

(3) The Agricultural Land Records Work be concentrated and very safely placed in the hands of the Head Record Keeper. We suggest that this appointment be in future held by a selection grade Mukhtiarkar. The annual inspection can be taken over by the Assistant Revenue Commissioner. The control work is certainly not more onerous or exacting than that of the Karachi Treasury Office or even the District Treasury Office.

(4) Except the City Survey Work of Karachi, this work in all other districts can safely be taken over by the Collectors. Any technical difficulty may be referred for solution to the Consulting Surveyor at Karachi. Even at present the Collectors are the appointing authorities of the City Surveyors and the Huzur Mukhtiarkars are the City Survey Officers, while Assistant/Deputy Collectors are Appellate authorities. We hold, therefore, that there should be no difficulty whatever in dealing with this section efficiently by the Revenue Department officers.

(5) The control of the City Survey work at Karachi, and Hyderabad, if possible, should be entirely handed over to the Consulting Surveyor. Even otherwise this officer will need an Assistant for the growing work of his department and we feel that if he is given a qualified Assistant—Graduate in Engineering in the scale of Rs. 170—15/2—320,—the work can be done more efficiently under such an arrangement.

CHAPTER IX.

CITY DEPUTY COLLECTOR, KARACHI.

171. At an early stage of our deliberations our attention was drawn to the working of the office of the City Deputy Collector, Karachi. On our inquiry the City Deputy Collector, Karachi, reported that he performed various duties, functioning in the under-mentioned capacities:—

- (1) City Survey Officer, Karachi.
- (2) Collector of Land Revenue for the City.
- (3) Administrator of the Entertainments Duty Act and Tobacco Act.
- (4) Assistant Superintendent of Stamps.
- (5) Honorary Secretary to the Trustees and Committee of Management, Karachi War Memorial Fund and also their Honorary Treasurer.
- (6) Honorary Secretary, Karachi Estate Board.
- (7) Member of the Cantonment Board.
- (8) Marriage Registrar, Karachi, under the Christian Marriages Act.
- (9) Magistrate for cases transferred to him for trial and Justice of Peace.
- (10) Documents Attesting Officer.
- (11) Passport Certification Officer.

172. The following is a further summary of his duties as related by him:—

“He has besides some other miscellaneous duties and out-door work to perform and to exercise general supervision over staff. The City Survey Office Section has four Surveyors, one Draftsman and two Clerks. All correspondence relating to waste lands in Karachi made over to the Municipality in 1872-73, Municipal land sale rules, grants of land by the Municipality, revision of Municipal leases, revision of land rents, grant of alignments land, acquisitions, exchanges, etc., are dealt with by the City Deputy Collector on behalf of the Collector before the orders of the Collector and Government are obtained. All appeals relating to these lands are sent to

the City Deputy Collector for report. He is specially required to watch observance of conditions of leases and construction of buildings in Garden and Lawrence quarters where the land belongs mostly to Government, so as to prevent overcrowding. All building plans in these two quarters are scrutinised by the City Deputy Collector before they are approved by the Collector. All Sub-division plans and alterations are passed by the City Deputy Collector. The survey work especially in those two quarters has increased to such an extent that Government have recently provided additional establishment of two Surveyors and one Draftsman to cope with it. The proposal to survey the Lyari quarter is at present under the consideration of Government and when sanctioned, enquiry will have to be made into the right, title and interest of each occupant of the area. There are 7,000 Government plots alone in that quarter; the enquiry work will have to be done by the City Deputy Collector according to the present system.

“In the Department of Land Revenue the City Deputy Collector is required to see that the Jamabandi forms are properly maintained and recoveries duly effected and accounted for. Coercive measures, under section 154 and 164, Land Revenue Code, for recovery of Government dues are often necessary and require the personal attention of the City Deputy Collector. He has to exercise general supervision over both the indoor and outdoor work of the village establishment. The Land Revenue collections of Karachi City for the year 1936-37 amounted to Rs. 84,396-3-0.

“Demands due from residents of Karachi relating to Municipal, Income Tax, Excise, Forest, Stamp and other Government Departments in Sind and other parts of India have to be recovered by this office and the City Deputy Collector has to see that the recovery is promptly made.

“He has to supervise the working of the Bombay Entertainments Duty Act and its collections. Similarly he has to see that the Tobacco Duty is properly assessed and recovered.

“He is also Assistant Superintendent of Stamps. In addition to the supervision exercised by him over the working of the Stamp Office he has to perform the duties of the ‘Proper Officer’ for the purpose of affixing and impressing labels on the various documents specified in the Indian Stamp Act Rules; 1925.

“He is responsible for supervising the conduct of sales and supply of stamps to the City and District of Karachi and grant of refund and exchange of spoilt stamps.

“The City Deputy Collector is Honorary Secretary of the Karachi Estate Board. He has to attend all its meetings and to deal with all questions and enquiries connected with the Estate. He corresponds direct with Government. He has to note on papers and take orders of the Chairman when necessary. He holds auctions of Estate Board land, conducts all correspondence with regard to the sale of each plot, recovers all dues and prepares the leases which is rather an intricate work. In 1926-27, Rs. 44,000 have been recovered on account of land rent and interest on the unpaid 50 per cent. of the purchase money. About Rs. 75,000 have been recovered on account of sale of plots. As option is given to purchasers to pay interest on the unpaid 50 per cent. of the purchase money within 99 years, the prescribed period of the lease, the work of maintenance of accounts and recovery is thus almost perpetual.

“He is the District Magistrate’s representative on the Cantonment Board. As Marriage Registrar he has to attend to all enquiries as to marriages under the Indian Christian Marriages Act. As a Magistrate he functions as an attesting officer for documents. He has to deal with persons requiring passports.”

173. The Committee have carefully considered the above account of the manifold activities of the City Deputy Collector, Karachi. His main duties may be divided under the following sections:—

(a) City Survey operations, which will include those relating to Lawrence, Lyari and Garden quarters.

(b) Estate Board.

(c) Stamps.

(d) Entertainments Duty and Tobacco taxes.

(e) Land Revenue assessment and recovery.

For all these matters he is the Supervisory Officer.

174. The other functions of the City Deputy Collector, as

- (i) Secretary and Treasurer, War Memorial Fund,
- (ii) Member, Cantonment Board,
- (iii) Magistrate and Justice of Peace,
- (iv) Passport Certification Officer,
- (v) Documents Attesting Officer, and
- (vi) Marriage Registrar,

are subsidiary and not germane to his office.

These could be tagged on to one or more other officers stationed in Karachi without detriment to public interest.

175. If the main duties (a) to (e) could be arranged for suitably, the office of the City Deputy Collector, Karachi, can be regarded as superfluous. And the Committee do not see any difficulty in arranging for the performance of these functions by other officers who have time and knowledge to carry out these duties quite as efficiently, if not more. The following arrangements are recommended for adoption:—

(a) That the control of the City Survey Work of Karachi at present exercised by the City Deputy Collector should be transferred to the Consulting Surveyor to Government. The latter officer is in every respect much better equipped for its exercise. The City Survey staff working in the office of the City Deputy Collector should also come under the control of the Consulting Surveyor.

(b) The Consulting Surveyor should also function as Honorary Secretary of the Karachi Estate Board in place of the City Deputy Collector. He is at present Advisor of the Board for technical matters and very recently he has been called upon to hold auctions of plots of the Board, a work which was hitherto being done by the City Deputy Collector.

(c) The Stamp Section be transferred partly to the Treasury Office and partly to the Revenue Commissioner's Office. This has been discussed in detail in the Chapter on the Stamp Department.

(d) We have suggested in the Chapter relating to Scheduled taxes that the Entertainments Duty and Tobacco Work should be supervised by an Inspector of Scheduled taxes under the direct control of the Collector of Karachi or his personal Assistant.

(e) (i) Land Revenue assessment and recovery work of the City of Karachi could easily be done in the Mukhtiarkar of Karachi's Office. The Mukhtiarkar of Karachi is comparatively a lightly worked officer and with the withdrawal of Magisterial work, he could easily take up more revenue work. The Land Revenue work of the assessment and recovery of City of Karachi will not be too great a load for him.

(ii) The City Land Revenue Jamabandi at present controlled by the City Deputy Collector should be done by the Personal Assistant to the Collector, who should also perform all other such functions of the City Deputy Collector as are not delegated to another independent authority.

176. It will thus be seen that the functions of the City Deputy Collector's Office could be performed conveniently and not less efficiently by being transferred to certain other responsible officers of Government. We, therefore, strongly recommend that the City Deputy Collector's post be abolished and his office staff be distributed to the several officers referred to above. We confidently hope that some economy may be possible in staff even by the suggested transference. Since there are other officers under the Government who are better equipped for performance of these duties, they should be entrusted with their management both as a measure of economy and efficiency. The Committee are of opinion that no time should be lost in carrying out these suggestions.

CHAPTER X.

TOWN PLANNING AND VALUATION DEPARTMENT.

177. The Town Planning and Valuation Department in Sind was brought into existence in 1921. It was a branch office of the Consulting Surveyor to the Government of Bombay and an Assistant Consulting Surveyor was in charge of the Karachi Office until 31st March 1936. With the separation of Sind pending the appointment of an independent Consulting Surveyor, the office was placed under the control of the Revenue Commissioner as its head. The Consulting Surveyor for Sind was appointed from 1st September 1937, on a scale of Rs. 500—30—800 plus a conveyance allowance of Rs. 50 and since then he is the head of the Department.

178. The chief duties of the Consulting Surveyor are Town Planning, Valuation and Land Acquisition. He is also Special Land Acquisition Officer for Karachi and Hyderabad Municipalities. For the former section he has a staff of one Junior Surveyor, one Draftsman, one Tracer, one Head Clerk and one Typist, and two peons and for the latter there are one Measurer, one Clerk, one Typist and one peon. He has told us that $\frac{2}{3}$ of the Consulting Surveyor's time is spent on Town Planning and Valuation work and about $\frac{1}{3}$ on the Special Land Acquisition under the Land Acquisition Act.

No specific touring is prescribed for the head of the Department but journeys are undertaken from time to time according to the exigencies of work.

179. Town Planning in Sind is in its infancy and its advantages are not yet fully recognised by the general public. But there is no doubt about the great need and vast scope for improvement in the conditions of towns and villages in Sind. As the Municipalities and Local Boards responsible for the development of areas under their respective jurisdiction and the general public recognise the importance of this activity, very useful work can emanate through this Department. At present the work had principally been done in and for the City of Karachi and slightly at Hyderabad.

180. The Miles-Irving Committee had estimated the basic expenditure of this Department at Rs. 18,000 and did not anticipate any extra cost after separation.

The cost of the Consulting Surveyor's Office is put at Rs. 16,100 for 1937-38 and the income at about Rs. 3,600 the net cost being Rs. 12,500.

110.

181. The land Acquisition work has been done by this officer at Karachi and Hyderabad and the cost is *pro rata* recovered on the Land Acquisition matters of the local bodies concerned. We are informed that in the past 15 years a sum of Rs. 52,923 had been recovered against the actual special establishment cost of Rs. 23,725.

182. The Consulting Surveyor's time spent on Town Planning work such as preparation and arbitration is being paid for by the local bodies concerned. The Town Planning is done by him under the Town Planning Act, 1915, and various schemes of town improvement and extension are carried out under the Municipal Act. He performs certain duties of Valuation under the Land Revenue Code and is also an expert Advisor to the Karachi Estate Board.

183. The Consulting Surveyor in furnishing a list of his duties and the work he has to perform, has pressed for an Assistant on the scale of Rs. 200—10—300 as suggested by the Sind Separation Officer. His contention is that he has no time for taking initiative in improving conditions in the mofussil.

184. The Committee have simultaneously discussed the organization of this Department and that the offices of the City Deputy Collector and Superintendent of Land Records with great precision and have come to a definite conclusion that the Consulting Surveyor is the fittest officer to take charge of the City Survey work of Karachi including the control of disposal of lands in Lyari, Lawrence and Garden quarters in preference to the City Deputy Collector, Karachi. Further he should be Honorary Secretary of the Karachi Estate Board of which he is already an Advisor. He should also be consultant of the Collectors for elucidation of technical matters arising out of City Survey Work in the districts. With the transfer of the City Survey Work of Karachi and the Secretaryship of the Karachi Estate Board, the Subordinate Office establishment engaged for these purposes in the City Deputy Collector's Office, including the City Surveyors, should also be controlled by the Consulting Surveyor.

185. As these additional duties will require the attention of the Consulting Surveyor and his other work has too increased in volume and is still further bound to increase, the Committee make the following recommendations :—

(a) The Consulting Surveyor should have the same rank and pay as Public Works Department Provincial Class I Officer, his scale being revised accordingly.

(b) The post of an Assistant in his office on a scale of Rs. 170—15/2—320 be created. An experienced B.E. qualified person should be recruited who should inspect City Survey Work of Karachi City and if feasible of Hyderabad Town, subject to the authority of the Consulting Surveyor and assist him generally in the performance of the other duties of his office.

186. There are certain minor matters relating to the office and work of the Consulting Surveyor on which the Committee have taken the following decisions and would suggest action accordingly:—

(1) The Committee see no justification for the staff of the Consulting Surveyor drawing Karachi local allowances. As this staff are not likely to be transferred to any mofussil areas their pay scales should not be based on the mofussil scales. If they have been so done in the past, they should be suitably revised.

(2) In order to avoid duplication of work and delay, the plans of buildings to be constructed in any Town Planning Area under a Town Planning Scheme should not be sent for scrutiny to the Consulting Surveyor or Collector. The scrutiny by a competent officer of the Local Authority empowered with the execution of the Town Planning Scheme appears sufficient. There is, however, nothing to restrict the Consulting Surveyor from inspecting the Town Planning Area under development in order to satisfy himself that the execution of the scheme is being carried out according to the sanctioned rules. Similarly the Karachi Estate Board Area having been incorporated within Municipal limits, the plans of the buildings to be raised on the Estate Board plots duly disposed of, should be scrutinised by the Municipality of Karachi and they need not be submitted for check either to the Executive Engineer, Karachi Buildings Division or to the Consulting Surveyor.

187. We would in the end suggest that the organization of this growing Department be reviewed after five years and such additional staff as may be found necessary, should be provided.

CHAPTER XI.

STAMP DEPARTMENT.

188. The present Central Stamp Office was created in 1904. It then constituted a large Central Depôt of Stamps for the requirements of Sind, Punjab, Baluchistan and the Persian Gulf. Very large stocks of stamps were maintained and a staff of 22 clerks was employed. In the year 1915, supervision, control and audit of the Sind Stamp Depôts were also transferred to the Central Office. In 1928, the Central Depôt for supplies beyond Sind was abolished. Since that year the Depôt has served the requirements of the Karachi City and district only, and the office had been assigned in addition the work of exercising check and control over stocks and indents of the district depôts of the whole Province. The district depôts forward their indents of non-postal stamp requirements through the Central Depôt Office to the Controller at Nasik, and the Depôt Office checks and orders payment of stamp bills for the whole Province. The District Depôts deal directly in regard to the postal stamps stocks. The Central Office does nothing in that respect for the District Depôts.

189. Before 1915, the Treasury Officer, Karachi, controlled the stamp stocks needed for district consumption. In that year the control was transferred to the Central Stamp Depôt then located in the old Agra Bank building near Boulton Market because the Treasury Office being then part of the Collector's Kutchery, was far away from the City business quarter, and the public felt much inconvenienced by having to go to the Collector's Kutchery for their stamp purchases.

190. The Collector of Karachi, who is ex-officio Superintendent of Stamps, had been requested to state if he had any reorganization proposals to suggest. He reported that since 1st April 1928, the work of this department had considerably increased and was still likely to increase with improvement of trade, and that he felt that it was desirable to raise the status of this office to the level of other independent Government departments such as the office of the Director of Public Instruction or Director of Public Health. He further stated that duties of the staff of the Stamp department were of a very responsible nature, each clerk being required to furnish security of Rs. 2,000 to Rs. 5,000, and that stamps to the extent of Rs. 2 lakhs were sold each month. We have also been supplied with lists of the duties of the City Deputy Collector, Karachi, who is ex-officio Assistant Superintendent.

191. The Miles-Irving Committee had said that the average income of 3 years from 1927-28 was Rs. 18.87 lakhs. There was the further income of Rs. 1.43 lakhs as the share of the postage stamps used for revenue purposes. Thus the total revenue was estimated to be Rs. 20.30 lakhs. The expenditure was estimated at Rs. 45,000 per year. The revenue budgetted for 1937-38 was Rs. 2 lakhs short and expenditure Rs. 3,000 short. The latter consisted of the following items :—

(i) Special pay of City Deputy Collector	...	Rs. 1,200
(ii) 4 Clerks at the Central Depôt	„ 5,340
(iii) 7 Inferior establishment	„ 1,660
(iv) Staff at District Depôts	„ 2,400
(v) Discount on sales	„ 16,600
(vi) 5 Vendors and 3 peons at Karachi	„ 5,100
(vii) Allowances	„ 1,600
(viii) Contingencies	„ 2,700
(ix) Cost of stamps payable to Central Stores	„ 5,600
		Total ... Rs. 42,200

192. At the outset it occurred to the Committee as to whether it would not be feasible to entrust stamp work proper to the Treasury Office, Karachi, which is now located in the same premises. Inquiry was accordingly made from the Collector of Karachi who is ex-officio Superintendent of Stamps. We also examined Mr. Shahani, Accountant and Store Keeper, Central Stamp Office and Mr. Tejumal, Inspector of Registration, which is an allied department. We were able to elicit much useful information from these two gentlemen about the work of these two departments. The Superintendent of Stamps (E. G. Taylor, Esquire, I.C.S.) reported that the Stamp Office was well-organized, well-housed, accessible to the public and efficiently run. The audit, control and supervision could be more effectively done if the Stamp Office was maintained as at present. He related that the department had three fold duties to perform—

- (i) It offers opinions to Government on all matters connected with Stamps.

- (ii) It audits, controls and supervises the Stamp work of all the Sind Treasuries.
- (iii) It supplies stamps to the Branch Depôts of the Karachi District and sells stamps to the public of the City of Karachi and does other Stamp work.

We quote below his own words :—

“ It is an expert department which puts its services at the general disposal of the Sind Government for the administration of technical and complicated questions arising out of stamp administration throughout the Province.

“ Out of the three classes of duties mentioned above, only item (iii) relates to Treasury work. Items (i) and (ii) relate to general supervision, control and audit of Stamp work in the Sind Treasuries.”

193. The Superintendent then gave details of the duties involved under items (ii) and (iii) and expressed his opinion as under :—

“ It will be seen that the major portion of the work done does not pertain to District Treasury work, and therefore, it is not feasible to break up the Stamp Office by transferring a part of the work to the Treasury Office. If the Stamp Office is not broken up, the question of additional staff or retrenchment does not arise.”

194. *Committee's Conclusions.*—We are unable to agree with the Superintendent of Stamps. The most important part of the Karachi Stamp Office is the sale of stamps in the City of Karachi and their supply to the Sub-Treasury Depôts in the District. This work can most conveniently be done from a Treasury Office and formerly even it used to be done in that Office. Item No. (iii) is thus clearly allied to Treasury work. Normally, a Treasury Office being quite conversant with such work should be in a better position to audit, control and supervise the indents of other District Depôts. But since this work relates to other district Treasuries, it may be carried out from a higher office than a district Treasury.

195. The Committee have therefore after careful consideration, come to the following conclusions :—

- (1) That the existing Central Office should be split up into two sections.
- (2) The custody of stamp stores required for the city and district of Karachi, their sales and refunds should be transferred to the Treasury Office, Karachi.

(3) Supervision, control and audit of the district stamp depôts be done in the Revenue Commissioner's office, which is competent to advise Government about rules, etc., too. [Items Nos. (i) and (ii) of the Stamp office duties].

(4) As Treasury Office is now located in the same building where stamp office is, there is absolutely no reason why Treasury Office should not take back the custody, sales and distribution of stamps in the city and district of Karachi.

(5) Our suggestions will entail the following changes and savings :—

(a) With the transfer of the custody of stamp stocks to the Treasury Office, one full guard strength can be dispensed with; the *charas* stocks (of the Treasury) the stamp stocks and other Treasury valuables will be under one controlling officer and can be kept in one strong room under one guard as opposed to the present double guard arrangement.

(b) There will be no case for special stamp allowance to the City Deputy Collector, Karachi.

(c) The following five officers be transferred to the Treasury Office for custody and accounting of stamp stocks required for the city and district use.

(i) Audit clerk who may be designated, Stamp Depôt Keeper, Karachi, and may be given a consolidated scale of Rs. 100—5/2—150 (the present incumbent continuing to draw present pay) and required to furnish security of Rs. 5,000.

(ii) Special Adhesive salesman.	} On the existing scale of Rs. 85-5/2—100.	} Since these three persons shall furnish substantial security, it will be a hardship if their pay scales are reduced.
(iii) Miscellaneous Stamp salesman		
(iv) Cashier.	} Rs 30-5/2--80.	
(v) Typist.		

117

(d) The Treasury Officer of Karachi who will under the Committee's proposals take over the stamp work will not receive any additional remuneration for stamp work. No Treasury or Sub-Treasury Officer had ever been granted special allowance for stamp work.

