will remain always at stake. There are various other developments in the Co-operative movement such as Land Mortgage Banks, Co-operative Farming, Purchasing Societies, Seed Societies and Stores which also require to be tackled by the Department. So far, Sind has practically made no progress on these lines.

CHAPTER XX.

EXCISE DEPARTMENT.

451. The Excise Department as a separate unit came into being in the year 1908. Prior to that the Salt Section was in the charge of the Collector of Salt Revenue, who was also Collector of Customs, Karachi. The supervision of distilleries and bonded spirit and hemp drugs Warehouses in Sind and the Opium and Excise preventive work was under the control of District Collectors. There was no special establishment for the prevention and detection of Excise offences in the districts, this work being performed by the District Police. The supervision of licensed shops was in the hands of the revenue and police Officials.

452. The newly constituted department aimed at the replacement of a large number of low paid incompetent men by a comparatively small staff of well paid men of fair education and intelligence and the provision of responsible supervision over the establishment. The various sections of Salt, Excise and Opium preventive staff were brought together under one head—the Assistant Commissioner of Salt Excise and Opium—who was subordinate to the Commissioner in Sind for Salt matters and to the District Collectors for Excise matters. The Districts were split up into Excise Divisions, under Inspectors and Sub-Divisions under Dafedars and Sowars.

453. By 1913, the Commissioner in Sind began to doubt the efficiency of these arrangements. It became evident that the new department was not achieving all that had been expected of it. The rates of pay were held to be insufficient to attract the right type of men. The supervising staff was regarded as inadequate and the preventive staff still weaker. The new arrangement brought in some slight improvement, but the new establishments were found in every district to be unequal to the task of protecting the Salt and Excise revenue and especially the latter.

454. A revision scheme was planned but it was put off on account of war. Inquiries resumed after the war and continued upto 1924 indicated on all hands that the organisation of the staff was not satisfactory. The pay of all the ranks was regarded as inadequate. The area assigned to rural Inspectors was found too large for proper supervision. General slackness was said to prevail in the subordinate ranks. It was regarded impossible for the Assistant Commissioner of Excise to exercise detailed and intimate supervision over the vast area under his charge. There were several unprotected areas. Lack of co-operation between the Police and Excise Officials was noticed. It was discovered that the men appointed did not always possess the qualifications required *viz.*, energy, detective, ability, liking for an out-door life and

readiness to rough it. Pay was reported to be too small to attract men of the right type and all the subordinate staff from the Inspectors down to Sowars was held to be unsatisfactory. Illicit removals from natural salt deposits were believed to be not uncommon. *Charas*, opium and *bhanga* smuggling was rife and illicit distillation prevailed. The success achieved in detective and preventive work had not been great, the record of offences detected was very small not because the Excise crime was absent, but because a large number of offences remained undetected. It was described that the Inspectors' grades (22 strong) contained only half a dozen good men, while the remainder consisted largely of failures from the clerical branches of the other departments, extremely unpromising material for out-door duties. This state of things called for very disparaging remarks from the District Collectors and the then Superintendent (formerly designated Assistant Commissioner) agreed that they were fully deserved. The Government of Bombay came to the conclusion that the Department as then constituted was unequal to the task of protecting the Salt and Excise revenue, and that the loss of Excise revenue in particular from the systematic smuggling of *bhanga* into Upper Sind from Kalat, of *charas* and opium into Lower Sind from the Western Rajputana States, and of *charas* from the Punjab must be considerable, as recent inquiries had shown that *charas* smuggling had been going on for years past on a large scale, and that the Excise staff had been either unaware of it or did very little to check it. In recommending the revision scheme of 1924 to the Government of India for sanction, the Bombay Government expressed that they felt confident that the extra annual expenditure involved in strengthening and organising the Department on sound lines and fitting it to become guardian of the Salt and Excise revenue of Sind will be more than recouped by the increase in revenue which will result from the suppression of illicit practices in Sind.

455. The revision as then proposed is explained in the subjoined table:—

Before revision of 1924.		After revision of 1924.	
Superintendent of Salt and Excise	Special pay Rs. 100		Special pay Rs. 150.
Deputy Superintendent ...	Nil	1 Deputy Superintendent, Personal Assistant to Superintendent.	Rs. 400—20—500, plus Rs. 50 conveyance allowance.
		2 Deputy Superintendents, one for Upper Sind Districts and another for Lower Sind Districts, except Karachi City.	Rs. 350—10—400, plus Rs. 60 conveyance allowance.

Before revision of 1924.			After revision of 1924.		
INSPECTORS—					
1	Inspector	Rs. 400	4	Inspectors	220—10—300
4	Inspectors	250—10—350	13	Inspectors	150—10/2—220
17	Inspectors	125—15/2 230	12	Assistant Inspectors...	105—5—145
13	Assistant Inspectors.	85—5/2—100—5—125.	15	Assistant Inspectors...	85—5/2—100
35			44		
	Allowance Rs.	1,010		Allowance Rs.	1,185
CLERICAL.—					
1	Head Clerk	105—5—140	1	Head Clerk	125—5—160
1	Assistant Clerk	105—5—140	1	Assistant Clerk	105—5—140
5	Clerks ...	85—5/2—100	9	Clerks ...	85—5/2—100
20	Clerks ...	30—5/2—50	19	Clerks ...	30—5/2—80
27			4	Clerks ...	30—5/2—60
	Allowance Rs.	190	34	Allowance Rs.	195
Petty Officers and Peons—					
Total strength 193 cost Rs. 3,497			Total strength 256 cost Rs. 4,936		
Allowances Rs. 632			Allowances Rs. 946		
Grand total average monthly cost Rs. 13,261			Grand total average monthly cost Rs. 16,945		
			Additional cost Rs. 3,684 p.m. × 12 = 44,212 per year.		

456. While working out the additional average cost of the reorganized establishment at Rs. 44,212 per annum, the Bombay Government had proceeded to explain that the actual pre-revision annual cost of the establishment was Rs. $13,261 \times 12 = 1,59,132$ in pay and allowances plus Rs. 64,919 on account of leave and travelling allowances, rates, rents, taxes and contingencies—Total Rs. 224,051. This was allocated between '3—Salt' and '6—Excise' in the proportion of 4 : 3.

3—Salt (Government of India) being debited with Rs. 1,28,033
and 6—Excise (Provincial Government) being
debited with 96,018

After the reorganization the total cost of Rs. 2,68,259 (16,945 × 12 plus 64,919) will be allocated in the proportion of 1 : 3—

3—Salt being debited with Rs. 67,062
and 6—Excise being debited with 2,01,197

The re-allocation was justified on the actual volume of work done by the combined Salt and Excise Department for Salt and Excise, respectively. Thus the Provincial Government expenditure was designed to increase by Rs. 1,05,179 and the Central Government's expenditure to decrease by Rs. 60,971. Adding an additional charge of Rs. 5,000 on account of sundry charges relating to purchase of additional dead stock, uniforms, stationery and payment of additional rates, rents and taxes, etc., the total additional cost of the reorganization to the Provincial Government was reckoned at Rs. 1,10,179, an increase of 109 per cent. over the pre-revision allocated debit against "6—Excise".

457. . The reorganization was sanctioned by Government of India in February 1924 and brought into effect from 1st March 1924 (B. G., G. R., No. 1609-C., R. D., dated 8th March 1924).

The question is whether this reorganization had resulted as 'confidently expected' by the Government of Bombay in making the Sind Excise Department a more efficient guardian of the Excise revenue and in producing an increase in revenues by suppression of illicit practices.

458. The subjoined tables of Excise Revenue and Crime will be a fitting answer to the question :

I. *Revenue—*
Year.

Total Excise
Revenue.

Remarks.

Rs.

1921-22	35,44,806
1922-23	39,56,283
1923-24	43,07,799
1924-25	42,63,055
1925-26	42,60,990
1926-27	40,58,45
1927-28	45,20,206
1928-29	46,12,002
1929-30	37,96,596
1930-31	27,50,840
1931-32	29,93,648
1932-33	31,15,474
1933-34	30,30,867
1934-35	31,97,015
1935-36	33,32,484
1936-37	35,21,353
1937-38	36,00,000

Due to foreign liquor shops being sold for a period of 3 years.

Due to picketting and poor economic condition.

Estimated.

II. *Crime—*

CASES DETECTED.

d with
Super-
and

Offences relating to—

Year.		Liquor.	Hemp Drugs.	Cocain.	Opium.	Total.	Convictions obtained.
1921-22	...	33	73	1	52	159	Not available.
1922-23	...	102	66	5	27	200	185
1923-24	...	99	88	1	42	230	207
1924-25	...	66	177	3	77	323	307
1925-26	...	91	179	4	89	363	320
1926-27	...	73	253	4	92	422	303
1927-28	...	139	338	1	124	602	507
1928-29	...	123	275	2	77	477	411
1929-30	...	114	237	3	71	425	386
1930-31	...	75	234	4	72	385	330
1931-32	...	177	244	1	105	527	416
1932-33	...	228	263	...	93	584	470
1933-34	...	228	215	1	81	525	Not available.
1934-35	...	311	196	1	76	594	370
1935-36	...	219	154	1	48	422	300
1936-37	...	206	156	...	27	389	320

It is evident that the reorganization of 1924 did not prove wholly effective. There has been no rise in revenue, inspite of some increase in crime detection. On the other hand expenditure increased from Rs. 96,018 to Rs. 2,01,197 under stress of revision of staff and pay and re-distribution of the cost between the Central and Local Government.

459. We are now again being told by the Superintendent of Salt and Excise that there is plenty of room for reorganization in the Department but none for economy, that the present staff is quite insufficient and their scales of pay are the lowest possible for securing suitable men for the posts. We also find from a Government Communication that Sind Government were so disappointed with the administration of the Department about September 1936, that they pressed on the Government of Bombay that an officer of the I.C.S. should be appointed as Superintendent of Salt and Excise in

If the Provincial Service Officer 'in order to effect reorganization of the Department, to put it on a sound basis and to review the Excise Policy to be followed in the Province'. Before the Government of Bombay could arrange for the deputation of an I.C.S. Officer, the Sind Government decided on the appointment of Mr. V. T. Dehejia, I.C.S., as Superintendent with effect from 1st April 1937, for a period of two years in the first instance "with a view to effect the long-needed reorganization in the Department" and observed that "such reorganization at a very early date was rendered the more imperative on account of the separation of Sind and will, it is expected, lead to substantial increase of revenue". It is clear from this decision of Government that they were not satisfied again with the departmental administration inspite of all the revision of 1924 under which 2 well-paid Deputy Superintendents were appointed to assist the Superintendent and Inspectorial and the Excise Police staff was augmented.

460. The receipts for 1937-38 estimated at Rs. 31,10,000 and the expenditure at Rs. 3,37,000 comprise of the following items:—

Receipts.		Rs.
Country spirits and fermented liquor...		14,87,000
Foreign liquor	4,82,000
Opium	4,36,000
Hemp Drugs	6,50,000
Fines, etc.	1,61,000
Miscellaneous	1,000
		<hr/>
		32,17,000
	Deduct Refunds.	1,07,000
		<hr/>
	Total...	31,10,000
Expenditure.		
Establishment charges in India	...Rs. 1,98,000 includes a sum of Rs. 79,300 on account of allowances (Rs. 46,960), Rewards (Rs. 9,540 contingencies (Rs. 22,800).	
Establishment charges in England	...	8,600
Cost of Opium	...	1,05,000
Contribution to Local Bodies in lieu of one anna cess.		24,900
Rounding	...	500
		<hr/>
	Total Rs.	3,37,000

641. The Excise Department is primarily concerned with preventive work—its chief function being described by the Superintendent to be prevention and detection of Excise crimes and supervision of Excise shops. Recovery of license fees, which constitutes the main source of the Department's revenue is effected by the Revenue Department. The disposal of Excise shops is arranged by the District Collectors.

462. The main income of the Department is derived from the manufacture and sale of country liquor. The following statement is interesting as it shows that Government do not only levy duty but make gain on issues of liquor and auction the vend right at different shops for a value called 'license fee'. For Karachi Town the last named item works out to roughly Rs. 3-8-0 per gallon. The consumer thus pays between 12 to 24 times more per gallon than its intrinsic value, for the sale price to public varies from Rs. 12 to 24 per gallon.

Per bulk gallon = 6 bottles.

Kind of liquor.	Contract price at which the contractor supplies.	Gain on issue made by Government.	Issue price.	Duty charged by Government.	Price to licensees <i>ex</i> Warehouse.
<u>15° U. P.</u>	Rs. a. p.	Rs. a. p.	Rs. a. p.	Rs. a. p.	Rs. a. p.
Plain ...	0 14 0	1 10 0	2 8 0	8 0 0	10 8 0
Ordinary flavoured ...	0 15 4	1 10 8	2 10 0	8 0 0	10 10 0
Masala ...	1 4 10	1 13 2	3 2 0	8 0 0	11 2 0
Chou Argi ...	1 5 11	1 15 5	3 5 4	8 0 0	11 5 7
<u>40° U. P.</u>					
Plain ...	0 9 11	1 0 1	1 10 0	6 4 0	7 14 0
Ordinary flavoured. ...	0 10 10	1 0 2	1 11 0	6 4 0	7 15 0
Masala ...	0 14 9	1 6 3	2 5 0	6 4 0	8 9 0

463. The issue of country liquor *ex*-Warehouses in Sind during 1936-37 had been as under:—

<u>15° U. P.</u>	Bulk gallons.
Plain ...	54,973
Ordinary flavoured ...	29,312
Masala ...	37,892
Chou Argi ...	4,073
<u>15° U. P.</u>	
Plain ...	10,095
Ordinary flavoured ...	61
Masala ...	4,286
Total ...	1,40,692

Departmental Organization.

464. As we have said above, the Head of the Department, the Superintendent of Salt and Excise is now an I. C. S. Officer. Some additions and alterations seem to have been effected in the staff since the revision of 1924. Barring the separate Superintendent of Salt and certain special staff now stationed at the Maurypur Salt Works (since considerably developed) and the Sugar control staff at Pritamabad both paid for entirely by the Central Government—the establishment for the Excise work under the control of the Superintendent of Salt and Excise now comprises—

- 2 Deputy Superintendents (the Personal Assistant has been withdrawn).
- 16 Inspectors.
- 25 Assistant Inspectors.
- 35 Clerks.
- 213 Petty Officers and Peons.

465. The City of Karachi embracing the Town, Cantonment, Mangho Pir, Malir and Landhi areas all together constitute charges of one Inspector assisted by 4 Assistant Inspectors. Between themselves they supervise—

- 16 Country Liquor Shops.
- 13 Hemp Drugs Shops.
- 9 Opium Drugs Shops
- 56 Foreign Liquor Shops.
- 6 Toddy Shops.

100 Total

The sub-joined table shows distribution of executive charges of Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors in districts and the number of Excise shops under their supervision :—

Excise Shops.

Name of the Beat.	No. of Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors.	Country liquor.	Drugs.	Opium.	Foreign liquor.	Toddy.	Total.
Karachi District ...	2	12	13	13	2	...	40
Hyderabad District ...	4	38	45	43	17	1	144
Nawabshah District ...	2	26	33	29	5	...	93
Tharparkar District ...	6	26	36	57	5	...	124
Sukkur District ...	4	36	54	62	10	1	163
Upper Sind Frontier District ...	2	21	19	15	2	...	57
Larkana District ...	3	26	56	27	1	...	110
Dadu District ...	3	21	36	30	7	1	35
Total ...	26						

The above accounts for 31 Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors
Seven Inspectors are employed as under :—

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1 Inspector, Bubak Ware-house. | Supervision over receipts and issue of Hemp Drugs. |
| 1 Inspector, Kotri Distillery. | Supervision over manufacture and issue of liquor from the Distillery. |
| 1 Inspector In-charge Maury-pur Salt Works. | Supervision over the Salt Works, |
| 2 Inspectors In-charge Dilyar and Saran Salt Depôt. | Supervision over the Salt Depôts. |
| 2 Inspectors Vend Fee Assessment and Examining Offices, Karachi. | Control over imports and exports of Foreign Liquor with regard to the collection of vend fee. |

Three are leave reserve Assistant Inspectors.

466. The sub-joined table shows distribution of Jamadars Dafedars, etc., designated Excise Police Force or Excise Petty Officers and peons allotted to certain offices and districts :—

Office or district.	Strength.		
	Mounted.	Unmounted.	Total.
Superintendent of Salt and Excise	6	6
Deputy Superintendent of Salt and Excise.	...	8	8
Superintendent of Salt Revenue	2	2
Inspector, Bubak Warehouse	6	6
Inspectors, Liquor Warehouses	9	9
Inspector, Kotri Distillery	7	7
Salt Works, Maurypur	26	26
„ Dilyar	6	6
„ Saran	4	4
Karachi City	16	16
Karachi District ...	9	3	12
Hyderabad District ...	11	9	20
Thar Parkar District ...	18	6	24
Nawabshah District ...	8	2	10
Sukkur District ...	12	12	24
Upper Sind Frontier ...	6	2	8
Larkana District ...	10	3	13
Dadu ...	9	3	12
Total ...	83	130	213

467. It will be apparent from the above statistical tables that the distribution of staff from point of Excise shops serving each area is very unequal. The Superintendent has himself admitted that the present staff is not properly distributed and the criminal tendencies of the different circles have not been considered in allocating staff.

468. In view of the past history of the revision of the Excise staff and the present state of things leading to the appointment of an I.C.S. Officer as Superintendent, we felt convinced that the Department required over-hauling. The Superintendent informed us in August 1937 that "proposals for re-distribution of staff will be submitted to Government after due consideration and that other administrative changes were also necessary and their advisability was being considered by Government". He was then requested for submission of his proposals for the reorganization of the Department. He wrote back in October 1937 that it was not feasible for him to formulate his proposals without touring through Sind to study the local conditions and that he would not "favour a hasty action". He elaborated this aspect in the following words:—

"The points I want to inquire about are—

- (1) Whether the present distribution of charges is proper considering the area, the crime and the revenue of each Circle. I find that some Circles are small and others do not bring in much revenue.
- (2) Whether the grades of the staff can be reorganized so as to allow for better recognition of merit.
- (3) Whether the rules of recruitment can be so changed as to ensure that only candidates with good character and educational qualifications can get into service.
- (4) Whether the charges of Deputy Superintendents should be changed and their number increased and also to decide about their recruitment.
- (5) Whether the services of the Subordinate staff are utilised to the fullest extent.
- (6) Whether the management of Kotri Distillery can be so altered as to get better country spirit and also to see whether we can produce varieties of country spirit which can substitute the use of foreign liquor.
- (7) Whether it is possible to undertake the cultivation of *Ganja* in Sind.