(e) The remaining section of the Central Stamp Office, viz., the Accountant and the clerks should be attached to the office of the Revenue Commissioner for Sind for exercising supervision, control, and audit of all district depôts from that head office. It should be possible to effect economy by amalgamating this Stamp Section with the Registration Section of that office. The latter section at present comprises—

(i) Sub-Registrar of 2nd grade on scale of Rs. 135—5—175.

(ii) A clerk on Rs. 50—5/2—90—5—110.

(6) The Committee suggest the following staff for the combined work of stamps and registration :—

(i) Stamp and Registration Accountant. (New appointment transferred from stamp section). 150—10—200, scale of selection grade clerk in the Revenue Commissioner's office.

(ii) Clerk and Typist on Rs. 50—5/2—90—5—110. Revenue Commissioner's office scale.

(Already in the Registration section).

(iii) Sub-Registrar clerk 3rd grade ... Rs. 95—5—125 plus local allowance.

(In place of present Sub-Registrar 2nd grade on Rs. 135—5—175).

This combined staff in the Revenue Commissioner's Office should do all the budget and other administration work of the two section of Stamp and Registration.

Stamp Vendors.

196. The Committee were informed that the Government stamp vendor attached to the court of the Honourable Judge, Commissioner, did not have full day's work. It was first tho

that the consumption would be so large that his stock should be of the value of Rs. 5,000 to be replenished every week. This has not materialised. He is now actually entrusted with stock of the value of Rs. 1,000. The average daily consumption has dwindled to Rs. 60—70, on rare occasions it reaches Rs. 200. It is uneconomical to maintain a vendor with a scale of 30—5/2—80 and local allowance and a peon on Rs. 22 for such small sales. The stamp vendor's post and that of his peon's should be abolished. It should be possible to secure one of the Section writers of this Honourable Court, who may invest a sum of Rs. 1,000, for sale of stamps in the Court premises on an allowance of Rs. 20 a month in lieu of discount.

197. The second stamp vendor working in the Court of Small Causes, Karachi, may continue to work there, though the Small Causes Court is now occupying a next-door building and no great hardship may even be caused by shifting the vendor to the Central Stamp Office proper. In any case the peon may be dispensed with, as the two offices are closely situated.

198. It has been brought to the notice of the Committee that a very drastic cut had been ordered in the discount rates, which had seriously affected the savings of the licensed stamp vendors. Firstly, in February 1932, a temporary cut of 10 per cent. was ordered when monthly discount amount permissible to a licensed vendor equalled or exceeded Rs. 40. This cut corresponded to a similar cut ordered in the case of all such Government servants as a measure of financial stringency. This cut was withdrawn in February 1935, just as in the case of Government servants. In the interval however, *i.e.*, in February 1933, Government had reduced as a permanent measure discount rates by 33 1/3 per cent. for Karachi and 10 per cent. elsewhere in Sind. These reduced rates are now in force. The Committee feel that the individual earnings of these persons have been reduced far too much, and they recommend that the discount rates should be generally increased by 10 per cent. in the Province. The additional cost of this reform will be Rs. 2,000 per annum and relief will be afforded to hundreds of vendors. This is an earning department and can well afford this slight additional expenditure in the interests of small wage-earners, who are Government agents for sales of stamps.

CHAPTER XII.

REGISTRATION DEPARTMENT.

199. This department provides facilities for securing to the parties to documents of transactions, to admit execution before a specified Government Officer and also for tracing documents so executed and supplying copies thereof. It was managed when Sind was joined to Bombay Presidency, by the Inspector-General of Registration. This post was combined then with the Commissioner of Excise. The Collectors were styled as District Registrars being his agents. An Officer who carried out all technical inspection, was known as Inspector of Registration.

200. When Sind was separated, the Revenue Commissioner was given the work of the office of the Inspector-General of Registration. There is one Inspector under him and also a senior clerk of the grade of second Sub-Registrar. The senior clerk works in the office of the Revenue Commissioner and the Inspector remains on tour for greater part of the year.

201. The Miles-Irving Committee had estimated the revenue of this department at Rs. 1.52 lakhs and the expenditure at Rs. 0.82 lakhs. In the budget for the year 1937-38 it is estimated that the revenue will be two lakhs and the expenditure Rs. 81,000. The Inspector of Registration has a pay scale of Rs. 220—10—300, and draws a Permanent Travelling Allowance of Rs. 115 per month. He examines Sub-Registry Offices and that work occupies him for about 140 days. The Senior Clerk who works in the head office is ranked as 2nd grade Sub-Registrar with a pay scale of Rs. 135—5—175. One clerk travelling with the Inspector is in the scale of Rs. 25—5/2—55 plus Permanent Travelling Allowance of Rs. 40 plus Karachi local allowance.

202. The departmental expenditure is detailed as under in the budget estimates of 1937—38 :—

Inspector of Registration and his staff.)	
1 Sub-Registrar	...)	Rs. 5,600
1 Clerk	...)	
2 Peons	...)	
Allowances	...)	Rs. 2,460
Contingencies	...)	„ 640
		<hr/> Total ... Rs. 8,700

37 Sub-Registrars their staff.	and	} Rs. 61,500
30 Clerks	
14 Peons	
Allowances	Rs. 2,425
Contingencies	...	„ 87,55
		72,500
	GRAND TOTAL ...	Rs. 81,200

It is necessary to notice that every Taluka is not equipped with a Sub-Registry Office. 7 Sub-Registrars are allotted 2 or more Talukas each, which are visited by them at regular intervals every month.

203. We have received a memorandum from the Revenue Commissioner, who is the Inspector-General of Registration, on the subject of re-organization of this department. In this memorandum the Inspector-General has stated that the District Registrars of Hyderabad, Nawabshah and Upper Sind Frontier and Inspector of Registration do not recommend any alterations. The suggestions of the other District Registrars are recounted below :—

Larkana.—Inspection of Sub-Registry Offices by District Registrar abolished in the year 1933, be revived. Certain light charges be placed under V grade Sub-Registrars and the number of the Registrars in grade V be increased.

Dadu.—Temporary posts of farashes and punkha pullers be converted into permanent posts of peons.

Karachi.—One of the two posts at Mirpur Bathoro and Jati be abolished and the remaining one be located at Sujawal.

Sukkur.—Visits of the Sub-Registrar of Ghotki to Pano-Akil be discontinued and post of a peon at Ghotki be abolished and substituted by part-time farash and part-time punkha puller.

Thar Parkar.—The work of Sanghar Taluka at present done by the Sub-Registrar of Mirpurkhas be transferred to the Sub-Registrar of Khipro, and that of Umarnot Taluka at present done by Sub-Registrar of Jamesabad to the Sub-Registrar of Mirpurkhas.

204. The Inspector-General of Registration has for good reasons not recommended transference of work from one office to another and the Committee agree with him. They do not see any

reason for altering the present location and jurisdiction, etc., of Sub-Registry Offices. The Committee are satisfied that there is no scope for reduction in the strength of Sub-Registrars, nor are any alterations needed in their present charges.

205. The existing part farash and part punkha puller arrangement is not unsuitable and may be continued. The combination will be more expensive and not as effective even.

206. We notice that 37 Sub-Registrars are grouped in four grades:—

	Number.	Revised Pay Scales
First Grade	Nil.	—
Second ,,	4	135—5—175
Third ,,	12	95—5—125
Fourth ,,	12	50—3—92
Fifth ,,	9	50—2—70

The last grade is designed to accommodate existing vernacular knowing Sub-Registrars. This grade will be extinguished in course of time as these Sub-Registrars retire, since recruitment of Vernacular knowing Sub-Registrars has been completely stopped. After the V grade men have all retired, the grouping should in the Committee's opinion be—

Grade II	4
Grade III	12
Grade IV	21

207. We are also of the opinion that since the minimum pay of the lowest grade is Rs. 50—3—92, it should be possible to recruit better educated candidates thus tending to purify the administration. It was a surprise to the Committee to know that unlike the new scales in the other departments being generally lower than the old scales, the new scale in this section of the Registration Department was higher than the old one.

208. We have said above that the Inspector of Registration has a Permanent Travelling Allowance of Rs. 115 per month. The Inspector's tour extends to seven months in a year but the Permanent Travelling Allowance is drawn throughout the year. In our Chapter on Permanent Travelling Allowances in the Interim Report, we have deprecated the system of Permanent Travelling

Allowances. We recommend withdrawal of Permanent Travelling Allowance in this instance too and substitution therefor of a daily allowance of Rs. 2/8 in addition to $1\frac{1}{2}$ times 2nd Class Railway fares. Similarly Permanent Travelling Allowance of the Inspector's Clerk should be abolished, he should draw the ordinary travelling allowance.

209. We feel that the Registration Clerk attached to the Commissioner's Office need not be 2nd grade Sub-Registrar in the scale of Rs. 135—5—175. A third grade Sub-Registrar in the scale of Rs. 95—5—125, will be quite sufficient. For complicated matters the Inspector of Registration who is designated as the Head Assistant of the Revenue Commissioner is always available for advice.

210. One District Registrar has recommended that examination of Sub-Registry Offices by the District Registrars be revived. The Revenue Commissioner has not supported the proposal. The District Registrar's inspection will not be his but his Clerk's. The Inspector brings under his scrutiny not less than $52\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. of the entries in each Sub-Registry Office. It is rarely that mistakes are detected and the Inspector's personal examination appears sufficient. We would however, suggest that the Inspector of Registration may be employed for a longer period for inspection purposes and may not be much burdened with administrative work in the Revenue Commissioner's Office, so that he may be able to give greater attention to inspection of Sub-Registry Offices, and to help in stopping corrupt practices which are admittedly prevalent there. The Inspector's examination before the Committee has revealed that Sub-Registrars levy a fee from the registering public apart from the Government prescribed charges. This illicit fee varies from 4 annas to Re. 1 per cent. *ad valorem* or is fixed per document.

211. It has come to the notice of the Committee that there is great delay in the Sub-Registry Office, Karachi, in the registration of documents and the registering parties are much inconvenienced on that account. We recommend that the two temporary copyists of that office should be made permanent and further during the rush season additional job-work copyists be engaged.

212. *Stamp and Registration.*—The Committee have suggested in the Chapter on the Stamp Department the combination of Stamp and Registration Sections in the Office of the Revenue Commissioner. The proposed combination is advised as a measure of economy.

CHAPTER XIII.

CONSULTING PUBLIC HEALTH ENGINEER.

213. This department is not yet an independent unit as it is in the Bombay Presidency. The importance of the department can not be under-rated, but Sind administration have not so far developed it in the interests of urban and rural health conditions.

214. The present cost of this department is in the neighbourhood of Rs. 5,000 consisting of—

- an allowance of Rs. 250 per mensem to the Executive Engineer, Karachi Buildings Division,
- an allowance of Rs. 50 to the Head Draftsman in the above named office who works as his Assistant,
- and pay of one clerk, one Tracer and one peon.

215. The Committee discussed the organization of this department, with Mr. F. S. Green, Executive Engineer, Karachi Buildings Division, who in addition to his duties as Civil Engineer for Roads and Buildings, holds the position of Consulting Public Health Engineer. It happens that the Province has a fully qualified and capable Public Health Engineer in its cadre of Civil Engineers thus enabling an economical arrangement to function without much drawback.

216. His duties as Public Health Engineer have been prescribed in G. R., No. 62-E., A. O. D., dated the 27th September, 1937, as under :—

(a) To act as Consulting Engineer to Government in connection with all Public Health Works which may be inaugurated by Government.

(b) To scrutinise and report on all Public Health projects, prepared by outside agencies, which are submitted to Government for approval by local or outside bodies.

(c) To act, when required, and with the approval of Government, as Consulting Engineer to local and outside bodies in any public health matter.

217. The Department recovers certain charges from local bodies for work done for them. These are detailed below :—

(a) For preparation of a project, complete with all necessary drawings and estimates—

2½ per cent. of the estimated cost.

(b) For the scrutiny of a project, prepared for a local or outside body, by an agency other than the Public Works Department—

$1\frac{1}{4}$ per cent. on the estimated cost of the project.

(c) For inspection of Public Health Works, under construction—

$1\frac{1}{4}$ per cent. on the estimated cost of the project is charged if the Consulting Public Health Engineer is asked to act continuously as consultant for any work, and has, accordingly, to visit that work periodically during construction. If, at the request of a local body, the Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government pays only an occasional visit, his charge per visit is reduced to Rs. 100 plus the actual expenses to Government, *i.e.*, travelling allowance under the ordinary rules, but no charge is made for visits made by him on his own initiative or for advice offered on such visits or for consultations with him in office by the Engineers of local bodies.

(d) For construction of works by Public Works Department on behalf of local bodies.

Prescribed establishment and tools and plant charges.

218. The Committee had been furnished with a detailed statement of the projects of Public Health works of local bodies in Sind approved by the Public Health Engineer and pending execution. The projects pertained to water works and drainage schemes of the Municipalities of Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur, Jacobabad, Larkana, Kambar and Shikarpur.

The aggregate estimated cost of the projects is Rs. 27,86,650 exclusive of the Karachi Water-supply distribution scheme costing rupees thirty lakhs. The centage charges on account of these schemes totalled Rs. 71,422. On funds being made available for the projects it will take about 3 years to execute the schemes and while Government will realise roughly Rs. 71,000 the expenditure would not exceed Rs. 15,000. In the mean time more projects may be designed and more centage charges will be earned. So actually Government are making a profit out of this Department.

219. The Committee had the advantage of a free discussion with Mr. Green which revealed valuable information about the present state of the Department, its future development and scope of work as nation building department. He appeared to favour the continuance of the present economical arrangement under which

the duties of the Consulting Public Health Engineer are performed by him with an allowance of Rs. 250. He observed that when the works are started by local bodies, which, he expected, would be done in October 1938, he should be given a full time Assistant Engineer.

220. It was noticed that works relating to improvement of drainage and water-supply at various places outside Karachi of the value of Rs. 25 lakhs would be started as soon as Government sanction to the floatation of loans by local bodies is received. It is, therefore, necessary that Government should make suitable provision for expert staff to advise the local bodies in respect of sanitary schemes and to inspect the execution of works.

221. For the present the Committee considered that the existing arrangement is good enough and should continue and that on return from leave Mr. F. S. Green should continue to function as Consulting Public Health Engineer with the special pay already fixed. When works are actually started by the local bodies, an Assistant Engineer may be appointed for inspection under his guidance.

222. The Committee advise recruitment of a qualified person as Assistant Engineer to be trained under Mr. Green who may be able to take charge of this section, which, the Committee feel, will be necessary to be formed as a separate unit in near future. Such separate unit should in the Committee's opinion consist of—

(1) a Consulting Public Health Engineer, Provincial Service Class I, Rs. 300—900, though the Committee are sceptical that an officer of the right type suitable for the purpose would be available for the minimum of the scale and would remain contented with the maximum. Both minimum and maximum will have therefore to be raised.

(2) an Assistant Engineer, Class II, Provincial Engineering service.

(3) one tracer.

(4) two Clerks and

(5) two peons.

223. The Committee would like to draw the attention of Government to a statement made by Mr. Green in answer to certain questions of the Late Chairman, Dewan Bahadur Hiranand Khem-sing, about the propriety of the existing centage charges.

“ Chairman : You charge $1\frac{1}{4}$ for scrutiny and an additional charge of $1\frac{1}{4}$ for inspection. These are the charges which were levied by Bombay.

Mr. Green : Yes.

Chairman : Do you consider that a fair charge or is it capable of reduction ?

Mr. Green : Personally, I think it is fair upto a certain limit, after which it becomes excessive. I think for purposes of scrutiny only, centage charges at $1\frac{1}{4}$ per cent. will be fair upto 10 lakhs, then from 10 to 15 lakhs. it should be 1 per cent., 15 to 25 lakhs $\frac{3}{4}$ per cent., and anything above 25 lakhs $\frac{1}{4}$ per cent. But for inspection the existing centage charges are both reasonable and necessary."

In view of this opinion of an expert Officer, the Committee advise Government to reconsider the rates of centage charges.

224. The lowering of centage charges will act as an impetus for the local bodies to take greater advantage of the department. At present several local bodies are afraid of launching upon schemes of improvement owing to the heavy initial cost of these charges. We would also suggest that this department should be in constant touch with the local bodies and should even suggest what schemes can be carried out by them, consistent with their income and local conditions.

CHAPTER XIV.

AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT.

225. The Department of Agriculture in Sind has grown from a small beginning and is being extended and expanded more and more under the stress of development of Barrage cultivation. When the Miles-Irving Committee reviewed the various departments in 1931, they adopted Rs. 51,000 as basic figure for revenue, and suggested that there would be an increase of income as the expenditure increased. The average expenditure for the three years (1927-28 to 1929-30) was Rs. 2.99 lakhs. The Government had however budgetted in the year 1931-32 for expenditure of Rs. 5.48 lakhs and the Miles-Irving Committee accepted the latter figure for basic expenditure. During the period 1933-38, the revenue and expenditure have progressed as under :—

	Revenue.	Expenditure.	
	Rs.	Rs.	
1933-34 ...	52,364	3,96,140	Cited in the Annual Administration Reports 1934-35 and 1935-36. The latest printed report relates to the latter year.
1934-35 ...	53,044	3,98,245	
1935-36 ...	43,655	3,85,756	
1936-37 (Revised) ...	79,000	6,06,000	Cited in the Budget Estimates for 1937-38.
1937-38 (Estimated) ...	1,30,000	8,40,000	

226. This department had been considerably helped by the Government of India and certain public bodies to mark their recognition of the importance of the Lloyd Barrage which was expected to bring about the greatest agricultural development of the Province. It will be interesting to note the salient features of the scheme sponsored and financed by the Central Government and certain public bodies.

	Expenditure in 1935-36.	Expenditure in 1934-35.
	Rs.	Rs.
<i>A.—By the Central Government.</i>		
1. Development of Agricultural Engineering Section.	76,778	90,705
2. Development and Reorganization of Agricultural Propaganda work in Sind.	60,838	24,221

	Expenditure in 1935-36.	Expenditure in 1934-35.
	Rs.	Rs.
3. Scheme for completion of equipment of the Agricultural Cotton Research Station at Sakrand.	59,855	All intended for capital expenditure.
B.—By the Indian Central Cotton Committee.		
4. Physiological Research Scheme Work at Sind Cotton Research Station, Sakrand.	34,236	30,117
5. Sind Cotton Extension Scheme.	55,005	51,377
6. Study of village consumption of cotton in Sind.	438	1,940
7. Technological Research Work in cotton.	4,750	5,002

The work is to be spread over 5 years till 1939, out of a total grant of Rs. 2,96,540. From this subsidy, Cotton Supervisors and Subordinate staff are engaged on both banks for carrying out cotton varietal tests to ascertain respective yields and suitability for expansion.

The total grant was of Rs. 2,500. The inquiry related to ascertaining the quantities of cotton consumed in villages, *ie.*, extra factory consumption of cotton in the cotton growing tracts. An investigator was employed to find the data in the selected dehs of the 3 Left Bank districts.

The work will be spread over 3 years. Equipment of the value of Rs. 2,396, has been installed at Sakrand and a Technological Assistant is carrying on fibre and spinning tests on all improved cotton varieties grown by the Department. The total grant was of Rs. 10,214.

	Expenditure in 1935-36.	Expenditure in 1934-35.
	Rs.	Rs.
<i>C.—By the Indian Central Cotton Committee and Imperial Council of Agricultural Research.</i>		
8. Study of the problems of cost of production of cotton.	4,600	4,700

This work is to be spread over 3 years and a half and the total grant is Rs. 16,030. A village investigator is stationed at each centre whose duty is to record detailed information and data regarding the cost of cotton cultivation by groups of individuals.

<i>D.—By trustees of the Sir David Sassoon Trust Fund.</i>		
9. Pathological Research on Rice crop diseases in Sind.	7,653	7,658
10. Research Work on the possibilities and economies of the extension of oil-seeds and pulse crop cultivation.	9,172	9,172

A special rice Mycologist has been appointed since June 1933 on this work and the work is being continued. The grant has ceased on 31st March 1936, on the separation of Sind from Bombay. Apart from Research Work at Sakrand about possibilities of cultivation and extension of improved varieties of oil-seeds. Growers' Associations have been organised for stimulating the cultivation of oil-seeds and pulses and assisting growers in subsequent marketing of their products.

<i>E.—By Imperial Council of Agricultural Research.</i>		
11. For marketing investigation in Sind.	18,147	...

This scheme is to last for 5 years and is part of an All-India Scheme for improvement of the marketing of Agricultural produce in India. Accordingly 3 officers (Rs. 200—600) have been appointed to make the necessary survey.

227. In the year 1937-38 the Sind Government had budgetted a sum of Rs. 8,40,000 for expenditure. We propose to give some details of the estimated expenditure because we feel that this department is one of the most important for the Province and would require now and then a good deal of attention of the Sind Government and the Assembly.