"There are various other questions also and the most important of them are about smuggling and illicit distillation. This year I am trying the experiment of having special parties for the purpose. This may also necessitate a re-distribution of staff. The greatest handicap to the department is of bad recruitment in the past and no amount of reorganization can cure this. The only course open to Government is of strong administration. I hope your Committee will realize that these are important questions and it is not advisable to do anything without proper enquiry in the first instance."

469. The Committee thus understanding that the Superintendent will formulate his proposals after the conclusion of his tour, waited until end of May last and then addressed the Revenue Commissioner and Secretary for obtaining the Superintendent's proposals and submission to the Committee. In the meantime we had the advantage of persuing the Superintendent's and Revenue Commissioner's remarks on the detailed note prepared by our colleague Mr. M. H. Gazdar, who had taken considerable trouble over it. Later, we had personal discussion with the Superintendent on the 12th May 1938. He admitted that the purpose underlying his appointment made in the first instance for 2 years, commencing 1st April 1937, was to put down corruption, review the policy and carry out the reorganization of the department. He frankly said that on his taking over charge, he came to know that there was a system of monthly payments by licensees to the Inspectorate. He claimed that he had totally stopped the monthly payment and that much corruption had been stopped but not entirely, for its stoppage can only be gradual. He admitted that illegal sale of *charas* was going on in some places known as 'Sakhi Khanas' and of liquor in some shops and hotels. He complained about lack of co-operation of Police in supervising shops and hotels, and of the leniency of magisterial courts in punishing offenders. He revealed that before 1937, the Department's policy in the hands of the then Superintendent was to increase the sales by any means. He went so far as to say that in the non-co-operation days when sales of liquor, etc., were hit, the places of illicit sales cropped up with the knowledge of the authorities concerned as their policy was to have more consumption in order to increase the revenue. He admitted that his department still required 10 years to gain the confidence of public because the department carried a bad name with the public on account of corruption, bribery, etc., which was rampant in previous years. This is a sufficiently strong condemnation of the department from the mouth of the Superintendent who took over in April last year. As to reviewing the policy, he expressed that he had made some changes but none yet in the staff. On the subject

of submission of reorganization proposals he conveyed that he had prepared his proposals or had them in his mind but had not submitted them to Government as no report had been called for in the Government Resolution of his appointment.

470. The trend of his evidence made it more clear that the Committee's deliberations about this department would be facilitated if the Superintendent would formulate his proposals and show them to the Committee. The Superintendent finally intimated on the 18th June 1938 that 'I have no proposals to put forward before the Reorganization Committee'.

471. The Committee regret very much that they were denied the benefit of considered views of the Head of the Excise Department who was specially installed to reorganize the Department. Being thus thrown on their own resources, the Committee taking note of the materials before them have formulated the following recommendations for consideration by Government:—

(1) The present I.C.S. Superintendent (V.T. Dehejia, Esquire) draws emoluments as under:—

	Rs.	
Pay	750	... Junior time-scale.
Special pay	150	
Permanent Travelling allowances	190	
Tentage	25	
Compensatory Allowance..	76	... (for 6 months).
Differential house rent ...	87/8	
Total Monthly	1,269-8	
„ Annual	15,234	
Deduct 6 months Compensatory allowance.	456	
Total per annum	14,778	

. As his junior who has since been appointed to officiate as Collector will draw pay in the senior time-scale, *viz.*, Rs. 1,000. Mr. Dehejia will, under the next-below-promotion rule, be entitled to draw Rs. 1,000. The annual cost of his appointment will thus increase to Rs. 17,832 and allowing for additional compensatory allowance on account of increased pay, the emoluments will be in

the neighbourhood of Rs. 17,900 or 18,000 in round figures. The Committee regard this as too disproportionate a burden on the Sind finances. Besides an I.C.S. Officer will not stick long in the appointment and every new incumbent will start afresh without previous knowledge of the Department. Much good is, therefore, not likely to result from such an arrangement. As two years of the present Superintendent will soon be over, the Committee suggest that a Provincial Service Officer be re-appointed as Superintendent of Salt and Excise. What is necessary is that a very good selection should be made. A well selected Provincial Service Officer will rise equal to the task and work for the efficiency of the Department.

(2) The Committee wished to emphasise that the Revenue and Expenditure figures of the department before and after the 1924 revision of the Departmental staff strength and pay, indicated that Revenue had not, as "confidently anticipated" by Government increased with the rise in expenditure due to revision. There may be several reasons underlying the retraction in revenue, but since the revision of staff and their scales was effected in 1924 with an eye to increase the revenue and stop mal-practices and both these objects have not been achieved, the only conclusion can be that the revision has failed to serve its purposes. Every effort should therefore be made to reduce the expenditure on staff and other items.

(3) The Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors are grouped under four grades:—

	Old Scale.		New Scale.
4 Inspectors ...	Rs. 220—10—300 ...	Rs. 200—15/2—275	
12 Do. ...	„ 150—10/2—220 ...	„ 140—10/2—190	
10 Assistant Inspectors.	„ 105—5—145 ...	„ 95—5—135	
15 Do. ...	„ 85—5/2—100 ...	„ 75—5/2—90	

The highest grade should be abolished. The Deputy Superintendent's revised scale is Rs. 170—500, which we propose under the Chapter on "Scales of pay of Gazetted Officers" to be reduced to Rs. 170—350. The Committee see no justification for an Inspector to rise above 190 in the new scale and Rs. 220 in the old scale. The present new scales of this grade are out of all proportion to the newly-sanctioned scale of the Deputy Superintendent. The lower 3 grades provide for a reasonable rise from Rs 75 which may be regarded as a decent starting pay for a graduate-entrant, to Rs. 190 in 24 years. In order to compensate for abolition of the highest grade Inspectors and to accelerate promotion towards end of service, the increment in the grade of Rs. 140—190 may be one of Rs. 10 annual in place of biennial, and the maximum may be raised to Rs. 200.

(4) Some of the executive charges are too light considering the number of Excise shops and the crime figures of the charges. Five Assistant Inspectors' charges should be retrenched and the beats affected amalgamated with the adjoining charges as shown below :—

Karachi District	...	1	By amalgamating Sujawal and Jati and transferring Ketri to Tatta.
Hyderabad District	...	1	By amalgamating Tando and Badin charges.
Sukkur District	...	1	By transferring Rohri Town to Sukkur and amalgamating the rest of Rohri with Ubauro.
Thar Parkar District	...	1	By amalgamating Nagar and Chachro charges.
Dadu District	...	1	By transferring Sehwan to Kotri and amalgamating Dadu with Mehar.
Total			5

(5) There is no justification for posting Inspectors at the Vend Fee and Examining Offices in Karachi. The work required is such as could be quite efficiently performed by an Accountant and a Clerk. An Officer of Executive force is not required for these posts. The Inspectors' posts should be withdrawn and in their place an Accountant on Rs. 105—5—140 and a Clerk on Rs. 60—5/2—75 would do quite well. In the alternative one senior grade Assistant Inspector with a Clerk will suffice, both offices being combined.

(6) Naiks for Deputy Superintendents and the Vend Fee and Examining Offices at Karachi and Rohri Circle appear superfluous. If the Country Liquor Warehouse, Karachi, can do without a Naik, that at Sukkur can also do so. The peon staff may also on scrutiny admit of some reduction.

(7) Every effort should be made to effect improvement in the quality of liquor manufactured at Kotri in order to checkmate preference for illicit liquor on the score of its superior quality. The progress made at Nasik in this direction may be emulated.

(8) In order to secure most advantageous rates from contractors for manufacture of liquor, the rates tendered at Cawnpur and Nasik should be ascertained 6 months in advance and necessary investigations made.

(9) There are too many wholesale drug shops in the Upper Sind districts. No district should have more than one wholesale drug shop. One may, as a special case, be allotted to Shikarpur where consumption is comparatively large.

(10) Mounted Excise Staff should be replaced by Foot staff except in certain charges in the Thar Parkar district and along the Kelat border. The remaining mounted staff should be disbanded.

(11) The existing practice of putting an embargo on the Police Department from not taking cognizance of Excise offences and investigating them should be removed. Information lodged with the Police about commission of Excise offences should be acted upon by the Police Officers. Such informants should not be referred to the Excise officials of the beats. The Committee is of opinion that this will tend to minimise corruption.

(12) Under the Committee's proposals there will be 14 Inspectors and these may be allotted to the following charges :—

(1) Karachi	(8) Nawabshah.
(2) Maurypur.	(9) Mirpurkhas.
(3) Hyderabad.	(10) Hala.
(4) Sukkur.	(11) Naushahro or Shahdadkot.
(5) Shikarpur.	(12) Distillery Kotri.
(6) Larkana.	(13) Dilyar.
(7) Jacobabad.	(14) Bubak.

(13) The Assistant Inspectors' posts would stand reduced at 20 which may be divided into 2 grades of Rs. 75—5/2—90 and Rs. 95—5—130, in the proportion of 2 : 3 as at present.

Further, since the two scales of Assistants Inspectors are continuation scales, there should be no promotion from one scale to another until the person in the lower grade has reached his maximum. Any vacancy in the higher scale should be left unfilled, if there is no person who can be so promoted. The deficiency should be made good by recruitment in the lower scale.

472. We might in conclusion refer to the policy of prohibition, which will be a subject-matter for a Special Committee to investigate. We do not, therefore, propose to offer any remarks on the subject or make suggestions in regard to the reorganization of staff required for giving effect to any policy of prohibition, which may materialise at any given time.

285

CHAPTER XXI.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

TEMPORARY STAFF.

473. We find that temporary service is almost an ordinary feature in the Public Works Department. We are told that several hundreds of persons are employed as such.

474. We have had prepared comparative lists of Permanent, Temporary and Work-charged staff of the Public Works Department. These are hereto attached as Appendix VI. The subjoined table will briefly illustrate the present comparative proportions of Permanent, Temporary and Work-charged staff and their cost.

Staff.	Permanent.		Temporary.		Work-charged.	
	No.	Pay and allowance.	No.	Pay and allowance.	No.	Pay and allowance.
		Rs. in lakhs.		Rs. in lakhs.		Rs. in lakhs.
Gazetted ...	88	9.65	25	1.71
Non-Gazetted ...	328	7.09	1,811	15.0	360	0.99
Inferior ...	112	0.27	991	2.04	12,455	15.43
Total ...	528	17.01	2,827	18.75	12,815	16.42

It will be apparent that several classes of officers from an Executive Engineer to a peon are serving as temporary staff and several do so *all their life*. Their lot compared to that of the Permanent staff is very unenviable. They are at a great disadvantage and several service concessions are denied to them. Some of their hardships may be recounted.—

(a) A member of Temporary staff does not enjoy protection of Government Servants' Conduct, Discipline and Appeal Rules. His service can be terminated with a month's notice and he can be removed for alleged inefficiency and no appeal lies against that or other disciplinary action.

(b) His leave is limited to one twenty-second part of the period of duty as opposed to one eleventh in the case of a Permanent employee and further restricted in the aggregate to 30 days as opposed to 90 days.

(c) In inferior services the Permanent employee gets leave to the extent of one twenty-second part of the period of duty limited to 30 days. To an inferior servant in temporary service no leave at all is admissible.

(d) Leave on private affairs and leave on medical certificate varying between 6 to 12 months on full or half pay is admissible to different classes of permanent Government servants. No such leave is admissible to temporary employees.

(e) A Permanent servant gets Extraordinary Leave for any period; a Temporary employee for three months only.

(f) There can be no Pension, or Gratuity of any kind for temporary employees.

The Temporary staff of the Public Works Department have for long accepted these conditions of service as matters of fate, but the injustice is apparent especially as they are required to perform duties of the same nature as the Permanent staff do and spend their life-time in the service.

475. While examining the list of the above noted staff and discussing the feasibility of bringing them on permanent cadre, it was elicited that the Public Works Department maintained huge staff on temporary basis because Government had been reluctant in the past to increase strength of permanent cadres. The Committee wished to emphasise that the Public Works Department should not be singled out for differential treatment of their staff. Such as are permanently required for day to day administration should be accorded permanent tenure and all the protection and privileges open to other services.

476. The Committee will now proceed to deal with each class of officers in the light of permanent requirements of the Public Works Department so far as it has been possible to ascertain. The appendix referred to above shows in some detail what classes of officers and servants are engaged in temporary and work-charged basis in the Public Works Department.

(a) *Assistant Engineers.*—There are at present 85 sub-divisional charges liable to be held by Assistant Engineers and Overseers appointed to act as Sub-Divisional Officer. There are besides certain posts of Assistant Engineers in the administrative offices. The Reorganization Committee had recommended that the sub-divisional charges be reduced to 76. As against this minimum required strength there are only 44 permanent Assistant Engineers. The deficiency has been made up by 11 officiating Assistant Engineers and 23 temporary Assistant Engineers. Of the last named

²³, it is understood that 18 have as much as 10 years' service. The minimum requirements having thus been fixed, the Committee see no reason why the temporary list should remain swelled. All the clear vacancies of which the number is not less than 30 at present, should be filled up by selection of the most efficient persons from among the Officiating and Temporary Assistant Engineers. The strength of permanent cadre should be suitably increased.

(b) *Supervisors*.—Their number on temporary list is 10. It is understood that 8 of them are required permanently for duties which are of a continuous nature. They should be made permanent.

(c) *Overseers*.—The permanent cadre consists of 144 men, while 112 men are borne on temporary list. The Reorganization Committee have recommended that the existing number of Overseers be maintained. The permanent cadre strength should be immediately increased and at least 80 out of 112 temporary Overseers should be selected and brought on the permanent list.

(d) *Accountants*.—These might be left as they are, since they have lien on permanent clerical posts.

(e) *Canal Assistants and Abdars*.—Pending orders on the recommendations of the Reorganization Committee pertaining to these classes, they may be retained on temporary list for the present.

(f) *Clerks*.—The permanent cadre of clerks is only 175 strong, while 234 clerks are employed on temporary basis, even though their service is continuous and the appointments are not to be abolished. The Committee wish to point out that temporary clerks serve all their life like the other permanent pensionable staff under Government and yet they are debarred from the privileges open to the latter. The Committee are strongly of the opinion that all such clerical posts as are continuously required, and are not likely to be retrenched under the Committee's proposal in the Interim Report should be classified as permanent. The requisite number of selected clerks now borne on temporary list should be taken up in such permanent posts.

(g) *Peons*.—A large number of peons is also on temporary basis. This is unfair. The minimum number of permanent offices being perfectly well known and an established fact, the peon staff modelled on the scale approved by Government for offices should be determined for the purpose of permanent cadre and all such posts should be classified as permanent. The required number should be drafted from the temporary staff and made permanent.

477. The Committee feel that the temporary staff made permanent under the above proposals should be admitted to all the privileges open to permanent staff and their unbroken temporary service should count for pension and leave. Their pay in the permanent cadre may be fixed in accordance with rules which may have been framed in the past to suit similar cases in other departments or in accordance with principles which may be regarded as just and reasonable.

478. The Committee notice that the Public Works Department staff classified as 'Work-charged' is also numerous especially under the inferior classes. Mr. Gordon explained that the 'Work-charged' staff fell under two categories—

(i) That engaged purely for specific works sanctioned for execution during the year.

(ii) Labour engaged for work required to be done permanently.

He observed that the staff under (i) must be regarded as 'Work-charged' and their tenure can not but be coextensive with the execution period of the work. As regards (ii) he was of opinion that all labour staff can not be made permanent and he could not even advise that the inferior staff engaged under (ii) should be made permanent. Such proposal must be rejected for both financial and administrative reasons. The financial liability for leave and pension will be enormous and it will be difficult to enforce efficient working of such huge permanent labour staff.

479. In view of these difficulties, the Committee recommend that such of the 'Work-charged' posts as are likely to be continuously required from year to year and such of the staff as have put in a sufficiently long period of unbroken service should be classified as 'temporary' and admitted to the privileges of temporary staff. The categories which should be so classified may be the following :—

Daroghas.

Signallers.

Telephone Operators.

Maistris.

Khalasis.

Tyndals.

480. The Committee fully realise that their proposals will involve additional financial burden but they fail to see how justice can be denied to several hundreds of Government employees in high and low grades in the Public Works Department. They therefore strongly recommend that a fair charge such as this, on public revenues should be faced.

BARRAGE TOWNSHIP.

481. Barrage Township was raised 15 years ago in the vicinity of Sukkur Town. It now forms part of the Municipal area. From the very outset it has been treated as a Government Estate, where sanitary, lighting, water-supply and communications arrangements are carried out at Government expense and Municipal services are not availed of within the Township area.

After completion of the Barrage, it was a problem whether it was economical to keep up the Barrage Town which had cost a large amount to the Government and must cost continually for maintenance.

482. The Barrage Township is covered with various official buildings, which are said to have cost Government in the neighbourhood of Rs. 25 lakhs. The standing buildings are at present as under :—

	2	Superintending Engineer's bungalows.
	10	Executive Engineers' bungalows.
	8	Assistant Executive Engineers' bungalows.
	23	A-I-Type quarters.
	39	A Type quarters.
	58	B Type quarters.
	102	C Type quarters.
	126	D Type quarters.
	44	D Type quarters attached to offices blocks.
	10	D Type quarters attached to Barrage Hospital.
	3	Dressers' quarters attached to Barrage Hospital.
Total ...	425	Buildings.

483. The sub-joined table shows the present use of these buildings as intimated by the Chief Engineer on the 13th July 1938.

Occupied by employees of Government ...	227
Rented to private persons ...	56
Used as Circuit House (Book value Rs. 53,733) ...	1
Used as Inspection bungalow (Book value Rs. 38,738) ...	1
Sold out for Rs. 5,537 ...	1
Vacant (Book value Rs. 2,72,634) ...	139
Total ...	<u>425</u>

Rent was realised in 1937-38 to the tune of Rs. 33,000 from officials and non-officials combined.