	Rs.
1. Pay of Gazetted Officers	1,06,300
1 Director.	
2 Deputy Directors.	
1 Personal Assistant to Director.	
1 Agricultural Chemist and Soil Physicist.	
2 Botanists.	
1 Cotton Breeder.	
1 Agriculturist.	
1 Divisional Superintendent (North Sind).	
1 Agricultural Engineer.	
2 Agriculturists and Agricultural Chemists.	
1 Assistant Rice Mycologist.	
3 Assistant Marketing Officers.	
<u>17</u>	
2. Pay of Subordinate Staff	92,700
50 Graduates and non-Graduates.	
7 Mechanical Staff.	
1 Physiological Assistant.	
25 Clerks and Managers.	
45 Servants.	
7 Kamgars.	
Unspecified temporary establishment estimated to cost	Rs. 1,15,500
3. Allowances	" 67,400
4. Contingencies	" 2,68,900

	Rs.	Rs.
5. Six farms scheme employing 14 clerks and managers and 15 servants.		55,300
6. Equipment for the Dokri Farm ...		51,000
7. Charges in England for leave and deputation salaries.		12,700
8. Lump sum provision for—		
(a) Scheme for the improvement of Thar Parkar breed of Cattle.	15,000	
(b) Scheme for extension of seed of improved varieties.	30,000	
(c) Economic development and improvement of rural areas.	13,000	
	<u>58,000</u>	
Note: There must be establishment under 8 too, but there is absolutely no reference to it in the budget estimates.		
9. Agricultural College, Poona, Scholarships.	2,900	
Contribution to Bombay Government.	6,300	9,200
10. Grants-in-aid to Associations ...		<u>3,000</u>
Total ...		<u>8,40,000</u>

228. It may be brought to notice that under contingencies are included large items, such as:—

1. Materials and wages ...	Rs. 78,500	(Rs. 28,500 relate to the new Station at Dokri)
2. Cultivation charges ...	42,000	(Rs. 13,000 relate to Farms Scheme).
3. Purchase and up-keep of Live Stock.	13,000	(Rs. 2,000 relate to Farms Scheme and new Dokri Station each).
4. Demonstration and shows and touring Propaganda Party.	25,000

	Rs.	
5. Experimental expenditure.	13,000	(Rs. 5,000 relate to Engineering Section).
6. Petty construction and repairs.	7,000
7. Working expenses of Tractor etc.	60,000	(All relating to Engineering Section).
8. Rates, rents and taxes ...	15,000	(Rs. 8,000 relate to Farms Scheme).
9. Office expenditure and miscellaneous.	11,500

229. We are of opinion that the expenditure of a growing department should come under careful scrutiny to ensure that every item of expenditure serves a useful purpose and there is no overdoing. There is always such danger, where much enthusiasm is infused in the working of a department however beneficent its activities may be supposed to be.

230. The Director of Agriculture who is the head of the Department has a scale of Rs. 1,200—50—1,500. His staff consists of:—

1 Personal Assistant, who is a Class II Officer (150—500).

1 Head Clerk (150—200).

1 Stenographer (105—125).

1 Price Inspector (100—140).

1 Auditor (105—140).

1 Accounts Clerk (85—100).

13 Clerks (25—80).

19 Total.

1 Naik.

8 Peons.

He has proposed an increase of 4 clerks (An Accountant, Assistant Head Clerk, Controller and a Senior Clerk) and also improvement of scales of some of his office staff. He also wants 4 more peons. The total additional yearly increase in expenditure is worked out at Rs. 6,660.

231. The District propaganda and Agricultural development staff consists of :—

- 2 Deputy Directors for the two Banks, Class I Officers. (250—900).
- 1 Divisional Superintendent for North Sind, Class II Officer. (150—500).
- 30 Inspectors and Overseers of Agriculture ; all Graduate Assistants. (60—300).
- 15 Non-Graduate Assistants. (30—140).
- 52 Kamgars. (25—40).
- 2 Head Clerks. (90—5/2—115).
- 6 Junior Clerks. (25—5/2—55).
- 37 Peons. (15).

The Director suggests an additional appointment of a Divisional Superintendent for South Sind, thus dividing Sind into four Agricultural divisions. The average annual cost of this appointment will be Rs. 3,786. There is another section which is used for purely publicity purposes. It comprises :—

- 1 Inspector (a Graduate Assistant). (60—100).
- 1 Non-Graduate Assistant. (30—100).
- 2 Kamgars. (25—40).
- 1 Peon.

Their duty is to move up and down for most part of the year lecturing and showing magic lantern and film shows. The entire propaganda section has widened considerably and will cost Rs. 1,74,900. It is a serious question for consideration whether such a heavy propaganda expenditure is justified or it will be advisable to divert a part of this expenditure to cheapen the cost of seed of improved varieties and enable their supply to steady but needy agriculturists.

232. Farms.—Then for practical experimental and demonstrational purposes there have been established auxiliary Farms—3 on Right Bank and 3 on Left Bank, where cultivation is supposed to be carried on under local conditions. The following staff is employed :—

- 6 Managers (150—300).
- 2 Assistant Managers (60—100).
- 6 Clerks (25—55).
- 15 Servants.

This costs Rs. 55,300 as under :—

Pay of Managers and other staff	...	Rs. 23,100
Allowances 2,800
Contingencies 29,400

Total ... Rs. 55,300

There is no doubt that some interesting and even valuable experiments are being conducted and researches carried out on these Farms but we are very doubtful of the practical utility of some of the work undertaken on these Farms. They are not known to be self-supporting, and are supposed to be worked on model lines, which are beyond the capacity of an ordinary zamindar to attain to. The Committee are inclined to the opinion that these farms are very nice places to visit but the average agricultural taxpayer is believed to regard dubiously most of this expenditure because the zamindari section is not taking commensurate advantage of these experiments and researches or even to learn how to run modern farms.

233. *Engineering Section—Tractor, workshop and ginnery.* Then there is a branch known as Engineering Section. This is a very costly undertaking. The cost estimated for 1937-38 is as under :—

An Engineer whose cost in pay alone is estimated at	Rs. 18,800
Mechanical Staff	„ 17,900
Allowances	„ 6,100
Contingencies	„ 68,100
Total Rs.				<u>1,10,900</u>

The last item of Rs. 68,100 under contingencies includes working expenses of a Tractor, Workshop and Ginnery.

234. The tractor outfit capital cost was Rs. 14,000. Its working cost and results are stated by the Director to be as under in the last three years :—

Temporary staff	Rs. 5,407
Stores	„ 8,561
Miscellaneous	„ 3,594
				<u>17,562</u>
Depreciation and Interest charges	„ 7,933
Total Rs.				<u>25,495</u>

The tractor had worked on hire system for 5,800 hours in the three years. The realisations were as under :—

For Departmental work ; Demonstration ...	Rs. 1,715
Dokri Farm	4,218
Debited to Department	5,933
For Private individuals on hire system	12,886
Total Rs.	18,819

It is apparent that it has not paid its way.

235. It is related in the Departmental Administration Report for 1935-36, that this department had designed and produced the following improved Agricultural implements :—

1. Iron wheel bullock cart, Price Rs. 150.
2. Hand power winnowing machine, Price Rs. 250.
3. Filtering Plant, Price Rs. 2,000.
4. Dutch barn Iron shed, Price Rs. 500.
5. Poultry pens.
6. Pot culture house.
7. Light boring machine. } Prices not indicated.
8. Bottle shaking machine. }
9. Inter cultivator, Price Rs. 12.

The workshop is said to have been fitted for execution of repairs, etc., to gates, electric pumps, gutters, drains, etc. We are further informed that an improved type of bullock cart, hand power winnowing machine and inter-cultivator were designed by the Agricultural Engineer.

236. The Director of Agriculture has furnished the under-mentioned details about the working of the workshop manufacturing and repairing sections during the last three years collectively.

Expenditure—

Temporary staff engaged apart from the	Rs. 26,331
Permanent staff	26,975
Stores	19,853
Depreciation and Interest	
Total Rs.	73,159
Capital cost on Buildings and Machinery	Rs. 59,808

Manufactures—

Number of articles manufactured.
Large and small

Selling price Rs. 16,189

Disposal of manufactured articles—

Number of articles disposed of large and small ... 105

Number of articles in stock 44

Total ... 149

Sale value debited to the Department for
purchase of articles Rs. 7,232

Sale value recovered from private
individuals ,, 5,785

Total Rs. 36,497

Repair work done at the shop—

For the Department Rs. 26,920

For Private Individuals ,, 9,577

Total Rs. 13,017

Comment is superfluous. The workshop is hardly a business proposition. The Department is its largest client; the popular use cannot be regarded as substantial.

237. Under this branch there is also a ginning factory at Mirpurkhas. In the year 1935-36 in all 3,500 maunds produce of Government Farms in Sind including Haris' share were ginned. In the year 1937-38 it was proposed to gin 20,000 maunds for a total cost of Rs. 8,000, though the Honourable Minister in charge of this Department had stated on the floor of the House that it was expected to gin upto one lac maunds. The farms are scattered all over Sind and transport charges must be heavy. The Director emphasised the utility of the Government ginnery as it helped to preserve purity of seed. The Committee are sure that that objective could be secured by collaborating with a private ginnery.

238. We are further informed that the Agricultural Engineer gives free advice to Agriculturists regarding suitable pumping plants, tube wells, etc., and he looks after the Government Machinery and implements on farms and Sakrand Station. We are of the opinion that already much money has been sunk in this section and what is now required is conservation and taking stock of its utility. We would wish that not only no further expenditure be incurred on it but the present pitch should be materially reduced, and that the section's activity be limited strictly to the needs of the present day average agriculturist.

239. *Crop Research Work.*—The most important activity of the Department is the Crop Research Work. This is in progress since several years at Sakrand where a regular colony of Agricultural scientists has been established with the paraphernalia of subordinate, clerical and mechanical staff and research laboratories. This Research Station works in conjunction with the Seed Farm at Mirpurkhas. Another Research Station is being established during the current year at Dokri in Larkana district. There is also an experimental farm concentrating on rice cultivation at Larkana.

240. The details of the staff employed or designed for employment are contained in the sub-joined table :—

	At Research Station, Sakrand and Seed Farm, Mirpurkhas.	At Research Station, Dokri and Rice Farm, Larkana.
Botanist. Class I Officer (300—900)	I	I
Agricultural Chemist and Soil Physicist. Class I Officer (300—900)	I	-
Agricultural Chemist. Class I (300—900)	-	I
Agriculturist	I	I
	(Class II 150—500)	(Class I 300—900).
Cotton Breeder. Class II Officer (150—500)	I	-
Horticulturist Class II Officer (200—500)	I	-
Assistant Entomologist. (160—260)	I	-
Assistant Mycologist. (160—260)	I	-
Superintendent, Rice Farm. (150—200)	-	I
Graduate Assistants. (60—260)	15	9
Non-graduate Assistants. (30—140)	12	11
Mechanical Assistants. (30—100)	4	4
Head Clerks. (95—115)	I	I
Senior Clerks. (60—95)	I	I
Junior Clerks. (25—55)	7	4
Store Keeper. (25—55)	I	I
Servants and Malhis. (15—35)	14	21

241. It will not be denied that the staff is both well paid and numerous. It is claimed by the Department that a good deal of research work on the technique and economics of the cultivation of various Kharif and Rabi dry crops has been carried out intensively at Sakrand, with special attention to Cotton and Wheat crops. Special types of seeds of different crops have been evolved which will flourish in the Province. Physical analysis and germination tests of all types of seeds of cotton, juwars and wheat are being carried out at the Laboratory before distribution of the seeds to the farms and other growers. Experiments are conducted to determine the duty of irrigation water for different crops under Barrage conditions. Agronomic investigations on cotton and rice varieties have been carried out with good results. Manurial experiments with different kinds of manures and the effects of different manures on the growth and maturity of crops are being watched and recorded. Kalar reclamation and crops rotational experiments are conducted in various ways to determine depreciation and recuperation of soil fertility. Investigations in affection of crops by pests and diseases and their possible remedies, are being conducted. The Sakrand Station Farm originally ad-measuring 200 acres, has been extended by addition of 178 acres. Work more or less along the same lines will now be commenced at the new Research Station at Dokri, specially for the Agricultural problems of the Right Bank tract relating to both Kharif and Rabi crops which, we are told, are different from those on the Left Bank. Research in rice will also it is said, be conducted on the new station at Dokri. The existing Rice Farm at Larkana with all its grounds will be converted into a sub-station of the new Dokri Station and serve as a Rice Seed Farm Station. The buildings at Dokri are estimated to cost Rs. 1,52,312, while the equipment cost will amount to Rs. 51,000. One might well feel sceptical as to how the dry crop problems on the Right Bank "differ considerably" from those on the Left Bank, so as to call for a second costly Research Station at Dokri.

242. The Director of Agriculture has suggested improvement of grades of Assistant Entomologist and Assistant Mycologist who are in the grade of Rs. 160—10—260. He recommends the rank of these two officers to be raised to Provincial Class II Service scale, Rs. 150—500, the idea being to strengthen the crop pest Research Section of the Sakrand Station. Mere improvement in rank can hardly lead to better results. This will involve an additional expenditure of Rs. 2,160. If a really effective pest resisting seed is evolved, it will offer a somewhat practical solution but any chemical process for pest destruction would be beyond both understanding and capacity of the Sindhi agriculturist in general. The Committee feel very sceptical about the propriety of the proposed additional expenditure on the revision of grades of these two posts.

243. *Live Stock.*—The Director of Agriculture has been pressing on the attention of Government a scheme of Live Stock Improvement and appointment of a Dairy Officer in Class I Service, and has referred to it in his memorandum submitted to the Committee. He estimates the expenditure of the scheme on pay alone at Rs. 22,260 per year. The Thomas Committee had recommended closure of the Willingdon Cattle Farm at Malir. This was adopted and the cattle were removed to Mirpurkhas. At present there are two herds of cattle—one at Sakrand and the other at Mirpurkhas. The last printed report for 1935-36, shows the numbers of cattle as under at the new stations :—

Fruit Farm, Mirpurkhas.		Research Station, Sakrand.	
1 Breeding Bull	11 Milk Buffaloes.	
19 Cows	3 Breeding bulls.	
17 Young bulls and bull calves	18 Female calves young and old	
19 Heifers	22½ Pairs of work cattle.	
13 Suckling calves.			

244. The Director had put up a scheme of development by scientific breeding, for which a sum of Rs. 15,000 is provided in the budget estimates for 1937-38. Best lactation at Mirpurkhas was over 4,000 lbs. in 1935-36. No account of use of milk has been given in the report. At Sakrand the total quantity of milk obtained in the same year was 43,715 lbs. while disposal is accounted for as under :—

791 lbs. fed to calves.

28,615 lbs. sold to members of colony.

7,209 lbs. turned into butter and sold to colony.

A sum of Rs. 1,425 is said to have been realised. The report does not give the cost of maintenance of these herds and the overhead charges.

245. The Director has furnished the following information about cost, milk produce and sale relating to the herd stationed at the Sakrand Farm for the last three years.

<i>Numbers—</i>				Nil.
Cows in lactation	17
Buffaloes in lactation	
<i>Expenditure—</i>				
Staff	Rs. 3,780
Feed	„ 2,593
				<u>Rs. 6,373</u>

Recoveries.	Rs.
Sale of milk sold to staff	... 3,010
Sale of butter sold to staff	... 250
	<hr style="width: 100px; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
	3,260
Add supposed value of compost of buffaloes	... 750
	<hr style="width: 100px; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
	Total 4,010

Still we find that the Sakrand Dairy is run at a loss.

246. *Fruit Farms.*—There is another section in this department which is known as 'Fruit Farm, Mirpurkhas'. This section employs :—

- 1 Horticulturist, Class II Officer (250—500).
- 2 Non-Graduate Assistants. (30—100).
- 1 Accounts Clerk. (80—95).
- 1 Store Keeper (25—55).
- 3 Servants. (15—35).

It is claimed that horticultural research work is carried on to determine the best methods for the establishment and maintenance of fruit orchards in Sind. A fruit sub-station has been opened at Larkana, and eleven demonstration orchards on privately owned lands scattered in different talukas. This section's future programme is said to include investigation of industries subsidiary to fruit growing. It is trusted that these are not mere pious hopes, for in the process of their materialisation large funds are expended for keeping up some sort of a show and visiting place without much good accruing to the general tax-payer.

247. *Other Activities.*—In addition to these activities the following schemes are under operation in the Province under the auspices of the Agricultural Department :—

(1) Scheme for conducting rice crop duty experiments on the Fuleli Canal. This costs Rs. 12,000 which includes the cost of the Duty Crop Officer (pay Rs. 3,100). This is a scheme for conducting intensive and controlled experiments on the 'duty' of irrigation water for rice cultivation on the Fuleli Canal system. A duty of 30 has been found to be easy. The Director of Agriculture styles this as "a development of much importance" and wants similar demonstrations of the technique of irrigation or

other crops and in other tracts of Sind. Scientific work on the botanical improvement of the crop is also done at this sub-station. Experiments about early transplanting of rice are claimed to have been made with much success and the practice of early transplanting of rice is much commended.

(2) Scheme for improvement of marketing. This is subsidised by the Imperial Council of Agriculture and costs Rs. 19,200. This work will continue for three years. Three Assistant Marketing Officers tour in the Province. They surveyed the marketing facilities including the cost of Wheat, Tobacco, Fruit, Live Stock and Dairy produce. How far they have succeeded is not yet known as the work had been started in 1936 and we have had no report of their actual work before us.

(3) The Trustees of Sir David Sassoon subsidise another activity known as investigation of possibilities and economies of oil seeds and pulse crops. Temporary establishment costing Rs. 3,400, is engaged. Rs. 5,500 will be for contingencies. Thus total expenditure will be Rs. 8,900 per year.

(4) Scheme for improvement of the Thar Parkar breed of cattle costing Rs. 15,000 has been launched. We only hope that the amount will be utilised to help the enterprising cattle breeders and money will not be spent on highly paid officers. In our opinion services of existing Veterinary officers should be helpful.

(5) Scheme for extension of seed of improved varieties of cotton is estimated to cost Rs. 30,000. The Indian Central Cotton Committee had made a grant of Rs. 93,000 for three years commencing with 1930. Subsequently, this Committee agreed to give a further grant of Rs. 2,96,540 for five years more. Thus, the Indian Central Cotton Committee has given a very large sum to Sind for the development of cotton cultivation. The work has been organised in two sections, one on the Left Bank and other on the Right Bank. Each section has been in charge of a Cotton Supervisor with a subordinate staff. We are told that this staff helped in distributing improved seed and guided the zamindar classes in better methods of cotton cultivation.

(6) The scheme for economic development and improvement of rural areas costing about Rs. 31,000 has been budgetted. We have not been able to get the details, but we find from the report of 1935-36, that the Central Government's grant for Village Uplift was utilised towards facilitating distribution of seed of approved varieties. Village Seed and Implement Depôts have been established at certain centres for issue of seed. The Agricultural department claims credit for increase in cotton yield of 120 lbs. to 161 lbs. per acre.

248. We have narrated in greater detail the composition of this comparatively new department and its activities, so that its utilitarian claim may be assessed at proper value. As the activities of the Department are very widely spread, it is more essential that they should be watched with zealous care so that they may be conducted more economically and may prove more educative and fruitful while duplication and over-lapping of effort may be avoided.

249. *Committee's Recommendations.*—Having concluded the descriptive task, the Committee will proceed to record their considered suggestions for such reorganization of the Department as has appeared necessary to the Committee.

Staff Organization.

(1) The Director's office staff does not require to be strengthened. His demand for additional staff is hardly justified. With the appointment of two Deputy Directors, the strain on his own office should actually abate.

(2) His Personal Assistant's post may be continued but he should not be allowed to tour; his attention should be confined to the office at headquarters. The expense of his tour with the Director should be spared. The Director should take along only a Typist or a Junior Clerk.

(3) One peon in the Director's office could easily be retrenched.

(4) The grade of the posts of Assistant Mycologist and Assistant Antomologist does not call for revision. Their present grade and pay appear sufficient and the Committee are unable to support the Director's proposal to raise these posts to Provincial Service Class II. The Committee would desire that efforts should be concentrated on evolving pest resisting seed, as that will be the practical solution of the difficulties of pest destruction. The adoption of chemical manurial process for fighting such destruction would be beyond both understanding and financial capacity of the average Sindhi Agriculturist.

(5) The existing 5 appointments in Class I which are now vacant and have been advertised should at least be split up into :—

2 in Class I.

3 in Class II.

We strongly feel that as research work on cotton and wheat has already made considerable progress, the future work and

financial capacity of the Province do not justify all the appointments being graded in Provincial Service Class I. Our Chairman had addressed Government in advance on this subject to prevent unwarranted commitments.

(6) The Director has asked for an additional Class II appointment for propaganda work in south Sind. Under the existing arrangement there are two officers of Class I and one of Class II for the propaganda section under the Director. The Committee fail to see any advantage in having Class I appointment for this purpose. This is a luxury which the Province cannot afford. We recommend, therefore, that there should be four Class II appointments each officer being placed in charge of two districts. We have no objection if suitable officers started with Rs. 200 in the Class II scale. We would suggest that in order to lighten the cost, the existing Class I Officers (Deputy Directors) should be reverted to their original posts outside Sind at the earliest opportunity.

Demonstration Farms.

250. The budget allotment for the six farms shows that these are rather extravagant institutions. Since, however, the objects in view are not yet wholly achieved, we propose that these may be continued for five years and then the question of their further maintenance should be reviewed. There should be no necessity of Assistant Managers for the Farms and these posts should be abolished immediately. All Farm Managers who are lightly worked at present, should be allotted propaganda work in the taluka in which the farm is situated. The farm will thus serve a much better purpose, as the Manager will be in a position to interest the agriculturists of the taluka in his work at the farm.