484. The Departmental Expenditure for maintenance of the Township area in a sanitary condition was reported as under:—

	Rs.	
Lighting ...	3,381	
Water-supply ...	6,172	
Conservancy ...	14,300	
Medical Relief ...	4,650	
Street Lighting ...	6,018	
Roads ...	7,236	
Roads-side trees ...	4,160	
House-tax ...	1,930	paid to the Municipality without using its services.

Total Rs. 47,847

An income of Rs. 9,300 was said to have been received from the lighting, water-supply and conservancy services rendered to the inhabitants of the Township. It admeasures 160 acres and the population of the Public Works Department Officers and their dependents is 884 and of all others 475.

291

485. The Municipality being by law entitled to house-tax levies it on Government buildings whether municipal sanitary and other services are utilised or not. The Barrage Power Station which had since been handed over to the North-Western Railway supplies electric current for lighting of buildings and for operating Barrage gates on payment by the tenants and Government respectively. Street lighting is paid for by the Public Works Department administration responsible for the Barrage Township.

486. Negotiations were started with the Municipality of Sukkur for rendering civic services to this area. At a meeting convened in February 1936, which was attended by a representative of the Public Works Department, the Collector and President of the Municipality it was stated that the undermentioned cost will have to be incurred by the Municipality on the services in the Township area:—

	Rs.
Repairs to roads ...	3,000
Provision of water-supply ...	5,300
Conservancy of roads ...	3,000
Lighting of roads ...	5,700
Total ...	<u>17,000</u>

Further it was pointed out that the Municipality will have to pay the undermentioned amounts being the present depreciated value of the lighting, water-supply and Conservancy systems:—

	Rs.
Water-supply system ...	50,943
Street lighting system ...	36,537
Conservancy system ...	11,749
Total ...	<u>99,299</u>

(In round figures Rupees one lakh).

487. The President refused to enter into a bargain, which would involve the Municipality in substantial non-recurring and recurring expenditure. The Public Works Department demanded from the Municipality maintenance of the existing standard of sanitary and other arrangements in the Township, while the President contended with the Collector's support that the Municipality cannot be expected to give to the Township any better service than what is given to the Town of Sukkur itself. The negotiations therefore fell through.

488. Another point of difference on which Government could not come to terms with the Municipality was that Government wanted to continue with the existing organisation for the supply of electric energy required for Township and Governmental purposes, while the Sukkur Municipality which had its own Electric plant, preferred to retail energy required in the Township.

489. The Chief Engineer has sent us a copy of a note by Mr. C. G. Hawes, Superintending Engineering, Northern Sind Circle. The latter is against the handing over of the Township to the Municipality. He thinks that the introduction of Municipal conservancy arrangements in the Township would very speedily change the present clean Township into something resembling a "Pigsty". Such a remark could not be applied to the Municipality of Sukkur which enjoys better reputation for general tidiness.

It was pointed out by him that Government had incurred heavy capital expenditure on—

	Original cost.		Depreciated value.	
	Rs.		Rs.	
Water-supply ...	1,07,709	...	50,000	
Roads ...	50,000	...	50,000	(being kept in repairs)
Street lighting ...	60,500	...	36,537	
Conservancy ...	27,712	...	11,749	

for the Township purposes.

Barring roads, which he admits, have to be handed over free to the Municipality, he observes that the transference of the area to the Municipality would mean a present of Rupees one lakh to them. We might quote a few paras from Mr. Hawes' note.

"Since the Municipality are apparently not prepared to consider taking over the Township and providing it with essential services, unless the supply of electric power is handed over to them, it would seem that the best solution of the difficulty which has arisen at present would be for Government to exclude from the Municipal area, the whole of the Barrage Right Bank Township. If this were done, the maintenance of the roads in the Township, of conservancy on roads and of water-supply to the Township can be carried out with no loss to Government, since the small profit on the sale of water (which could if necessary be slightly increased) plus the amount not paid in house-tax to Municipality, would suffice to cover the maintenance charges of roads. The electricity supply, as shown, at present covers the cost of street lighting and the expenditure on conservancy can, without any great hardship on the tenants of bungalows, be made self-supporting.

"At present we have many Government servants of other Departments than the Public Works Department and some private individuals living in the Right Bank Township. One of the attractions of the Township is that the charge made for electric light is Re. 0-4-6 per unit.

"If the distribution of power were handed over to the Municipality they would presumably increase the charge made to that in force in Sukkur, which is more than Re. 0-4-6.

"This might possibly cause people who are not bound to stay in the Township, to move thereby causing loss of rent to Government.

"Presumably, if the Barrage Township were excluded from the Municipal limits, the Township would immediately become excluded also from the area included in the Sukkur Electric Company's License, and the dispute in regard to the use of power from the Barrage (now North-Western Railway) Power Station and its sale in the Barrage Township, would presumably automatically be settled.

"The question of developing the water power available at the Tando Masti Khan Fall (some 7,700 H. P.) is at present under investigation with a view to the supply of power for pumping stations working on drains along Rohri Canal and possibly, at the end of the present contract with the North-Western Railway in 1941, for the supply of power to the Barrage itself, Workshop, the Township, etc. There seems every possibility that power can be developed cheaply at the Tando Masti Khan Fall and that such power might be sold to the North-Western Railway under an arrangement by which they would maintain the existing power station for use as a stand-by plant during periods when the Rohri Canal had to be closed. The full load required for the drainage and tubewell pumping, the Barrage Workshop, and Township (including the Left Bank Township and the new Jail Buildings about to be constructed) would not absorb more than 1/8th of the power available and in the event of any difficulty being raised by the North-Western Railway in regard to the retention of their power station, a sufficiently large stand-by plant could be created at Sukkur and run by Government."

490. Mr. Gordon, our colleague, is of the opinion that Barrage which constituted the biggest asset of the Province and is a monumental work of vital importance should have very neat and reasonably attractive surroundings. In his opinion the Barrage Township sanitary, etc., arrangements should not be disturbed by being transferred to the Municipality. The present tidy and pleasant appearance of its surroundings will then deteriorate. He hoped that the net cost of the Barrage Township could be reduced to Rs. 30,000 as against

Rs. 38,000 shown in Mr. Hawes' note. He added that if the concession of free water-supply and conservancy services permissible to Government servants drawing upto Rs. 150 under Bombay Civil Services Rules 846 Note 3 (b) were withdrawn and the charges levied on other Government servants were slightly increased, the financial burden falling on Government revenues will be considerably lightened.

491. Mr. Gazdar on the other hand regarded the present cost as prohibitive and saw no great disadvantage in the Municipality of Sukkur performing the sanitary, etc., services in the Barrage Township as a part of Municipal area.

492. Mr. Gordon has forwarded to us a fresh note about income and expenditure of the Township and suggested ways of increasing revenue and decreasing expenditure.

493. The Committee re-examined the position and found that even in accordance with the revised figures furnished by Mr. Gordon, the Barrage Township will involve net expenditure of Rs. 17,480, or Rs. 15,780, according as the existing conservancy charges are doubled or trebled to reduce the deficit. If for any reason the expected economies do not materialise or the lower paid staff resist the imposition of conservancy and water-supply charges in contravention of the Bombay Civil Services Rules and the higher paid staff refuse paying, as suggested, double or treble conservancy charges, there will hardly be any likelihood of reduction in expenditure. The Committee are, therefore, definitely of the opinion that there is no justification for the Barrage Township being a burden on Public Works Department estimates. The Sukkur Municipality is a fairly well managed body and Sukkur enjoyed reputation for cleanliness. The Barrage Township being within the Municipal area could be fairly well looked after by the Municipality as any other part of the town of Sukkur. There is no point in paying property taxes to the Municipality and taking no advantage at all of the Municipal services. The administration of the Township should be transferred to the Sukkur Municipality. The conservancy arrangement pointed out to be the main difficulty was not such as could not be got over. Government may come to an arrangement with the Municipality and pay for the cost of two or three extra carts required for removal of rubbish from the bungalows and other buildings.

494. Water-supply, street lighting and conservancy systems of which the depreciated book value is put at Rs. 99,229, should be transferred free to the Municipality so that they may run them in future. It is the duty of an estate owner within a Municipal area to equip his area with these arrangements before a Municipality can be called upon to take over the arrangements for future maintenance. Since value of these systems will go on depreciating

from year to year and their profitable disposal in any other way is not possible, it will be financially more advantageous to hand over the systems free than to continue spending a sum of Rs. 17,000 annually holding that it is even possible to run the show most economically as now proposed. With the transfer of these systems to the Municipality, the occupants of the bungalows or other buildings in the Township will be liable to deal directly with the Municipality and pay the charges according to the Municipal Schedule, and there will be no grouse any where or any claim to any concessions under the Bombay Civil Services Rules.

495. As to charges for electric current required for purely Government purposes, it should not be difficult to enter into a pact with the Municipality for charges at a specially low rate of 1 or 1·3 annas per unit common in other areas for industrial purposes. The existing charge made by North-Western Railway is Rs. 17,100 for 2,37,316 units, *i.e.*, 1·06 annas per unit, while the Municipal charge is anticipated at Rs. 49,956 which works out to a unit rate of 3·1 annas. If the Municipality decide to adopt an unreasonable attitude, which this Committee do not expect from a statutory local body if approached in a suitable way and in a reasonable spirit. Government may continue to receive the current required from the North-Western Railway.