251. We find that there is considerable multiplicity of grades for Farm Managers, District Inspectors, Graduate Assistants and Overseers and their pays are pitched too high.

The Committee recommend the following scales:—

(a) Managers, Inspectors, and Senior Graduate Assistants, 100—5—150—10—200.

(b) Overseers and Junior Graduate Assistants, 50—5/2—70—5—100.

(c) Non-Graduate Assistants, 30—5/2—80.

Agricultural Engineering Section.

252. We feel strongly that this section has been very extravagantly manned and paid and propose immediate retrenchments. The Agricultural Engineer should be a Class II officer. The work

done or required does not warrant a Class I appointment. No Assistant Engineer is necessary for this section, as there is hardly work for one person. The scales of Accountant, Head Clerk and Mechanical Draftsman are also very highly pitched and should be reduced as under :—

Accountant and Head Clerk—From Rs. 80—8—200—
25/3—225, to Rs. 80—5/2—140.

Mechanical Draftsman.—From Rs. 200 fixed to Rs. 80
5/2—140.

There is no need for a Naik and one peon can also be retrenched.

253. This section controls the workshop, Tractor and Ginery. We have indicated in the descriptive part that these are costly undertakings and are not being worked as business propositions. They are all practically working at a loss. The working methods should be so altered that all the three branches may be self-supporting and non-departmental clientele should be secured more than departmental.

254. We wish to emphasise that the propaganda for the use of hand winnowing machines and bullock cart made in the Mirpurkhas Workshop should be intensified. The former will help to obviate destruction of crop on account of untimely rains and will release agricultural labour for more useful pursuits. The latter will considerably reduce the cost of transport. The Committee are, however, of the opinion that the sale prices of these two implements namely Rs. 250 for the hand winnowing machine and Rs. 150 for bullock cart, are beyond the financial capacity of a hari, or even a small zamindar. It is, therefore, suggested that by way of demonstrational intensification, a number of winnowing machines should be concentrated in one or two talukas in each district especially where untimely rains are known to cause damage. For the first year free use of the machine should be made available. It will be very useful if selected Co-operative Credit Societies are supplied with the machines with option after one year to acquire them on hire-purchase system. The use of carts may be popularised in urban areas by interesting transport *mukadams* and offering them on hire-purchase or some subsidised system. The District Local Boards and Municipalities may also be advised to use the improved type carts for their departmental transport work. We further propose that the proprietors of established workshops in the Province may be interested in the manufacture of these two useful articles, for private venture may cheapen production. We feel that with mass production the cost could be lessened.

255. *Kamgars.*—The Committee had the opportunity of meeting the Director of Agriculture and agree with him that the Kamgar staff should be strengthened to enable intensification of agricultural instructive work among haris. At present there are 52 Kamgars in the Province comprising 61 Talukas and Mahals. We propose that there should be at least two Kamgars in each Barrage Taluka and one Kamgar in each non-Barrage Taluka. The existing scale of pay Rs. 25—1—40 is adequate for all such posts including essential travelling in the taluka. Kamgars should be selected from members of the hari class who have been given previous training at the Farms. There is no need for stressing on a high standard of literacy. They should be hardy persons able to work in fields and cover long distances on foot. Their work should be efficiently supervised. As they will have to work in a taluka or part thereof, additional travelling allowance should not be allowed.

256. *Seeds Supply.*—The Committee need not emphasise the great importance of good seed, which will germinate well and will resist pest attacks. We are of the opinion that the Agricultural Department should re-double its efforts in this direction. They should enlist a much larger number of registered growers and intensify good seed production on their farms as well. We estimate that 3 lakhs maunds of cotton seed and 5 lakhs maunds of wheat seed of improved varieties are essential for Sind requirements. A sum of Rs. 23 lakhs will roughly be required for financing the seed distribution scheme. It will be of the nature of practically safe capital investment with little likelihood of loss. We, therefore, recommend that Government should place substantial funds at the disposal of the Agricultural Department for purchase of good seed stocks, their storing and issue to growers on certain safe terms preference being given to 'registered' growers. The purchase and sale transactions should be conducted as far as possible on prevailing market prices, due allowances being made for interest, storage and overhead charges. The Committee are of opinion that if this scheme is worked for three years, good seed will be available throughout the Province. We do not anticipate losses if the scheme is well organised and managed. The present Agricultural staff is not only numerically large but is comparatively lightly worked. The department should be able to manage the seed distribution scheme without substantial additions. Such a scheme if properly worked for three years would also strike at the root of one of the main causes of rural indebtedness.

257. *Propaganda Staff.*—The Committee are not at all satisfied with the standard of turn-out of the propaganda staff. We feel that things have been taken very easy. The Farms which wear neat appearance and in which substantial capital has been sunk, cannot be a criterion of good work of the department. The zamindar generally refuses to believe what is claimed by the Agricultural

Department to their credit. The general opinion in the Province is that most of the Agricultural Department is a white elephant. It is, therefore, necessary that propaganda staff should work with zeal. We are also of the opinion that though the results of the Sakrand Research Station may be excellent, these have not been implanted beyond the departmental farms, *i.e.*, on Zamindar's soil and therefore the main purpose is not served. We are now launching on large expenditure both capital and recurring on the Dokri farm and therefore, it is much more necessary that these farms should be turned to greater practical use.

258. The energy of Agricultural Inspectors, Overseers, Farm Managers and Cotton Supervisors should not be allowed to be frittered away over small uneconomic plots. This staff assisted by the Kamgars should be held responsible for concentrated cultivation in certain compact areas of as large size as possible and they should be made to carry out cultivation operations on a larger scale outside the department's farms under zamindari conditions of labour and water-supply. We do not think it will be difficult to secure large zamindari areas for agricultural management. This will serve demonstration as well as real economic purpose.

259. We cannot sufficiently emphasise that all Kamgars, Mukadams and peons of the department should be recruited from the hari class and no other. We suggest that the Director of Agriculture should be required to issue twice a year within a month at the latest of the harvesting season of each crop detailed report, both in English and Vernacular, of the work of each district unit of the propaganda staff and publish such reports widely.

260. *Fruit Farm, etc.*—The Fruit Farm at Mirpurkhas and the Dairy Sections at Mirpurkhas and Sakrand Farms seem to require examination and overhauling. The orchard plantations at Larkana and other places should be looked into for more economic management.

261. *Cattle Breeding.*—There is one more item to which attention needs to be drawn. One of the members of the Committee (A. Gordon Esquire, I.S.E.), raised the issue of the control of cattle breeding operations. He argued that the premium bull system was more or less moribund under the Agricultural Department and that the cattle breeding operations could be carried out more scientifically by the Veterinary Department and therefore, Agricultural Department should hand over this section of its activity to the Veterinary Department. In his opinion the existing 19 Veterinary Dispensaries could constitute workable centres of action for this purpose, and as Veterinary Dispensaries will very likely multiply in the Province, the breeding operations will progress on sound lines under expert Veterinary supervision especially if a stud bull could be stationed at each dispensary.

262. Khan Bahadur Khuhro urged the contrary view. He agreed with the Director of Agriculture that cattle breeding which was allied with farming in Sind should be retained under the control of the Agricultural Department as that department is better equipped by reason of its staff spread over the whole Province to deal with the correct cattle breeding operations. He also referred to the decision of conferences held at Simla and Karachi favouring the control of Agricultural Department over cattle breeding operations. Professor Ghanashyam supported Khan Bahadur Khuhro.

263. The opinion of the majority of the Committee was expressed in favour of Mr. Gordon's proposal. We, accordingly, recommend to Government that the Veterinary Department should control the cattle breeding operations and the Agricultural Department should co-operate with it. Stud bulls should be maintained for general service at all Veterinary Dispensaries, Agricultural Farms and with selected zamindars within easy reach of the public.

The Chairman felt that both the Veterinary and Agricultural Departments will be useful for Live Stock breeding and that a scheme for co-ordination and co-operative working could be framed by Government to carry out the cattle breeding operations.

264. We have referred to the Director's demand for a Live Stock Officer's appointment in Provincial Service Class I. The Committee are strongly of the opinion that the Live Stock Officer for this Province should be an officer of Class II Provincial Service. There is no justification whatever for entertaining a highly paid officer in Class I scale. The Chairman has already addressed Government on this subject as Government had advertised the appointment in Class I. The Committee would urge that the selected person should be offered appointment on Class II or the post should be re-advertised as such.

265. Finally we affirm that we are not convinced of the justification for such a large expenditure on staff of this department, nor are we convinced that the huge expenditure on the Research Section has brought in proportionate good, or anywhere near it, to the people of the Province. Considering the results achieved, a good deal of public money and of other public bodies is in our opinion being frittered away and considerable energy is wasted. The Committee are inclined to the opinion that waste of public funds would be avoided if a body of experts of the Revenue, Public Works, Veterinary and Agricultural Departments, one of each, is constituted to examine the activities of the various institutions of this department and report to Government periodically. That body should go into all the details of those activities to gauge whether useful work is being done in the interests of the Province and its people.

CHAPTER XV.

MEDICAL DEPARTMENT.

MEDICAL ORGANIZATION.

266. We have dealt with the Prisons and Public Health Sections in our Interim Report and had not then concluded our deliberations about the Medical Institutions.

The Head of this Department, who deals with the administration of Hospitals and Dispensaries is the Director of Health Services and Inspector-General of Prisons until recently known as the Director of Public Health and Prison Services in Sind. This single Officer is responsible for medical relief and prisons of the Province.

267. The Dow Committee had suggested creation of a post of Inspector-General of Hospitals who should also be responsible for the administration of Jails and Public Health, the appointment being earmarked for an officer of Indian Medical Service for some years. The Sind Separation Officer had also recommended the creation of such combined post. The Thomas Committee had also made similar suggestion. The Miles-Irving Committee had desired the combination of Prisons with Hospitals under a single Head and a separate Director of Public Health. They could not contemplate an unusual arrangement of a common head for all the three departments and further much emphasis was laid on the problems of Public Health which will arise in the wake of Lloyd Barrage irrigation and expanded cultivation. They had proposed a salary of Rs. 2,750 for the head of Prisons and Hospitals and that of Rs. 1,000 for the Director of Public Health. The Officer in charge of the three combined posts now draws Rs. 2,350, in the scale of Rs. 2,000—50—2,350. It may be of interest to know that the Thomas Committee had suggested for the Officer of these three combined posts, a scale of Rs. 1,000—50—1,250.

268. The Revenue estimated by the Miles-Irving Committee under Hospitals was Rs. 1,32,000 and in the budget of 1937-38, it is put at Rs. 1,43,000. This Committee had estimated the expenditure at Rs. 6,78,000 and the cost of expansion under Barrage conditions at Rs. 2,00,000 and the cost of separation at Rs. 57,000. Total, Rs. 9,35,000. The budget estimates for 1937-38 shows the figure of Rs. 7,81,000. It is note-worthy that the proposed expenditure for 1937-38 exceeds that for 1935-36 (last pre-separation year) by Rs. 1,29,000, without any substantial expansion of practical medical relief in the Province. This amount

of Rs. 1,29,000 is accounted for under the following items :—

Directional (Share) charges	...	Rs.	19,000
I. M. S. charges	"	6,000
B. M. S. charges	"	5,000
S. M. S. charges	"	12,000
Grants to Local Bodies	"	18,000
Grant for scheme of subsidised Medical Practitioners	"	28,000
Medical School, Pay of B. M. S. Officers and Contingencies	"	8,000
Mental Hospital, Pay of S. M. S. Officers and Contingencies	"	3,000
Charges in England	"	10,000
Contribution to Bombay Government towards Leave, Pension and Passage of I. M. S. Officers	"	20,000
			Total Rs. 1,29,000

The Budget includes Rs. 23,800 for allowances and Rs. 1,34,000 for contingencies ; grants to Local Bodies for maintenance of Hospitals and Dispensaries amount to Rs. 1,50,000 and for other Public Institutions Rs. 43,000. The Medical School at Hyderabad costs Rs. 55,900.

269. The Medical staff of the Province consist of :—

- 1 I. M. D., Officer.
- 2 I. M. S., Officers (besides part-time I.M.S. Director).
- 3 B. M. S., Officers, Class I.
- 5 B. M. S., Officers, Class II.
- 1 B. M. S., (woman), Class II.
- 2 B. M. S., Officers reserve, Class II.
- 70 S. M. S., Officers of whom 16 are attached to 8 Hospitals and 54 are in charge of Local Boards and Municipal grant-in-aid Dispensaries.
- 15 S. M. S., Reserve Officers for employment for duty at Civil Hospitals and in leave vacancies.

The tutorial staff at the Medical School at Hyderabad consist of :—

- 1 I. M. S. Superintendent with an allowance.
- 3 Teachers B. M. S. Officers, Class II.
- 2 Lecturers B. M. S. Officers, Class II.
- 1 Lecturer (Science) Non-B. M. S.
- 3 S. M. S. Officers with special allowance.

The one Mental Hospital in the Province costs Rs. 36,000, detailed as under :—

I. M. S. Superintendent's pay	...	Rs.	1,800
2 S. M. S. Officers	"	4,500
32 Male Attendants	}	...	8,900
6 Female Attendants		...	1,400
7 Temporary Attendants	...	"	200
Allowances	...	"	19,200
Contingencies	...	"	
			Total Rs. 36,000

The total pay to staff is Rs. 3,96,300, besides allowances and this is classified as under among different groups :—

Class.	Strength.	Salary.
I. M. S.	2 plus 1 part.	Rs. 65,100
B. M. S.	17	" 93,400
S. M. S.	87	" 1,68,100
Clerical	67	" 36,300
Inferior	182	" 33,400
Total Rs. 3,96,300		

We might lastly refer to the Karachi Port Health Section embodied in the Director's memorandum. It comprises :—

- 1 Port Health Officer Pay Rs. 500—900 plus 33 1/3 per cent. plus compensatory and conveyance allowances and special pay.
- 1 Assistant Port Health Officer. Pay Rs. 200—700 plus Compensatory conveyance and house rent allowances and special pay.
- 1 S. M. S. Officer. Pay Rs. 60—200 plus Compensatory, conveyance and house rent allowances and special pay.

- 1 Nurse Inspectress. Rs. 150—200 plus conveyance allowance.
- 2 Clerks. Pay Rs. 25—100 plus local and conveyance allowances.
- 6 Disinfection Station and Barge Staff; Mechanical and other. Pay Rs. 18—76.
- 4 Launch Staff Mechanical and other. Pay Rs. 21—55.
- 4 Inferior servants. Pay Rs. 19—20.

The cost of this staff which must be substantial, is not included in the Provincial estimates as it is entirely borne by the Central Government. The Committee have not, therefore, looked into the propriety of all this expenditure.

270. The Director has represented the necessity of certain additional staff for better management of medical relief at certain Government Medical Institutions in the Province. The subjoined statement shows the existing strength of the staff and supplementary requirements under each group :—

	I. M. S.		B. M. S.		S. M. S.		Clerks.		Ward Boys.	
	Existing.	Additional requirements.	Existing.	Additional requirements.	Existing.	Additional requirements.	Existing.	Additional requirements.	Existing.	Additional requirements.
Karachi	1	1 Eye specialist for eye branch.	1 (I.M.D.)	...	6	3	2	...	28	...
Hyderabad—										
Civil Hospital	1	...	1 Woman	...	2	1	2	...	16	6
Mental Hospital	1	2	1
Mirpurkhās	1	...	1	1	1	...	3	5
Sukkur	1	...	2	1	1	...	8	..
Larkana	1	...	2	..	1	...	5	...
Nawabshah	1	...	1	...	1	...	Local emplo	Board yee.
Dadu	1	...	1	1	1	...	2	...
Jacobabad	1	...	1	...	1	...	2	...

271. It will be apparent from the above table and other descriptive details that the two Chief Hospitals in Sind are located at Karachi and Hyderabad. The Karachi Civil Hospital serves Provincial requirements as ailing persons from all over Sind take advantage of this Provincial Medical Centre. To the latter a Medical School is attached. There is also a Mental Hospital at Hyderabad. We are devoting separate sub-chapters to the School and Mental Hospital. There are besides, Civil Hospitals in the Province at Sukkur, Shikarpur (aided), Jacobabad, Larkana, Mirpurkhas, Nawabshah (aided) and Dadu.

272. The existing Civil Hospital building at Dadu is not worth being called a Civil Hospital. It is in a most deplorable condition. We would urge that immediate steps should be taken to provide a suitable new building for the Hospital. On the abolition of the Treasury proposed in our Chapter on Revenue Department, the Treasury building may be altered to suit Hospital purposes.

273. Medical relief in rural areas is provided by 56 Local Board and Municipal Dispensaries, where indoor accommodation is invariably available. These are distributed as under:—

Karachi District	...	10
Hyderabad District	...	6
Nawabshah District	...	7
Thar Parkar District	...	10
Sukkur District	...	7
Upper Sind Frontier	...	3
Larkana District	...	6
Dadu District	...	7

These Dispensaries are aided by Government and the Medical officer-in-charge, who is an S. M. S. Officer except at one place (Tatta) where a B. M. S. Officer has been posted, is a lent Government servant. These Medical Officers are paid and controlled by Government direct, a lump-sum contribution—Rs. 1,080 per annum in the case of a S. M. S. lent officer and Rs. 2,400 in the case of a B. M. S. lent officer—being receivable from the local body concerned. All other staff is paid by and subject to the authority of the local bodies. There are a few privately managed Medical Institutions. Most of these are Maternity Homes run by private bodies or registered Health Associations, or the Red Cross Society.

274. We have carefully studied the various lists and have examined Doctors Primalani and Rochiram Amesur—two well informed Medical Practitioners of Karachi. The former is *ex-President* of the Sind Medical Union. The latter is Secretary of the Karachi Medical Association which is Sind Provincial Branch of the Indian Medical Association. He is also *ex-President* and now Secretary of the Karachi Health Association. We are much obliged to them for their enlightening us on some important aspects of medical relief in the Province and particularly at Karachi.

275. *Committee's recommendations.*—We now proceed to place our considered suggestions before Government. Most of our recommendations relate to the Karachi Civil Hospital, where persons from all over Sind flock for major operations and treatment of complicated diseases.

(1) Firstly, dealing with the Director's demand for certain extra staff referred to in the table above, the Committee recommend entertainment of the following additional staff:—

- 4 S. M. S. Officers for Hospitals outside Karachi.
- 1 Clerk for the Mental Hospital.
- 11 Ward Boys (6 for Hyderabad ; 5 for Mirpurkhas).
- 1 Dresser at Mirpurkhas.
- 1 Compounder at Mirpurkhas.

(2) The appointment of an Indian Medical Service Officer for the Eye-Hospital at Karachi suggested by the Civil Surgeon is not necessary and its cost will be prohibitive. There should be attached to the Eye-Hospital, two Honorary Eye Doctors and one Stipendiary Assistant Surgeon—Specialist in eye diseases. The latter should reside on the premises and should not be allowed private practice. His scale may be fixed at Rs. 200—40/3—400 and the no-private-practice-stipulation should be attached. The existing S. M. S. Officer should also continue.

(3) There is great rush in the out-door section of the Civil Hospital, Karachi. Two additional S. M. S. Officers—one male and one woman doctor, should be engaged to facilitate treatment of out-door patients. With the addition of these two extra hands, the out-door section will be manned by three hands and this should be regarded as minimum on any day. A separate room for female patients should be made available by re-arrangement of the available out-door accommodation.

(4) The present number of inferior female servants at the Karachi Civil Hospital is inadequate. There should be two more female ward servants and two more female sweepers. Corresponding numbers from the male staff may be reduced.

(5) The list of diet charges for non-paying and paying patients and for those in the Nursing Home should be scrutinised and revised by the Chairman of the Civil Hospital Advisory Committee. We feel that the diet cost for non-paying patients should range between 6 to 8 annas per day. In the case of paying patients the diet value should not exceed 50 per cent. of the payment made. If the diet value exceeds this limit, the paying patients' charges may be proportionately raised.

(6) The Committee are not satisfied with the working of the existing Advisory Committee established for the Karachi Hospital. Its constitution requires to be altered. The Civil Surgeon should be its Secretary and not Chairman as well. The Chairman should be elected annually by the Committee from among the members. There should be a representative of the Hospital Honorary Doctors on this body. It should meet once every month. It should be authorised to advise about matters pertaining to management and administration of the Hospital. When the Civil Surgeon is not able to accept the advice of the Committee, he should report to Government and inform the Committee.

(7) The Committee are not also satisfied with the present working of the Nursing Association. There are numerous complaints about in-attention. It is agreed that it is most essential that the constitution of the Managing Committee be altered and we recommend the following modifications:—

(a) It is no longer necessary to have the Collector as Chairman of the Managing Body. The Civil Surgeon, Karachi, should take that place.

(b) The other members should be:—

2. Mayor of Municipal Corporation of Karachi or his nominee.
3. Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce or his nominee.
4. Chairman of the Karachi Port Trust or his nominee.
5. An additional representative of the Municipal Corporation.
6. An additional representative of the Karachi Port Trust.
- 7-8. Elected by life members of the Association.
- 9-10. Elected by the ordinary members of the Association.
11. One nominee of the Mohatta (R. B. Shivrattan Mohatta) Family.
12. A representative elected by the Honorary Doctors.