496. The Committee have examined the list of Barrage bungalows and other buildings furnished by the Chief Engineer decided to recommend that the 122 vacant buildings of the present book value of Rs. 2,49,908 out of a total of 425—203 being variously occupied, *i.e.*, all such as are not required strictly for official purposes, should be forthwith disposed of by auction. The buildings would be decaying, while maintenance cost and depreciation would be mounting. Private sales if possible may also be arranged. The local property brokers would help when approached in a business like spirit. What the Committee emphasise is that all realisable value of the vacant properties should be secured forthwith in order to prevent further losses.

MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR EXPENDITURE.

497. In the Chapter on Public Works Department incorporated in the Interim Report, the Committee had suggested limitation of expenditure on 'Bunds' and Maintenance and Repairs for Irrigation Works to Rs. 32,00,000. The total 'Bunds' expenditure for 1937-38 was estimated at Rs. 12 lakhs, of which about half being the expenditure relating to Bunds below the Barrage is under the new accounting system included under the Maintenance and Repairs grant pertaining to the Lloyd Barrage Canals under Budget

Head—"XVII." The Committee had recommended total 'Bunds' expenditure to be limited to Rs. 9 lakhs. In regard to Canals 'Maintenance and Repairs' expenditure the Committee strongly felt that it should not exceed Rs. 23 lakhs calculated on the basis of aggregate cultivation of 46 lakhs acres exclusive of *dubari* at a rate of annas eight per cultivated acre.

498. In February last the Chief Secretary to Government of Sind intimated the Committee that it was open to them to examine the items of 'Maintenance and Repairs'. We, accordingly, wrote for and have obtained some statistical information bearing on this subject and shall refer to it in this Chapter.

499. Since we last wrote on this subject the Budget estimates for 1938-39 have been presented to the Legislative Assembly and passed and the Chief Engineer has furnished certain statements under his No. 1,448-11-I., dated the 16th June 1938. The information relating to 'Maintenance and Repairs' contained in the Budget estimates for 1938-39 and the Chief Engineer's statement is embodied in the sub-joined table.

Maintenance and Repairs.

	Budgetted Expenditure in 1937-38 as shown by Chief Engineer.	Revised estimates in 1937-38 as per budget estimates of 1938-39.	Actual Expenditure 1937-38, as shown by Chief Engineer.	Budgetted Expenditure in 1938-39 as per Budget estimates of 1938-39.
XVII—Irrigation	40,05,000	39,25,500	32,94,551 (Canals)	39,05,400
18—Other works (Bunds) ...	8,85,000	2,55,900	4,14,223 (Bunds)	3,12,500
Total	48,90,000	41,81,400	37,08,774	42,17,900

500. If the reduction in expenditure effected in 1937-38 is an indication of the efforts of the Public Works Department in regard to the 'Maintenance and Repairs' expenditure, we have reason to be satisfied, for it is a good start to cut down expenditure by Rs. 11.83 lakhs compared with the estimates of 1937-38. It would have been very satisfactory if this reduction had been fully reflected in the allotment provided for 1938-39. The full extent of the reductions materialising for 1937-38 could not possibly have been known when the estimates for 1938-39 were prepared.

501. The 'Bunds' expenditure under Budget Head—"18" has been accounted for under the following circles:—

	Rs.
Development and Research Division ...	42,000
Western Sind Circle ...	63,000
Northern Sind Circle ...	6,978
Indus River Commission ...	3,02,245
Total Rs. ...	4,14,223

The reduction works out to more than 50 per cent. The Committee feel that there is naturally over-budgetting in the estimates of expenditure for Bunds and Canals, Maintenance and Repairs, for the Abkalani conditions of the coming year cannot be forecasted with much accuracy. We would, therefore, suggest that basic expenditure should be first determined and separately provided for Maintenance and Repairs which should not exceed a sum calculated at annas eight for cultivated area exclusive of *dubari* cultivation. However in order to meet emergencies, a lump sum grant of say Rs. 5 lakhs should be admitted and kept in reserve. This may be drawn upon from time to time, if and when any emergency such as damage due to extraordinary floods and other unforeseen causes arises, with the sanction of Government.

502. The 'Maintenance and Repair' expenditure under "XVII.—Irrigation" in 1937-38 in each circle is co-related to the actual cultivated area (Kharif and Rabi exclusive of *dubari*) of the the year 1936-37 in the sub-joined table. The incidence is worked out on the previous year's cultivation figures, as those for the year 1937-38 are not available with the Committee. There is no disadvantage in this for it is not claimed, that cultivation is going down.

Circle.	'Maintenance and Repairs' expenditure in 1937-38.	Average cultivation in 1936-37.	Incidence of 'Maintenance and Repairs' per acre of cultivated area in annas.
	Rs. in lakhs.	Acres in lakhs.	
Western Sind Circle ...	4.44	6.36	11.1
Rohri Canal Circle ...	5.66	6.45	14.0
Eastern Sind Circle ...	6.35	8.60	11.8
Northern Sind Circle ...	8.87	9.90	14.3
Southern Sind Circle ...	7.50	7.93	15.1
Total ...	32.82	39.24	13.3

503. Taking the Committee's limit of aggregate Maintenance and Repairs expenditure, *viz.*, Rs. 32 lakhs and deducting therefrom the 'Bunds' actual expenditure above Barrage shown by the Chief Engineer, *viz.*, Rs. 4.14 lakhs, the remainder Rs. 27.86 lakhs gives an incidence of 11.4 annas per acre on the cultivation of 1936-37. It will be seen that in one circle on the Right Bank and one on the Left Bank, the incidences have not been exceeded. The average for the Province is only two annas more per acre. The Committee cannot, therefore, be said to be asking the impossible in bringing down the aggregate Maintenance and Repairs expenditure to Rs. 32 lakhs.

504. The further reduction of Rs. 5 lakhs should not cause any great derangement in the normal administration of the Public Works Department. The following items of expenditure during the past year 1937-38 should be able to bear the requisite curtailment in order to bring down the expenditure to the limit proposed by the Committee :—

	Expenditure 1937-38. Rs.
1. Bungalows inclusive of furniture, crockery, cutlery, equipment, chowkidars, gardens and Nurseries	2.90 Lakhs.
2. Work-charged establishment	11.45 "
3. Plantations	1.64 "
4. Service roads and inspection paths	1.15 "
5. Rent on Telegraph and Telephone charges—	
NOTE.—This service may be cut down where it is not very essentially needed	1.86 "
6. Earth-work on Banks	5.19 "
7. Miscellaneous	4.87 "
Total	29.06 Lakhs.

505. We would in conclusion draw upon the valuable note of our colleague, Mr. M. H. Gazdar, submitted by him to the Committee and point out some statistical details pertaining to the pre and post-Barrage Public Works Department of Sind and some comparative figures relating to Sind, Punjab and United Provinces Public Works Department administrations.

I.—Sind.

1. Pre-Barrage mileage of Canals in operation	7,808
Post-Barrage mileage of Canals in operation	9,732

Increase 24·7 per cent.

2. Pre-Barrage maximum discharge of Canals working in Sind	1,06,880 cusecs.
Post-Barrage discharge—			
Barrage Canals	...	46,568	
Non-Barrage Canals	...	39,862	
			86,430 "

Decrease 19 per cent.

3. Last Pre-Barrage 3 years' (1929-30 to 1931-32) average cultivation exclusive of <i>dubari</i>	36·12 lakhs acres.
Last Post-Barrage 3 years' (1934-35 to 1936-37) average cultivation exclusive of <i>dubari</i>	38·64 "
4. Last Pre-Barrage 3 years' average 'Maintenance and Repairs' Irrigation	28·97 lakhs of Rs.
Last Post-Barrage 3 years' average 'Maintenance and Repairs' Irrigation	40·99 "
5. Incidence of Pre-Barrage 'Maintenance and Repairs' per acre of cultivation	12·6 annas.
6. Incidence of Post-Barrage 'Maintenance and Repairs' per acre of cultivation	16·9 "

II.—Comparative figures for the year 1934-35 for which Administration Reports for the Provinces of Punjab and United Provinces are available.

	PUNJAB.		SIND.		UNITED PROVINCES.	
1. Cultivation in lakhs of acres.	Kharif	53	Kharif	25	Kharif	12
	Rabi inclusive of <i>dubari</i> .	59	Rabi inclusive of <i>dubari</i> .	17	Rabi	26
	Total	112	Total	42	Total	38
2. Mileage of Canals	21,518		9,732		16,384	
3. Discharge in cusecs	1,03,080		86,430		Not available.	

	PUNJAB.	SIND.	UNITED PROVINCES.
4. Gross Revenue in lakhs of rupees of productive and unproductive works for which capital accounts are kept.	660.32	121.69	196.00
5. Working Expenses in lakhs of rupees of productive and unproductive works for which Capital Accounts are kept.	183.45	72.46	86.00
	Including Maintenance & Repairs (Canals) 96.48.	Including Maintenance & Repairs (Canals) 43.54	Including Maintenance and Repairs 35.00
6. Incidence of Maintenance and Repairs per cultivated acre.	13.4 annas	16.5 annas	14.7 annas per acre cultivated whether by canal, tube wells and dam irrigation. The last two are more costly arrangements than canal flow irrigation and that accounts for higher incidence of Maintenance and Repairs expenditure.
Net Revenue ...	476.87	49.23	110
Capital invested in productive works.	33 crores	25 crores.	26 crores inclusive of Hydro Electric Scheme and Tube wells.
Return on capital ...	14.4 per cent.	2 per cent.	4.2 per cent.

506. It is evident from the above that the Sind cost is comparatively heavy; so the Committee feel fully justified in requiring that the Sind Public Works Department estimates for Maintenance and Repairs should be further reduced by 5 lakhs at least so that the total should not exceed Rs. 32 lakhs.

507. As regards retrenchments in other sections of the Public Works Department of the Province our views expressed in the Interim Report similarly stand unaltered. We are of opinion that the proposed retrenchments and reorganization, which will not in any way retard the efficiency of the Department, should be given effect to without delay.

CHAPTER XXII.

PRINTING AND STATIONERY.

GOVERNMENT PRESS.

508. With the separation of Sind the Old Commissioner's Press was converted into Government Press. This necessarily required considerable expansion owing to increase of work in all directions.

Mr. Neale, the Superintendent of Government Printing and Stationery, Bombay, was deputed to inspect the present arrangements and report on the needed expansion of the Press and we have had an opportunity of going through his report. We have also examined Mr. Mukherjee, Manager of the Press. The Government have commenced taking action to equip and extend the Press on the basis of Mr. Neale's report. The Manager stressed the need of an Assistant Manager and we understand that the post has been advertised by the Joint Public Service Commission. More machinery has been ordered so that all the printing work including the printing of standard forms which is now done at Yeravda Press could be done at the Sind Government Press and for which Sind Government pay Rs. 75,000 annually to the Bombay Government. In view of Mr. Neale's report and our examination of the present Manager, we have come to the conclusion, that it is essential to have a complete and properly equipped and staffed press for the Sind Government. The total work done by the Press in 1936-37 is costed at Rs. 1,83,020 and it is sure to increase year by year.

509. The present organisation of the Press consists of the Manager (300—650), 16 Clerical Staff, 90 Technical Staff and 4 Peons which cost Rs. 82,800. The total cost of running the Press at present is Rs. 1,11,400 including depreciation, contingencies and salaries.

510. Mr. Neale had submitted two schemes—

- (a) for meeting the ordinary demands,
- (b) for becoming independent of outside help in the work of Government Printing, i.e., including the standard forms.

For the present Government have accepted the 1st proposal which does not require extension of the building. Budget provision has been made for purchase of machinery included under (a) scheme, and we feel that this is a move in the right direction.

The Committee hope that this will be followed next year by action on the (b) scheme. The required machinery to complete the equipment is estimated to cost only Rs. 35,000. The 2nd part of the scheme requires construction of buildings estimated to cost Rs. 2,00,000. The Committee feel that this large expenditure on buildings could easily be avoided by placing the premises of the Revenue Commissioner's Office at the disposal of the Press.

511. The Manager is of opinion that with slight additions and alterations the Revenue Commissioner's Office rooms will be suitable for Press expansion. The Committee do not anticipate any difficulty in shifting the Revenue Commissioner's Office to some rented accommodation until the new Secretariat is built where the Office of the Revenue Commissioner will also be housed. This will be a more economical arrangement. Suitable accommodation should in their opinion be available temporarily in—

- (a) One or more of the bungalows which will be available on the transfer of the Western Command to Quetta in September next, or
- (b) Any of the undermentioned buildings, which are now vacant, on the McLeod Road.
 - (i) Nadir Building.
 - (ii) Mandviwalla building.
 - (iii) Oriental Insurance Company building.
 - (iv) James Finlay building.
 - (v) Safe-Deposit Company's new building.
- (c) Any of the new building on Victoria Road.

512. The Press Office Staff from Head Clerk downwards are eligible for the Karachi local allowance. As none of the office members are likely to be transferred to any office in the mofussil, the Committee see no justification for fixing mofussil scales for this staff and recommend that the scales may be revised and the drawal of Karachi local allowance should be stopped.

513. The Manager has sent us copies of correspondence relating to revision of pay scales of the clerical staff, which is being held up by Government as intimated to him, pending report by the Reorganization Committee.

We have examined the revision proposals, which mainly relate to merging of the Karachi local allowance and provide for a slight improvement in pay. Considering that the Press Work is bound to be very dry for the largest part of it is accounting and there is no

other outlet for promotion outside the office and the cadre is very small, the Committee recognise the need for revision and suggest the following scales in place of the existing scales and those proposed by the Superintendent. The immediate effect of the revision, as worked out by the Manager, will be an increase of Rs. 45 per month or Rs. 540 per year. We have slightly varied the scales proposed by the Manager so as to provide regular graded scales—the next higher post beginning slightly above the next lower one and avoid over lapping of pay in different grades.

Designation.	No. of posts.	Present scale.	Scale proposed by Manager.	Scale suggested by the Committee.
Head Clerk	1	125—5—150 plus Rs. 15 L.A.	140—10—200	160—8—200
Accountant	1	105—4—125 plus Rs. 12/8 L.A.	115—5—150	125—5—150
Senior Clerks	4	85—5/2—100 plus Rs. 12/8 L.A.	100—5—130	100—5—120
	2	80—5/2—95 plus Rs. 10 L.A.		
Clerks	4	30—5/2—80 plus Rs. 10/8 L.A.	60—4—100	75—5/2—95
	4	30—5/2—60 plus Rs. 7/8 L.A.	35—5/2—75	35—5/2—70
	1	25—5/2—55 plus Rs. 7/8 L.A. (Revised).	Do.	Do.

514. One more recommendation about the Press staff relates to the removal of the two-annas-in-rupee cut in the wages of new entrant piece-work Compositors introduced as a measure of administrative necessity, but continues to be enforced still. This cut was removed in the case of superior services with the revision of their pay scales and lastly in the case of peon staff in November 1937. The Committee deprecate the continuance of the cut in the case of these low paid employees, whose wages are limited and recommend its removal.

STATIONERY.

515. The Committee discussed the arrangements for supply of stationery stores to Government Offices. We have perused the rules of indents, supply and distribution of stationery articles and we have elicited requisite information from Mr. Rodrigues, Assistant Secretary, Political and Miscellaneous Departments. We are of the

opinion that the present tender and direct supply arrangement, which eliminates the cost of the central depôt and distribution agency, deserves a trial. But we suggest that each department should be granted an allotment for stationery and in order that expenditure should strictly be restricted within such fixed limits for each Department, the cost of the stationery supplied should be debited to that allotment.

516. The Budget Provision for supply of stationery and printing stores is Rs. 1,51,500 and we feel that by economical purchase and use of materials, there should be a substantial saving.

517. We have seen the long list of stationery articles and the scale of permissible annual requirements of articles in general use, prescribed under Appendix III of the Stationery Rules. We have examined Mr. Lalchand, Retired Treasury Officer, Karachi, who had some experience of this Department. He and the Committee Secretary have suggested certain changes to the above said Appendix. We are of the opinion that these suggestions which are incorporated in Appendix VII to this Report should be included in the Stationery Rules Appendix III. Its adoption will prevent a good deal of stationery wastage.

518. We are informed that there is at present great wastage in the use of forms and stationery articles and that Stationery Supply Rules are not rigidly followed. We suggest for consideration of Government, whether it will not pay to appoint an Inspector of Forms and Stationery for checking stocks and preventing wastage.

Postage.

519. There is great wastage under service postage stamps. It is well known that clerks, responsible for the issue of letters, do not take the trouble to weigh them and while affixing stamps, always err on the safe side and apply more stamps than actually necessary. They do not economise by issue on the same day of not more than one cover to the same address and use of messenger delivery locally. Steps should be taken to put down this tendency with a strong hand. We also draw the attention of the Government that while commercial firms have adopted measures to take advantage of the one-anna-per-tola rate of postage by using thin but at the same time proper writing paper and envelopes, Government have lagged behind in this respect. If thinner paper were used for covers and if the writing paper could also be made thinner without losing its strength, a two sheet letter could be carried easily for one anna instead of one and a half annas. By ensuring these suggested methods, it will be possible substantially to bring down the postage cost.

Stationery and Book Depot Organization.

520. We consider that the present Book Depot working is an extravagant arrangement. In our opinion the Stationery and Book Depot Sections should both be attached to the Government Press and the Manager of the Press should be the Superintendent.

521. The Manager observed that he could conveniently take charge of these two Sections and would not need any additional staff after the second part of Mr. Neale's scheme is acted upon. Whether the Government change the present system of supply of stationery by manufacturers direct to districts or establish a Central Distributing Depot at Karachi, the Manager of Press, who is supposed to be some sort of an expert in stationery articles would manage more efficiently. Similarly the Press would be in a better position to manage a Book Depot. The transfer of the Book Depot will save the following staff expenditure:—

One Manager on Rs. 150—10—200.

One Clerk „ 50—5/2—90—5—110

One Peon „ 17 plus 2 plus 4.

In the alternative we suggest that the Book Depot and Library may even be transferred to the Oriental Translator and Director of Information and the present staff disbanded. It is sheer extravagance to maintain a Manager on Rs. 150—10—200 and a Clerk on Rs. 50—110 for the Book Depot and Library. If the Book Depot is transferred to the Press according to our first recommendation, the Library should be transferred to the Oriental Translator.

Gul Hayat Institute

CHAPTER XXIII.

MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS.