(c) There should be no distinction of caste, creed or nationality in the selection of Nurses for training, and special encouragement should be given to Indian candidates to receive the training.

(d) The Committee see no justification for the following allowances given to the Lady Superintendent :—

- (1) Rs. 50 Eye Hospital supervision allowance,
- (2) Rs. 75 conveyance allowance.

The Eye Hospital is not situated outside the premises of the Civil Hospital and the only other Hospital visited for inspection is the Municipal Epidemic Diseases Hospital, which is just across a road. A conveyance allowance was not called for at all for performance of this or any other duties of the Lady Superintendent.

(e) The Committee regard the expenditure on the Nursing staff as unduly excessive particularly that in respect of messing charges. The latter compare unfavourably with those known to be incurred in the King Edward Memorial Hospital, Bombay. It should be substantially reduced under this and other heads.

The Committee wish to explain that as the Government grant-in-aid is substantial (being equal to half of the divisible items of expenditure, it is usually Rs. 30,000 or upwards) it should henceforth be made subject to acceptance by the Association of the changes in the constitution of the managing body and economies referred to above and to giving an undertaking to abolish all distinction of caste, creed or nationality in the selection of probationers and to provide special facilities for Indian girls to be trained as Nurses.

(8) The Committee express their disappointment with the functioning of the Honorary Doctors at the Civil Hospital and it is necessary that immediate steps be taken to overhaul the system. The following suggestions appear worthy of consideration for more efficient working of the system :—

(i) The number of Honorary Physicians and Surgeons should be increased and re-allotted as under :—

- 1 Pathologist.
- 1 Venereologist.
- 1 Nose, Ear and Throat Specialist.
- 1 Dentist—new.
- 2 Eye Specialists—one new.
- 2 Surgeons.
- 2 Physicians.
- 1 Honorary Lady Doctor—new.

Total. 11

The Lady Doctor would be generally very helpful in the treatment of female patients and particularly in the out-door section. Separate rooms should be provided for the first named three Specialists and the Lady Doctor to function properly.

(ii) The Civil Surgeon should act as Dean and arrange proper distribution of the work among all Honorary Doctors reserving such work for himself in which he feels that he excels without interference with the work, which can appropriately be handled by the Honorary Specialist Doctors.

(iii) The Honorary Doctors should be required to observe regular hours of attendance as may be fixed by the Civil Surgeon.

(iv) As a condition precedent to appointment as an Honorary Doctor, he should be required to instal at his own expense a telephone in his consulting room and residence so that there may be no difficulty in calling him for attendance on urgent cases and in communicating with him whenever necessary.

(v) Any attempt on the part of an Honorary Doctor to enforce Hospital patients to be his private patients must be discouraged.

(vi) The Hospital and Nursing staff must have strict orders to comply with the instructions of the Honorary Doctors. Any attempt at disregard must be severely punished.

(9) The Committee advocate that the appointment of Honorary Doctors at all Hospitals should be encouraged under more or less similar conditions, so that local talent may develop and serve a useful public purpose. Advisory Committees should also be attached to other Civil Hospitals in the Province. In the case of difference of opinion between the Civil Surgeon and the Committee, the former should report to the Director of Health Services and inform the Committee.

(10) Similarly early steps should be taken to attach Stipendiary Lady Doctors and Nurses at all other Civil Hospitals in the Province at the cost of Government. Every Hospital should serve as a centre for training of Indian Nurses. This will greatly improve the efficiency of medical relief, and particularly alleviate the present female suffering.

(11) We would also bring to the notice of Government that the Civil Hospital at Karachi, falls very short, in comparison to even smaller Hospitals in the Country, in the matter of equipment, instruments—surgical and medical, which modern medical Science demands. We suggest that substantial provision be made in the next year's budget for this purpose. Same remarks apply to other Civil Hospitals in the Province also.

276 *Dispensaries and Rural Medical Relief.*—We have said above that there are 56 Dispensaries in all the Districts of Sind for rural medical relief. These Dispensaries are aided by Government and the Doctors are provided by the Government on a contribution system from the local bodies. The above number of Dispensaries work out to just one Dispensary per taluka. This is a very inadequate provision. We are not aware whether the local bodies are unable to finance more Medical Institutions or Government do not provide the necessary grant and S. M. S. Officers. It is primary duty of Government to offer every encouragement for extending medical relief to remote corners of the Province.

Government ought to take steps to investigate into the financial liability of the Local Boards in respect of medical relief, and should issue orders fixing a certain percentage of the Local Board's income for expenditure on medical aid. Government ought to encourage the local bodies by offer of extra grants so that they may be enabled to open more dispensaries. When the Local Boards have done their best and yet all requirements are not met, we propose that each year a certain number of additional dispensaries should be opened by Government. Hundreds of persons in the mofussil suffer acutely from lack of medical relief. We may bring to the notice of Government that they are spending Rs. 22,000 a year on provision of medical relief for 4,365 prisoners in 4 prisons. Surely free population cannot have a lesser claim on the State exchequer.

277. We are glad to know that arrangements are being made to start travelling dispensaries in Sind. We hope there will be at least 4 in each District within the course of next two or three years, wholly financed by Government. All this expenditure would be worth-while incurring, as it would, while improving the health and strength of the people, pay back in many ways to the advantage of the Province.

278. We would also suggest that Government should employ an Eye Specialist, a Nose and Ear Specialist, and a Specialist for Tuberculosis, who can travel all round Sind periodically and give advice and treatment to patients suffering from such diseases, by opening temporary Hospitals at different places. Experience has shown that such temporary Hospitals are much welcomed; people flock in large numbers and get the advantage of the treatment by a Specialist. It becomes a great boon to the poor and ailing.

279. We would also advise that special grants be given to local bodies for opening Maternity Homes and Maternity Clinics. These are urgent necessities as female medical relief has been long neglected and redoubled efforts should be made to recompense for past omission.

280. *Laboratory.*—In the Interim Report we had suggested that the Karachi Laboratory equipment be brought up-to-date. The Committee emphasise that suggestion, because we find that though the only institution in Sind, is short of many a essential apparatus. The modern medical science demands at every step laboratory analysis and research, and we feel that a fully equipped laboratory is a great need of this Province.

MENTAL HOSPITAL AT HYDERABAD.

281. We have no statistics before us to show the percentage of cures in the Mental Hospital at Gidu Bunder. But we regret to note that no attempt had until recently been made to get efficient and qualified medical aid of a Specialist in mental diseases for the inmates of this Hospital. In all modern countries such experts are engaged for the treatment of the mentally defective, and we urge that no time should be lost in placing this Hospital in the charge of a Specialist trained in this line. We understand that Government have deputed a B. M. S. Officer to take necessary training. That is a step in the right direction. The Committee suggest a scale of Rs. 400—20—600 for a really qualified Specialist in Mental diseases. On a Specialist being posted, one of the S. M. S. Officer's appointments should be retrenched and the special pay of Rs. 150 at present allowed to the Civil Surgeon should be discontinued, as his constant and frequent visits will not then be required.

We also suggest that a Nurse, specially trained in the Science of psychetry, should also be engaged, to deal with the mentally defective patients. She will combine sympathy and patience with treatment specially required for such diseases.

Games, light work, gardens and such other healthy amenities are provided in Mental Hospitals for mentally defective patients. Music, radios and other recreations, are known to have a soothing effect upon them. We, therefore, propose that in consultation with qualified experts, such amenities should be provided. The present grounds may also be improved as far as possible to enable these unfortunates to feel happy.

MEDICAL SCHOOL AT HYDERABAD.

282. The Committee have gone through the details of the working of the School, the number of Lecturers and Tutors, the number of teaching hours and the number of students in each class.

The Civil Surgeon in charge of the Hyderabad Civil Hospital acts as the Superintendent of the Medical School and receives an allowance of Rs. 150 for this additional duty and as lecturer in Surgery and Mental diseases. There are besides 11 Lecturers and

Tutors. The sub-joined statement shows the nature of their Hospital duties and School work and the number of hours they are so employed :—

Statement showing approximately the work done by each Lecturer and Tutor and the number of hours in the School and Hospital.

Nos.	Subjects in which he lectures : and additional School duty.	Designation, present pay and allowances.	Hospital duties.	School work number of hours per day.	Hospital duty number of hours per day.	Total number of hours per day.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	Medicine ...	B. M. S. Officer, Rs 360 per mensem, special pay Rs. 50 as lecturer.	Medical Officer-in-charge Medical and Police Wards and Anti-Rabic Treatment centre and Sub-charge Civil Hospital.	3½	3½	7
2	Minor-Surgery, Superintendent of Hostel.	B. M. S. Officer, Rs. 240, special pay Rs. 50 as lecturer.	Surgical Registrar and Resident Medical Officer.	3½	3½	7
3	Materia-Medica ...	B. M. S. Officer, Rs. 200, special pay Rs. 50 as lecturer	In charge of Septic Ward, Eye Ward.	2½	2½	5
4	Anatomy and Physiology.	B. M. S. Officer, Rs. 520.	...	4½	...	4½
5	Pathology Bacteriology and Medical Jurisprudence.	B. M. S. Officer, Rs. 600.	In-charge of Laboratory.	2½	2½	5
6	Midwifery and Gynaecology.	B. M. S. Officer, Rs. 410, special pay Rs. 50.	In-charge of Female Ward and Female Out-door Department.	1½	3½	5
7	Anatomy Dissection Work.	S. M. S. Officer, special pay 25, as Tutor Rs. 60-7-200	Relieving duties ...	3½	1	4½
8	Histology and Physiology.	S. M. S. Officer, Rs. 60-7-200, special pay Rs. 25, as Tutor.	Relieving duties ...	3½	1½	5
9	Chemistry, Physics and Biology, In-charge of Medical Stores.	S. M. S. Officer, Rs. 60-7-200, special pay Rs. 25, as Tutor,	Relieving duties ...	3½	2	5½
10	Chemistry, Physics and Biology.	Full time Lecturer, Rs. 125-10-275.	...	5½	...	5½
11	Elementary Dentistry.	Rs. 50,	Honorary Dentist	6 hours per week.

Summary.

- 1 Part Time I.M.S. Officer.
- 4 Part Time B.M.S. Officers (one being woman A. S.).
- 2 Full Time B.M.S. Officers.
- 3 Part Time S.M.S. Officers.
- 1 Full Time Science Teacher.
- 1 Honorary Doctor.

283. The Superintendent has supplied us with a statement of students classified according to domicile, *e.g.*, Sindhis, Gujaratis, Punjabis, Christians and other Non-Sindhis who were on the rolls of the Institution during the session ending on 15th October, 1937. It is reproduced below :—

Class.	Sindhis.	Non-Sindhis.					Grand Total.
		Gujaratis.	Punjabis.	Chris- tians.	Others.	Total	
IV year regulars ...	23	1	4	5	28
IV year casuals ...	9	1	6	7	16
III year ...	19	...	6	1	...	7	26
II year regulars ...	33	1	8	1	1	11	44
II year casuals ...	6	...	1	1	7
I year ...	1	1
Total ...	91	3	25	2	1	31	122

In the budget estimates for 1937-38 the aggregate expenditure of the Medical School was put at Rs. 55,900, the revised estimate was for Rs. 52,300 and this year the estimated expenditure is Rs. 54,100. The income from School fees is estimated at Rs. 11,000.

284. As indicated above, there are 9 part time Lecturers and Tutors and 3 full-time Lecturers and Tutors. The minimum and maximum hours of work for teaching staff including Hospital duties range between $4\frac{1}{2}$ to 7 hours per day. The above enormous expenditure is being incurred for educating 91 Sindhis, leaving aside 31 Non-Sindhis who should not count for the Province. Calculating on the basis of Sindhi students and deducting fees receivable from them, the cost per Sindhi Student works out to Rs. 477 per annum. It was very strange that there was only one student in the First Year Class. This proves that the upper classes will be sooner or later completely starved. We are told that from

the current year Inter Science Examination has been prescribed as the admission test. This is likely to lead to further depletion in numbers as the School course will thereby be lengthened by another two years. Further the admission test for the Medical School and College course being the same, the latter will be preferred by a prospective candidate.

285. We realise that the Province of Sind should have its own Medical Institution for supply of medical men and women for service in rural areas, where there is great need for expansion of medical relief. But it is doubtful if the Hyderabad Institution is run on economical lines. The Committee feel that a Medical School can be run more economically at Karachi, just as the Law College is being run. Karachi possesses many talented general Private Practitioners and Specialists, who would be available for part-time employment on an honorarium and much saving in cost may be anticipated. The Superintendent of the Medical School at Hyderabad has reported that with the closing down of the School at Hyderabad, 4 B.M.S. Officers, 2 S.M.S. Officers, 1 Science Teacher and 1 Honorary Dentist costing about Rs. 25,000 and certain inferior staff and allowances and contingencies to the tune of Rs. 20,000, total Rs. 45,000 would be saved. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Medical School be shifted from Hyderabad to Karachi as early as possible. The medical work at the Karachi Civil Hospital would offer a larger field of learning for the students and besides the School will serve as nucleus for the future Medical College of the Province to which we should confidently look forward.

286. We have stated above that at the close of the October 1937 Session, there were 122 students, out of whom only 91 were Sindhis, and 31 Non-Sindhis were taking advantage of the Institution. Following the lead given by the other Provinces, Non-Sindhis should be required to pay enhanced tuition fees so as to reduce the burden of expenditure on the Province. Female students should continue to be exempted from payment of fees. We want many more female Doctors and female students should be encouraged to take to medical training by free-ships added to Scholarships, which may also be instituted.

CHAPTER XVI.

POLICE DEPARTMENT.

287. The estimated expenditure for 1937-38 for this department is Rs. 40,10,000 and the revenue is estimated at Rs. 77,000. The latter falls short of the estimate of Miles-Irving Committee by Rs. 10,000 barring realizations from the Motor Vehicles fees which are since 1931-32 being classed under a separate budget head "12—Charges on account of Motor Vehicles Taxation Acts," and not under the Police budget as done before 1931. The expenditure on the other hand exceeds the basic figure assumed by the Miles-Irving Committee by Rs. 4,20,000.

288. That Committee had estimated the cost of separation at about Rs. 12,400 only—Rs. 2,400 representing the allowance to the Deputy Inspector-General at Rs. 200 p. m. on account of his status being raised to that of Inspector-General and Rs. 10,000 for the cost of training 15 officers a year at Nasik or Phillaur. They had, however, visualised expenditure of Rs. 4,81,000 on account of Police Reorganization Scheme and of Rs. 1.81 lakhs for the new district of Guni, which has not yet been created.

289. The Sind Separation Officer had suggested—

- (a) creation of the post of the Inspector-General of Police on a scale of Rs. 2,250—125—2,500;
- (b) retention of the post of the Deputy Inspector-General, who should be Superintendent C. I. D. as well; and
- (c) strengthening the I. G. P.'s office by the appointment of a Deputy Superintendent as Personal Assistant to Inspector-General of Police and 3 clerks.

So far 3 clerks only had been added to the office of the Inspector-General of Police. The Sind Separation Officer's suggestions (a) and (b) had not been acted upon as being much too extravagant.

290. The Thomas Committee had suggested reduction of the number of links which had in their opinion been unnecessarily multiplied, leading inevitably to dissipation of energy and duplication of work. They regarded the Deputy Inspector-General and Deputy Superintendent as superfluous links and recommend their abolition. They further thought that an Inspector of Police who had no inspection to do, but was primarily an investigating officer, should be stationed at district headquarter so as to be available for important crime investigation. They suggested some changes in

organization of Taluka stations and out-posts. They had emphasized that the Local Government had justifiable claim on the Government of India for a substantial contribution towards cost of the Railway Police employed on the Railway Line for maintenance of law and order as opposed to crime.

291. The Police revenue and expenditure for the year 1937-38, consisted of the following items :—

Revenue.

Cash receipts under Arms Act	...	Rs. 17,000
Fees, Fines, etc.	4,000
Miscellaneous	9,000
Recoveries of over-payments	...	3,000
Police supplied to Public Departments, private companies, etc.	38,500
Cost of service rendered	1,600
Contribution for Railway Police	3,900
	Total	<u>Rs. 77,000</u>

Expenditure.

1. Inspector - General of Police, and his office (Deputy Inspector- General's post included in the estimates has not been filled)	Rs. 85,300
2. District Executive Force	34,81,500
3. Village Police comprising 492 Village trackers	62,000
4. Railway Police	1,54,700
5. C. I. D.	1,35,100
6. Charges in England	30,000
7. Contribution to Government of Bombay towards Leave and Pensions of I.P. Officers	62,000
		<u>Rs. 40,10,600</u>

Of this ' charged ' expenditure is 2,10,000

Details of the largest Item No. 2 on which a sum of Rs. 34,81,500 is expended are given below :—

(a) Pay of district staff of—

- 11 Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents.
- 40 Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors.
- 202 Non-Gazetted Executive Officers.
- 5,506 Constabulary.
- 129 Clerks.
- 49 Servants.

Rs. 23,41,900

- (b) Allowances and Honoraria ... ,, 7,56,300
- (c) Contingencies ... ,, 2,75,300
- (d) Contribution for passage of officers to Government of Bombay ... ,, 3,600
- (e) Other contribution ... ,, 300
- (f) Harbour Police consisting of :—

- 1 Inspector.
- 7 Non-Gazetted executive officers.
- 106 Constabulary.
- 1 Clerk.

Allowances 14,200

Contingencies 8,800

,, 73,600

- (g) Additional Police Establishment ... ,, 6,600
(not fixed)

(h) Contribution for training of—

- (i) Sind Police Students ... ,, 25,740
- (ii) I. P. S. Officers ... ,, 14,760

Rs. 16,600 are recovered from other bodies for supply of Police force.

292. The Railway Police force comprising of—

- 1 Superintendent (I.P.),
- 2 Inspectors,
- 16 Sub-Inspectors,
- 267 Constabulary,
- 11 Clerks, and
- 4 Servants.

is estimated to cost Rs. 1,45,000 in pay and passage contribution, allowance and contingencies for this force amount to Rs. 61,900. The North Western Railway contribute Rs. 52,200 for this item and therefore the net cost of the Railway Police administration to Sind Government is Rs. 1,54,700.

293. The Criminal Investigation Department of Sind Police has a staff of—

- 1 Superintendent,
- 8 Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors,
- 10 Sub-Inspectors,
- 26 Constabulary,
- 14 Clerks, and
- 16 Servants.

and costs Rs. 1,15,000 in salaries, Rs. 23,000 in allowances, and Rs. 17,000 towards contingencies.

294. *Allowances.*—We observed that the allowances of the Police rank and file are very numerous being paid to one and all from the lowest to the highest of the Executive force. It will be interesting to recount the nature of these allowances in respect of each class of officers and men.

Inspector-General of Police is entitled to

- Pay Scale : (a) Compensatory allowance at Karachi,
(1,950—50—2,150 plus O. S. P. plus Special Pay Rs. 200). (b) Clothing allowance of Rs. 400, renewable every 10 years,
(c) Charger allowance of Rs. 600, renewable every 7 years if a charger is maintained, and
(d) House rent allowance when the rent exceeds 10 per cent. of pay.

Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents

Pay Scale :
Junior Scale
350—25—700.

Senior Scale,
650—1,450.
plus O.S.P.

- get all the above allowances, plus—
(e) Conveyance allowance in the case of Superintendent of Police, Karachi and C.I.D., and
(f) Sind allowance when posted to districts other than Karachi and Hyderabad.

Deputy Superintendents

Old Scale : 200—800.
New Scale : 200—600.

receive all the allowances of Superintendent of Police except that—

- (i) the clothing allowance is limited to Rs. 200, renewable after 10 years,
- (ii) Charger allowance is limited to Rs. 400, while posted to a Sub-division and when one is maintained, and
- (iii) Conveyance allowance at Karachi.

Inspectors of Police

Pay Scale :

180 — 15/2 — 255 —
270—300.

get—

- (a) Compensatory allowance at Karachi,
- (b) Conveyance allowance of Rs. 25 per month outside and Rs. 40 at Karachi and Hyderabad and Rs. 30 at Sukkur and Shikarpur,
- (c) Clothing allowance of Rs. 45 per annum,
- (d) Free quarters or house rent upto 10 per cent. of pay. Special rates in Hyderabad and Karachi, and
- (e) Those in C.I.D. get Rs. 50.

Police Prosecutors

Pay Scale :

Pensionable, 90—10—
—180.

200—10—300.

300—20—400.

receive—

- (a) Conveyance allowance of Rs. 25, and
- (b) House rent allowance upto 10 per cent. of pay.

Sub-Inspectors of Police

Pay Scales :

75—5—145—150—160

get—

- (a) Conveyance allowance of Rs. 15 per month,
- (b) Clothing allowance of Rs. 40 per annum,
- (c) Free house or rent allowance ranging from Rs. 12 to Rs. 30 according to locality, and
- (d) Those in C.I.D. get Rs. 30 and some get shorthand allowance of Rs. 15—40.

Police Prosecutors

Non-Pensionable.
Rs. 200 Karachi.
Rs. 150 elsewhere.

get—

Office allowance of Rs. 40 in Karachi and Rs. 30 elsewhere.