ORIENTAL TRANSLATOR TO GOVERNMENT AND
COMMISSIONER OF LABOUR'S DEPARTMENT.

522. Before Sind was separated, the Oriental (Sindhi) Translator for Sind was the Assistant Commissioner in Sind (I.C.S.) and there were besides two Assistant Translators and four Junior Translators. Since then two Junior Translators have been added for the new work of scrutinising newspapers, books, etc., in Gujarati, Marathi, Urdu, Hindi and Konkani, formerly done in the Oriental Translator's Office in Bombay. The pre-separation Senior Assistant Translator is now the Oriental Translator. He combines in himself the Offices of the Director of Information, Commissioner of Labour and Secretary of the Departmental Examination.

523. He is allotted one clerk for each of the sections of Labour and Information. There is also a clerk for the Examinations Section. As all the examinations are hereafter to be conducted by the joint Bombay-Sind Service Commission, from Bombay, services of the Examinations Section clerk will not be required.

524. The estimated cost of the staff of the Department of the Oriental Translator for 1937-38 is Rs. 24,000 and that of the Examination Section Rs. 3,900. The income from the Examination fees is estimated at Rs. 2,400.

The pay of the Oriental Translator has been recently fixed at Rs. 550-40-750. The first Assistant in the Department has a scale of Rs. 225-15-300, the second Assistant Rs. 140-10-180, and three Junior Translators get Rs. 70-5-140 and two Rs. 90-5-160 each.

525. The duties of the Oriental Translator, Bombay, are as under :—

(1) Attending Government House parties and receptions and Darbars of Sardars.

(2) Remaining present at interviews between His Excellency and persons who cannot speak English

(3) Keeping the Military Secretary to His Excellency informed of the status of persons who are to be invited to Government House parties.

(4) Reviewing all newspapers and submitting his weekly review to the Government through the Department concerned.

(5) Bringing to notice of Government articles in newspapers and other publications which he considers to be objectionable.

(6) Performing certain statutory duties under the Press Act.

(7) Getting translations prepared from English into Vernacular and *vice versa*, as required by Government in different Departments.

(8) Acting as Secretary to the Examinations Committee.

526. The Oriental Translator of Sind is not called upon to perform duties (1) to (3). The Oriental Translator's Office in Sind deals with :—

- (a) Translation of newspapers and publications.
- (b) Departmental Examinations.
- (c) Publicity Department of Government.
- (d) Labour matters.

The Committee observe that the Oriental Translator in Sind has no political functions to perform. He is first and last a repository of local information and views. As he is Director of Information too, he should be a person possessing journalistic flair and be trained in Publicity Department.

527. As Director of Information or Commissioner of Labour, he has some very simple functions to perform. The only work done at present is some occasional Press notes issued from the Director's Office, while on the Labour side, some statistical tables are prepared and published. He was expected to be in control of the Secretariat Library and Record Room, but this has not materialised. As Commissioner of Labour, he is not called upon to perform any political or industrial work. There was once a suggestion of combining the Office of the Commissioner of Labour with the Assistant Director of Industries.

528. The Committee feel that the Oriental Translator is hardly the person who should deal with the labour matters proper. Labour disputes are dealt with in the Home Department. As labour questions are rightly assuming the importance they deserve, Government should consider the question of appointing a separate officer for labour matters including statistics. He should act as Conciliation Officer also. The Committee further suggest that Government should constitute a Conciliation Board for settlement of labour disputes. The Chairman of the Board should be a high officer of the Judicial Department and the proposed Conciliation Officer its Executive authority.

529. With the transfer of Departmental Examination work to the Public Service Commission, it should be possible to retrench one clerk in the Oriental Translator's Office and bring into effect the pre-separation arrangement of an allowance of Rs. 10 to one of the Junior Translators.

530. In the Oriental Translator's Office each Translator types out his translation work. A Translator is a more highly paid person than a Typist would ordinarily be. Actually each Translator is at present engaged for some time of the day in a work which could be done by a less paid person. The Committee therefore recommend that one Translator's post (70—5—140) be retrenched and in its place a Typist's post on 50—5/2—90 be created. This Typist should do all the translation typing work of the Oriental Translator's Office.

531. The Committee notice great extravagance about grant of rewards to I.C.S. Officers for passing third compulsory language of the tract in which they are called upon to serve. The Committee regard that as an obvious duty of a highly paid officer like that of the I.C.S. He should attain a reasonable standard of proficiency in local languages in order to be really useful in public service. The Committee recommend that the rewards of Rs. 500 and Rs. 1,500 for passing Interpretership Proficiency Test carrying 60 per cent. or 80 per cent. marks, respectively, should be abolished altogether. The attainment of this literary achievement should be a matter of pride for the service officer and no reward need be offered as an inducement therefor.

532. The Committee recommend that the cost of holding Departmental and Vernacular Examinations should be repaid in fees as far as possible. At present Government receive Rs. 2,100 less than the income. Fees should be so adjusted as to avoid any loss.

533. The Committee recognise that the official examiners do some extra work in drawing question papers and assessing answer papers and some fees must be paid to them in order that they may not lose interest in the work. The present scale of fees payable to Examiners may therefore be continued. To balance this expenditure fees should be levied on the following principles from the candidates sitting at the examination:—

(1) No fee should be levied for any compulsory examination prescribed by Government for retention of the candidate in Government service.

(2) A fee equal to 5 per cent. of a month's salary of a candidate should be levied for a voluntary examination, which is taken with a view to improve one's prospects in the service or gain promotion.

(3) Non-officials appearing for any examination must pay the full charges incurred on their examination by way of fees to official examiners.

STEAM BOILER AND FACTORIES.

534. Both these Departments come under Budget Heads—
“ XXVI and 47 ” for Revenue and Expenditure, respectively.

The income of the Boiler fees is about Rs. 14,000, though the Miles-Irving Committee expected Rs. 17,000. There is no income from the Factories Section. The expenditure of the Steam Boilers Department is Rs. 13,900 and of the Factories Rs. 11,100. Total Rs. 25,000. The Miles-Irving Committee estimated Rs. 17,000 for both these Departments.

535. It has been ascertained that there are 250 Boilers and 300 Factories in Sind. The Sind Separation Officer was of opinion that there would not be enough work for the Inspector of Boilers nor for the Inspector of Factories to occupy them for all time. In order that the two Acts may be smoothly worked, he suggested a *via media* of combining the posts as under:—

(1) Chief Inspector of Steam Boilers and Smoke Nuisances and Inspector of Factories.

(2) Inspector of Steam Boilers and Smoke Nuisances, Sind.

536. The Government had, however, appointed separate Inspectors for Boilers and Factories. This arrangement did not last long as the Inspector of Factories relinquished charge here and reverted to his post in the Bombay Presidency in 1937. Since then the Chief Inspector of Boilers, Sind, is looking after the Factory work in addition to his own duties, and draws a special pay of Rs. 100 per mensem.

537. While the present arrangement is economical and may for that reason be continued, the Committee are advised that it does not leave sufficient time to the Chief Inspector of Boilers to look after the interests of labour employed in factories. This important aspect of labour welfare cannot be over-looked. The Committee, therefore, feel that a Class II post of an Assistant be created bearing the designation of Inspector of Boilers and Smoke Nuisances and Assistant Inspector of Factories. The new incumbent will work under the present Chief Inspector of Steam Boilers and Smoke Nuisances and Inspector of Factories. We are told that a similar arrangement is said to be working well in the United Provinces.

538. We suggest the following scales for the aforesaid two officers:—

1. Chief Inspector of Boilers and Smoke Nuisances and Inspector of Factories. Rs. 300—700
2. Inspector of Factories and Smoke Nuisances and Assistant Inspector of Factories „ 200—350

With the appointment of the proposed Assistant to the Chief Inspector, the special pay of Rs. 100 at present allowed to the latter should be withdrawn. There should be no longer any justification for it.

539. Further we notice that the Chief Inspector is permitted a conveyance allowance of Rs. 140 per mensem. This is much too excessive. An officer of his status may use a light car and accordingly the light car allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem only should be allowed in place of the existing allowance of Rs. 140. His Assistant may be granted a motor cycle allowance of Rs. 25 per mensem as such conveyance allowance should meet his requirements.

BUDGET HEAD “12” AND “13” MOTOR VEHICLE TAX AND OTHER TAXES AND DUTIES.

540. The Committee reviewed the possibilities of an improvement or modification in the matter of administration of other Taxes and Duties provided under Budget Heads “12” and “13”.

Four kinds of taxes come under these heads:—

- (1) Motor Vehicles Taxation.
- (2) Entertainment Tax.
- (3) Electricity Duties.
- (4) Tobacco Duties.

The anticipations of Miles-Irving Committee were Rs. 15,000 under Motor Vehicles Taxation and Rs. 55,000 under Entertainment Tax. Fortunately very substantial increases have accrued under both these taxes. The revenue for 1937-38 under Motor Vehicles Taxes was estimated at Rs. 1,59,100, and for 1938-39 at two lakhs. Under the Entertainment Taxes the income for 1937-38 was put at Rs. 1,05,000, and for 1938-39 at Rs. 1,11,000. The revenue for the third and fourth items had been estimated as under:—

	1937-38		1938-39
Electricity Duties	... 92,500	...	1,14,000
Tobacco Duties	... 70,750	...	64,000