Sergeants

Pay Scale :
150—200.

get—

- (a) Cost of first outfit Rs. 225. Then clothing allowance of Rs. 4 per month.
- (b) Free house or house rent of Rs. 52 in Karachi and Rs. 40 elsewhere.
- (c) Local allowance of Rs. 25 wherever posted.
- (d) Conveyance allowance of Rs. 40 for Traffic Sergeant.

Head Constables

Pay Scale :
Rs. 28—50.

get—

- (a) Local allowance ; Rs. 4 at Karachi for Head Constables IV grade only,
- (b) Conveyance allowance of Rs. 15 if and when in charge of Police outposts,
- (c) Free uniforms, (Capitation grant, Rs. 15 for foot Police and Rs. 18 per mounted police)
- (d) Free house or rent allowance of Rs. 2 to 7 according to locality,
- (e) Compensatory allowance of Rs. 2 to 5 according to locality, and
- (f) Pagi allowance in few cases.
- (g) Literacy allowance of 0-8-0 to Rs. 4.

Constables

Pay Scale :
Rs. 20—24 in 10 years.

get—

- (a) Local allowances of Rs. 4 for all constables, and
- (c) to (g) as Head Constables.

295. *Functional distribution of Constabulary force.*—With a view to ascertain how the large constabulary force of 5,506 men as mentioned in the budget, was engaged in the districts, the Committee addressed the Superintendent of Police to indicate functional distribution of the force in their districts under several specified activities pertaining to the duties of their office. The details received and compiled in the Committee's office are contained in Appendix V. This statistical information throws important and interesting light on the manner of employment of this large force. Some of the district officers may not have followed a strictly uniform classification under the several specified heads, but the value of the compiled figures cannot on that ground be much discounted. These reveal that out of the large total number of constables and head-constables constituting the Police Force in Sind, only 1,881 are engaged in direct investigation detection and prevention of crime.

1. Investigation, detection and prevention of Crime	925
2. Patrol and Night Rounds	... 813
3. Chowkey duty	... 143
	Total, 1,881

At the district headquarters are concentrated 674 men for various duties, while those engaged for escort of the prisoners, guarding of the sub-jails and treasury strong rooms, number 1,065. The orderly list for attendance on officers and offices shows 127 distributed as under :—

Inspector-General of Police	4 one being head constable.
Superintendents of Police	... 4 each.
Assistant/Deputy Superintendents of Police	... 3 each.
Inspectors.	... 1 each.

The reserve Police Force is 692 strong for emergencies. As many as 299 men are engaged as writers, *i.e.*, Munshis or clerks; 279 serve as process serving agency and 106 are on traffic duty. In addition to the 19 Police Prosecutors, 62 head constables work as Court Jamadars for prosecution purposes, while 135 men are detailed for Miscellaneous duties. In addition to the C.I.D. force shown above, 50 men of the executive force move about in plain clothes, while 13 are on duty at different Railway Stations in addition to the 267 Railway Police constabulary. A special mounted force of 48 men is maintained at Jacobabad for occasional duty of patrolling the frontier. This is of the nature of Military Police Force, which was brought into being on the withdrawal of the cavalry regiment from Jacobabad in the year 1914.

It is apparent from the above analysis that only about one third of the constabulary force is engaged in the actual detection and prevention of crime. We do not wonder, therefore, at the constant complaint from the public about insufficiency of police staff all over Sind.

296. The Committee had two long interviews with Mr. Healy, Inspector-General of Police and we take this opportunity to thank him for helping the Committee with his views and appreciating our suggestions. The Committee had also the advantage of a report from Mr. H. M. Haslehurst, who acted for some time as the Inspector-General of Police in Sind and had perused with interest the memoranda received from all the Superintendents of Police.

297. *Committee's recommendations.*—After very careful consideration the Committee have come to the following conclusions and wish to press certain proposals for adoption by Government.

(1) The Committee do not propose to alter the scale of the Inspector-General of Police of the Indian Police Service or disturb the special pay attached to the post. They further appreciate the necessity of giving relief to the Inspector-General of Police in his office routine. We suggest therefore, the creation of the post of a Deputy Superintendent who will work as Personal Assistant to the Inspector-General of Police. While on this subject the Committee would observe that they do not see the necessity of a special pay for the (Deputy Superintendent) Personal Assistant. His duties would in no sense be more onerous than those of a district Deputy Superintendent. There is no need in our opinion for the post of a Deputy Inspector-General of Police. This post has remained unfilled and should be abolished and the idea of making such appointment should be once for all dropped. The Superintendent of C.I.D. who now acts as the Personal Assistant to the Inspector-General will then be free from this duty.

(2) We have alluded to the Thomas Committee's reference about certain superfluous links. Considering the relative importance and utility of the Sub-Divisional Officer (Deputy Superintendent) and Inspector in the Police organization, the Committee feel strongly that the Deputy Superintendent and Inspector should not normally function in the same area and that where there are Deputy Superintendents, the Inspectors may be dispensed with in those charges. The Committee confidently believe that the tone and purity of administration will improve thereby. Further the appointments of Home

171

Inspectors are also regarded unessential except at Sukkur and Hyderabad. The Inspector-General of Police preferred to have a Deputy Superintendent at Jacobabad and we agree to this proposal. Hyderabad could afford to give up one Deputy Superintendent (that of Tando). We have felt that the reduced Dadu district as proposed by us can carry on efficiently without a Deputy Superintendent.

(3) There are at present 14 Deputy Superintendents—12 in the Executive Force and 2 in the C.I.D. and 35 Inspectors—27 in the Executive Force, 6 in the C.I.D. and 2 in Railways.

We suggest re-distribution as under of the charges of Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors in the district based on the above proposals :—

Name of Districts.	present No. of		Proposed No. of	
	Deputy Superintendents	Inspectors.	Deputy Superintendents.	Inspectors.
Jacobabad	3 1 Home Inspector. 2 Sub-Divisional Inspectors.	1 Kandhkot Division.	1 Jacobabad and Garhi Khairo.
Sukkur ...	2	5 1 Home Inspector. 2 City Inspectors. 2 Sub-Divisional Inspectors.	2 Rohri Sub-Division and Shikarpur Division.	3 1 Home Inspector. 2 City Inspectors, Sukkur and Shikarpur.
Larkana ...	1	3 1 Home Inspector 2 Sub-Divisional Inspectors.	1 Kambar Sub-Division.	1 Larkana Sub-Division.
Dadu (Reduced District.)	1	2 Deputy Superintendent not necessary on account of proposed territorial changes.	2 1 for Kakar and Mehar. 1 for Dadu, Johi and Sehwan.
Hyderabad ...	2	3 1 Home Inspector. 1 City Inspector. 1 Sub-Divisional Inspector.	1 For Hala Sub-Division, Tando Division, Deputy Superintendent is not necessary as the charge is light.	4 1 Home Inspector. 1 City Inspector. 1 Tando Division. 1 Kotri and Kohistan transferred from Dadu District.
Nawabshah ...	1	2	1 Nawabshah Sub-Division	1 Naushahro Sub-Division
Thar Parkar ...	1		1 Mirpurkhas Sub-Division	2 (No change).
Karachi ...	4 1 Tatta District. 1 Traffic. 2 Karachi City.	2 in district. 5 Karachi City.	4 As at present.	6 1 Sujawal Sub-Division. 5 Karachi City.
Total ...	12	27	11	20

While on this subject of Deputy Superintendents the Committee wish to record that no direct recruitment should be made for this post. The Inspector-General of Police is also opposed to direct recruitment. Such recruitment in the past has not proved successful. An honest and experienced Inspector is the fittest person for promotion as Deputy Superintendent. The Committee's attention was drawn to the duplication involved in Police Stations and out-posts being inspected by the District Superintendent and Deputy Superintendent. We would, therefore, suggest issue of executive orders that a Deputy Superintendent should not hold inspection of Police Stations and out-posts when the Superintendent had already done so or had decided to do so.

(4) We are of opinion that Railways should not constitute a separate charge for a Superintendent of Police. There is not enough day's work for a full time Superintendent of Railways. Compared with the Districts, the Crime work is not only light, but not even of a very serious nature. He has the facility of travel too. It had been ascertained that he had visited 10 scenes of offences only in the years 1935 and 1936. On the other hand the present political conditions of the country, when the tension is least acute, are such that the strain of political work must not be too great for the Superintendent of C.I.D. He will besides be relieved of work as Personal Assistant to the Inspector-General of Police. We, therefore, suggest that he should be placed in charge of the combined duties of the C. I. D. and Railway Police. The Inspector-General of Police has agreed to this being tried as an experiment. We would wish this to be brought in force immediately. We have already in the Chapter on Special pays in our Interim Report recommended for good reasons withdrawal of special pay of Superintendent of Railway Police. We wish to emphasise here that there is no justification for a special pay for this combined office. As Superintendent of C.I.D., however, he will continue to draw a special pay of Rs. 150. We accept the suggestion of the Inspector-General of Police that a post of Deputy Superintendent of Railway Police be created to assist the Superintendent of C. I. D. and Railways combined. We intended to suggest that after creating the Deputy Superintendent of Railways' post, one of the two posts of Railway Inspectors should be retrenched and the new Deputy Superintendent should take over the Left Bank area in addition to the general Railway administration and the Inspector be placed in charge of the Right Bank area. The Inspector-General of Police was, however, in favour of retaining the two Railway Inspectors. He felt that the Deputy Superintendent will have enough work of general superintendence and should not be burdened with a charge.

Then we find that there are 15 Railway Police Stations on the North Western Railway. Considering the crime figures and the nature of crimes committed on the Railway line and the availability of facilities of travel, there is scope for reduction in the number of Police Stations. The Committee would suggest examination of crime work and exploration of the possibility of reducing the number of Police Stations from 15 to 12 if not 10.

The District Superintendent of Police, Railways, has drawn attention to the necessity of deputing more than one travelling constables on night trains and on some of the more important day trains. At present one constable in uniform travels by night trains. In his opinion one constable in uniform with a train is useless and that there should be at least one constable in mufti as well on each train and even two on important trains. Bad characters would then be more effectively watched and offences if any reported will be properly investigated without loss of time. He calculated that 50 more constables would be required under his plan. The Committee gave much thought to this demand. They fully agreed with the District Superintendent of Police that one additional travelling constable in mufti was very essential. It will be possible to checkmate kidnapping and escape of offenders if running trains are carefully watched. As the Inspector-General of Police considers it impossible to spare 50 men from the existing force of Railways or districts, the Committee recommend that at least 16 additional constables be detailed to travel on the—

- | | |
|-----------------|--------------|
| 1. Lahore Mail | Up and Down. |
| 2. Sind Express | Up and Down. |
| 3. Bombay Mail. | Up and Down. |

The Committee feel that it should not be difficult to rearrange existing duties and spare 16 men from the huge Police Force, Railway and other, for this important security and preventive work. In any case 16 additional men should be employed for this purpose.

In connection with the Railway Police Administration, we would like again to draw attention of Government to the recommendation of the Thomas Committee that the Local Government had justifiable claim on the Government of India for a substantial contribution towards the cost of the Railway Police employed on the Railway line for maintenance of law and order and that the matter should be pressed on the Central Government. We see from the budget estimate for 1937-38, that the North Western Railway contribution is Rs. 52,200 against Local Government expenditure of Rs. 2,06,900 on the Railway Police Administration. The Inspector-General of Police observed that the present contribution had been

fixed after prolonged correspondence. The Committee would still suggest that the matter should be re-examined and strictly 'law and order' expenditure re-calculated. It will perhaps be found that the Railway contribution is yet below the mark and enhanced claim if any should be pressed on the Railway Board.

(5) The Sind C.I.D., staff is occupied as under at present :—

	Political Section.	Crime Section.	Total.
Deputy Superintendents	1	1	2
Inspectors	3	3	6
Sub-Inspectors	8	2	10
Head Constables	20	6	26

We believe that the stress of political work has abated under the changed conditions of the political life of the country. On the other hand organised crime is on the increase and the Crime Section requires to be strengthened by withdrawals from the political side and some retrenchment may even be effected. The Committee accordingly suggest re-allotment of staff as under to enable more efficient turn-out in the Crime Section. The resultant retrenchments are also indicated :—

	Political Section.	Crime Section.	Retrenchment.
Deputy Superintendents	-	1	1
Inspectors	2	3	1
Sub-Inspectors	4	4	2
Head Constables	10	16	-

The Inspector-General of Police did not favour disturbing the strength of the Political Section arguing that it should be ready to meet all eventualities. We feel, however, that the situation is so easy now and the future apparently so cloudless that much risk will not be run by effecting economies so long as the present situation lasts.

(6) *Sergeants*.—We are of the opinion that the number of Sergeants in the Sind Police Force is much more than necessary. We find that the cost is heavy and a good deal of heart burning is caused amongst the better qualified Sub-Inspectors and Inspectors whose promotions is retarded by the Sergeants being put above them.

We, therefore, propose a change in the present allocation as under :—

	Present.	Proposed.
Karachi, Harbour.	3	4 (Inspector General of Police suggested an increase.)
Karachi Cantonment	3	3
Karachi City Police Stations	15	-
Karachi Traffic	1	1
Karachi Railway	1	1
Drigh Road	1	1
Hyderabad	1	1
Total	25	11

It will be seen that we have a number of Sergeants working at the City Police Stations where their real utility is very doubtful. Their's is a very anomalous position, which must lead to many awkward situations. Statutorily, they occupy rank below Sub-Inspectors who are in-charge Police Station Officers and therefore armed with powers of investigation. But being paid on a much lower scale they could be hardly commanding the statutory position due to them and must be submitting to the will of the less knowing but superior paid Sergeants. If good and efficient English knowing hands are required at City Police Stations, the Department can well employ educated Indians as Head Constables who will be able to do the duty now performed by the Sergeants. We, accordingly, suggest that recruitment of the Sergeants be stopped until the strength is reduced to 11. We further recommend that the promotion of Sergeants to Inspectors' grade and the promotion of Sergeant-Inspectors as Deputy Superintendents should solely be determined by comparative length of service and merit of Service men, i.e., Sub-Inspector and Inspector, and not under any system of reservations in favour of the Sergeant cadre.

(7) *Police Prosecutors.*—We find that for the prosecution of Police cases in Magisterial Courts a large establishment of Prosecutors is employed. The more important cases are attended to by Police Prosecutors of whom eight are pensionable and eleven are on non-pensionable tenure, and for the less important cases

before Taluka Magistrates there is an army of 62 Court Jamadars of Head Constable's rank—one being practically attached to each Taluka Court. Of late the practice of employing non-pensionable Police Prosecutors has been encouraged. The pensionable Prosecutors have 3 grades—

- (i) 90—10—180,
- (ii) 200—10—300, and
- (iii) 300—20—400,

while there are two non-pensionable Prosecutors at Karachi each drawing Rs. 200 plus Rs. 40 as office allowance and nine in the districts each drawing Rs. 150 plus Rs. 30 as office allowance. These non-pensionable Prosecutors can have private practice. The Committee would wish that private practice were stopped altogether as they have reasons to believe that serious abuses are bound to and do arise out of this practice, because not only the Police would like to oblige their Prosecutor, but the Magistracy would be also inclined to show some out-of-the-way consideration to the demand of the Prosecutor. The Inspector-General of Police however argued that the cost of non-pensionable Police Prosecutors was not only comparatively lighter but they being always on trial, as it were, have proved more efficient, while several pensionable Prosecutors had been noticed to grow indifferent and inefficient at a later stage of their service. The Committee would, however, observe that if for any cogent reasons the present system be adhered to, it is necessary that reasonable restrictions be imposed on the Police Prosecutors engaging in private practice. The rules relating to restrictions on private practice governing the Public Prosecutors should be extended to non-Pensionable Police Prosecutors.

(8) *Mounted Police.*—In the Sind Police Force is included mounted section which is 1,342 strong. The Inspector-General of Police informed us that the cost of one mounted man was equivalent to that of two foot Police men. It will be economically advantageous to substitute foot Police for mounted Police, but we would not, however, suggest the substitution as a measure of economy. We would stress the necessity for a larger foot Police force, so that Government may be enabled to detail additional foot Police for night patrol and chowkey duty in larger villages for ensuring greater security of person and property in rural areas. This substitution can however, we are told, be made possible with development of communications. In this connection the Committee wish to point out that there has been a great improvement of communications in the Nawabshah district, where in the last few years Railway loop lines have been constructed and other communicational facilities provided. The question of the suggested substitution may, therefore, be explored in that district and a commencement made.

We have referred above to the special Mounted Police Force at Jacobabad. We would like to emphasise that constant patrol work be exacted from this force and it should not merely serve purposes of show.

(9) We have referred above to the nature of numerous allowances admissible to rank and file of the Police staff. We have devoted separate chapters to different kinds of allowances and our recommendations relating to allowances so far as affecting the Police Department shall apply. There are, however, certain allowances which are not treated under these chapters. We accordingly offer our suggestion in the following wise in regard to such allowances :—

(a) Though a charger allowance is admissible to the Inspector-General of Police and Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Police, the allowance is drawn by the District Superintendent of Police, Upper Sind Frontier only, in the Province. In view of the present-day times of mechanised transport, when a charger is out of vogue, the rules in regard to the charger allowance be once for all amended so that a claim, if ever, made for it should be very restricted. Further, horses are not now so costly as in the past. The Inspector-General of Police agreed that a sum of Rs. 300 would be adequate. So, the charger allowance when permissible under the amended rules should not exceed Rs. 300.

(b) The existing outfit allowance of Rs. 400 for Inspector-General of Police and Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Police and Rs. 200 for Deputy Superintendents renewable every 10 years, can hardly be justified.

The Inspector-General of Police has use for it on very rare occasions. The other officers make more frequent use of the uniform, but dressing in a prescribed manner should be a charge on ordinary pay and no special allowance appears called for in the case of highly paid officers. Ceremonial dresses are prescribed for other Civil officers also but the Committee are not aware that any periodical clothing or outfit allowance is permissible to them. High Police Officers may not claim differential treatment.

The Committee accordingly recommend that the outfit allowance of the Inspector-General of Police, District Superintendent of Police, Assistant Superintendent of Police and Deputy Superintendent of Police, renewable every ten years, should be abolished altogether. A loan may be advanced for making uniforms in necessitous cases.

(c) We find that Sergeants' pre-war pay-scale was 90—5—120. It was raised in 1920, to 150—5—200. Yet a local allowance of Rs. 25 was added as if the scale was fixed on basis of muffasil living. Such an idea is untenable as all

but one Sergeant are stationed at Karachi and they were never intended for service outside Karachi. The local allowance of Rs. 25 is wholly uncalled for and should be withdrawn. The scale as it is, is quite ample for the class of persons seeking employment as Sergeants. They are sufficiently liberally dealt with by grant of a house rent allowance of Rs. 52 at Karachi and Rs. 40 at Hyderabad—the two towns where Sergeants are stationed.

Further, Sergeants get an initial outfit allowance of Rs. 225. No other Police Officer of analogous status, e.g., Inspector or Sub-Inspector gets an outfit allowance. The Inspector-General of Police seemed to suggest that Sergeants as a class were usually short of funds at the appointment time and that they required this initial help for a decent 'rig-out'. The Committee, however, see no justification for differential treatment and recommend that the initial outfit allowance of Rs. 225 be abolished altogether. In necessitous cases loans may be advanced.

(10) Lastly, we wish to emphasise that the constabulary force requires to be strengthened for ensuring security in rural areas. We have stated above that only one third of the present Police Force is engaged in actual prevention and detection of crime, the other two thirds being employed for various miscellaneous duties. In our opinion functional redistribution is called for and therefore the possibility of redistribution tending to make available more men for direct crime detection and preventive work should be seriously explored by Government. We would also here draw attention to the following tables of recruitment by denominational classification supplied by the Inspector-General of Police at the request of the Committee.

Statement showing denominational classification in the cadre of District Superintendents of Police, Deputy Superintendents of Police, Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors, of Police in Sind as it stood on 1st January 1938 :—

	Sindhis; original and Domiciled.	Non- Sindhis.	Europeans.	Eurasians.
District Superintendents of Police...	1	1	8	...
Assistant Suprintendents of Police...	..	1
Deputy Superintendents of Police...	7	1	5	..
Inspectors	17	10	9	..
Sub-Inspectors	124	73	..	1

Statement showing denominational classification in the cadre of Head Constables and Constables in the Police Force in Sind as it stood on 1st July 1937 :—

	Sindhis, original and Domiciled.	Non-Sindhis.	
Head Constables ...	679	*580	* (300 in armed Police).
Constables ...	2,021	†2,601	† (1,438 in armed Police).

STATEMENT SHOWING RECRUITMENT IN THE POLICE
FORCE IN SIND.

Candidates sent to Police Training School, Nasik.

	In January 1935.	In July 1936.	1937.
Sub-Inspectors —			
Sindhis ...	8	8	Nil.
Punjabis ...	3	...	Nil.
Others ...	3	2	Nil.
Constables ...	316 non-Sindhis were recruited during the 12 months ending 30th June 1937.		

The Committee strongly urge that in future the interests of Sindhis in this department should be fully protected in view of acute unemployment and ample material, as best types of men are available in our Province.

Qul Hayat Institute

CHAPTER XVII.

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

298. The Sind Judicial Department has been a self-contained unit for a very long time and not interdependent on Bombay, except for its I. C. S. cadre.

299. The Miles-Irving Committee had estimated the revenue as under :—

Judicial Stamp sales.	Rs. 8.71 lakhs.
Administration of Justice	„ 2.03 lakhs.

Total Rs. 10.74 lakhs.

An additional revenue of Rs. 0.25 lakhs was anticipated when the Judicial Commissioner's Court would be converted into Chief Court.

The expenditure was estimated at Rs. 11.93 lakhs. The Committee had not included the cost of the posts of Legal Remembrancer and Administrator-General and Official Trustee, in the separated Sind hoping that it would be possible for the Legal Remembrancer's duties to be carried out by the Public Prosecutor and the Administrator-General's and Official Trustee's by the Official Assignee. The conversion of Judicial Commissioner's Court into a Chief Court was estimated to cost Rs. 3.14 lakhs.

300. In the budget estimates of 1937-38, Revenue side, the cash receipts under Administration of Justice were reckoned at Rs. 1,99,000, while sales of Judicial Stamps were estimated to yield Rs. 8,36,000, total Rs. 10,35,000. The expenditure estimated for the same year at Rs. 12,42,300 comprises the following items :—

Law Officers of Government	...	Rs. 1,49,900
Judicial Commissioner's Court	...	„ 2,89,300
Official Assignee	...	„ 25,500
Civil and Sessions Courts	...	„ 4,81,300
Small Causes Court	...	„ 49,600
Magisterial Courts	...	„ 1,80,400
Contribution to Bombay Government for leave and pension of I.C.S. Officers	...	„ 24,600
Charges in England	...	„ 41,700
		Total Rs. 12,42,300

The Judicial Department thus costs more than it yields.

301. The Committee had discussed certain aspects of the Judicial administration with Mr. Partabrai D. Punwani, Advocate-General for Sind, and Mr. Kimatrai Bhojraj, President, Karachi Bar Association, and have had the benefit of their views. We had also addressed the Registrar of the Court of Honourable Judicial Commissioner for Sind to supply us with a memorandum about the organization of the Judicial Department and the views of the Honourable Judicial Commissioner for reorganization and functional alterations.

302. The memorandum received from the Registrar of the Court of the Honourable Judicial Commissioner contains the following general observations :—

1. Retrenchment had been carried out in the whole department in the year 1931. Both strength and scales were reduced to the minimum.

2. Any curtailment of the staff or reduction in scales of pay would result in inefficiency and deterioration of work. On the contrary improvement of scales and addition to establishment appeared called for. No functional alteration is feasible in any Court or Office.

303. The following needs are specifically stressed :—

(a) An allowance for Stenographer-Clerk in the 1st Class Court at Shikarpur and one additional Clerk.

(b) A similar allowance for the 1st Class Subordinate Court, Hyderabad.

(c) Water carrier for the Subordinate Court at Rohri.

(d) Improvement in the pay of peon staff of District and Subordinate Courts and supply of clothing to the peons of the Subordinate Courts.

(e) Improvement of scale of pay of the ministerial, process serving and peon staffs of the Judicial Commissioner's Office.

(f) Improvement in the scales of pay of the three Judicial Commissioner's Court Stenographers and making their posts pensionable.

304. The Committee have carefully considered the propriety of the demands set forth above and make the following recommendations :—

(a) There is hardly any justification for an additional clerk or a stenographer's allowance for the Court at Shikarpur on the plea of pressure of work. This is not borne out by the figures of institution and disposal of cases for this Court. Barring Small Causes suits where the difference is insubstantial, the institution of First and Second Class suits has in the last 5 years fallen by 40 per cent. and their disposal by 23 per cent.

(b) In the Hyderabad Courts the fall has occurred generally under all classes of suits—it being 22 per cent. under institutions and 27 per cent. under disposals. We cannot, therefore, advise any additional expenditure on the plea of large volume of work. In both cases the plea of heavy work is hardly tenable. If the Judges require convenience of a Stenographer, it may be conceded if and when a Clerk's appointment is abolished in each Court; the savings may then be utilised towards Stenographer's allowance.

(c) In view of the position of the Rohri Court on a high hill and the reduction in peon staff in 1931, a water carrier on pay of Rs. 14 to Rs. 16 appears necessary. The cost is debitable to office contingencies, which may be increased suitably.

(d) We have dealt with the pay of peon staff in a separate Chapter. The recommendations contained therein will apply uniformly to peons of all offices. As to clothing for the peons of Subordinate Courts, they should be accorded the same treatment as peons of other offices. Supply of clothing should under a uniform plan be made from the office contingent grant which may be suitably increased.

(e) We have compared the scales of pay and grades of the staff of Judicial Commissioner's Court with those of the Secretariat. Curiously we find that the former are based on cost of living in the mufasil and Karachi local allowance is admissible to all of them though none of the office members is liable to be transferred to any post in the districts. With the addition of the Karachi Local Allowance the scales except the minimum starting pay are not very unfavourable. There is, however, great disparity in the constitution of appointments

under different grades as will be evident from the sub-joined table :—

	Number of appointments in		
	Top-most grades.	Middle grade Assistants.	Lowest grade clerks.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
All Secretariat Sections combined ...	19 (200—400)	48 (75—200)	55 (50—110)
Revenue Commissioner's Office—			
(a) as before revision ...	2 (150—300)	14 (80—140)	15 (50—110)
(b) as recently revised ...	6 (200—400)	14 (75—200)	20 (50—110)
Judicial Commissioner's staff ...	3 (170—350)	26 (85—200)	13 (25—80)

The distribution of the Judicial Commissioner's staff in different grades is :—

	No. of posts.
I. Top-most grades—	3
1 Rs. 300—10—350 ...	Deputy Registrar.
1 Rs. 220—10—300 ...	Nazir.
1 Rs. 170—10—230 ...	Head Clerk.
Middle grades—	26
7 Rs. 150—5—200 ...	Office Assistants.
5 Rs. 105—5—140 } ...	Upper grade Clerks.
14 Rs. 85—5/2—100 }	
3. Lowest grades—	13
9 Rs. 30—5/2—80 } ...	Lower grade Clerks.
4 Rs. 25—5/2—55 }	

It will be apparent that the middle grade posts are too many and the appointments in top-most and lowest grades comparatively few. This must undoubtedly cause blockade

and prevent even flow of promotion. The list received from the Registrar shows that the position as regards the pay stages of the present staff is as under :—

3	are drawing above	Rs. 200.
5	”	” 200.
2	”	” 175 and 190.
4	”	” 140.
13	”	” 100.
2	”	” 85 and 90.
13	”	” 30 to 80.

Further, Typists in Secretariat Offices have a distinct scale of Rs. 50—100. It is not so in the Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Office. These incongruities may be removed by suitable revision and regrading.

In doing so the Karachi Local Allowance should be merged in pay scales as there is no point in fixing pay scales of the staff of the Honourable Court on mufasil cost of living and then supplemented by Karachi local allowance, when none of them is liable to be transferred to the districts. The Committee think that with the merging of Karachi local allowance in the pay scales the existing aggregate rates of pay would largely appear adequate. We would, however, recommend that the scale of pay of the Deputy Registrar should be raised to correspond to that of the Senior Superintendent of the Secretariat as the former appointment does not carry any less responsibility.

(f) There are four Shorthand-writers in the Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Court on the scale of Rs. 150—5—200, of these three are non-pensionable. The Assembly Reporters are on the scale of Rs. 150—10—250 and the Secretariat Stenographers are on the scale of Rs. 120—8—200. In view of the fact that each of the four Judges constituting the Honourable Court will necessarily require permanently for all time a Shorthand-writer, we propose that these Stenographers' posts should be formed into a separate cadre and be made permanent and pensionable. As to the relative importance of the nature of the duties of the Honourable Court's Stenographers, the Committee feel that while their work is not as arduous as that of the Assembly Reporters, it is more arduous than that of the Secretariat Stenographers. Their scale is therefore proposed at Rs. 130—5—225 without any local allowance. The Committee hope that the present incumbent's previous non-pensionable service if satisfactory and continuous will be counted for purposes of leave and pension.

305. In addition to the staff dealt with above there are three Gazetted Officers attached to the Court of Honourable the Judicial Commissioner whose designations and scales are given below :—

Registrar.—Old scale. For direct recruits Rs. 750—50—1,000. For service incumbents, grade pay subject to the minimum of Rs. 500 plus special pay of Rs. 100—50/2—200.

New scale. For direct recruits Rs. 650—50—900. For service incumbents, grade pay plus special pay of Rs. 100.

Second Registrar.—Old scale. Rs. 300 plus special pay of Rs. 100.

New Scale Rs. 350. (As this officer gets Rs. 75 for doing duty as Registrar of Companies and Rs. 50 as Registrar of Firms, his aggregate emoluments at present, amount to Rs. 525.)

Official Assignee.—Rs. 750—50—1,000 (non-pensionable). This officer gets Rs. 50 for doing duty as Administrator-General and Official Trustee.

306. The Committee had been furnished with details of the duties assigned to these three officers. Reference had in this connection been invited to pages 64 to 73 of the Rules of the Court of the Honourable Judicial Commissioner of Sind. They are usually recruited from the bar and are supposed to be experienced members of it. Although the minimum qualification is 'being an Advocate of not less than 5 years standing,' in actual practice a senior lawyer is appointed. The present Registrar had 17 years' experience at the bar at the time of his appointment and the Second Registrar of 14 years. The former being Registrar on the appellate side both for Criminal and Civil appeals does all the preliminary work. He is besides Clerk of the Crown and in charge of the Sessions side of the Court. On the administrative side he is Personal Assistant to the Honourable Judicial Commissioner and is responsible for the entire working of the office. The Judicial Re-organization Committee had, it is said, suggested a scale of Rs. 1,000—100—1,500 for this post.

307. The Second Registrar is Registrar on the original side and relieves the Judge of considerable miscellaneous work and does all the work preliminary to the hearing. He is Prothonotary in the High Court and is in charge of the executive work, which consists

of several hundreds of applications. He is the Insolvency Registrar too in which capacity he receives, hears and passes orders of adjudication on Insolvency petitions. He is also Registrar under the Indian Companies Act, Guardian and Wards Act, Indian Succession Act, the Muslim Wakf Act and Indian Trusts Act. In his case the Reorganization Committee had suggested a scale of Rs. 750—50—1,000. As recently as 1936, the Honourable Judicial Commissioner suggested consolidated scale of Rs. 600—25—850, for this post.

308. The Official Assignee is in charge of the administration of the Estates of Insolvents adjudicated as such by the Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Court. He takes possession of and realises assets of Insolvents and distributes them. He is also appointed Receiver of disputed properties, Administrator in administration suits, and Official Liquidator of liquidated companies. He is also Administrator-General and Official Trustee for Sind.

309. It is, therefore, clear that these three appointments involve grave responsibility. But considering our financial limitations we recommend the following scales for these posts :—

1. Registrar of the Court of Honourable Judicial Commissioner. Rs. 750—50—1,000.
2. Official Assignee. Rs. 750—50—1,000. This post should be made permanent and pensionable. Security of service and protection of pension are necessary to invoke the best in an employee.
3. Second Registrar of the Court of the Honourable Judicial Commissioner. To be borne on the cadre of Sub-Judges, First Class, Scale : Rs. 540—40—700. This will have the advantage of making transfers when the exigencies of service so require. No special pay or allowance of any kind should be allowed.

The present fixed pay of Rs. 300 plus special allowance of Rs. 100 plus 75 plus 50 = 525, without a proper scale was not suitable for this office and the Honourable Judicial Commissioner had written very strongly for providing an adequate scale for this office.

Note.—None of these Officers shall have any special pay or allowance, local or other attached to the scale recommended by us.

310. While on the subject the Committee discussed the question of other high appointments administering justice at Karachi, one on the Civil side and the other on Criminal side and both held by Provincial Service Officers. After very careful consideration we are of the opinion that these two posts, *viz.*, Judge of the Small Causes Court and the City Magistrate, Karachi, are of equal importance with those of the Registrar and the Official Assignee and not more. The scales for both these posts should also be fixed at Rs. 750—50—1,000. At present higher scales are attached to these posts, *i.e.*, Rs. 1,000—50—1,200. These are much too excessive in the opinion of the Committee. The Thomas Committee had suggested a maximum of Rs. 1,200 in the 23rd year of service for a Provincial Service Collector or District Judge. The scale suggested by us should, therefore, be regarded as quite adequate and even liberal.

311. The Committee are of the opinion that all these four posts should ordinarily be filled by recruitment from senior members of the Bar unless capable and senior service men are available. Further as we have suggested that the Judicial be separated from the Executive, the post of the City Magistrate will along with other magisterial posts come under the control of the head of the Judicial Department in the Province. It will thus be of great public advantage if the incumbents of these three posts paid on the same scale are made interchangeable.

312. There is one other smaller appointment in the Court of Small Causes, Karachi, whose incumbent too performs functions of a Civil Judge. We refer to the Registrar, Small Causes Court, who has a special scale of Rs. 300—500, and cannot therefore be transferred anywhere. This is a great handicap in administrative machinery. We would suggest that this appointment be brought on the cadre of 2nd Class Sub-Judge in the 2nd grade. (Scale Rs. 250—275—15—380). An Officer of this rank and pay will be able to do justice to this post.

313. We have had examined the published reports on the Administration of Justice for the five years 1932-36, and the salient features emerging from the mass of statistical information compiled by the Secretary for our benefit are summarised as under. These are of great value for the purpose of assessing the working of the Judicial Department from different aspects.

(a) *Strength of Judiciary.*

Judicial and Additional Judicial Commissioners.	4
Sessions, Additional and Assistant Judges.	9

189

Sub-Judges, First Class	...	4
Sub-Judges, Second Class	...	10-12, of these 6 or 7 exercise magisterial powers.
Stipendiary Magistrates	...	155 to 158, of these, the 4 Mukhtiarkars of Desert Talukas exercise Civil powers.
Honorary Special Magistrates		24—23.
Bench Magistrates	...	61 to 67, constituted into 9 to 11 Benches.

The last named two authorities have been recently abolished. Four Stipendiary Magistrates two at Karachi, one at Hyderabad and one at Sukkur and Shikarpur alternatively, will take their place.

(b) *Output Criminal Side.*

		Average of five years.		Remarks.
Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Court (Sessions) one Judge ...	Cases	...	33	} Allowing for vacation, holidays, Sundays and Saturdays when Court work is usually stopped the average turn out is roughly one sessions case a week and one appeal and 0.5 other matters per day, for each Judge.
	Appeals	...	200	
Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Court (High Court) 3 Judges	Appeals	...	296	
	Other matters	...	298	
Sessions Judges (Session Court Jurisdiction) 9 Judges and Assistant Judges.	Cases	...	450	} Allowing for vacation, holidays and Sundays, the average turn out is roughly 1.3 cases a week and 0.7 appeal per day for each Sessions and Assistant Judge.
	Appeals	...	1,442	
Magistracy	Cases brought to trial			} Allowing for Sundays and holidays the disposal is 0.8 case for each Magistrate or Bench per day.
	I. P. C.	...	13,909	
	Other Laws...	...	39,269	
Total		...	53,178	

190

Criminal work has shown considerable increase in the last 5 years but the increase is confined to the cases under special and local laws, while there is a slight decrease in I.P.C. cases as will be seen from the subjoined figures of cases brought to trial :—

			I. P. C.	Local and Special Laws.	Total.
1932	14,673	24,240	38,913
1933	14,428	26,863	41,291
1934	13,771	29,556	43,327
1935	13,987	35,704	49,691
1936	13,831	42,834	56,665

It is noteworthy that the Honorary Magistrates and Benches used to render not insubstantial service. In the year 1936, the Stipendiary Magistrates had tried 19,654 cases while the Honorary Special Magistrates and Benches had tried 36,990 cases.

(c) Criminal fines of five years.

		Minimum.	Maximum.	Average of five years.
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Imposed	...	2,17,815	3,17,401	2,60,807
Realised	...	1,46,694	1,77,722	1,64,132

The tendency to award less fines, which is noticeable in the annual figures may be checked.

(d) Output Civil Side.

		Average of five years.	Remarks.
Judicial Commissioner's Court (District Court Jurisdiction) 1 Judge.	Suits ...	298	Allowing for vacation holidays, Sundays and Saturdays when open Court work is closed, the average turn out is roughly 1 suit and 6 other matters per day. It is noted that the work is on increase.
	Other matters	1,534	
	Arrears ...	1,255	

		Average of five years.		Remarks.
Judicial Commissioner's Court (High Court Jurisdiction) 3 Judges.	Appeals ...	113		Allowing for vacation holidays, Sundays and Saturdays when open Court work is closed, the average turn out is roughly 1 appeal a week and 1½ matters a day for each Judge. The work has more than doubled and the arrears have been brought down by 25 per cent. roughly.
	Other matters	202		
	Arrears ...	552		
District Judges 7 Judges ..	Suits ...	8.8		Allowing for the vacation, Sundays and holidays the out-turn is roughly 1 suit a year and 0.5 appeal or other matter a day for each Judge. The out-turn is almost constant from year to year.
	Appeals ...	366		
	Miscellaneous matters.	466		
	Arrears ...	538		
Sub-Judges	Suits ...	26,779		The 1936 figure is 20,885—the disposal has decreased by 35 per cent. compared with that of 1932. Arrears have been brought down from 10,750 in 1931 to 6,748 in 1936. Maximum arrears were 1,053 in 1933 and minimum 615 in 1936. The turn out is roughly 8 suits and 1.3 matters a day for each Sub-Judge allowing for vacation, holidays and Sundays.
	Miscellaneous matters.	675		
	Arrears ...	8,675		
	Pending for more than a year.	791		
Small Causes Court	Suits ...	8,273		The turn out is fairly constant from year to year. The daily out-put in this Court is about 35 suits, deducting vacation, holidays and Sundays. The proportion of full trial disposal suits to "other methods" disposal suits is roughly 1 : 7. The value of suits ranges between Rs. 10 to 11 lakhs.
	Miscellaneous matters.	53		
	Arrears ...	1,716		

Institution, value and disposal of suits, average of 5 years.

	Institution.	Value in lakhs of Rs.	Disposal after full trial.	Disposal in other ways i.e., without trial, <i>ex-parte</i> admission of claim, Compromise, Arbitration and transfer.
Judicial Commissioner's Court (District Court Jurisdiction).	261	15.81	144	156

Institution is fluctuating, maximum was 324 in 1932 and minimum 213 in 1935. Value is no less fluctuating: maximum was Rs. 25.23 lakhs in 1933 and 45.58 lakhs was minimum in 1935. Roughly 50 per cent. disposal is full trial.

District Judges ...	8	0.26	1	8	The suit work in district Courts is most insignificant and only a small fraction reaches a full trial stage.
Sub-Judges ...	25,580	106.61	2,721	24,058	

The quinquennial figures however show that Institution is steadily falling: it was 33,682 in 1932 and it has come down to 20,029 in 1936—a fall of 38.6 per cent. The value of suits has fallen by 30 per cent from 127.30 lakhs in 1933 to 88.29 lakhs in 1936. This spells considerable reduction of income from Court fees.

The 'full trial' disposal has fallen by 22 per cent. from 3,014 to 2,355 and its proportion to the 'other methods' disposal is 1:8. This must considerably lighten the work of the Civil Judge.

314. It can be clearly inferred from the above statistical details that the district Civil work has decreased a great deal, the turnout is small, arrears are still heavy and income from Court fees has substantially decreased. Comparatively few suits are fully tried and most of the work is disposed of by the easier methods

such as ex-parte, admission of claims, compromise and arbitration. We cannot but come to the conclusion that most of the Civil Judges in the districts are lightly worked, and can easily take on more work. We have, accordingly, proposed in the scheme for separation of the Executive from the Judicial that all Subordinate Judges wherever posted with the possible exception of those at Shikarpur, Sukkur and Hyderabad should be called upon to do magisterial work and they should take on a good share of it. We do not therefore suggest any retrenchment in the cadre of Sub-Judges as we want them to be useful for the achievement of this great objective.

315. Under the same scheme the Sessions Judges will also be required to shoulder additional responsibility. They should be well able to do this as the Civil or Criminal work of their Court cannot be exhausting. On the Criminal side, the magisterial work has increased in respect of offences under Special and Local Laws, while there is slight decrease in the I. P. C. cases. The marked increase in the offences reported under Special or Local Laws indicates that greater interest is taken by Government and public bodies in the enforcement of provisions about 'order', sanitation, health, etc., in large towns, notably in Karachi, which accounts for roughly 2/3rds of the total number.

316. We notice that work has increased in the Honourable Judicial Commissioner's Court both on the Civil and Criminal side and for High Court jurisdiction and the disposal has improved, but it cannot be said to be very taxing. We would in this connection refer to the subject of temporary appointment of Additional Judicial Commissioner to fill leave vacancies. The Thomas Committee had also examined this matter and we had better quote their observations :—

“ We have carefully considered the question of reducing the number of Additional Judicial Commissioners, but have come to the conclusion that such a course is impracticable. We prefer the adoption of the measure recently approved by Government of not filling up temporary vacancies in this Court, but we recommend that this be adopted as a permanent measure of retrenchment and not as an experiment, as sanctioned by Government. Taking the average pay of the Judicial Commissioner and the three Additional Judges at Rs. 3,125 a month and assuming that one or other of them is on leave for six months a year, the saving accruing would be about Rs. 20,000 per annum on the scale of pay in force in the year 1929-30.”

317. We would then proceed to quote the Government orders on this recommendation :—

“ Government accept the recommendation of the Re-organization Committee in this paragraph subject to the two following qualifications :—

- (1) That the present practice of not filling temporary vacancies of Additional Judicial Commissioners should be continued indefinitely (and not permanently) and that it should be revised periodically in the light of the state of arrear in the Judicial Commissioner's Court, and
- (2) that the period for which temporary vacancies should be left unfilled should not exceed six months.”

318. We have been furnished with a statement of leave availed by the Honourable Judges of Judicial Commissioner's Court during the last three calendar years and the temporary appointments made to fill the leave vacancies. We reproduce it below :—

The Hon. Mr. Dadiba C. Mehta, Judge.	1935.	
	M	D
	5	0 from 6-3-1935.
	1	1 extension.
	6	1

The Hon. Mr. G. Davis, Judge, was appointed in this change up to 31-5-1935 and thereafter the Hon. Mr. Lobo from 1-6-1935.

The Hon. Mr. V. M. Ferrers, J.C. From 1-6-1935 to 9-12-35 preparatory to retirement, with permission to prefix the summer vacation of the Court from 1 to 31-5-35.

The Hon. Mr. G. Davis was appointed to officiate as Judicial Commissioner.

The Hon. Mr. Rupchand, Judge. One month from 18-10-1935 to 17-11-1935. No substitute was appointed.

1936.

The Hon. Mr. Dadiba C. Mehta, Judge. 2 months 23 days from 11-3-1936 and permitted to prefix to the leave the Bakri Idd and Holi holidays from 4 to 10-3-1936 and suffix the Summer vacation from 3-6-1936 to 2-7-1936.

The Hon. Mr. Lobo was appointed in this change

- The Hon. Mr. Rupchand, Judge. 15 days from 12-9-1936 to 26-9-36. No substitute was appointed.
- The Hon. Mr. Rupchand, Judge. 3 months 9 days from 19-2-1937 and permitted to suffix vacatoin from 28-5-1937 to 27-6-1937.
- The Hon. Mr. Lobo was appointed to act in this change.
- The Hon. Mr. Lobo, Judge. 5 days from 15 to 19-3-1937 and permitted to suffix to the leave the Court holidays from 20-3-1937 to 4-4-1937. No substitute was appointed.
- The Hon. Mr. G. Davis, J.C. 4 months from 28-6-1937 to 27-10-1937 and permitted to prefix vacation from 28-5-1937 to 27-6-1937.
- The Hon. Mr. Rupchand was appointed to officiate as Judicial Commissioner.
- The Hon. Mr. Rupchand, Judge. 6 months 17 days from 28-10-1937 preparatory to retirement.
- The Hon. Mr. Lobo continued to officiate in this change.

319. It is apparent that the spirit of Government orders had not been observed and the following leave vacancies of Honourable Additional Judicial Commissioners shorter than 6 months were filled up—

1935	Leave vacancy of Honourable Mr. Dadiba C. Mehta from 1st June to 6th September (3 months 7 days) one month was vacation.
1936	Leave vacancy of Honourable Mr. Dadiba, 11th March to 2nd July (3 months 22 days) of which one month was vacation.
1937	Leave vacancy of Honourable Mr. Rupchand from 19th February to 27th June (4 months 9 days) of which one month was vacation.

The only leave vacancies not filled up were 2 occasions of 15 days each and an occasion of 5 days.

320. The Committee wish to emphasise that the recommendation of the Thomas Committee concurred in by Government should be given effect to in future and leave of 6 months and under should without qualification be left unfilled.

321. One other matter having a bearing on the out-turn of work is that of vacation and special holidays for the Civil Courts. The former extends to one month for the Judicial Commissioner's Court and 6 weeks for the other Civil Courts in Sind, inclusive of the Small Causes Court at Karachi. We are unable to understand why the Small Causes Court should have a longer vacation than the Judicial Commissioner's Court. Vacation for Civil Courts is no doubt a very old institution, but it is necessary to examine the question again and determine whether the work of Civil Judges is now really of more exhausting nature than that of Magisterial Courts or for the matter of that of other offices. It could not certainly have been the demand of the litigants to give them rest from recovery or payment of their dues. The Committee suggest that the question of vacation may be investigated thoroughly how far it is really necessary under the present day conditions of work and living. Further if climatic conditions are a factor in the determination of the period of vacation, the Civil Courts at Karachi, which enjoy most agreeable and therefore enviable climate compared with other capital towns in India, should have the smallest period. Next the Courts in South and Middle Sind, *i.e.*, in the districts of Hyderabad, Nawabshah and Thar Parkar should have smaller period than the Courts situated in Upper Sind, *i.e.*, the districts of Sukkur, Larkana, Upper Sind Frontier and Dadu. In any case we see no reason whatever why the Court of Small Causes should enjoy more than a month's vacation and there was at least no justification for allowing that Court 6 weeks vacation when the Judicial Commissioner's Court had a month's vacation.

322. We next proceed to the question of the Court holidays. These are of varying duration for different Courts and are prescribed by the Honourable Judicial Commissioner, and materially exceed the number of holidays permitted by Government to all other offices in the Province as notified for the year 1938 and recounted below :—

Holidays under the Negotiable Instruments Act or Bank Holidays as they are called.	29	inclusive of 4 Sundays but besides sectional holidays allowed as under:—
		Hindus ... 4
		Muslim Suni ... 3
		Muslim Shia ... 5
		Parsis Kadimi ... 8
		Parsis Shahan-shahi ... 4
		Jews ... 10
		Jain ... 9
		Christians ... 5
Judicial Commissioner's Court .	55	inclusive of 4 Sundays.
Small Causes Court ...	51	inclusive of 4 Sundays.
Other Courts in the Province...	43	inclusive of 4 Sundays.

323. We suggest that the Court holidays should not only be uniform all over Sind but should be considerably curtailed. There is no reason why the Court holidays should exceed the number of holidays allowed to other offices. We feel that Bank holidays ought to be quite sufficient for all purposes and offices including all Courts in Sind. We could here point out that the Civil Courts in Sind work for 6 to 8 months in a year. The workless periods consist of—

(a) *Judicial Commissioner's Court.*

Vacation	30
Public Holidays	55
Sundays	44
Saturdays	48
	<hr/>
Total	177
	<hr/>

(b) *Small Causes Court.*

Vacation	42
Public Holidays	51
Sundays	42
	<hr/>
Total	135
	<hr/>

(c) *Other Courts.*

Vacation	42
Public Holidays	43
Sundays	43
	<hr/>
Total	128
	<hr/>

We are not aware whether other Courts fix any work for Saturdays. If they do not, the workless period in all Courts will be practically of 6 months duration. It will greatly help to clear arrears and expedite disposal, which is the crying need of Civil litigation, if the workless period is shortened by suitable reduction in the vacation period and holidays.

324. The attention of the Committee had been drawn to great inconvenience caused to public by having to travel long distances for obtaining justice. We have also shown that the Judges and Assistant Judges are not heavily worked officers. At present Larkana District Court serves the district of Dadu and that of

Hyderabad serves the district of Thar Parkar. This causes much trouble, inconvenience and expense to the public and is an expensive arrangement for Government too. We, therefore, recommend re-distribution of jurisdiction and location of District Courts as under :—

	Present distribution.		Proposed distribution.	
	District Judges.	Assistant Judges.	District Judges.	Assistant Judges.
Sukkur ...	1	2 (1 I. C. S.)	1	1
Larkana ...	1	1	1	...
Dadu	1 (Additional Judge).
Hyderabad ...	1 I. C. S.	2 (1 I. C. S.)	1	1
Nawabshah	1 (Additional Judge.)	1	...
Thar Parkar	1	...
Total ...	3	6	5	3

The Additional Judges posted to Dadu and Nawabshah should perform the functions of District Judge in all respects.

325. We further recommend that out of the proposed 8 appointments only 2 should be reserved for I. C. S. and 6 should be filled from selected officers of the Provincial Judicial Service. Having suggested a liberal recruitment of Provincial Judicial Service Officers for District and Additional or Assistant Judges' posts, the Committee warn against the present high scales of pay for Provincial Service men promoted to these listed posts, for they regard the present scales of pay for Provincial Service very excessive. A Provincial Service Officer of Deputy Collector's grade, maximum pay old scale, Rs. 850, and new scale Rs. 800, starts with Rs. 1,275 as Collector and rises to Rs. 2,250, whereas a Provincial Service Officer of Assistant Judge's grade, maximum pay old scale Rs. 1,200, new scale Rs. 800 also starts with Rs. 1,275 as District Judge and similarly rises to Rs. 2,250. A scale of Rs. 1,000—50—1,250 which appears quite adequate for this class of officers promoted to listed posts should be adopted.

326. Allied with the Judiciary is the organization of Law Officers of Crown, who represent the Crown, assist the Courts and enjoy a specific status under the Criminal Procedure Code. They

generally appear in the higher Courts, whereas in the lower magisterial Courts, prosecution is conducted by Police Prosecutors and Court Jamadars dealt with in the Chapter on Police.

327. At the head of the hierarchy of law officers is the Advocate-General for Sind. Next to him is the Government Pleader for Sind and Public Prosecutor for Karachi. Then follow—

7 District Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors, one for each District, and

29 Assistant Public Prosecutors, and Sub-Government Pleaders distributed as under :—

- 4 for Karachi District.
- 6 for Hyderabad District.
- 1 for Thar Parkar District.
- 3 for Nawabshah District.
- 2 for Dadu District.
- 5 for Larkana District.
- 6 for Sukkur District.
- 2 for Upper Sind Frontier District.

328. It has been said above that the provision for salaries, allowance and fees for all these Law Officers was made in the budget estimates of 1937-38 to the tune of Rs. 1,49,900. The Advocate-General and the District Government Pleaders receive salaries and office allowance in addition to fees for Court attendance on the following scales. Their Assistants do not receive any salary but draw fees on the same scale as their chiefs.

	Monthly.	
	Salary.	Office allowance.
	Rs.	Rs.
Advocate-General	1,000	250
Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor for Sind.	300	100
Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors, Sukkur, Hyderabad and Larkana.	200 each.	...
Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors; Nawabshah, Thar Parkar, Upper Sind Frontier and Dadu.	100 each.	...

	Scale of fees.	
	At Headquarters.	Outside Headquarters.
Advocate-General and Public Prosecutor for Sind.	Rs. 27 per case if one accused; Rs. 13/8 for every additional accused in Judicial Commissioner's Court (High Court Jurisdiction). Maximum Rs. 135. Rs. 45 per day in Sessions and Magisterial Court.	Additional fee of Rs. 12/8 per day (6 p.m. to 6 p.m.) if outside the district and Rs. 7/8 per day in the district plus 1½ first class Railway fares.
Assistant Public Prosecutors for Sind.	Rs. 27 per case in Judicial Commissioner's Court (High Court Jurisdiction) Rs. 22/8 per day in Sessions and Magisterial Court.	Additional fee of Rs. 12/8 per day (6 p.m. to 6 p.m.) if outside the district and Rs. 7/8 per day in the district plus Railway fare, 2nd class.
District Public Prosecutors and their Assistants.	Rs. 18 per day ...	Do. do.

Special enhanced fees may be sanctioned under exceptional conditions.

329. It has been suggested to us that the Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors should be full-time Government servants as in the Punjab. The present incumbents of these posts have expressed varying views on this subject. The chief objection taken is the loss of independence on the part of these officers and that they will virtually be degraded to the position of Police Prosecutors and even Police Agents. It is emphasised that the proper function of a Public Prosecutor is to conduct the case fairly and thus help the Courts in the administration of justice; he is not there simply to prosecute but to place all materials both for and against the accused before the Court. The other view is that a fixed salary (instead of meagre wage for each day of labour) and security of service will make for fuller independence. Under the present notice of 3 months, and report about his conduct is, it is believed, arrangement it is a tenure for 3 years terminable however with a called for every year from the Police and Magistracy. The insecurity of service is verily a sword of Democles and it saps all independence from the incumbent. The remuneration not being adequate, the Public Prosecutor has to look to private practice and indulgence in it is no doubt open to serious objection and sometimes abuse, for a Public Prosecutor is unquestionably an influential person with the Courts in the Districts.

330. We have examined the amount of fees and allowances, which are taken by the Public Prosecutors and their assistants. The budget allotment under this head is Rs. 1,27,100, besides Rs. 6,200 under contingencies, total Rs. 1,33,300. The details furnished by the Public Prosecutors are as under :—

Serial No.	—	Average of 3 years (1934-1937)				Remarks.
		Pay.	Allowance.	Fees.	Total.	
1	Public Prosecutor, Karachi alone ...	Rs. 8,000	Rs. 1,800	Rs. 33,670	Rs. 44,070	Details of Assistant's remuneration not supplied.
2	Public Prosecutor, Sukkur and Assistants ...	2,400	...	10,500	12,900	
3	Public Prosecutor, Thar Parkar and Assistants ..	1,200	...	4,820	6,020	
4	Public Prosecutor, Larkana and Assistants ...	2,400	...	17,980	20,380	
5	Public Prosecutor, Dadu ...	1,200	...	7,830	9,030	
6	Public Prosecutor, Upper Sind Frontier and Assistants ...	1,200	...	6,270	7,470	
7	Public Prosecutor, Hyderabad and Assistants ...	2,400	...	5,440	7,840	
	Total ...	19,400	1,800	86,510	1,07,710	

Details of Public Prosecutor, Nawabshah, had not been received.

Average cost per district works out to Rs. 15,400, i.e., Rs. 1,283 per month for each Public Prosecutor and Assistants. It would have been still more if all details had been received.

331. After careful consideration of this important subject, and study of the memoranda received from the Public Prosecutors, we make the following recommendations :—

(a) There should be full-time salaried Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors one for each district. The Committée appreciate the reasons given by the Public Prosecutor, Dadu, for the change from the present salary-cum-fees to full-time salary. Not only will the change conduce to saving in expenditure but there will be greater purity in Judicial Administration by the elimination of undue influence exercised by the Public Prosecutors in advancing their private practice. The present system of the exercise of the right of private practice by Public Prosecutors must be abolished.

(b) The Committee recommend the following scales of pay for Public Prosecutors :—

Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor for Sind
Rs. 1,000—50—1,200.

District Government Pleader and Public Prosecu-
tors. Rs 500—50/2—750.

When required to attend Court outside headquarters travelling allowance should be admissible like other officers of similar rank and status—the Public Prosecutors being treated as Gazetted Officers.

(c) The full-time salaried Public Prosecutors must keep themselves fully busy on all Court working days. The number of Assistant Public Prosecutors should admit of being largely reduced and they should not be entrusted with Crown work by the Public Prosecutors unless it becomes impossible for the Public Prosecutors to attend personally to any such work.

(d) The Public Prosecutors may ordinarily be retained in service until they attain the age of 55 years and should be entitled to full pension on completion of 20 years' service.

(e) The recruitment of Public Prosecutors should be made by selection from the local members of Bar, who must have had actual practice for not less than 10 years—the Public Prosecutor for Sind may preferably be even a more senior Advocate.

(f) If the proposed system is, however, not to be adopted, the Committee recommend that the fees of the District Public Prosecutors and their Assistants be reduced from Rs. 18 to Rs. 15 per day and that of the Assistant Public Prosecutors for Sind from Rs. 22-8 to Rs. 20 per day, in all Courts, including the High Court. The concession of additional fee for Court attendance outside headquarters in the district should be withdrawn. Ordinary travelling allowance should only be admitted.

(g) The Public Prosecutors and their Assistants should not be allowed to go beyond their individual district. The rule about grant of higher additional fee for Court attendance outside the district should accordingly be wholly abrogated.

(h) With appointment of Advocate-General for Sind, the Public Prosecutor for Sind should cease to be responsible for Sind Courts' affairs. His Jurisdiction should be restricted to the district of Karachi.

(i) The Committee deprecate the present practice of frequent visits of the District Public Prosecutors to Karachi to assist and advise the Advocate-General or Public Prosecutor for Sind. Undue advantage is taken by the district Public Prosecutors of trips to Karachi for personal enjoyment at public expense. Such visits should be most restricted and allowed in very exceptional and complicated cases and should never be permitted by the District Magistrates except on very special request of the Advocate-General or Public Prosecutor for Sind supported by very good reasons and with the concurrence of the Sessions Judge.

(j) The Committee do not wish to interfere with the present emoluments, fees and allowances and allocation of work of the Advocate-General. He may ordinarily be retained in service until completion of 60 years of age.

332. We would next refer to the posts of Remembrancer of Legal Affairs and Administrator-General and Official Trustee. The Miles-Irving Committee had noted that the former office may be held by the Public Prosecutor for Sind and the latter two by the Official Assignee. It will be hardly feasible to make the Public Prosecutor function as Remembrancer of Legal Affairs. We endorse the Government decision to create a new post of the Remembrancer of Legal Affairs combining it with Deputy Secretaryship of Legal Department. The Legislative Assembly recently discussed this matter and sanctioned a scale of Rs. 750—50—1,000 for the combined office. The scale is suitable in the Committee's opinion and should be adhered to. The other suggestion of the Miles-Irving Committee has been acted upon by Government and we see no objection thereto except that the special pay of Rs. 50 should be withdrawn. The present Official Assignee draws Rs. 1,000 and we have suggested a scale of Rs. 700—50—1,000 for the future permanent incumbent. No additional allowance whatever is warranted with such covetable scale.

333. Lastly we shall refer to the much needed reform of the separation of Executive from Judicial. We have dealt with this subject at great length in the Chapter on Revenue Department, where retrenchments were possible to meet the cost of the separation. We have elaborated a full plan of separation from the bottom to the top. We have taken care that the Collector shall continue to function as District Magistrate for all 'law and order' purposes and retain his present control over the Public Prosecutor's functions while the other Executive, *i.e.*, the Officers of the Revenue Department will continue to be armed to quell disturbance of peace or tranquillity arising from any cause including disputes over immovable property, put down habitual criminals and checkmate

opposition to or contempt of lawful authority of public servants. All other criminal work as distinguished from that relating to what is in common parlance called 'order' shall under our scheme be dealt with by a separate agency supervised and controlled by the highest Judicial Authority of the Province, *viz.*, the Honourable Judicial Commissioner by himself and through his agents—the District Judges. The appointing Authority shall in all cases be the Honourable Judicial Commissioner or Government as may be decided upon by Government.

334. We have made these recommendations with full sense of responsibility aiming at purification of administration and general good of the Province. We feel that the proposed separation will leave the officers of the Revenue Department free to devote all their time and energy to revenue side of the administration, which is at present rendered faulty, by reason of inordinate delays, inattention to details and general inefficiency.

335. It remains for us in this Chapter to state that we want that Civil Justice should also be carried nearer to the people. We have said that all Local and Resident Magistrates should be recruited from LL.Bs. and Graduate-Advocates. At the start the separation will be effected by continuing with the present Taluka Head Munshis and Resident Magistrates who are qualified for exercise of Magisterial powers. As vacancies occur in the Revenue Department the present incumbents should be absorbed in that department and fresh recruitment made. With the appointment of LL.Bs. and Graduate-Advocates in the cadre of Local Magistrates and Resident Magistrates, these officers should be empowered to try civil suits the former upto value of Rs. 50 and the latter upto value of Rs. 200. A great convenience will thus be placed in the way of rural people and much expense and trouble to the masses will be obviated and thus the reform will be much appreciated by the public.

336. In view of the fact that the Government have finally resolved to abolish the Honorary Magisterial Benches and Special Honorary Magistrates, we recommend that the following additional staff should be appointed :—

(a) One Magistrate for trial of Municipal and Cruelty to Animals Acts cases for the City of Karachi. The cost of this Court should be divided proportionately to the fines levied, between the Municipality and the Society for prevention of Cruelty to Animals.

(b) Two more Magistrates for disposal of cases under other Special and Local Laws and the Indian Penal Code.

(c) One Magistrate for disposal of Municipal and Cruelty to Animals Acts cases and other Special and Local Laws arising in the City of Hyderabad.

All these 4 Magistrates should be added to the cadre of Sub-ordinary Judges, 2nd Class, 2nd grade, and recruited accordingly.

The existing Additional City Magistrate of Hyderabad should also be added to the cadre of Sub-Judge, 2nd Class, 2nd grade and recruited accordingly.

337. We have ascertained that the two Special Magistrates at Sukkur, the one at Rohri and the two Benches at Shikarpur were turning out not insubstantial magisterial work. The sub-joined table indicates the extent of their average disposal based on the figures of 3 years :—

Towns.	Under I. P. C.		Under Special Laws.	
	No. filed.	No. disposed of.	No. filed.	No. disposed of.
Sukkur	228	265	1,136	1,113
Shikarpur	161	125	321	301
Rohri	162	137	92	91

The Local Magistrates at Rohri and Shikarpur should be able to tackle this work in addition to their own. One Additional Magistrate would be required at Sukkur. We recommend creation of this additional appointment, which should also be ranked with 2nd Class, 2nd grade, Subordinate Judges.

Gul Hayat Institute